

ETHNIC DISFRANCHISEMENT AND CHRISTIAN MISSIONS:

THE CHRISTIAN REFORMED CHURCH AMONG THE HAITIAN IMMIGRANTS IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC: ITS ORIGIN AND DEVELOPMENT IN THE FIRST DECADE (1981-1991)

**Dr. Cornelius Hegeman
Miami International Seminary
2005**

ETHNIC DISFRANCHISEMENT AND CHRISTIAN MISSIONS: THE CHRISTIAN REFORMED CHURCH AMONG THE HAITIAN IMMIGRANTS IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC: ITS ORIGIN AND DEVELOPMENT IN THE FIRST DECADE (1981-1991)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

- 1.1. Stating the Problem
- 1.2. Methodology
- 1.3. Structure of the Study
- 1.4. Essential Terms
 - 1.4.1. Introduction
 - 1.4.2. Cultural Anthropological Terms
 - 1.4.3. Geographical Terms
 - 1.4.4. Historical Terms
 - 1.4.5. Sociological Terms
 - 1.4.6. Religious Terms
 - 1.4.7. Conclusion
- 1.5. Primary and Secondary Sources
 - 1.5.1. Primary Sources
 - 1.5.2. Secondary Sources

PART I

THE CONTEXT OF THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

CHAPTER 2

THE HAITIAN IMMIGRANTS IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

- 2.1. Introduction
- 2.2. Historical Perspective
 - 2.2.1. Colonial Era (1492-1844)
 - 2.2.2. Post-Colonial Era (1844-present)
- 2.3. Socio-economic Development
 - 2.3.1. General Overview
 - 2.3.2. Sugar Cane Economy
 - 2.3.3. Slavery and Servitude
 - 2.3.3.1. Indian-American Slaves
 - 2.3.3.2. African-American Slavery
 - 2.3.3.3. Imported Haitian Labor
 - 2.3.4. Haitian Sugar Cane Cutters Identity

- 2.3.4.1. Identification of Haitian Immigrants
- 2.3.4.2. Identification of Haitian Immigrants' Communal Structures
- 2.3.4.3. Socio-Economic Conditions
- 2.4. Religious tradition
 - 2.4.1. Voodoo
 - 2.4.2. Roman Catholicism
 - 2.4.3. Protestantism
 - 2.4.4. Other Religious Movements
- 2.5. Conclusion

CHAPTER 3

ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC AND THE HAITIAN IMMIGRANTS

- 3.1. Introduction
- 3.2. Roman Catholic Church in the Dominican Republic
 - 3.2.1. History of the Roman Catholic Church in the Dominican Republic
 - 3.2.1.1. Establishment of Roman Catholicism (1492-1822)
 - 3.2.1.2. Challenges to Roman Catholicism (1822-1844)
 - 3.2.1.3. Re-establishment of Roman Catholicism (1844-1965)
 - 3.2.1.4. Development of Roman Catholicism (1965- present)
 - 3.2.5. The Development of Roman Catholic Mission Agencies
 - 3.2.5.1. Communications and Literature Distribution
 - 3.2.5.2. Health
 - 3.2.5.3. Social Services
 - 3.2.5.4. Education
 - 3.2.5.5. Family and Youth Services
 - 3.2.5.6. Human Rights Advocacy
- 3.3. Roman Catholic Ministries and the Haitian Immigrants
 - 3.3.1. Haitian Pastoral Center
 - 3.3.2. Roman Catholic Ministries and the Haitian Immigrant Context
- 3.4. Conclusion

CHAPTER 4

THE PROTESTANT CHURCHES IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC AND THE HAITIAN IMMIGRANTS

- 4.1. Introduction
- 4.2. Protestant Churches in the Dominican Republic
 - 4.2.1. Early Representation of European Protestants (1528-1824)
 - 4.2.2. North American Protestant Involvement (1824-1922)
 - 4.2.3. Establishment of Denominational Dominican Protestantism (1922-1965)
 - 4.2.4. Growth of Dominican Protestantism (1965-present)
 - 4.2.5. Protestant Mission Agencies (1965- present)
 - 4.2.5.1. Communications and Literature Distribution
 - 4.2.5.2. Health

- 4.2.5.3. Social Services
- 4.2.5.4. Education
- 4.2.5.5. Family and Youth Service
- 4.2.5.6. Human Rights Advocacy
- 4.2.5.7. Multiculturalism
- 4.3. Protestant Church Ministries and the Haitian Immigrant
- 4.4. Conclusion

PART II

THE REFORMED AND THE HAITIAN IMMIGRANTS IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

CHAPTER 5

REFORMED AND PRESBYTERIANS IN THE CARIBBEAN AND LATIN AMERICA (1528-1991)

- 5.1. Introduction
- 5.2. Reformed and Presbyterian Church and Mission History in CALA
 - 5.2.1. Early Reformed and Presbyterian Church and Mission (1555-1916)
 - 5.2.2. Later Reformed and Presbyterian Church and Mission (1916-present)
 - 5.2.3. Denominational, Interdenominational, Global Confessional and Para-Church Agencies
 - 5.2.3.1. Denominational Agencies
 - 5.2.3.2. Interdenominational Agencies and Partnerships
 - 5.2.3.3. Global Confessional Bodies
- 5.3. Identity of the Reformed and Presbyterians in CALA
 - 5.3.1. Traditional Reformed
 - 5.3.2. Ecumenical Reformed
 - 5.3.3. Evangelical Reformed
 - 5.3.4. Unity in Diversity
- 5.4. Reformed and Presbyterian Ministries in CALA and the Haitian Immigrants.
 - 5.4.1. Reformed and Presbyterian Ministries
 - 5.4.2. Reformed and Presbyterian Ministries and the Haitian Context
- 5.5. Conclusion

CHAPTER 6

THE CHRISTIAN REFORMED CHURCH IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

- 6.1. Introduction
- 6.2. Leaders of the ICRRD.
 - 6.2.1. Elofin Lerisme
 - 6.2.2. Eugenio Castillo
 - 6.2.3. Emilio Pérez

- 6.2.4. Sirel Lors
- 6.2.5. Locano Jean
- 6.2.6. Odeis Ydamé
- 6.2.7. Pierre Philippe
- 6.3. History of the Assemblies and Important Events of the ICRRD
 - 6.3.1. Official Organization (May 1981-May 1982)
 - 6.3.2. Structural Establishment (May 1982-May 1983)
 - 6.3.3. Representative Cooperation (May 1983-September 1984)
 - 6.3.4. National Identity Expressions (September 1984-September 1985)
 - 6.3.5. Expansion and Turbulence (September 1985-September 1986)
 - 6.3.6. Church Stabilization (September 1986-September 1987)
 - 6.3.7. Mission Affirmation (September 1987-September 1988)
 - 6.3.8. Internal Growth (September 1988-September 1989)
 - 6.3.9. Calm Before the Storm (September 1989-September 1990)
 - 6.3.10. The Storm of Deportations (September 1990-September 1991)
- 6.4. Ministerial Training in the ICRRD
- 6.5. Ministries of the ICRRD
 - 6.5.1. Relationship to the Protestant Dominican Churches
 - 6.5.2. Denominational Ministries
 - 6.5.3. Interdenominational, Global Confessional and Para-Church Agencies
- 6.6. Reformed Identity of the ICRRD
 - 6.6.1. Traditional Reformed
 - 6.6.2. Ecumenical Reformed
 - 6.6.3. Evangelical Reformed
 - 6.6.4. Unity in Diversity
- 6.7. Conclusion

CHAPTER 7

CONCLUSION

- 7.1. Introduction
- 7.2. Thesis Summaries
- 7.3. The Future of the ICRRD and the Haitian Immigrants
 - 7.3.1. Social Context
 - 7.3.2. Church Context
- 7.4. Conclusion

Appendices

- I. Abbreviations
- II. ICRRD Ministry Response to Haitian Immigrant Context
- III. List of Reformed Missionaries in the Dominican Republic: 1980-on
- IV. List of ICRRD Pastors (1981-1991)
- V. Process of Auto-Responsibility in the ICRRD
- VI. Church Statistics of the ICRRD from 1981-1991
- V. Ministerial Training in the ICRRD: 1976-1991

Bibliography

PREFACE

For twelve years and six months (1981-1993) our family lived in the Dominican Republic where I was employed with World Missions of the Christian Reformed Church as a church planter and leadership trainer for the *Iglesia Cristiana Reformada en la República Dominicana* (ICRRD). This dissertation is a result of my observations and research of the context, origin and development of the ICRRD. Many people have helped throughout the course of study. Dr. Jan A. B. Jongeneel, missiologists from the State University of Utrecht, helped structure and revise the study. Dr. Sidney Rooy, veteran Latin American missionary and church historian reviewed the Latin American historical information. Dr. Raymond Brinks, fellow missionary and colleague at the Universidad Nacional Evangélica (UNEV) in Santo Domingo, the Dominican Republic, was the primary field reader.

I am also thankful to Mrs. Elise Armfield, Drs. John Medendorp, Rvd. Hernán González Roca, Dr. Johan Hegeman and Mr. Eufemio Ricardo, Mr. Eric Slechter for reading sections of the manuscript. A word of appreciation goes to Mrs. Helena Wybinga, former librarian of UNEV, who helped compile Reformed literature from the Caribbean and Latin America. The countless hours of work performed by Joseph Leveillé and Claribel Baptis in compiling the *Misiología Dominicana-Haitiana* volumes has left students with a valuable collection of articles and writings about the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic. A special thanks to the pastors who participated in the writing of their testimonies. The enthusiasm and motivation of Alfonso Lockward for Dominican and Evangelical scholarship was contagious.

I dedicate this book to my loving and patient family; my wife, Sandra; and Jonathan, Katrina and Melinda, who have continued to support me throughout the years of study, as well as my mother (Gertrude Hegeman) and siblings (Johan Hegeman, Lona Hegeman, Nella Hegeman Trudy Hegeman and Ben Hegeman, all who are involved in missions in their areas of the world.

Finally, all thanks goes to the Father, Son and Holy Spirit and may this research glorify Him alone and be used for the extension of His kingdom and the building up of His Church.

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1. Stating the Problem

This dissertation deals with *Ethnic Disfranchisement and Christian Mission: The Christian Reformed Church among the Haitian Immigrants in the Dominican Republic: Its Origin and Development in the First Two Decades (1981-1991)*.

The denominational formation of the *Iglesia Cristiana Reformada en la República Dominicana* (ICRRD: Christian Reformed Church in the Dominican Republic) on May 1, 1981, was a joint effort of Christians from four different nations. The local ethnic Christian groups consisted primarily of Haitian immigrants and Dominican nationals, while the international missionaries came from Canada and the United States. The establishment of the ICRRD signaled an important development in the cooperation among Christians belonging to diverse cultural, educational, ethnic, historical, lingual, national, political, socio-economic and religious groups. The multicultural condition of the ICRRD is challenged by living in conditions of observable ethnic disfranchisement in the areas of legality, education, civil law, labor rights, health care and religious tolerance¹ The study seeks to provide an overview of how not only the Roman Catholic Church and Protestants have responded to the multiple needs of the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic. Special attention is given to the Christian service of the ICRRD among the Haitian immigrants, its church members and leaders.

Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic (Part I) will be described and analyzed from an historical, socio-economic and religious perspectives. The history of forced slavery, and after emancipation, sugar plantation labor, is traced from its early beginnings to the modern expression in order to show that under current conditions the ethnic disfranchisement of the Haitian immigrant is permanent and resistant to change. In the midst of the ongoing ethnic marginalized situation of the Haitian immigrant, religious service is expressed through traditional religion, the Roman Catholic Church, the Protestant churches and in non-religious ways.

Amid the conditions of disfranchisement, a phenomenal church growth took place among the Haitian immigrants, which started in 1980 and peaked in 1989. After twenty years of existence the ICRRD growth has stabilized. The growth of the ICRRD will be observed in terms of the development of ethnic church leaders, the institutionalization of the congregations and denominational structures, the extension of communal and ecumenical

¹ A variety of adjectives have been used to describe the Haitian immigrant situation in the Dominican Republic. The economic terms include: slavery (Veras, 1983); supra-explotación (Pons (ed), 1986); forced labor (America Watch: 1992), unfree labour (Baum, 1992) and exploitation. In more social structural terms, proletariat (Bosch: 1981) and peripheral (Martinez, 1995). In previous research, the author has used the term marginalization (Hegeman: 1985). Ethnic disfranchisement is used in this study not only because basic national, legal and social rights of the Haitian immigrants are systematically ignored and denied by the Dominican government as well as the USA government as seen in the migration issues related to the sugar cane cutters and the boat people (Stepick, 1992, Castro, 2001), but the Haitian problem is typical to the Haitians. Since the Haitian government has not been able to stabilize its civil and international services, the Haitians outside of Haiti are left with little defense.

relationships and the expressions of spirituality and ministry. The dissertation will study the role of ethnic church leadership in the ecclesiastical mission work.

The ICRRD could be seen as a North American funded and maintained institution which reflects an international response to the Haitian immigrant's dilemma. Yet the ICRRD has responded as a church institution in which its own leaders and members are responsibly ministering and serving in their context. The study will show the interrelationship between the international mission community and the national church ministries.

1.2. Methodology.

This study uses both an historical documentation and an oral history interviewing method in order to describe and analyze the origin and development of the ICRRD. Each subject matter of the overall theme is studied from a historically chronological perspective.

The study of historical documents is accompanied by the usage of a series of interviews. Already in 1984, the author interviewed a group of pastors, who wrote their testimonies for the denominational history book.² Then in 2001- 2002, the author conducted another series of interviews, which are reported in chapters 6.³

The role of documenting history through eye-witnessed accounts needs to be highlighted. The role of the author as one of the founding missionaries with the ICRRD could be a potential distraction for objective research, however, the use of multi-witnesses as well as minuted proceedings prepared by a variety of denominational secretaries and clerks, offset the dangers of a personalized reporting. Also, and more importantly, as most of the major actors in the twenty year history are alive, reporting was verified through multiple sources.

The scope of the study reflects on a variety of disciplines and has greatly benefited from many academic sources, as seen in the bibliography. The inter-disciplinary contributions come from: cultural anthropology mission anthropology, economics, geography, history, journalism, political science, practical theology, sociology and other disciplines. Yet, the focus of the study is historical and missiological. This dissertation will be inter-disciplinary in scope, historical in methodology and missiological in perspective.⁴

1.3. Structure of the Study

The dissertation describes and analysis the first twenty years of the existence of the ICRRD. The description is centered on the examination of historical documents as well as through the interviews of ethnic church leaders and members. However, to understand the context of the Haitian immigrant situation, it is crucial to understand the history of the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic.

The study begins with a historically survey and analyze of two basic stages of historical development. These stages include the general context of the Haitian immigrant in

² Neal Hegeman, *Iglesia Dulce: Una Historia de la Iglesia Cristiana Reformada Incorporada en la República Dominicana: 1976- 1986* (1986).

³ Donald A. Ritchie, *Doing Oral History* (1995).

⁴ Jan A.B. Jongeneel, *Missiologie* (1991), pp. 103-110. Jongeneel convincingly seeks to integrate all of the social sciences with a comprehensive view of missiology.

the Dominican Republic (Part I) and actual origin and growth of the Reformed Churches among the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic (Part II).

In Part I entitled, *The Context of the Dominican Republic*, the historical, socio-economic and religious data and developments are presented for the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic (chapter 2). The general time frames include the colonial era (1492-1844) and the post-colonial era (1844-present). The complex development of the current forced labor situation of the Haitian immigrant is traced back to the pre-and post emancipation slavery roots. Part I also surveys the Roman Catholic (chapter 3) and Protestant (chapter 4) presence in the Dominican Republic prior to the formation of the ICRRD. The study will seek to establish a link between the historical, socio-economic and religious developments and existence of ethnic disfranchisement.

Part II presents the history of the Reformed and Presbyterians in CALA and specifically the ICRRD in the Dominican Republic. Chapter 5 places the ICRRD in the broader context of Reformed and Presbyterians in CALA. Chapter 6 will present the oral history of some of the indigenous church leaders and review the denominational events of the ICRRD. The study of the ICRRD ends with a description and analysis of the spiritual and ministerial expressions in the midst of ethnic disenfranchisement (chapter 7).

The year 1981 marks the first year of the institutional and denominational existence of the ICRRD. In order to take into account the coming of the first full time missionaries in 1980 and the official beginning of the ICRRD denomination in May of 1981, the year 1981 was chosen as the starting point for the dissertation. The 1991 date as a termination point for the study is chosen for two reasons: first, the author has physically witnessed the origin and development of the ICRRD during these years; and second, a ten year time span gives sufficient data for a historical description and a missiological analysis.

1.4. Essential terms

1.4.1. Introduction

This section will introduce and explain the usage of terms mentioned in the titles, sub-titles and conclusion of the dissertation. A review of major developments in the use of the terms and concepts will be undertaken in order to interact with relevant academic content and place this dissertation in its appropriate academic context. It will not be possible to explain in detail all of the terminology and it is presumed that the readers are familiar with basic cultural anthropology, ecclesiastical, geographical, historical, missiological and sociological terms. The terms will be explained in chronological order and not in order of importance.

1.4.2. Cultural Anthropological Terms

Part of cultural anthropology is the identification of the ethnic and national character of the social group under study. A variety of people groups, of which the Haitian immigrants are one, can be identified in the context of the Dominican Republic.

The Indians were the first known immigrants to inhabit Hispaniola. They are distinguished from the East Indians, who come from India. The term Indian and Indian-American is used in this dissertation in order to associate the migratory Indian population with similar groups in North and South America. European refers to persons born or who

are citizens of European nations. Euro-Americans or European-Americans are the American descendents of European born immigrants. The term European-American, in line with the full usage of Indian, African and other ethnic distinctions, is used. African refers to persons born, who are citizens of African nations and who are descendents of Africans. This dissertation prefers using the full spelling identification of the ethnic and national groups.⁵

The racial distinctions due to intermarriage are too numerous to mention. Reference will be made to general categories of *mestizo* and *mulatto* peoples. *Mestizo* refers to a Caucasian and Indian mix while *mulatto* is indicative of a Caucasian and Negroid mix.⁶

The Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic form an ethnic group⁷ which shares a common ascribed status, group consciousness, common values and traits, and a defined posture within the overall Dominican society.⁸ Ethnic groups, like the Haitian immigrants, find themselves in a plural society, in a culturally heterogeneous population.⁹ The Haitian immigrants constitute a minority within the Dominican society.¹⁰ The role of

⁵ The *Real Academia Español, Diccionario de la Lengua Española* (1992) is the authoritative dictionary for the Spanish language. The Spanish descriptions prefer the *indoamericano, afroamericano, euroamericano, iberoamericano* and *indoamericano* usage. However, for clarity sake, the full words are used in the English language. When the identification "Indian" is used it refers to the original Indians in American, the Indian-Americans or Indo-Americans. Further distinction can be made between Indians living in the Caribbean as Indian-Caribbean or Indo-Caribbean. Iberian or Ibero-Americans refer to both Spanish and Portuguese. The terms Spanish-American and Portuguese-American are appropriate but are not used in the dissertation. National origin and geographical location defines the African-American or Afro-American. African-Caribbean or Afro Caribbean is also used in cultural anthropological literature.

⁶ The *Real Academia...* points out that *mestizo* comes from the Latin *mixticius*, a common word for mixing. *Mulatto* (*a*) has a negative connotation as it comes from *mulo* (mule). Bernardo Vega, in "Ethnicidad y el futuro de las relaciones Dominico-Haitiana," *Estudios Sociales*, Year 26, No. 94, Oct-Dec, 1993, p. 38 speaks about the Dominican identification of being *indio* rather than *mulatto* or *negro*. My observation has been that even though a Haitian in the Dominican Republic and a Dominican may have the same color, their ethnic designation will be different, not according to color but according to nationality.

⁷ The word ethnic comes from the Greek *ethne* and *ethnos* See Jan Jongeneel (1991), Vol. II, p. 172.

⁸ Paul Hiebert, *Cultural Anthropology*, p. 277-279, defines an ethnic group in terms of ascribed status (by birth, common ancestry), consciousness of kind (identify with the group), shared values and traits (in terms of language, foods, political views, clothes, religious beliefs and economic trade) and limited interaction among groups (there are insiders and outsiders). According to this definition, the Haitian immigrants are an ethnic group. All members of the group are born to Haitian parents (ascribed status). They are considered Haitians or Haitian immigrants due to their birth and common identification (consciousness of kin). They share practices such as speaking Haitian Creole, eating Creole foods and supporting the political process in Haiti. They are spiritistic in religious ethos and are commonly involved in manual and agricultural labor. Finally, the Haitian immigrant is distinguished from the Dominican, not so much in language and race, but especially in not being able to secure legal papers to reside in the Dominican Republic. Furthermore, according to the definitions of Hiebert, the Haitian immigrant would be part of a polyethnic society, as they occupy the same geographical space as the Dominicans. Hiebert notes that "stable polyethnic societies evolve when groups develop symbiotic relationships, in which each depends on the others for certain goods or services ((p. 280)." Hiebert also speaks of the minorities and social outcasts within the polyethnic societies (pp. 285-286).

⁹ Thomas Hylland Eriksen, "Ethnicity and Nationalism" in *Anthropological Perspectives* (1993), pp. 12-15.

¹⁰ Exact numerical figures are not available, but estimates range between 100,000 to over 500,000. Frank Moya Pons, *El Batey. Estudio socioeconómico de los bateyes del Consejo Estatal del Azúcar* (1986), pp. 400f; Hegeman, *Leadership Training*, p. 214 estimates the lowest as being 250,000;

homogeneous peoples within a heterogeneous population is of interest in this dissertation. The homogeneous people group has significance for both cultural anthropology as well as missiological church growth.¹¹ This dissertation prefers to use the term, ethnic, rather than homogeneous. The Haitian immigrants are more of an ethnic people group than a homogeneous people group since ethnic origin (i.e. being Haitian born or born of Haitian parents) is a more determinative to define the cause of disfranchisement of the Haitian immigrants than any other single factor. The dissertation will show that Haitian immigrants are systematically denied civil liberties, not because they are a homogeneous people group, but because they are ethnic Haitians whose rights are not guaranteed, not even by their own government.

The ICRRD is a sub-group within the larger Haitian immigrant group. Chapters 6 will examine the membership and leadership experiences, church and community growth, and finally, the spirituality, system of beliefs and internal and external relationships.¹² Such a qualitative study, as opposed to a quantitative documentation alone is necessary in order to comprehensively present the Haitian immigrants point of view.¹³

It is sometimes difficult to distinguish between Dominican cultural anthropology and sociology studies. What is distinct about anthropologists is their extensive fieldwork, complete with interviews as well as statistical surveys.¹⁴ The inter-disciplinary approach to the complexities of the Haitian immigrant is best seen in the monumental investigation carried out in *El Batey* (1986). The research team included: anthropologists, sociologists, economists, engineers, psychologists, doctors, nutritionists, architects, programmers, statisticians, lawyers and other consultants. Missiologist, theologians and pedagogues were not mentioned in the study team.¹⁵

Dominican cultural anthropological studies have dealt with the questions of slavery. Carlos Deive, *La esclavitud del Negro en Santo Domingo (1492-1844)*, Vol. I and II (1980),

Bernardo Vega, "Ethnicidad y el Futuro de la Relaciones Dominico-Haitianas," en *Estudios Sociales*, (Oct-Dic, 1993), p. 35, estimates 400,000; Joachim Balaguer, when he was president in 1989, implied that there were two million Haitian in the DR (Feb 27, 1989).

¹¹ Donald McGavern, *Understanding Church Growth* popularized the usage of the term, homogenous unit. He defines it as: "a section of society in which all the members have some characteristics in common." (Revised edition, 1980, p. 95).

¹² Fredrik Barth, "Enduring and emerging issues in the analysis of ethnicity" (1996), pp. 11-32. Barth argues for constructionists view to analyze ethnic groups. "We should continue to make use of every advance in the analysis and deconstruction of 'culture': rethinking culture provides a useful, no, necessary basis for rethinking ethnicity. This must be so: if ethnicity is the social organization of cultural difference, we need to transcend habitual conceptions of this 'culture.' Barth proposes three interpenetrating levels in order to observe an ethnic group: the micro level (focus on persons and relationships), the median level (field of entrepreneurship, leadership and rhetoric) and the macro level (state policies, institutionalization), pp.20-22. Our dissertation does not strictly follow the three levels of Barth's proposal but offers a similar approach: at the first level, the study of personal testimonies of leaders and church members; second level, a study of spirituality and system of beliefs and practices of the ICRRD; and thirdly, the formation of the ICRRD as an institution.

¹³ Andres Droogers, interview, November 21, 2000, Free University, Amsterdam

¹⁴ See Martin Murphy, "The Push Factors of Haitian Migration to the Dominican Sugar Industry and the Characteristics of the Immigrants." (1983).

¹⁵ Frank Moya Pons (et al) *op. cit* The absence of educators, theologians and missiologists accounts for the lack of information on NGOs, non formal education efforts and churches.

gives the most extensive treatment about the existence of slaves in Hispaniola. The question of slavery is also treated in political science and sociology as well.¹⁶

Carlos Deive also has made a major contribution to the study of Voodoo in, *Vodú y magia en Santo Domingo* (1977). The work of Alfred Mettraux in Haiti, *Vodú* (1979) is translated from French into Spanish and English. June Rosenberg, in *El Gaga, Religion y sociedad de un culto dominicano. Un estudio comparativo* (1979) gives the most complete description of Dominican spiritism.¹⁷

Race related studies examine the lives and cultures of the *cimarrones* (run-away slaves), the *colocos* (English island sugar cane cutters), the *mulattos* (mixture between Caucasian and African race) as well as the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic.¹⁸

The major contribution of cultural anthropology for the study of the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic has been the field studies. The themes of slavery, voodoo, race relations and the nature of social groupings continue to be developed.¹⁹ The interviews conducted for this study will add to the growing number of field studies involving the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic.

1.4.3. Geographical Terms

Hispaniola is the anglicization of the Spanish word, *Española*, which simply refers to that which belongs to Spain. In terms of geography, it refers to the Caribbean island that today consists of the Dominican Republic and Haiti.

The Caribbean islands are a sub-section of the Western Hemisphere along with North America, Central America, Mexico and South America.

¹⁶ Carlos Deive, *La esclavitud del Negro en Santo Domingo (1492-1844)*, Vol. I and II (1980) give the most extensive treatment about the existence of slaves in Hispaniola. Ramon Antonio Veras, *Inmigración, Haitianos y Esclavitud* (1983) and Moya Pons, *El Batey...*(1986).

¹⁷ Carlos Deive, *Vodú y magia en Santo Domingo* (1977). The work of Alfred Mettraux in Haiti, *Vodú* (1979). June Rosenberg, in *El Gaga, Religion y sociedad de un culto dominicano. Un estudio comparativo*, (1979). See also, Louis Mars, *The Crisis of Possession in Voodoo* (1977); Wade Davis, *The Serpent and the Rainbow* (1985); *Passage of Darkeness. The Ethnobiology of the Haitian Zombie* (1988); Robert Lawless, "The Faces of the Gods: Vodou and Roman Catholicism in Haiti," *Journal of Third World Studies* (fall, 1995), pp. 477-481.

¹⁸ Miquel Barnet, *Biografía de un Cimarrón* (1968); Julio Cesar Mota Acosta, *Los cocolos en Santo Domingo* (1977). H. Hoetink, *The Dominican People, 1850-1900* (1982), has an important section on "Race Relations and the Attitude toward Haiti" (pp. 181-192). From a Haitian perspective, Yanick St.-Jean, "A Case of Inculturation: Haitians in the Dominican Republic," *International Policy Review* (6.1. 1996), pp. 24-29. See Gayle Plummer, "Haitian Immigrants and Back yard Imperialism," *Race and Class* (Spring, 1985), pp. 35-43. See Meindert Fennema and Troetje Loewenthal, "The Construction of Race and Nation in the Dominican Republic," *International Sociological Association* (1986).

¹⁹ American Watch, "Harvesting Oppression: forced Haitian labor in the Dominican Sugar Cane Industry," (1990); "Half Measures: Reform, Forced labor and the Dominican Sugar Cane Industry," (1991).

1.4.4. Historical Terms

One of the purposes of this thesis to contribute to ever growing body of mission history literature about Protestantism in Latin America,²⁰ as well as contributing to history of Presbyterian and Reformed marginalized peoples in the Caribbean and Latin America.²¹

Despite the growth of freedom in democratic republics in CALA, persecution of not only Protestant groups but also of Presbyterian groups continue until the last two decades of the twentieth century in Columbia, Cuba, Mexico and Peru. Nevertheless, this dissertation is not about blood spilling persecution but about ethnic disfranchisement and the response of the ICRRD. The experiences of the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic have similarities and yet are different than the experiences of the Presbyterians in Chiapas, Peru and Columbia. In the afore mentioned cases, the membership and leadership of the churches are legal citizens, with the right to civil law and property ownership. The Haitian immigrants do not benefit from this in the Dominican Republic. The relationship of the Dominican society and Haitian immigrants is expressed in a structural and practical system of discrimination, based on Haitian ethnicity.

The history of the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic is placed in the colonial and post-colonial continuum. The usage of the term 'colony' to refer to either the Spanish or French settlements in Hispaniola is common to Dominican historians.²² The pre-colonial era predates the coming of Cristobal Colón in 1492. The Spanish colony was established in 1492 and spans until Dominican Independence in 1844. Haitian independence was declared in 1804. The Dominican post-colonial era extends from 1844 to the present. The study relies on the writings of the Dominican historians Frank Moya Pons, Alfonso Lockward and Bernardo Vega.²³

Protestant church history in the Dominican Republic is gleaned from the denominational history books as presented by Israel Brito, Margaret Short and Phillip Wheaton, and general Dominican church history as written by George Lockward, Alfonso Lockward and William Wipfler.²⁴

²⁰ David Barrett, *World Christian Encyclopedia* (1982); Jean-Jacques. Bauswein and Lukas Vischer, *The Reformed Family Worldwide. A Survey of Reformed Churches, Theological Schools, and International Organizations* (1999); José Miquez Bonino, *Rostrros del Protestantismo Latinoamericano* (1995); Orlando. Costas, *Theology at the Crossroads in Contemporary Latin America* (1976); Pablo Deiros, *Historia del Cristianismo en America Latina* (1986) Justo Gonzalez, *Historia del Cristianismo* (1996) David Martin, *Tongues of Fire: The Explosion of Protestantism in Latin America* (1990), H.J. Prien, *Die Geschichte des Cristemtums in Latein-Amerika* (1978) J.H. Sinclair, *Protestantismo in Latin America: A Bibliographical Guide* (1967); David Stoll, *Is Latin America turning Protestant?* (1990).

²¹ Jose Miquez Bonino, *Doing Theology in a Revolutionary Situation*(1980); Gonzalo Baez-Camargo, "The Earliest Protestant Missionary Venture in Latin America," *Church History* Vol. XXI (1952); William Cook, "The Expectation of the Poor," (1985); J. Goff, *The Persecution of Protestant Christians in Colombia. 1948-1958. (1968)*, J.M. Lopez, *Origines del Presbiterianismo en Mexico* (1972); John Maust, *Peace and Hope in the Corner of the Dead* (1987). Bastian Pierre, *Historia del protestantismo en America Latina* (1989).

²² Frank Moya Pons, *Manual de Historia Dominicana* (1995), pp. 24f.

²³ Moya Pons, *El Batey*; Bernardo Vega, *Trujillo y Haiti*. Vol. 1 (1988); Alfonso Lockward, *Intolerancia y Libertad de cultos en Santo Domingo* (1993).

²⁴ Israel Brito, *Historia de la Iglesia Metodista Libre Dominicana* (1978); Margaret Short, *Toward the Renewal and Growth of the Dominican Episcopal Church: A Practical and Theological Case Study* (1992); Philip Wheaton, *Triunfando Sobre las Tragedias* (1997); George Lockward, *El*

Raymond Brinks and the author have researched at post graduate levels the history of the ICRRD.²⁵ The history of the ICRRD has not yet been written by a Dominican or Haitian author. The interviews presented in this dissertation will hopefully inspire the ICRRD to write their “own” history.²⁶

1.4.5. Sociological Terms

A variety of literary works were published and re-published prior to the 1980’s, which highlighted the suffering of the Haitians²⁷ as well as give a socio-historical analysis about Haiti’s relationship with the Dominican Republic.²⁸ Books and documentation brought to light the horrible massacre of thousands of Haitian immigrants living on the Dominican side of the boarder.²⁹ The interest shown by the authors during the last three decades has to do with human rights abuses, history, Dominican-Haitian relations as well as immigration patterns.³⁰

Beginning in the 1980’s, the plight of the Haitian immigrants received significant international exposure through the writings of Maurice Lemoine, *Azucar Amargo* (1983). The documentation and photographs presented by the French author made its way to the anti-slavery committee of the United Nations as well as a variety of church groups and human rights agencies.³¹ Consequent studies by the UN anti-slave committee generated

Protestantismo en Dominicana (1982); A. Lockward, *op. cit.*, William Wipfler, *Poder, influencia, e impotencia: la iglesia como factor socio-politico en Republica Dominicana* (1980).

²⁵ Raymond Brinks, *Cane Harvest, a Kingdom Multi-Ministry Strategy for Missions* (1985); *The Formation of a Non-Formal Education Team* (1989); Neal Hegeman, *op. cit.*

²⁶ Moya Pons, *op. Cit.*

²⁷ Suzy Castor, *La ocupación norteamericana de Haití y sus Consecuencias: 1915-1934*, (1971); *La Estructura Agraria Posesclavista en Saint Dominique* (1978); Pierre Charles Gerard, *La Economía Haitiana y su Via de Dessarrollo*. México, 1965; *Radiografía de una Dictadura. Haití bajo el Regimen del Dr. Duvalier* (1969); *Problemas Dominico-Haitianos y del Caribe* (1973).

²⁸ H. Hoetink, in *The Dominican People. 1850-1900. Notes for a Historical Sociology* (1982), in the section on “Race Relations and the Attitude Toward Haiti,” observes the importance of Haitian presence in the Dominican Republic at the end of the nineteenth century

²⁹ Freddy Prestol Castillo, *El Masacre se pasa a pie* (1977); Juan Manuel Garcia, *La Matanza de los Haitianos. Genocidio de Trujillo, 1937* (1983); Robin L.H. Derby and Richard Turits, “Historias de terror y los terrores de la historia: la masacre Haitiana de 1937 en la República Dominicana,” *Estudios Sociales* Vol. 92 (April-June 1993), pp. 65-76.

³⁰ Michiel Baud develops that theme in “Una Frontera-Refugio: Dominicanos y Haitianos contra el Estado (1870-1930),” *Estudios Sociales* No. 92 (April-June, 1993), pp. 39-64 and “Una frontera para cruzar: la sociedad rural a traves de la frontera Dominico-Haitiana (1870-1930) *Estudios Sociales* No. 94 (October-December, 1993), pp. 5-28; Ramon Antonio Veras contributed two studies about the immigration of the Haitians to the Dominican Republic. His first work, *Inmigración, Haitianos, Esclavitud* (1981) examines Dominican law, immigration statutes and Dominican and Haitian government practices and concludes that both the Dominican and Haitian government gain economically from the official selling and payment of Haitian workers and for that reason do not want to change the status quo (p. 7). The author places the dynamics of the Haitian immigrant in the context of an unchecked capitalistic growth, which uses and abuses the laborer in slave like conditions. Veras second contribution, *Migración Caribena: Un capítulo Haitiano* (1985) places the Haitian immigration within the wider laborer’s immigration movements within the Americas. Veras contribution lies in the well documents government decisions and labor deliberations.

³¹ Interview with Eduard Jean Baptist, a promoter with the Roman Catholic *Pastoral Haitiana*. Eduard notes that due to the international exposure brought by Maurice Lemoine, *Azucar Amargo* (1983), Roman Catholic authorities began to press for more cooperation between the Haitian and Dominican

commentary as well as collaboration from human rights groups such as American Watch.³²

A number of studies were published seeking to understand the development of the sugar cane economy as a capitalistic development which requires hegemony of authority between the governments on the island, the military and sugar cane institutions in order to secure labor.³³

The Centro de Estudios Sociales Padre Juan Montalvo, located in Santo Domingo, has produced a series of sociological as well as historical studies relating to the Haitian immigrants. Research has been conducted in the areas of history, Dominican-Haitian relationships and NGOs³⁴. The magazine, *Estudios Sociales* is one of the few Dominican publications in which social scientists are addressing the Haitian immigrant situation.

This study uses the terms ethnic disfranchisement to describe the religious and social conditions of the Haitian immigrant in the Dominican Republic.³⁵ Disfranchisement implies that one is set outside of a normal situation and basically ignored. The Haitian immigrants are ignored by their own government, the Dominican government, international governments and not only civic governments, but also by the traditional Roman Catholic and Protestant churches.

Other terms could be used. Marcos Villamán speaks of exclusion-inclusion.³⁶ This designation comes very close to the social dynamics related to the Haitian immigrants. They are excluded from civic rights, such as the freedom to be legally documented, freedom of education, medical services and judicial protection. Samuel Martínez uses the term peripheral in speaking about the Haitian immigrant in relationship to the sugar cane plantations.³⁷ Again, the idea that the Haitian immigrant is outside of the normal societal structures (i.e. Dominican structures) is portrayed. Several authors speak of the exile and the Diaspora. It is not uncommon for the term refugee to be used.³⁸

Church in order to address this concern. This resulted in the 1985 appointment of both Dominican and Haitian priests to the *Pastoral Haitiana*.

³² American Watch, "Harvesting Oppression: forced Haitian labor in the Dominican Sugar Cane Industry," (1990); "Half Measures: Reform, Forced labor and the Dominican Sugar Cane Industry," (1991). Robin Kirk, "Stone of refuge: Haitian Refugees in the Dominican Republic," National Coalition for Haitian Refugees (1991).

³³ Ramonina Brea, *Ensayo sobre la formación del estado capitalista en la Republica Dominicana y Haiti* (1983); José Castillo, *La Inmigración de Braceros Azucareros en la República Dominicana* (1978); Franc Baez Evertsz, *Braceros Haitianos en la Republica Dominicana* (1984); José Manuel Madrugra, *Azucar y Haitianos en la República Dominicana* (1986); Carlos Cabral Dore, "Los Dominicanos de origen haitiano y la segregación social en la República Dominicana," *Estudios Sociales* No. 20 (1987), pp. 57-72

³⁴ Carlos Dore, *op. cit.* (1987); Michiel Baum, *op. cit.* (1993); Bernard Vega, *op. cit.* (1993); Américo Badillo Veiga, *op. cit.* (1998); *De este lado de la frontera* (1999).

³⁵ Franchise is: "A privilege or right granted a person or a group by a government, state, or sovereign." Or, "The territory or limits within which some privilege, right, or immunity may be experienced." *The American Heritage Dictionary*, p. 522.

³⁶ Marcos Villamán, "Religion y pobreza," in *Estudios Sociales*, No. 94 (Oct-Dec., 1993), p. 83-84.

³⁷ Samuel Martínez, *Peripheral Migrants: Haitians and Dominican Republic Sugar Plantation* (1995).

³⁸ See also Oscar Lewis, *La Vida: A Puerto Rican Family in the Culture of Poverty* (1965), pp. xl – xli.. Lewis uses the term "culture of poverty" to describe when this study calls disfranchisement. Janice E. Perlman in *The Myth of Marginality. Urban Poverty and Politics in Rio de Janeiro* (1979) correctly points out that marginality is often misunderstood. She places marginalization in the larger sociological context. She writes: "...the functionalists or integration model of society is founded on the premise that every functioning social structure is based on a set of shared values among its

All of the terms mentioned above point to the same reality, the systematic exclusion of the Haitian immigrant from the legal, labor, civil, educational and health care benefits of the society in which the immigrants find themselves. The importance of the church as an alternate community takes on special status among the disfranchised peoples.

1.4.6. Religious Terms

The origin and development of the ICRRD are examined within the religious context of traditional religions, Roman Catholicism and Protestantism.

The traditional religions mentioned in this study are the religions of the Indians living in Hispaniola at the time of the Conquest as well as the African religions brought to Hispaniola by the African slaves after the Conquest. The two systems of religion are significantly different. The Indian traditional religions died out and the African traditional religions continue to be expressed through Haitian Voodoo and Dominican Gaga.³⁹

Roman Catholic missiology is defined according to the Vatican Documents, as well as the regional bishop conferences and national pronouncements.⁴⁰ Interviews and study of documents associated with the Haitian Pastoral Committee are used as reference.⁴¹

The Protestant churches were initiated from the sixteenth century on by separating from the Roman Catholic Church and by establishing their own churches. For the purposes of the study, two strains of Protestantism (there are many more) are referred to, namely, the traditional Reformed and the evangelical.⁴²

The Reformed version of Ecclesiastical missions, the planting and development of churches, needs to be supplemented by ethnic persons and church groups to continue in missions.⁴³ The ongoing propagation for missions is closely associated with what is spoken

members. It sees society as an integrated social system defined by a shared set of values which are differently allocated through the different subsystems...The "marginals" in this case are defined as permanently outside of the society since they do not participate in the shared values which are the definition of society itself." Perlman observes that the marginalized will not be integrated into the mainstream of society. She adds that society requires to have a marginalized sector: "...it demands relations of economic dependence which result in the temporary or permanent misery of the dependent elements for the benefit of the society."

³⁹ For Indian traditional religion: Frank Moya Pons, "The Taínos," *Caribbean Review*, 13 (Fall, 1984), 4:20-22,47-48; For an extensive bibliography on Indian culture see Frank Moya Pons, *Manual de Historia Dominicana* (1995), pp. 591-592. For Voodoo, Carlos Deive, *op. cit.*; Alfred Metraux, *op. cit.*, June Rosenberg, *op. cit.*.

⁴⁰ The Vatican documents which were reviewed included *Evangelii Nuntiandi* (1975), *Dives in Misericordia* (1980), *Laborem Exercens* (1981); *Sollicitudo Rei* (1987), *Centesimus Annus* (1991). For the Dominican Republic, *Documentos de la Conferencia del Episcopado Dominicano*. (1955-1990) (1990).

⁴¹ "Centro de Coordinación y animación de la Pastoral de los Inmigrantes Haitanos en República Dominicana," (pamphlet), (2000).

⁴² Jean-Jacques Bauswein and Lukas Vischer, *The Reformed Family Worldwide* (1999), p. 2, Lukas Vischer defines the general doctrinal tenets of the Reformed and Presbyterians. Samuel Escobar, "¿Qué significa ser evangélico hoy?" *Misión*, Vol. 1, No. 1, p. 46, provides a standard definition for Caribbean and Latin American evangelicals.

⁴³ The word "mission" comes from the Latin *missio*, meaning, "to send." *Missio* is closely associated with the New Testament Greek *apostello*, from which the noun "apostle" is derived (K.H. Rengstorf, "Apostello," *Theological Dictionary of the New Testament*, Vol. I (1969), p. 421). Mission, in the theological sense, refers to the *missio Dei*, the mission of God. "Missions" (plural) are the variety of activities rooted in the *missio Dei* carried out by the Church, Christians and organizations dedicated to

of in English as indigenization.⁴⁴ Rather than using the term indigenization, this study will speak of ethnic responsibility.⁴⁵

Ethnic responsibility, as a missiological concept, takes on a variety of forms. Administrative ethnic responsibility is expressed when the national church and missions are responsible for church governing, church propagation and church supporting⁴⁶. Cultural ethnic responsibility stresses the importance of the use of the vernacular language in Bible translation, hymnology, liturgy and ministry. Ministerial ethnic responsibility occurs when the local believer and church are able to respond to God's call to ministry and service in the local context and beyond. Mission ethnic responsibility, takes place when local Christians organize, support, carry out and multiply their mission extension activities among their own and other ethnic groups.

This dissertation will seek to document the level of ethnic responsibility in the ICRRD. Leaders and members of the ICRRD will be interviewed and asked questions about their perspective on administrative, cultural, ministry and mission issues. The study will propose questions on ethnic responsibility in the context of the conditions of marginality.

1.4.7. Conclusion

Section 1.4 introduced the reader to the usage of terms found in the titles and as major concepts within the study. The following chapters will use these terms in their specific historical and missiological contexts.

that end. There is one *missio Dei* and many missions (Orlando E. Costas, *Theology of the Crossroads in Contemporary Latin America* (1976), p. 8.; see Jan. A. B. Jongeneel, *Missiologie. I. Zendingwetenschap* (1991), p. 38.; Johannes Verkuyl, *Contemporary Missiology: An Introduction* (1978), p.3.) In classical Reformed thought, missions has been defined in terms of the manifestation of God's glory through the extension of His kingdom. This was the emphasis of Gisbertus Voetius (1580-1676). The three-fold goal for missions was: *vocatio e conversio gentium* (the calling and conversion of the gentiles); *plantatio ecclesiae* (the planting of the church) and *Gloria et manifestatio gratiae divinae* (the glory and the manifestation of divine grace). This three-fold purpose for missions was reflected in the Mission Order of Christian Reformed Church (p. 1) as well as the initial field strategy for the ICRRD.

⁴⁴ The term indigenization is helpful but when used in the Hispanic culture it takes on a different meaning. *Indigena* refers to the Indians. Literally speaking, an indigenous church, in Spanish, is an Indian church. Indigenization would then mean to indianize the church. There are other derivatives which need to be considered. *Los indigentes* are the poor and needy, Larousse (1989). This is different than the notion of self-support, self-administration and self-propagation and other concepts related to the English use of the word indigenization. For a standard use of the term indigenization see David Barrett's "Dictionary," *World Christian Encyclopedia...* (1982), p. 830.

⁴⁵ Lefever Beyerhaus in *The Responsible Church and Foreign Mission* (1964) takes issue of using the word "self" in the three-self formula. His recommendation to use "responsible" solves several problems. First, it is theologically more consistent with the Christian ethic of service. The church does not exist to serve itself, administrate itself and propagate itself. Rather, by God's grace and intervention, the Christian community responds to God by evangelizing, in participating in the church and through serving God in all areas of life. Secondly, the use of the adjective responsible is more consistent with partnership. Indigenization should not lead to isolation but rather to cooperation and partnership

⁴⁶ The three-self formula of self-support, self-administration and self-propagation was developed by Rufus Anderson (1796-1880) and Henry Venn (1796-1873). For further reading see, J. Jongeneel, *op.cit.*, II, pp. 175-177.

1.5. Primary and Secondary Sources

1.5.1. Primary Sources

The main primary source materials for investigating the ICRRD are the following: the ICRRD's national assembly reports and minutes, the ICRRD church statistics, the ICRRD pastor's and member's interviews and ecclesiastical documents as found in the denominational archives. The denominational archives are housed in the ICRRD denominational office at the National Ministry Center in Santo Domingo. Documentation related to both CRWM and CRWRC is archived at their office in Santo Domingo. CRC missionary libraries are a valuable source for ICRRD related documentation, especially in relationship to the variety of zones and projects in which the missionaries labored. The reference section of the library of the Miami International Seminary has the *Misiología Dominicana-Haitiana* collection of newspaper articles and monographs related to the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic.

Throughout the years 1980-2000, the minutes for the Central Committee were preserved by the secretaries of the Central Committee with the cooperation of missionaries. Missionaries Ray Brinks and Neal Hegeman, in conjunction with the synodical leaders, oversaw the publishing of synodical minutes and the recording of the denominational statistics. The synodical minutes are published in *Actas y Estatutos de la Iglesia Cristiana Reformada. 1981-1991*.⁴⁷

The first ICRRD pastor interviews were conducted by the author in the context of a denominational history class. The interviews were first published in the denominational history book, *Iglesia Dulce: Una Historia de la Iglesia Cristiana Reformada Incorporada en la República Dominicana: 1976- 1986*. The second interviews were realized during the years 2001 – 2002.

1.5.2. Secondary Sources

Dr. Raymond Brinks wrote two theses on the Dominican Republic. The first thesis, *Cane Harvest, A Kingdom Multi-Ministry Strategy for Missions*, was completed for a Th.M.degree in 1985 under the mentorship of Dr. Robert Recker of Calvin Theological Seminary in Grand Rapids, Michigan.⁴⁸ Brinks' second thesis, under the leadership of Dr. Harvey Conn and Dr. Roger Greenway of Westminster Theological Seminary, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, was published as a D. Min. thesis in 1989. This study, entitled, *The Formation of a Non-Formal Education Team*, describes the history and educational background for the Theological Education by Extension program of the ICRRD and CRWM.⁴⁹

Several missiological works published by the author of this study are used as secondary sources. The D. Min. thesis, *Church Ministry Among Marginal Peoples: A Study*

⁴⁷ Minutes are preserved in the CRWM mission office, AMMICRAN, Inc., Santo Domingo, Dominican Republic. Hegeman, *op.cit.* ; Hegeman, ed., *Actas y Estatutos de la Iglesia Cristiana Reformada. 1981-1991* (1992) and *Reglas Internas de la ICRRD. Reg Inten EKRRD* (1992).

⁴⁸ Raymond Brinks, *Cane Harvest, A Kingdom Multi-Ministry Strategy for Missions* (1985).

⁴⁹ Raymond Brinks, *The Formation of a Non-Formal Education Team* (1989). Brinks used the thesis to train leaders who would be able to teach Bible and theology in the ICRRD

Project on Church Ministry and Leadership Training Among the Haitian Immigrant Sugar Cane Cutters in the Dominican Republic was completed in 1985 through Westminster Theological Seminary under the tutelage of Roger Greenway.⁵⁰ The focus of that study is to develop the concept of ministry centers whereby a multi-ministerial approach to multi-dimensional needs was proposed. *Iglesia Dulce: Una Historia de la Iglesia Cristiana Reformada Incorporada en la República Dominicana: 1976 - 1986* is a history of the ICRRD published in 1986.⁵¹ In 1990, the author participated in a nation wide survey of Protestant churches in conjunction with Dominican church leaders. Mr. Eufemio Ricardo and Miss Claribel Baptist were the recording secretaries. The results were presented under the title, *Directorio de la República Dominicana*, at the national convention, CONPAS 92 (Congreso de Pastores 1992), held in Santo Domingo.⁵² Dr. Frank Moya Pons edited the most extensive socio-economic study related to the Haitian immigrants, in *El Batey*.⁵³ He reports on investigations, surveys and questionnaires conducted in the *bateyes* (sugar cane worker villages) and among CEA (State Council of Sugar) employees. Other secondary sources, written by journalists, anthropologists, missionary workers and a variety of different authors, will be consulted.

More than 200 secondary source titles of books, articles and documents have been written about the ICRRD, from 1975-2000. Only those that were consulted will be listed in the bibliography.

Since 1984 and until the present, newspaper articles and other monographs related to the Haitian immigrant situation have been collected and bound in a series called *Misiologia Dominicana-Haitiana*. The plus 20 volume series is housed in the library of the Miami International Seminary.

⁵⁰ Neal Hegeman, *Church Ministry among Marginal Peoples: A Study Project on Church Ministry and Leadership Training among the Haitian Immigrant Sugar Cane Cutters in the Dominican Republic* (1985). This study is a description and analysis of the leadership training program of the ICRRD implemented in Sabana Grande de Boya, Dominican Republic

⁵¹ Neal Hegeman, *Iglesia Dulce*.

⁵² Eufemio Ricardo and Neal Hegeman, "Directorio de la República Dominicana," *Desde Lutero Hasta la República Dominicana* (1992).

⁵³ Moya Pons, *op. cit.*

PART I

THE CONTEXT OF THE ICRRD IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

CHAPTER 2

THE HAITIAN IMMIGRANTS IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

Thesis 1. The Haitian immigrant in the Dominican Republic is historical, social and religious disfranchised from governing powers, economic development and traditional religion in Hispaniola.

2.1. Introduction

Chapter 2 is dedicated to placing the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican historical context, to outlining their socio-economic developments and to identifying their religious characteristics.

Section 2.2. will develop the historical framework for the Haitians immigrants in the Dominican Republic. During the colonial era (1492-1844), the Haitian immigrant's ancestors were brought as slaves from Africa to Hispaniola. The Haitian people gained their freedom through revolutionary activities in Haiti (1792) and became the aggressors against the Dominicans (1822-1844). The invading Haitians were defeated by the Dominicans in 1844. In the post colonial era (1844-present), the Haitian immigrants return to the Dominican Republic both as temporary and long term agricultural and manual laborers.

Section 2.3. will describe the historical development of the sugar cane economy as well as the rise and fall of slavery. It will be documented that slave like conditions continued after emancipation even to the present day. The study will concentrate on the contemporary Haitian sugar cane cutter situation. The status, number, location and marginal condition of the immigrant will be analyzed.

Section 2.4. will introduce the religious structures, belief systems, and practices found among the Haitian immigrants. The major tenets of Voodoo are explained. Voodoo remains the folk religion of the Haitian immigrant. The Roman Catholic Church has historically been the most dominant religious institution on the island. Voodooism and Roman Catholicism continue to live in a syncretistic relationship. Protestantism came to Hispaniola to stay in 1824. Since its small beginnings it has steadily grown, also among the Haitian immigrants.

2.2. Historical Perspective

The history of the Haitian immigrants involves two distinct eras. Previous to 1492, the ancestry of the Haitian immigrants is traced to the coast of West Africa. With the beginning of the colonial era in 1492, the slaves became part of the colonial system of the Spanish, and later, under the French. The second era is the post-colonial period, starting in Haiti in 1804 and the Dominican Republic in 1844 until the present. Section 2.2. will concentrate on the colonial era (Section 2.2.1) and the post-colonial era (Section 2.2.2.).

2.2.1. Colonial Era (1492-1844)

The Africans brought to Hispaniola trace their roots to West Africa, particularly the Gulf of Guinea and Dahomey (modern day Benin) regions. The African slaves were either captured or made prisoners of war by African oppressors and then sold to the Portuguese and other slave trading European nations. In the year 1493, the first domestic slaves were brought from Spain on the second voyage by Colón. Importation of slaves continued until 1791 in Haiti and until 1820 in the Dominican Republic.⁵⁴

The rural and African population was far greater in Haiti than in the Dominican Republic. On both ends of the island, the African population outnumbered the Spanish and the Indians.⁵⁵ The *mulatto* class continued to grow as the Spanish and French intermarried with the Africans. The *mulattos* and the African slaves rose up in revolt against the white French colonists in Haiti in 1791. In an ironic turn of events, which were determined by the warring French and Spanish in Europe, the 1795 Treaty of Basilea gave the eastern part of Hispaniola, the Dominican Republic, to France. The Haitian revolution against the French spilled over into the Dominican Republic. The Haitian leader, Toussaint L'Ouverture, marched on Santo Domingo in 1801. He was routed in 1802 by the French General, Charles Leclerc, who was dispatched there by the French. By 1804, Haiti had declared its independence from France, becoming the first free African republic in the Americas.⁵⁶

During the first decades of the nineteenth century, the Dominican Republic was ruled by the French, the Spanish, the Haitian and their own Dominican leaders. It was a period of unrest and instability. Whereas new republics were struggling for independence from Spain in Mexico and South America, the Dominican Republic sought military help from Spain for protection against England, France and Haiti. This could not be realized due to Spain's precarious national and international situation. In this state of weakness, the Dominican colony was ill equipped to defend itself. As a result, the Haitian General, Jean

⁵⁴ An archeological collection of early Indian cultures is displayed at the Museo del Hombre Dominicano in Santo Domingo. Apart from the archeological evidence, the earliest recorded descriptions are from Bartolomé de las Casas in *Historia de las Indias* (1985) and Gonzalo Fernández de Oviedo's, *Historia general y natural de las Indias* (1959). Melville J. Herskovits, *Life in a Haitian Village* (1971), pp. 16-20, makes a strong case for Hispaniola slaves coming from Dahomey because the religious language and symbolism can be traced back to that area. Deive, *La Esclavitud del Negro en Santo Domingo. 1492-1844.*, Vol. 1, pp. 233, mentions the Bantu, Sudanese and mostly the Guineas. Alfred Métraux in *Voodoo in Haiti* (1972) estimates that 900,000 Africans were brought into Haiti. George Simpson in *Black Religions in the New World* (1978) cites 864,000. For the Dominican Republic, Carlos Deive calculates that 1820 was the last year for importation of slaves (Vol. 1, p. 279). The number of slaves in the Dominican Republic was far less than in Haiti. Frank Moya Pons, *Manual de Historia Dominicana* (1995), pp. 1-10, 26. Mannix D. and Cowley M., *Historia de la trata de negros* (1968), p. 67. For a brief overview of slavery in Benin, see Benjamin Hegeman, *Between Glory and Shame...*, 26-29.

⁵⁵ The Indian population was reduced from an estimated 400,000 in 1492 to less than 4,000 in 1518. The causes for the rapid decline also included mass suicides, imported diseases and war, as well as immigration out of the island. Las Casas, *History of the Indies*, Book Vol. 1, No. 85 (1971), p. 47. Moya Pons, *Manual*, p. 26; The Spanish population in Hispaniola dwindled in 1540 to 3,000 Spanish colonists. However, by this time there were at least 12,000 African slaves on the island. Moya Pons, *Manual*, pp. 34,48; Deive, *op. cit.*, pp. 81-102.

⁵⁶ Moya Pons, *op. cit.*, pp. 81-102, 193-210; Bosch, *op. cit.* pp. 113. 122; Wenda Parkingson, *This Golden African* (1978).

Pierre Boyer, conquered the entire island in 1822 and remained in control for twenty-two years.⁵⁷

Historians and sociologists differ as to the overall effect of the Haitian occupation (1822-1844). Observations range from severe criticism to a cautious positive observation. The most critical perspective, understandably, came from the Dominican liberation spokesmen, the *Trinitarios*. They lamented the exile of the more wealthy families, the confiscation of private property, the destruction of agricultural fields, the humiliation of the clergy and church, the dictatorial government, among other matters.⁵⁸ Dominican political scientist and sociologist, Juan Bosch, observed that despite the fleeing of the colonial elite, a land owning class continued, forming a new *bourgeoisie*. Bernard Vega speaks of the same phenomena as the *new oligarchy*.⁵⁹

Independence from Haitian rule was accomplished by the Dominicans on February 27, 1844. The colonial era officially ended with national independence, secured both in Haiti and the Dominican Republic. The Haitian twenty-two year invasion, along with the reported brutalities, the shifting of political and social power, left a psychological scar in the relations between the Dominican Republic and Haiti. Reports and exaggerations of the invader's brutality continue to live in the collective psyche of the Dominican people.⁶⁰

The Haitian immigrant in the Dominican Republic traces its historical heritage to the captive slave populations on the Ivory Coast in West Africa. Continuing migrations from Africa were registered until the middle of the eighteenth century. The birth of the Republic of Haiti freed the African Haitian laborer from slavery but not from servitude. The continuing wars and socio-economic instability kept the majority of the Haitians as an exploited agricultural working class. The Independence in the Dominican Republic was anti-Haitian, due to the 22 years of Haitian occupation, and created in its Dominican nationalism an anti-Haitian ethos.

2.2.2. Post-Colonial Era (1844-present).

National independence in Haiti was declared in 1804 while Dominican independence came in 1844. The Haitians liberated themselves from the French whereas the Dominicans were freed from the Haitians. Haitians sought to invade the Dominican Republic on several occasions during the nineteenth century, but they were repelled. Despite the continuing threat of Haitian invasions and a series of internal conflicts, the Dominican Republic developed a stronger and more stable socio-economic environment than Haiti.

⁵⁷ Moya Pons, *La Dominación Haitiana : 1822-1844* (1978).

⁵⁸ Gregorio Luperón, *Notas autobiográficas y apuntes históricos*, 2nd. ed. (Santiago: Editorial El Diario, 1939), Vol. 2, pp. 258ff. See H. Hoetink, *The Dominican People. 1850-1900. Notes for a Historical Sociology*, Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press (1982), pp. 168-169.

⁵⁹ Vega, *Trujillo y Haití*. Vol. 1 (1988), p.4. Bosch calls the new oligarchy, formed by ruling politicians, a small bourgeoisie who were in competition with the another bourgeoisie group, the tobacco farmers. The later group dominated, but in siding with the Spanish takeover, lost their position when nationalization returned, pp. 163f. Bosch divides the bourgeoisie into high, medium and low.

⁶⁰ Frank Moya Pons reports of abuses during the invasion and retreat of the Haitians. That Haiti was continually the aggressor in the nineteenth century cannot be denied. Moya Pons, *Manual...*, pp. 281-296.

Dominican liberators, Juan Pablo Duarte, Francisco del Rosario Sánchez and Ramón Matías Mella led their liberation group called the Trinitarian Society against the Haitian invaders. This led to the formation of the Dominican Republic in 1844. During the same year, a central governing board was established to govern the new republic.

Between 1844-1930 there were 50 presidents, 30 revolutions and 22 constitutions in the Dominican Republic⁶¹. Three times the republic was reconstituted.

The post-colonial era can be sub-divided into sub-periods: annexation to Spain, 1861-1865; the restoration and the second republic, 1865-1916; the North American occupation, 1916-1924; and the establishment of the third republic, 1924-present.⁶² Each of these sub-periods will be introduced in the following paragraphs.

The first Dominican republic was ruled by the Central Governing Board until Pedro Santana became its first president. From then until the Spanish annexation, Pedro Santana and Buenaventura Báez fought each other for governmental control. Periodic Haitian invasions were repulsed. Santana was defeated and exiled by Báez in 1857. During the same year he returned with his own army to overthrow Báez and return to power in 1858.

Furthermore, in 1861, Santana successfully solicited Spain for annexation leading to Santana being named General Captain from 1861-1862.⁶³ Dominican nationalists conducted a two-year war of restoration. The Spanish annexation lasted only four years. After Santana's death in 1864, Haitian influence, as well as growing USA pressures, continued to mount. In 1865 Spain left Hispaniola for the last time.⁶⁴

The development of the second Dominican republic is dated from 1865 to 1916, the year of the American invasion. It was also a period characterized by political upheaval. The two major national leaders at that time were Buenaventura Báez and Ulises Heureaux. Both were known for their use of arms and political savvy to gain power. International momentum shifted from dependence from Spain to seeking both an economic and a political relationship with the United States. Báez sought to have the Republic annexed by the USA. The growth of USA investments led to a large debt that the republic could not repay. This was used as a justification for the Americans to overthrow the Dominican government in the year 1916 and to establish a military government until 1924.⁶⁵

The eight-year USA occupation (1916-1924) created conditions influencing future governments. For the first time, highways were built to connect the major cities and to unify the north with the south. An infrastructure for collecting taxes and tariffs was put into place. Public schools and public institutions were developed. The sugar cane industry was strengthened. At the same time, power was shifted from the general population to the national police. The population was disarmed while the police and the military forces were increasingly trained and armed. These measures gave the police and military more power over the people and helped to create conditions for a future dictatorship.⁶⁶

The third attempt to establish the republic as a self-governing nation was realized in the year 1924. The era from 1924 is divided in three stages: first, the era of post-occupation government of Horacio Vásquez (1924-1930); then, the era of dictatorship of Rafael

⁶¹ Howard Wiarda, *The Dominican Republic. A Nation in Transition* (1968), p. 33.

⁶² Moya Pons' division of time periods.

⁶³ Moya Pons, *op. cit.*, pp. 297-320.

⁶⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 337-358

⁶⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 359-473.

⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 475-493.

Leónidas Trujillo Molina (1930-1961); and finally, the era of the new democratic order (1961-present).

The post-USA occupation under the rule of Horacio Vasquez included increased economic prosperity, new public works in the country and new constructions in Santo Domingo. However, the consolidation of armed power in the hands of the police and military and the weak government of Horacio Vasquez set the stage for the dictator Trujillo to take control in 1930.

During Trujillo's 31 year reign of terror, the civic, cultural, economic, educational, judicial, political infrastructures and religious-ecclesiastical infrastructures were monopolized by the Trujillo family and their associates. The assassination of Trujillo on May 30, 1961, left the country to re-organize its entire social structure.⁶⁷

The post-Trujillo era of government included military governments, special commissions, and a revolution, which finally led towards a constitutional democracy. Democratic elections were established in 1961 and continue to be held until the present. The transition from the police state of three decades to a responsible democratic society is still in process. As demilitarization increases, police accountability is required and privatization of industry continues. Though measures are being taken, national political elections are still marred by voting irregularities and political obstructionism.

This brief overview of the formation of the Dominican State shows the social turbulence, the resulting authoritarian control and the recent democratic and privatization reforms. Yet, while most of Dominican society evolved from colonial structures to independent democratic structures, the Haitian immigrant community in the Dominican Republic did not undergo such a socio-political transformation. Rather, due to the socio-political instability of Haiti, which continued to be ruled by dictators, military juntas and a fledgling democracy during part of the 1990's, the Haitian sugar cane cutter continues to live in a colonial-like system of servitude and have not benefited from democratic reforms in the Dominican Republic or Haiti.

The history of colonial and post-colonialism shows a distinct pattern in the evolution of socio-political reform. Of the two nations residing on Hispaniola, the Dominican Republic has progressed to become a democratic republic governed by democratically elected officials and ruled by agreed upon law. At the beginning of the 21st century, Haiti continues to seek to become a democratic nation. As these developments take place, the Haitian immigrant in the Dominican Republic continues to work in colonial-like servitude, lacking the protection from their home government in Haiti and continuing to be used for inexpensive labor by the Dominican government and people.

2.3. Socio-economic Development

2.3.1. General Overview

The socio-economic developments in which the ancestors and present day Haitian immigrants were involved in Hispaniola are described from the conquest of 1492 to the present.

The agricultural society of the Indians was replaced with the Spanish mercantile system. Juan Bosch gives a summary statement of the impact of the Spanish on Dominicans:

⁶⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 495-524.

We became a western nation, not according to the more developed models of Europe but rather according to the Spanish model. Spain gave us everything it had: language, architect, religion, manners of dress and eating, military arts, civil and judicial institutions, wheat, cattle, sugar cane, and even cats and dogs. But we did not receive from Spain, because she did not have them, the western methods of production and distribution, technical skills and capital, and the ideas of the European society of that epoch. We had money, but not the banks; we knew the Gospel, but not the works of Erasmus.⁶⁸

With the failure of the gold rush early in the sixteenth century, the remaining colonists dedicated themselves to establishing sugar cane plantations and cattle farming. After the sugar cane industry diminished in the mid-sixteenth century, cattle grazing became dominant. The raising of cattle took on extra-commercial importance with the rise of contraband activities on the northern coast. The cattle were raised to supply the growing hide trade to Europe through northern European filibusters and pirates. This economic development was temporarily halted with the devastation of the northern and western outposts of Hispaniola by the Spanish army in the opening decade of the seventeenth century.

The seventeenth century saw the rise of the buccaneers on the northwest side of Hispaniola. The buccaneers would raise their own cattle and crops in order to trade them on the European market. The depopulation of the colonist due to brighter economic prospects in South America and Mexico, the economic depression, the inability of Spain to provide sufficient military protection and economic help, all led to the growth of the buccaneer society on the fringes of the Dominican colony.

Out of the buccaneer society arose the French land claim in the eighteenth century to what was later called Haiti. The buccaneers eventually became plantation owners in Haiti. The Haitian society developed independent of Santo Domingo. The French took over the eastern colony in 1697 and its control lasted until 1777. During this time commercial trading was hampered by political disputes, military border conflicts and pirating.

The nineteenth century saw the cattle farmers and tobacco growers under constant stress. This century was characterized by Haitian invasions, French counter attacks, a war of independence, a series of revolutions and a brief Spanish annexation. The sugar cane industry was in danger of disappearing and large economic debts were accumulated with the United States.

When the United States occupied Haiti in 1915 and the Dominican Republic in 1916, an economic infrastructure was developed on the island that connected the sugar cane production to the USA markets. The physical incursion of the United States military in order to establish its imperialistic boundaries would set the tone for twentieth century trade relations.

The Trujillo era was dominated by his family's monopolization of the important industries in the Dominican Republic. After his death, many of the industries, including the sugar cane company, were again taken over by the government.

During the latter half of the twentieth century, privatization began to accelerate in the areas of banking, tourism, communication and manufacturing as well as in sugar production. Large tax-free manufacturing zones, whereby international companies paid

⁶⁸ Bosch, *Composición Social Dominicana* (1981), p. 11.

minimal taxes and provided employment, were developed. Tens of thousands of workers moved from the rural areas to the major cities in order to secure employment.⁶⁹

Economic activities between Dominicans in the country and those who have migrated to neighboring countries continues to grow and accounts for a substantial capital input into the Dominican Republic. International trade also includes the Dominican-Haitian commerce. During the 1980's and early 1990's, commercial activities were significant between the two countries. Open trade is practiced, except for the periodical restrictions placed during times of social upheaval.

The embargo placed on the Haitian military government by the USA in 1991 resulted in merchants on the island increasingly using contraband trade networks. Commerce continued but prices rose as contraband intermediaries had to be paid. The embargo was economically beneficial to the military and contraband agents on both sides of the border. The Dominican and Haitian *mafiosos* (mafia) replaced the open market system.

The economic activities between the two Hispaniola countries have endured and outlasted colonial disputes, slavery, pirating, border conflicts, invasions, massacres, deportations, droughts, hurricanes and international embargoes. The Dominican Republic has developed to a greater degree than Haiti due to the government's stability, administrative and technological modernization and import-export activities. Due to the Dominican socio-economic strength, the demand for workers in the agriculture and construction sectors is ever present. To this end, Haitian immigrants are sought to fill that demand.

2.3.2. Sugar Cane Economy

Sugar cane was brought to Hispaniola on Colón's second voyage in 1493. The sugar cane plantations as well as the ranches became recipients of African slaves during the sixteenth and seventeenth century.⁷⁰

The sugar cane industry continued during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries but did not reach the proportions of the sugar cane companies of the twentieth century. The control of the sugar plantations by Trujillo, and later, in large part, by the Dominican government, continued to make the sugar cane operations a national concern.

In 1990, 17,978,573 tons of sugar was cut from 3,759,932 *tareas* (tares). More than a million *tareas* were planted. The government sugar cane company, CEA, remains the largest operation with 14 plantations, followed by the privately owned La Romana Central company in the West. Over 550 *bateyes* (villages for sugar cane workers) are registered. The government reports that between 77,000-85,000 Haitians workers and their family members are involved in the sugar cane companies. Other sources indicate that the actual numbers easily double that number.⁷¹

The sugar cane system is a carry-over of colonial and economic structures. In the state owned companies, the government has in effect replaced the colonial system. The sugar cane workers continue to supply the manual labor. Full mechanization has not been implemented because it is still more profitable to hire Haitian workers than to purchase and

⁶⁹ Moya Pons, *op. cit.*, pp. 31-60;75-86;322-334; 403-412; 427-445; 475f.

⁷⁰ Deive, *op. cit.*, Vol. 1, pp. 53 and 338.

⁷¹ República Dominicana en *Cifras 1990*, Vol. 14 (1991), pp. 118-119; A *tarea* is 628 square meters, *Sopena diccionario-Encyclopedia*, Vol. 4.

to maintain expensive sugar cane cutting machinery. In many respects, the colonial slave culture is continued.

2.3.3. Slavery and Servitude

Hispaniola's socio-economic development depends traditionally on the manual laborer. Forced labor has also been part of the economic system. Due to the disappearance of the indigenous population by the mid-sixteenth century, African slaves were imported to take their place. Slavery was abolished in the early nineteenth century, however, the servile structure has continued until the present day.⁷²

2.3.3.1. Indian-American Slavery

The Spanish colonists did not initially enslave the indigenous population in Hispaniola. Only domestic Spanish slaves (mostly African) were permitted by the Church and the Spanish crown to come to the New World. Quickly, however, a justification for enslaving the Indian population was found. When the Spanish soldiers, left behind by Colón, were killed and La Navidad fort was destroyed by the local population, the colonist's retaliation and imprisonment of the Indians was considered justified.⁷³

The enslaving of Indian-Americans became an instrument of production. Colón even returned to Spain with Indian-American slaves. Juan Bosch observed:

The first indigenous [people] of the Americas submitted to slavery were not destined to work for the *conquistadores* but to be sold in Spain in order to pay for the cost of the *Conquista*; reference is made to 500 Indians of Hispaniola who Cristobál Colón sent to Sevilla in four boats which left Isabela, February 24, 1495. In 1499, Bartholomew, the brother of Cristobál, sent 300 Indians to the port of Cadiz. In 1498, in returning to Hispaniola on his third trip, the Discoverer wrote to the Catholic Kings in these words: "From here it is possible, in the name of the Holy Trinity, to send as many slaves as one can sell..."⁷⁴

⁷² Deive, *La Esclavitud del Negro en Santo Domingo*, Vol. 1, (1980), p. XIV. Ramón Antonio Veras, *Inmigración, Haitianos, Esclavitud* (1983), pp. 91-96; Moya Pons, *El Batey...* (1986), pp. 194-199. Pons and the other researchers who contributed to the book do not describe the situation as slavery. The authors write: "The Haitian worker in the Dominican sugar cane industry is not a slave or lives in conditions similar to the slave systems of the past centuries of the New World, but his conditions of life could be much worse than that of a slave. The defense of this claim is very simple and is based in the same economy of the modern plantation systems that function with free salaried work" (p. 197). Moya Pons uses the term "super-exploitation" (*super-explotación*) (p. 198). American Watch, "Half Measures: Reform, Forced labor and the Dominican Sugar Industry," (1991). American Watch, US Committee for Refugees, and other human rights agencies primarily address home government and labor organizations calling for investigation and if necessary, boycott actions. See also, Juan Bosch, *Composición Social Dominicana* (1981), p. 11. Bienvenido Alvarez-Vega, "Apuntes sobre la Estructura de Poder en República Dominicana," as presented for *Consulta Sobre La Teología y la Práctica del Poder* (1983).

⁷³ Cristobál Colón in "Memorial de Antonio Torres," *Diario de Navegación y otros escritos* (1988), p. 242. Las Casas, *History of the Indies*, Book 1, No.85 (1971), p. 47.

⁷⁴ Bosch, *op. cit.*, p. 14.

The institutionalization of the slave trade to Spain permitted the Spanish to keep their own slaves. The *encomienda* system was established, parcels of land were given to the Spanish, together with Indian-Americans, to work the land.⁷⁵ The original mandate was to pay the Indian-Americans for their work but soon the *encomiendas* became an institution of slavery.⁷⁶

By the 1520's, sugar cane plantations were in full operation. A small plantation required about 20 workers, while a medium sized one, required 50.⁷⁷ When new frontiers opened up in Mexico and South America, Hispaniola began to lose its Spanish inhabitants and the sugar cane industry slowed down considerably. Cattle farming was replaced or was combined with some of the sugar cane operations. Manual laborers were needed to keep the colony producing.⁷⁸

The harsh treatment of and the disappearance of the Indian-American population caused alarm among some of the religious and governing leaders. Antón de Montesinos and Bartolomé de Las Casas, both clergymen from the Dominican Order, were among the first to speak against the abuses of the Indian-Americans.⁷⁹

The motivation to stop the abuse of the Indian-Americans was, in part, intended to preserve the colonial labor force. Indian-Americans had been used in the mines, as well as in newly developing plantations. It was argued by Las Casas that the African slave would be a better replacement for the Indian-American slave, though he later lamented this counsel.⁸⁰

Fifty Spanish and African born slaves were authorized by King Fernando to be shipped to Hispaniola in 1510. Thirty-six went.⁸¹ They were to work in the mines. The results were not encouraging, as the slaves died of illness and the harsh labor conditions.

The African slaves brought directly from Africa then replaced the Spanish born slaves and Indian-American slaves, not only in the mines, but especially on the plantations. In 1528, 4,000 slaves were sent by the Spanish to the Indies, including 1,400 to Hispaniola.⁸² The slave traffic was growing, but not without religious and government reservations.

Religious and government restrictions were placed on the direct trafficking of slaves from Africa to the Indies. Fear was expressed that the slaves were not baptized, catechized and members of the Roman Catholic Church. The Catholic kings gave instructions to Nicolás de Ovando in 1501 to concern himself with the evangelization of the Indians and the prevention of the immigration of non-Catholic persons, including non-Christian slaves.⁸³

The response of the clergymen and government officials to the plight of the Indian-Americans was too late. By the middle of the sixteenth century their population had disappeared in Hispaniola. They were replaced by the African-born and African-American slaves. The institution of slavery became a pillar for the colonial economic system.

⁷⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 15-16.

⁷⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 18.

⁷⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 24.

⁷⁸ Moya Pons, *Manual...*, pp. 35f.

⁷⁹ Las Casas recorded the sermon of Montesinos (ed., Juan Manuel Pérez) *¿Estos, No Son Hombres?* (1984), p. 38.

⁸⁰ Deive, *op. cit.*, pp. 60-61.

⁸¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 28-29.

⁸² *Ibid.*, p. 73.

⁸³ CODOIN, XXXI, 23, as cited in Deive, *op. cit.*, p. 20.

2.3.3.2. African-American Slavery

Slaves have been an integral part of the conquest and development of the Americas. It is commonly accepted that Colón brought several domestic African slaves to the New World on his second voyage in 1493.⁸⁴ While both African and Indians were enslaved, the African slaves outlasted their Indian counterparts.

The introduction of slavery was widely discussed in Spain. At the beginning of the 16th century both Church and State expressed their reservations about slave trafficking. By the 1520's, the Spanish authorities allowed for some significant exceptions.⁸⁵ King Carlos V negotiated Spain's debt with the non-Catholic German banking family, the Welsers. Permission was granted to the Welsers to import 4,000 slaves to the Indies, under the condition that they would not be resold without permission. The agreement was eventually violated by the buyers.⁸⁶

By 1543, Carlos V understood that the African-American population was continuing to increase, not only through officially permitted slavery but also via contraband trafficking. In 1543, he ordered the return to Spain of the African slaves. This order was revoked in 1550.⁸⁷

In 1580, Philippe II of Spain invaded Portugal and took over the lucrative slave trading posts in Western Africa. Meanwhile, the Dutch, English and French slave trade and mercantile activities put pressure on Hispaniola. The Englishman, John Hawkins, sought to do business on the northern coast, starting in 1562. In 1586, another Englishman, Francis Drake, invaded and plundered Santo Domingo. Also, English, Dutch and French buccaneers and filibusters patrolled the northern coast and inhabited the coast land.⁸⁸ Shortly after the Drake invasion, an epidemic on the island reportedly killed over one-half of the slave population.⁸⁹

The introduction and consolidation of African-American slavery on the island of Hispaniola was influenced also by the slave revolts and emergence of the Maroons. These were runaway slaves who grouped together, mostly in the marginal areas of Hispaniola, including the northern and western part of the island, later known as Haiti.⁹⁰

By 1606, the Spanish colonists de-populated the north coast and retreated to the southern region of Santo Domingo. Afterwards, the French controlled western part of

⁸⁴ Deive, *op. cit.*, cites Ayala and Mellafe, among others, pp. 18-20.

⁸⁵ According to Silvio Torres Saillant, in 1501, King Ferdinand and Queen Isabella appointed Fray Nicolas de Ovando governor of Santo Domingo, authorizing him to bring "black slaves" to their colony. "Tribulations of blackness: stages in Dominican racial identity." *Latin American Perspectives*. May 1998. Vol. 25, No. 3., pp. 126-126

⁸⁶ Deive, *op. cit.*, pp. 83-84.

⁸⁷ Cipriano de Utrera, *Santo Domingo: dilucidaciones históricas*, Vol. 2 (1978), p. 12.

⁸⁸ Moya Pons, *Manual...*, pp. 46f.

⁸⁹ Bosch, *op. cit.*, pp. 38-39.

⁹⁰ African-American Maroons, called *cimarrones* in Spanish, form an important non *mulatto*-African class, since they did not generally live with the Spanish and French colonists. *Cimarrón* in Old Spanish refers to domestic animals that have gone wild, hence the transfer to escaped slaves. The term was used in relationship to escaped slaves who lived in the hidden bush areas of Haiti. Maroon, this word probably has nothing to do with *cimarrón*, in English it refers to being stranded on an island or being in isolation.

Hispaniola continued to grow. This growth was stimulated by the buccaneer trade on the north coast and through the import of African slaves.⁹¹

In 1697, the Peace of Rijswijk treaty recognized French control over modern day Haiti. Former buccaneers and filibusters, along with French colonists, began to develop plantations, especially ones dedicated to sugar. By 1701, there were 35 sugar cane plantations and 25 more under construction. The growing industry would require manual labor in which African descendants were used.⁹²

The numbers of imported slaves from Africa rose dramatically in the French colony of Haiti. The numbers reported in 1681 were 2,000 slaves. By 1787, 40,000 slaves were reported to have been imported to the French colony. By 1794, when the revolution for independence began, estimates as to how many imported slaves were in the French colony range from 864,000 to slightly less than 900,000.⁹³ Many slaves died during the voyage from Africa to Hispaniola and others perished upon arrival.⁹⁴

The Haitian revolution was a slave revolt. In August of 1791, a meeting in Bois Cayman led to a revolt in seven other plantations. Northern Haiti was captured by the ex-slaves, and would remain under their control under a variety of leaders and international affiliations. The *mulattos*, the offspring of French colonists and Africans, controlled the western and southern part of the Haitian colony.

Meanwhile, by 1792, France was at war in Europe. The pro-emancipation forces in the colony would join the Spanish and English against the French. France started to concede some freedoms to the slaves.

The 1795 Treaty of Basilea conceded all of Hispaniola to France. Haitian leaders such as Toussaint L' Ouverture co-operated with the French again. This cooperation was short lived because Toussaint took over Haiti at the turn of the century. By 1801, he was in control of the whole island. He announced that slavery was abolished and permission was given to import more Africans as free workers.⁹⁵

The French returned to Haiti in 1802. Toussaint was arrested, deported to France and died there in April, 1803. Tens of thousands of French colonists and Haitian revolutionaries died in the battles between the French and Haitians. The French were defeated by Jean Jacques Dessalines at the end of 1803. On January 1, 1804, Haiti was declared a republic. However, the colonial war had virtually destroyed the colonial infrastructure. Haiti would have to start rebuilding its society from its agricultural base.⁹⁶

Slavery was reinstated in the Spanish colony in 1802. When Dessalines invaded Santo Domingo, he again abolished slavery. Dessalines was later defeated and slavery once again was reinstated by the Dominicans. When Haiti conquered the whole island in 1822

⁹¹ Bosch, *op. cit.*, p. 47. Bosch traces the establishment of Haiti to the French buccaneer trade. Yet, on p. 63, he broadens that and traces the origins of Haiti to the French pirates and inhabitants. Buccaneers were pirates. But their name probably came from the "buccan," processed smoked meat from wild domestic animals on Haiti.

⁹² Deive, *op. cit.*, p. 134.

⁹³ José Franco, *Historia de la Revolución de Haití* (1971), p. 126. See Bosch, pp. 38f for 16th century and p. 114 for 18th century estimates as to how many imported slaves were in the French colony. These range from 864,000 (George Eaton Simpson, *op.cit.*, p.4) to slightly less than 900,000 (Alfred Métraux, *op.cit.*, p.8).

⁹⁴ Métraux, *op. cit.*

⁹⁵ Robert Debs and Nancy Gordon Heintz, *Written in Blood: The Story of the Haitian People, 1492 - 1971* (1978), p. 94.

⁹⁶ Bosch, *op. cit.*, p. 121; Moya Pons, *op. cit.*, pp. 198f.

slavery was finally abolished by Jean Pierre Boyer.⁹⁷ In the establishment of the new Dominican Republic in 1844, slavery was constitutionally outlawed, thereby ending almost three and one half centuries of governmental sanctioned servitude of Indians and Africans. However, the conditions for slavery continued in the form of inexpensive agricultural labor.

2.3.3.3. Imported Haitian Labor

Emancipation in both Haiti and the Dominican Republic set the slaves free and a new working arrangement had to be established. Small landowners worked their own land and also worked for the larger land owners.⁹⁸ It is against this background that a new system of servitude developed. Prominent to our understanding is the development of oligarchies in the history of the new formed Dominican Republic. Bernardo Vega, a Dominican historian, notes:

We have to be aware that there was a colonial oligarchy that began to disappear around 1822 as a result of the Haitian invasion. However, another oligarchy was installed. It consisted of timber owners, tobacco growers, large landowners, importers and exploiters.⁹⁹

The Dominican oligarchy became aligned with North American interests around the turn of the twentieth century. The USA interests included the repayment of outstanding international debts and the need to buy sugar. The USA invaded the Dominican Republic in 1916 and stayed until 1924, citing the unpaid debts to the United States as their reason for taking over the country.

The sugar industry flourished as a non-government industry, covering over two million *tareas* of land.¹⁰⁰ Manual laborers were needed for the growing sugar cane industry. The number of Haitian laborers in the Dominican Republic increased from 900 in 1919-1920 to 10,000 in 1925-1926.¹⁰¹ The increased presence of Haitian rural workers was halted with the infamous Haitian massacre ordered by the Dominican President Rafael Trujillo. Between 10,000 and 35,000 Haitians living near the Haitian-Dominican border were reported to have been killed in 1937.¹⁰²

By 1952-1953, the influx of Haitians began again. Immigration records indicate that 16,500 entered the Dominican Republic in that period of time. Formal agreements between the Dominican and Haitian dictatorships were arranged to secure sufficient Haitian laborers for the sugar cane industry. The Dominican government agreed to pay the Haitian government for the workers.

⁹⁷ Bosch, *op. cit.*, pp. 143-144.

⁹⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 148.

⁹⁹ Vega, *op. cit.*, p. 4. Bosch calls the new oligarchy, formed by ruling politicians, a small bourgeoisie who were in competition with the another bourgeoisie group, the tobacco farmers. The later group dominated, but in siding with the Spanish takeover, lost their position when nationalization returned, pp. 163f. Bosch divides the bourgeoisie into high, medium and low.

¹⁰⁰ Moya Pons, *Manual...*, p. 494.

¹⁰¹ José Castillo, *La Inmigración de Braceros Azucareros en la República Dominicana* (1978), p. 46.

¹⁰² Juan Manuel García, *La Matanza de los Haitianos. Genocidio de Trujillo, 1937* (1983), p. 15. Other estimates include: Moya Pons - 18,000; Jean Price Mars - 12,136; Joaquín Balaguer - 17,000. An extensive list of estimates is given by Bernardo Vega, *Trujillo y Haití* (1988), pp. 385-387.

After the Second World War, Trujillo consolidated the Dominican sugar industry under his rule. In 1961, the Consejo Estatal de Azucar (CEA: State Sugar Council), as well as many other large industries, were taken over by the Dominican government. This converted the state into what Bienvenido Vega calls a "capitalistic state".¹⁰³ The state, as the owner of the majority of the sugar cane industry in the country, became the patron or boss of the sugar cane cutters. The state became, along with several private sugar cane industries, an exporter of sugar. This hegemony continued after the assassination of Trujillo. The Dominican government took over most of Trujillo's vast holdings, including CEA.¹⁰⁴

Several events give an indication that both the Dominican and Haitian government have failed to protect the Haitian immigrant in the Dominican Republic.

1. The massacre of tens of thousands of Haitian laborers and family members close to the Dominican-Haitian border in 1937 was never thoroughly investigated by the Dominican and Haitian governments.
2. The inter-government agreements between the Dominican government and the Duvalier dictators to contract Haitian laborers to work in the Dominican Republic under sub-standard labor conditions involved payment by the Dominican government to the Haitian government.
3. During the late 1980's and 1990's the Dominican government promoted mass deportations of Haitian workers who were actually supposed to be employed by the government's sugar cane industry. The Dominican government did not renew Haitian documentation even though they were willfully employing the Haitians during their state of illegality imposed by the government.
4. The Dominican government has shown itself to be unwilling to address the serious labor, migration and social issues as raised by the United Nations and interested NGO's who are calling for the abolition of forced labor and sub standard working condition.

As in colonial days when slavery was legal, the post-colonial Dominican Republic retained the dominant socio-economic structure that resulted in marginal peoples doing undesirable manual labor. By the early 1990's, the system of servile labor, or modern slavery, continued to be entrenched in the Dominican Republic.

2.3.4. Haitian Sugar Cane Cutter's Identity

The understanding of the Haitian immigrant identity in the Dominican Republic is a complex matter. Section 2.3.4.1. will document the social and legal identity of the Haitian immigrant while section 2.3.4.1. will observe the communal structures. Section 2.3.4.3. will conclude with a summary of the Haitian immigrant's socio-economic needs.

¹⁰³ Bienvenido Alvarez-Vega, "Apuntes sobre la Estructura de Poder en República Dominicana," (1983).
¹⁰⁴ Moya Pons (ed), *El Batey...*, p. 186, cites the government list of imported short term workers from 1966-1984. The numbers range between 10,000 (1967-68) to 23,000 (1983-1984). The legal nature of the contracts that the Dominican government signed with the Haitian Duvalier's during the 70's and 80's, have been a matter of dispute. Even if the contracts were not legal, according to international and labor laws, a faithful fulfilling of the contracts would have indicated the moral intent of the signers.

The most extensive contemporary study completed on the socio-economic situation of the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic was edited by the Dominican historian, Frank Moya Pons: *El Batey. Estudio Socioeconómico de los bateyes del Consejo Estatal del Azúcar*.¹⁰⁵ It is not the intention of this present study to repeat what has already been documented by Moya Pons and others. The work of Moya Pons will serve as a main source to present contemporary data to establish the afore-mentioned observation that the Dominican government and the sugar cane industry is a hegemony that combines to create a servile system of manual labor for the Haitian immigrant.

Another useful investigation is presented by the American anthropologist, Dr. Martin Murphy.¹⁰⁶ This scholar examines the flow of Haitian immigrants back and forth from Haiti to the Dominican Republic. He identifies the reasons why Haitians want to leave Haiti (the "push factor") and why they are drawn to the Dominican Republic (the "pull factor"). The present author, in *Leadership Training Among Marginal Peoples*,¹⁰⁷ adds another dimension, namely, the "put factor." This factor refers to the government's sugar cane industry efforts to keep a certain number of cheap manual laborers, combined with the desire of the workers to stay in the Dominican Republic. While studying these factors concerning the Haitian presence in the Dominican Republic, we turn to further understand the legal and social identification of Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic. Section 2.3.4.1. will identify the legal status of the Haitian immigrants, Section 2.3.4.2. will analyze the Haitian's communal structures and Section 2.3.4.3. will further elaborate on the Haitian immigrant's socio-economic conditions.

2.3.4.1. Identification of the Haitian Immigrants

The exact number of Haitian immigrants living in the Dominican Republic is not documented. The demographic statistics gathered by Moya Pons in *El Batey* are not based on original research; they are supplied by the government.¹⁰⁸ The government reports importing between 10,000 and 23,000 Haitians each year since 1966. The official government statistics account for 17,667 Haitians who mostly stay in 12 sugar cane *ingenios* (industries). These statistics cover 172 of the 223 *bateyes* reported by the government. This does not include the large private companies, which at least doubles the number of *bateyes*.

Hegeman's previous demographic study identified approximately 197,952 Haitians living in the sugar cane plantations and 57,800 residing in urban centers in 1983. The Dominican government does not legally recognize as Dominicans those Haitian children born in the Dominican Republic.¹⁰⁹

Except for government officials and upper class Haitians residing in the Dominican Republic, the immigrant status of the Haitian sugar cane cutter is functionally that of an

¹⁰⁵ Moya Pons, *El Batey...* (1986).

¹⁰⁶ Martin Murphy, "The 'Push' Factors of Haitian Migration to the Dominican Sugar Industry and the Characteristics of the Immigrants" (1983).

¹⁰⁷ Neal Hegeman, *Leadership Training Among Marginal Peoples* (1985).

¹⁰⁸ Moya Pons, *El Batey...*, pp. 400f. Even though Dominicans are capable of registering voters with professional accuracy and speed, as well as conduct accurate surveys on the Dominican population, it has hesitated to conduct a responsible demographic study of the Haitian immigrants in the country. Even the professional sociologists under the direction of Moya Pons do not conduct a realistic demographic count

¹⁰⁹ Neal Hegeman, *Church Ministry Among Marginal Peoples* (1985), p. 214

illegal alien. Even though sugar cane company documents and government papers are granted, during times of deportation, the military and government unilaterally suspend legal rights and deport people at will.¹¹⁰

The reason for this illegal condition of the Haitian immigrant is basically three fold. First, the Haitian government has not been able to protect and provide for legal assistance to the tens of thousands of Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic. There have been particular cases where diplomatic intervention was exercised, but the Haitian government has traditionally been limited in its effectiveness. Second, the Dominican government encourages illegality since this discourages the social mobilization of the Haitian immigrant out of the *bateyes* and into the Dominican cities. Illegal Haitian immigrants will more readily work in the sugar cane fields than legal Haitian immigrants who seek to improve their economic condition by working in higher paying jobs. Third, the consumers of the sugar, mostly in Europe and North America, benefit from low prices created by inexpensive labor. The consumers have been slow to respond to the violation of human rights and labor abuses. Human rights groups such as American Watch have documented many human rights abuses. Yet, foreign governments, such as the American and Canadian governments, have been hesitant to criticize and intervene in international migration issues of political and economic friends on the island of Hispaniola.

Men, women and children have a different status according to work situations, place of birth and skin color. During times of deportation, the family will often be split up, with the children staying in the Dominican Republic since they were born there.¹¹¹ Yet, for a proper identification of the alien status of the Haitian immigrants, at least six main categories of social status can be identified among the Haitian community in the Dominican Republic. These include:

1. the short term worker (*bracero*), spouse and children;
2. the illegal worker (*ambasfil*) and family members;
3. legal immigrants and family members;
4. residents and family members;
5. political refugees and family members; and
6. the working elderly, the non-working elderly and the handicapped.¹¹²

The *bracero* is a short-term worker who comes from Haiti to the Dominican Republic during the sugar cane season. CEA officials and immigration officer's report in the 1970's to 90's to be between 10,000 and 23,000 entrances each season.¹¹³ The short-term worker is not usually accompanied by a spouse or their children. If he stays in the Dominican Republic, he tends to develop family relationships in the *batey*. It is not uncommon for a *bracero* to develop family relationships on both sides of the border. Until recently, the *bracero* was supplied with a working document identifying his name and place of work. The *carnets* (documents) were given out by the sugar cane company officials.

¹¹⁰ The author interviewed persons whose legal papers were ripped up during the 1989 and 1991 deportations.

¹¹¹ Hegeman, *Church Ministry...*, p. 214.

¹¹² *Ibid.*

¹¹³ Moya Pons, *El Batey...*, p. 186.

The *ambasfil* (under the wire) worker comes on his own accord and decides to stay. Pons reported that in 1983, 31.1% of such Haitians interviewed had lived 21 or more years in the Dominican Republic and 15% had lived there less than 2 years.¹¹⁴

A limited number of Haitians in the Dominican Republic have legal documentation which is recognized and guaranteed by the Dominican government. A more significant number of Haitians have illegally acquired Dominican legal papers. The fabrication of illegal resident's permits is common in the Dominican Republic.

A handful of diplomats and government related Haitians have legally processed documents. Due to the bureaucratic complications and high costs, these channels are not available for the Haitian sugar cane cutters and urban manual worker.

A small number of Haitians have found political refuge in the Dominican Republic. Usually, such a status is worked out in conjunction with the staff of the United Nations during times of political unrest. The United Nations works in conjunction with the Dominican government in order to determine whether an applicant meets the conditions for being a political refugee.

The elderly constitute a class on their own. Those who work in the cane fields continue to do so at an advanced age. A token number of pensions were supplied by CEA but the elderly have difficulties collecting the stipends. CEA intermediaries are known to collect the pensions for themselves. The elderly, who cannot work, as well as the handicapped, live by the mercy of a neighbor or family member.

Given the illegal status, as mentioned above, what motivates the Haitian to go to the Dominican Republic? Murphy writes:

...from the *ambasfil* study population it appears that these workers are primarily the "extra" son of peasant families who as a response to population pressure on scarce family resources and the lack of employment opportunities in Haiti, are forced to work in the Dominican Republic... There appears to be in some families more mouths to feed than hands needed to till the soil. Therefore, some of the sons must leave the family plot. These members ... are those who could not find, or chose, non-family farm employment.¹¹⁵

Despite the poor working conditions and illegal status in the Dominican Republic, there is still a need for Haitian workers in the Dominican agricultural economy. This applies to not only the sugar cane fields but also for farms producing coffee, pineapple, cocoa, rice and other agricultural projects.

Demographic factors also contribute to the eastward flow of Haitians across the Dominican border. Over 80% of the Haitian population lives in rural areas and 40% are under 15 years old. Educational opportunities are limited. Industry and employment opportunities are lacking. Haiti claims a 90% plus illiteracy rate, while in the *bateyes*, the surveys by ALFALIT Dominicana, a Dominican literacy training agency, shows less than 45% literacy among Dominicans and Haitians in the Dominican Republic in the year 1983. The Dominican Republic offers elementary education from grades 1-5. Legal papers are not required for children attending these grades.¹¹⁶

¹¹⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 433.

¹¹⁵ Murphy, "Push Factors," p. 67.

¹¹⁶ Gaspar Geisteffer, "General Survey of Communities with a Christian Reformed Church," (1983).

Another factor contributing to migration is health care. Health care is minimal in Haiti, whereby most of the medical services are located in the larger urban areas. The situation in the Dominican Republic is more attractive. Even though the public hospitals of the Dominican Republic lack medical equipment and medicines, they are available for emergencies and maternal care. Infant mortality is high among the Haitian immigrants. Intestinal, venereal and lung diseases cause many deaths. In the early 1980's, many young Haitians passed away of what was thought to be tuberculosis, which was later discovered to be related to AIDs.¹¹⁷

Between 1952 and 1991, the Dominican and Haitian governments mutually agreed to three five year labor contracts, in which the Dominican government would pay the Haitian government to supply thousands of short term sugar cane cutters for Dominican industries. The legality of the inter-governmental contracts has been challenged by national and international labor unions. However, the contracts, whether legitimate or not, have been the only written standards. The use of contracts was unilaterally suspended by the Balaguer government near the end of the 1980's.

During the year 1990, the Dominican government stopped issuing Haitians legal working and immigration papers. Even though the Haitians were working for a government institution, namely the CEA, they were not allowed to renew their documents. By spring 1991, after a year of not renewing the annual documents, the Dominican government started to systematically deport Haitians, especially those living in urban zones and non-sugar cane agricultural areas.

The deportation of illegal immigrants is a common procedure found also in many other countries. However, for government institutions to first employ illegal residents as sugar cane workers for a number of years and then continue to systematically deprive them of a minimal legal status and instill the fear of military deportation is nothing short of exploitation.

Such tactics have similarities to the plantation societies in the colonial era. Sociologist George Beckert, writes in *Persistent Poverty*:

Basically, the dominant class of decision makers in plantation society has their self-interest at heart and control the system so as to insure continuously this self-interest. On the other hand, the dispossessed majority of people do not like their condition and are a potential threat to the destruction of the system...our conclusion...is that the plantation system generates its own self-perpetuation by effectively containing internal threats... Consequently, a dynamic equilibrium of underdevelopment is endemic in plantation economy.¹¹⁸

Aside from the local contextual considerations it is important to understand the international political context and how that contributes to the servitude of the Haitian immigrant. The perpetuation of the sugar cane economy and labor system requires avoiding international economic, human rights, labor and political intervention and sanctions. This was masterfully carried out by the Dominican president, Joaquín Balaguer during the late 1980's and early 1990's. When the first democratically elected Haitian president, Jean Bertrand Aristide, was voted into office in 1991, he publicly denounced the slave-like conditions of

¹¹⁷ Moya Pons, *El Batey...*, pp. 62-63; 66-67; 187-188; 314-315.

¹¹⁸ George Beckford, *Persistent Poverty* (1972), pp. 212-213.

the Haitian sugar cane cutters in the Dominican Republic. President Balaguer responded by initiating mass deportations of the older Haitian generation. Internal pressures within Haiti led to the September, 1991, coup of President Jean Bertrand Aristide, leading to his exile to the USA. Mass deportation was then temporarily halted by the Dominican authorities. During his exile, President Aristide remained critical, both of the USA foreign policy towards Haitian boat people as well as toward the Dominican government's dealing with the Haitian immigrants. Due to the USA foreign policy of not accepting Haitian boat people, the USA could not go on to ask the Dominican government to accept Haitian refugees. The Dominican government could therefore continue unheeded to deport or import Haitian workers as they pleased.

After the coup to rid Aristide, the USA imposed an embargo on Haiti in protest of the conduct of the military government. Contraband trade flowed across the long border between the Dominican Republic and Haiti. Part of the contraband traffic was the bringing in of new Haitian sugar workers, many of whom had previously been deported.¹¹⁹

In the days of colonial slavery, slave owners had to treat their slaves with a certain amount of self-interest. A dead or sick slave had no economic worth. A healthy slave was a productive slave. The status of the current Haitian sugar cane cutter is worth less than his ancestral slaves. If he were to die or become sick, he could easily be replaced by one of the thousands of Haitian *braceros* who could be brought over for a small payment to a *buscon*.¹²⁰ In the *El Batey...* the following is noted:

First of all, the nineteenth century African slaves sold in the Caribbean cost more in nominal and real terms than the \$118.42 US dollars which is paid to the Haitian government in order to "cover the administrative costs for securing" each *bracero*, or the \$5.00 to \$40.00 Dominican pesos which they pay the contractors for manual labor and the soldiers for the *ambasfil* workers. Therefore, the contemporary employer of Haitian agriculture workers, in comparison with his former counterpart, the owner of slaves, has a relatively small investment on his hands. Under the present system, the worker is expendable; if he dies, becomes sick or becomes too old for work, he is replaced for as little as \$5.00 Dominican pesos.¹²¹

This assessment rounds off our understanding of the socio-economic conditions of the Haitian immigrant. Where then, does a Haitian immigrant turn for a sense of personal dignity and worth? The Haitian immigrants usually form their own community structures, as seen in the family, living in the *batey* and associating with friends. Some seek quick comfort in the common personal and communal vices. Others turn to traditional religion to find meaning and consolation. For a significant minority solace is found in the Christian message and Church community. In the following Section attention will be given to identifying the Haitian immigrant's communal structures.

¹¹⁹ German Reyes, "Traen haitianos para la zafra," *Hoy* (November 25, 1992), p. 1. The day by day Dominican newspaper articles describing the contra banding of clothing, food, gasoline, oil and other merchandise are found in *Misiología Dominicana-Haitiana*, Vol. 2 (1991).

¹²⁰ A *buscón* is a recruiter, usually a Haitian with sugar cane cutting experience in the Dominican Republic.

¹²¹ Moya Pons, *El Batey...*, p. 197. The Dominican peso in 1986 was worth about 15 cents USA.

2.3.4.2. Identification of the Haitian Immigrants' Communal Structures

Most of the Haitians cutting sugar cane live in a *batey*. The *batey* is the main community dwelling of the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic. However, it is not the only place where Haitian will live. Haitians generally move out of the *batey* into neighboring Dominican villages and cities. Haitians will generally live on the outskirts of the cities in homes built by them. Middle class and upper class Haitians have moved directly into more affluent areas of the capital city, Santo Domingo and other large urban centers.

The center of the Haitian communal structure is the family. As noted previously, the traditional family structure is rooted in the Haitian rural culture. Among the Haitian immigrants in the *bateyes*, the family is far weaker than found in Haiti. Birth rates of Haitian in the Dominican Republic are reported to be below two children per couple.¹²² Haitians living in multiple families, in Haiti and the Dominican Republic, are more common. More than 50% of the Haitians in the Dominican Republic live in common union rather than in legal marriage.

The Dominican government or CEA allow Haitian family members to secretly cross the Dominican border and to accompany the adult male workers to the sugar cane *bateyes*. This is necessary to keep the Haitian workers "put," especially during the off season. It is reported in *El Batey...*:

...the actual buyers of Haitian manual labor are not obligated to pay the cost of reproduction of the manual labor; the Haitian economy absorbs this cost. The Dominican sugar cane industry rarely employs female or child manual labor and pay such low salaries to the workers that the biological and social reproduction becomes almost impossible as evident in the extra-ordinary low birth rates among the *ambasfil* population on the plantations.¹²³

Communal activities in the *batey* are closely connected with near-by markets and urban centers. There is a constant business inter-relationship between the *batey* and nearby cities. Haitians who have access to Dominican gardens or who have rented their own garden space will grow and sell their produce. Not all Haitians have access to garden space. The *El Batey...* study reports:

The Dominican producers of sugar actually only maintain the productive worker during those times when his labor is necessary. Using this system, under which 97.5 % of the Haitian informants used in this study live, the plantation only pays the worker when he works, which is eloquently stated by the workers as: "If you don't cut, you don't eat." In the off-season the industry employs less than 50% of the Haitian manual labor used in the harvest, the other workers either having been returned, as is the case of the *bracero*, or he has to look for employment in other agricultural sectors during this period of five to seven months. In the old slave plantations, the slave owner was forced to maintain his population of slaves during this period of time, one

¹²² Moya Pons, *El Batey...*, pp. 211-212.

¹²³ *Ibid.*

of the reasons for which in certain countries during the last century that some owners asked for the transition from slavery to a labor contract system and salary.¹²⁴

Another community activity is related to sports and recreation. Sport activities do not play a large role in the lives of the Haitian immigrants. Soccer is the national sport in Haiti, while baseball is popular in the Dominican Republic. Very few first generation Haitians have integrated into the national Dominican sport scene.

The Haitian communal structure is very mobile due to the illegal and migrant status of the sugar cane cutter. The ethnic, family, religious and social status is a more constant factor than the quality of life and labor. The Christian church plays a major role in improving the quality of life.

2.3.4.3. Socio-Economic Conditions

The socio-economic conditions of the Haitian immigrant sugar cane cutter continues to deteriorate. The personal and communal quest for normalcy of life has been frustrated for many generations. The battle against illegality, illiteracy, illnesses and illegitimacy is being waged by churches and NGOs but the war has not been won.

The Haitian government continues to be unstable and unable to guarantee basic legal rights to their citizens at home and abroad. Legal immigration documentation and labor contracts are basic to the Haitian immigrant's well being in the Dominican Republic. Due to the inability of the Haitian government to effectively secure immigration and labor rights for the immigrants, the status quo of exploitation will continue.

Increased privatization of the Dominican sugar cane plantations has brought both decreased labor standards among some companies, as well as better working conditions in others. The Romana Central Company has the reputation of granting better housing, salaries, and working conditions to their sugar cane workers. The other private company, Casa Vicini, operating in the San Pedro de Macoris region, has the worst living conditions. The largest employer of sugar cane workers continues to be the government owned CEA.

Demographic mobility out of the sugar cane economy is seen among the descendants of the cane cutters. Haitian immigrant children are known to be registered as Dominicans and living in the larger urban centers. Their presence is especially noticeable in the construction and agriculture trades.

Frequent deportations of Haitian immigrants outside of the sugar cane zones are conducted by the military, especially since the overthrow of the dictator governments in Haiti. The democratically elected leaders have been more outspoken about the Dominican treatment of the Haitian immigrant than their political predecessors.

Amid the unstable socio-political conditions in Haiti, the demand for sugar cane cutters, the patterns of immigrant mobilization and the formation of the unstable Haitian immigrant community there exist the need for religious expression. Section 2.4. is dedicated to studying the three main religious expressions as found among the Haitian immigrants: Voodooism, Roman Catholicism and Protestantism. Other religious movements will be mentioned but due to their small representation, they will not be studied.

¹²⁴ *Ibid.*

2.4. Religious Traditions

The religious context of the Haitian immigrant in the Dominican Republic includes the transplant of tenets of African traditional religions, as well as the introduction of Roman Catholicism, Protestantism and other religious movements among the Haitian immigrants. Section 2.4.1. will review the basic tenets of African spiritism as expressed in Voodoo. Section 2.4.2. gives an introduction to the Roman Catholic influence among the Haitian immigrants. Section 2.4.3. presents the context of Protestantism among the Haitian immigrants. Section 2.4.4. identifies some of the new religious movements found in the Haitian immigrant community.

2.4.1. Voodoo

The essential characteristic of Voodoo is the practice of spirit possession. Members and leaders are possessed by and communicate with supernatural spirits. The practice of possessions and the ceremonies surrounding such practices can be traced back to the West African serpent cult of Dahomey.¹²⁵

Voodooism came with the African slaves when they first arrived in Hispaniola. Voodooism became an expression of cultural and religious identity for the African-Caribbean people. Meetings were held during the evenings in order to avoid Roman Catholic clerical or colonist's detection. Eventually, when religious and colonial authorities could not prevent Voodoo practice, it was not only tolerated, but Voodoo was syncretized into Roman Catholic religious symbolisms. Voodoo continues its symbiotic relationship with the RCC in Hispaniola until the present day.

At the end of the eighteenth century, Voodooism served as a unifying force in the slave's quest for independence in Haiti. Voodoo priests and rites were associated with the freedom movement. Voodoo came to represent the non-colonial religion.¹²⁶

Voodoo is an oral religion that uses ceremonial rites. Voodoo does not follow a written liturgy. Still, its beliefs can be observed and described. Anthropologist J.G. Leyburn has summarized the basic tenets of the typical Voodoo believers as follows:

I believe in scores of gods and spirits, guardians of earth and sky, and of all things visible and invisible; I believe that these *vodun* (who are called *loa*) are potent, although less majestic than *le bon Dieu* of the Christians; that some of them came with our ancestors from our former home in Africa, while others we have learned

¹²⁵ Alfred Métraux, *Voodoo in Haiti*, describes the Roman Catholic and African spiritistic syncretism. See also Marcus Bach, *Strange Altars* (1952). For a thorough treatment on syncretism, see William Madsen, *Christo-Paganism: A Study of Mexican Religious Syncretism* (1957). The word "voodoo" is derived from a West African (Dahomean) word meaning "god" or "spirit." Leyburn uses a more technical term, *vodun* while Rodman speaks of *voudou*. See also J.G. Leyburn, *The Haitian People* (1941), p. 143 and Selder Rodman, *Haiti: The Black Republic* (1954), p. 66. George Simpson, in *Black Religions in the New World* (1978), p. 14, calls Voodoo a neo-African cult. Voodoo is best described as a folk religion (Rodman, p. 66).

¹²⁶ The first three Haitian black rulers sought to suppress Voodooism (1800-1815). Later, when the government severed ties with the RCC, Voodooism became more acceptable. By the time the church-state Concordat of 1860 was signed, Voodooism had established itself as the folk religion of Haiti, Hegeman, *Church Ministry...*, p. 84.

about in our Haitian fatherland; that these *loa* have power to possess us, their worshipers, informing us by inspiration of their need and desires, which we must faithfully satisfy; that these *loa*, like us, are capable of good and evil, gentleness and anger, mercy and revenge.

I believe in the efficacy of sacrifice; in the pleasure of living; in respect due to twins; in the cult of the dead, who may return to our abodes; in the dance through which we may be mounted by our *loa*; in the possibility of interfering with the normal flow of events by means of magic; in the efficacy of charms and spells; and in the Holy Catholic Church.¹²⁷

Voodooism crosses ethnic borders under other names. The Dominican Republic calls it *Gaga*. When ICRRD pastors speak of Voodooism, as practiced in conjunction with the Dominican population, they also refer to it as *Gaga*. It is the author's observation that *Gaga* does not play as central and dominant role in Haitian immigrant society as Voodoo does in Haiti.¹²⁸

There are a variety of sociological reasons for the existence of Voodoo. These reasons are related to areas of need such as literacy, health, community, identity and religious expression.

As previously mentioned Voodooism is an oral tradition and thus does not require literacy on the part of the leaders and members. In a society predominantly illiterate, the majority of the population can therefore readily participate in religious activities based on oral tradition.

Voodooism provides accessible and low cost alternatives to the struggle with illnesses. Medicines, doctors and hospitals are not readily available, especially in Haiti. The Voodoo priest (*hougan*), priestess (*mambo*), sorcerer-magician (*bocor*), or the general practitioner (*caplatic*) appeals to the spirit world for solutions at lower cost and with higher accessibility than modern medicine.

Voodoo is indigenous to the Haitian immigrant's culture. Unlike Roman Catholicism, Protestantism and sectarian religions like the Mormons and Jehovah Witnesses, Voodoo is indigenous to the African-Caribbean heritage.

Persons with spiritistic experiences receive immediate acceptance into the Haitian immigrant Voodoo community by being able to contact the spirit world. Voodoo practitioners are known to travel all across Hispaniola in order to exercise their powers. This is especially true during the Christian holidays when their ceremonies are exhibited publicly.

Voodoo spirituality is immediate as well as continuous. Once contact with the *loa* has been made, the *loa* becomes a protector and guardian. Contact with the *loa* can be maintained in communal ceremonies or in private.

The Haitian immigrant culture, as seen in the sugar cane *bateyes*, is influenced by the sight, sounds and beliefs of Voodoo. It is not unusual to see Voodoo practitioners participate in funeral processions going to the cemeteries. During the evenings one hears the playing of the bongo drums as groups of Haitians are seeking the *loa*. Adults and children

¹²⁷ Leyburn, op. cit., p.145. A more detailed description written by the author is found in Hegeman, op. cit., pp. 50-53.

¹²⁸ June Rosenberg, *El Gaga: Religión y Sociedad de un Culto Dominicano* (1979). Due to the mixing of Dominicans and Haitians in the sugar cane *bateyes*, the Haitian Voodoo is not uniformly accepted.

alike wear charms around their neck to ward of evil spirits. Voodoo is a visible part of the Haitian ethos.¹²⁹

2.4.2. Roman Catholicism

Roman Catholicism is the largest religious institution in both the Dominican Republic and Haiti. The RCC belief system is defined in its ecclesiastical creedal and papal tradition. The institutional structure evolves from its Roman headquarters to the regional and national Episcopal hierarchies. Its history in relationship to the Haitian immigrant will be analyzed in Chapter 3. This Section will only highlight a few important contextual factors in relationship to the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic.

The situation of the Roman Catholic Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic is distinct from that of the Roman Catholics in Haiti. In Haiti, the RCC has parishes among the Haitians. In the Dominican Republic, regular parishes are not established among the Haitians. Rather, the Haitian community is served by a special Haitian pastoral commission. The reason, as explained by Eduard Jean Batiste of the Haitian Pastoral Commission, is that Roman Catholicism has an official relationship with the Dominican government. Part of this relationship includes stipulation for the RCC to work with the Dominican population, including the poor. Haitian immigrants fall outside the Dominican government's jurisdiction. The international Catholic community, including Pope John Paul II, has urged the Dominican Catholic Church to pay more attention to the Haitian immigrants.¹³⁰

The majority of Haitians and Dominicans are nominally Roman Catholic. The Haitian majority is smaller due to the high number of Haitian Protestants. Nevertheless, the majority of babies in both countries are baptized and registered in the RCC.

The Roman Catholic registration begins at birth. In order for Haitian immigrants to receive legal papers for the birth certificate of their children, it is often necessary to receive the Roman Catholic baptism and registration. In the Dominican Republic, the RCC is recognized as the state religion and it is the only denomination whose ecclesiastical documentation has legal authority.

Roman Catholic sources consider that more than 85% of the Dominican citizens are registered as Roman Catholics. Regular attendees or practicing Catholics percentages are substantially lower.¹³¹

By the end of the 1990's there were virtually no Catholic worship centers in the Haitian *bateyes*. A handful of Haitian worshipping groups are associated with the Haitian Pastoral Commission. Haitian Catholics are, on the whole, expected to visit the regional Dominican parish church. Since the Roman Catholic Church is the Dominican state religion, spending Dominican money on buildings and social services for Haitians is not considered to be their responsibility.¹³²

Besides nominalism and social discrimination, religious syncretism plays an important part among the Haitian immigrants. Syncretism refers to the mixture of two or

¹²⁹ Hegeman, *op.cit.*, p. 219.

¹³⁰ Interview with Eduard Jean Batiste in September, 1988, in Santo Domingo at Pastoral Haitiana.

¹³¹ David Barrett, *World Christian Encyclopedia* (1982), p. 269.

¹³² Eduard Jean Batiste, *op. cit.*

more religious systems.¹³³ Roman Catholic doctrines and symbols are interchanged with Voodoo beliefs and practices. Voodoo and *Gaga* practitioners make unofficial or non-Roman Catholic sanctioned use of the Roman Catholic religious holidays, the names of the saints and borrow Roman Catholic religious terminology to conduct their festivities.¹³⁴

The RCC role among the Haitian immigrants is further explored in Chapter 4. In general terms, Roman Catholicism is to be recognized as the dominant religious structure in both the Dominican Republic and Haiti. Even though the Roman Catholic Church struggles with nominal membership, it remains the politically and cultural dominant force in Hispaniola.

2.4.3. Protestantism

In this section Protestantism, in its Dominican and Haitian context, will be introduced. Chapter 5 will provide an in-depth analysis of Protestantism in the Dominican Republic and its relationship to the Haitian immigrants.¹³⁵

The Protestant influence in Hispaniola during the sixteenth to the nineteenth century had more to do with English, French and Dutch pirating and contraband trading than with the establishment of churches. When Haiti became independent in 1804, an open door was given to North American ex-slaves to migrate there. Together with Methodist and Baptist missionaries, Protestant church planters and leaders came to Haiti shortly after independence. When Haiti invaded the Dominican Republic in 1822, the former North American population migrated to the northern coast of the Dominican Republic.

The twentieth century Baptist inroads into rural Haiti are very significant. Until the development of Pentecostalism, Protestantism was almost equivalent to being *Baptiste* (Baptist). The Baptists were not only conservative in their theology and congregational in their church organization. Congregationalism and local church autonomy served the Haitian immigrant community well. When the Haitian immigrants came to the Dominican Republic during the twentieth century, they would readily set up their own congregations and maintain the basic Christian beliefs.

The influx of Pentecostal and charismatic worship, especially during the later half of the twentieth century, radically changed the Haitian Protestant landscape. Pentecostalism encouraged greater participation of the church members in the worship services as well as in the task of evangelism and church leadership. The freedom of expression and vocation led to the formation of a variety of Pentecostal denominations. Due to the emphasis on the work of the Holy Spirit among the Pentecostals, spiritism would resurface. The reality of a syncretism between voodoo spiritism and Pentecostal practices were especially evident in spiritual possessions and healing rites.

The vast migration of Haitian sugar cane cutters to the Dominican Republic during the twentieth century weakened the Protestant ties to the distant home churches in Haiti. As early as the 1920's, Haitian Baptist missionaries were sent from Haiti to organize the Baptist

¹³³ Charles Taber and Tetsuneo Yamamori, *Christopaganism or Indigenous Christianity* (1975). Roman Catholic doctrines and symbols were interchanged with Voodoo beliefs and practices.

¹³⁴ Raymond Brinks, *The Formation of a Non-Formal Education Team* (1989), pp. 62f. explains the Haitian and Dominican historical factors leading to this syncretism. June Rosenberg, *El Gaga* (1979), p. 186.

¹³⁵ Eufemio Ricardo, "Directorio....," p.15. Samuel Escobar, "¿Qué significa ser Evangélico hoy?", *Misión*, Vol. 1, No. 1, p. 46. David Barrett, *op. cit.*, speaks of Catholic evangelicals. Eufemio Ricardo, "Chart SD 1," *Desde Lutero....* (1992), n.p.

churches in the Dominican Republic. Because this could not be financially sustained, independent churches with untrained and self-appointed leaders became the order of the day.

Limited cooperation exists between the established Dominican Protestant churches and the Haitian Protestant immigrant churches. The historical Protestant denominations, described in *CONPAS 1992* as "liturgical Protestants," such as the Episcopal Church, has established a Haitian pastoral committee to work with the immigrants.¹³⁶ Other major Protestant denominations, such as the Assemblies of God, Church of God, Dominican Evangelical Church, Methodist Church, Missionary Church and many larger Pentecostal churches, did not have Haitian congregations in the Dominican Republic prior to 1980. Smaller groupings like the Brethren (Templo Bíblico), World Evangelical Crusade, Evangelical Temples, First Baptist, Mennonite, Nazarenes, Missionary Baptist, and smaller Pentecostal groups served in the *bateyes* during the 1980's. The Adventists have very little involvement with Haitian immigrants. It was into this sociological and ecclesiastical context that the Christian Reformed Church entered in 1980.

Dominican Protestant churches as well as North American and European ministries have developed literacy training programs, health services, community development and formal education structures in order to meet the social needs of the Haitian immigrants and the Dominican poor. The Haitian denominational and para church ministry from Haiti to the Dominican Republic is almost non-existent.

In this brief overview it is seen that the Protestant influx into the Dominican Republic is small but significant in meeting religious and human needs. In comparison to the monolithic Roman Catholic Church Protestantism is a sociologically significant and religiously active minority.

2.4.4. Other Religious Movements

Certain religious movements that are common among the Dominican population are scarce among the Haitian immigrants. These would include the Christian sectarian groups, such as the Jehovah Witnesses and Mormons. However, the Haitians in the Dominican Republic have associated with and developed their own religious groups. *Mitah en Aaron* from Puerto Rico has several temples in Haitian *bateyes*. The appeal of *Mitah* is the emphasis on spirit possession and special spiritual powers. Self-initiated spiritist groups are common and they may use the name Pentecostal, without being affiliated with other Pentecostal churches.

From among the sectarian groups associated with Christianity, the Christian Reformed Church drew a significant number of adherents. Former participants in *Mitah en Aaron* and Unitarian groups affiliated with the ICRRD. Also, in the Barahona region, a former Mormon church joined the ICRRD.

The major representatives of the world religions of Buddhism, Confucianism, Islam and Judaism are not found among the Haitian immigrants. The social isolation of the immigrants may very well attribute to this.

Religious expression at the personal and communal level plays a major role in the life of the Haitian immigrant sugar cane cutter and urban manual laborer. The remaining Chapters will be dedicated to analyzing in more detail the Roman Catholic and Protestant relationship to the Haitian immigrants in general and the ICRRD relationship in particular.

¹³⁶ Pastoral Haitiana de la Iglesia Episcopal Dominicana

2.5. Conclusion

The Haitian immigrants trace their roots to rural Haiti and all the way back to their ancestry in West Africa. Within the Dominican Republic the Haitian presence has been of either an invader (nineteenth century) or a manual laborer (twentieth century). As manual laborers, the Haitian immigrants continue to be marginalized from the main stream societies, both in Haiti and the Dominican Republic. The marginalization status is seen in the high rates of illiteracy, illnesses and cases of deportation (illegality). An acceptable solution, by which the Haitian immigrant workers and their families are legally recognized and granted education, labor, legal, medical, personal and social rights and privileges, has not been accomplished during the last 500 years.

The historical pattern of the traditional dominant relationship of the political, labor, military and religious institutions over the Haitians workers in the Dominican Republic continues despite efforts to establish a stable nation in Haiti and stabilize the Haitian immigrant working conditions in the Dominican Republic.

The political and social instability in Haiti provides CEA and private sugar cane companies the opportunity to recruit Haitian manual laborers for substandard working conditions without fear of Haitian government interference. The Haitian immigrant sugar cane cutter continues in the colonial-like slave legacy of their forefathers with, politically and practically speaking, no hope for social and economic emancipation within the Haitian immigrant setting. The absence of socio-economic hope lies in the failure to secure legal rights and protection as immigrants, which in turn depends on a stable and responsible government in Haiti.

The stagnant socio-economic condition of the thousands of Haitian immigrants has resulted in high rates of illiteracy, illness and illegitimate activities. Education, medical and family services are in high demand by the immigrants. The Dominican Republic offers access to limited number of social services that the Haitian government is not able to provide. Even though the social services rendered to Haitian immigrants are given under a cloud of doubt and suspicion, it is better than in Haiti and so the immigration continues.

Haitian immigrants have turned to religious institutions and organizations in order to express their religious faith and also to address personal and communal needs. Voodooism, Roman Catholicism and Protestantism either participated in keeping the Haitian immigrant in their status quo marginality or have provided a personal and communal alternative to the current situation. Chapters 3 and 4 will take a closer look at the role of the RCC and Protestantism among the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic.

CHAPTER 3

THE ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC AND THE HAITIAN IMMIGRANTS

Thesis 2. *The Roman Catholic Church in the Dominican Republic is part of the disfranchisement of the Haitian immigrants yet efforts are being made to minister to the immigrants.*

3.1. Introduction

The Roman Catholic Church (RCC) has been the largest and most dominant religious institution in Hispaniola since the coming of Cristobál Colón. In Chapter 2 (Section 2.4.2.) Roman Catholic Christendom was seen in the Dominican historical context.¹³⁷ Chapter 3 will study history of the RCC as well as the economic, political, educational and religious relationship of the RCC with the Haitian immigrant in the Dominican Republic. It will be shown that while the traditional RCC has been part of the disfranchisement of the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic efforts are being made to minister to the immigrants.

The historical description used in this Chapter for speaking about the RCC in the Dominican Republic is: 1) the establishment of Roman Catholicism (1492-1822); 2) the socio-political challenge to Roman Catholicism (1822-1844); 3) the re-establishment of Roman Catholicism (1844-1965), and 4) the development of Roman Catholicism in a pluralistic society (1965-present).¹³⁸ The watershed time periods are the beginning of the Iberian conquest in Hispaniola (1492), the slave rebellion in Haiti (1792) leading to the Haitian invasion of the Dominican Republic (1822), the establishment of independence in the Dominican Republic (1844) and the conclusion of the Second Vatican Council (1965). Each of these time periods marked a distinct change in the direction and development of the RCC in the Dominican Republic.

¹³⁷ Early Roman Catholic writers of historical monographs who lived in the Dominican Republic include Bartolomé de las Casas (1474-1566), *Historia de las Indias*, Vol. 1-3 (1985) and Antón de Montesinos (died in 1528). Pedro de Córdoba's, *Doctrina Cristiana y Cartas* (1988) is not a history book but shows how the religious workers sought to teach the indigenous people in the Dominican Republic. Authors who have written about Cristobál Colón and the Dominican Republic include: Francisco Alvarez Seisdedos, trans., *Libro de las Profecías de Cristóbal Colón* (1984); Salvador de Madariaga, *Vida del Muy Magnífico Señor Don Cristóbal Colón* (1984); the Dominican Protestant historian, Alfonso Lockward, in *Algunas Cruces Altas* (1992), includes Colón's book on prophecy. Justo L. González, *La Era de Los Conquistadores* (1980), is the major Protestant historian in the Caribbean. Dominican sociologist, Carlos Esteban Deive, *Heterodoxia e Inquisición en Santo Domingo-1492-1822* (1983), adds the history of the marginal groups in society, including the Africans and Protestants.

¹³⁸ General outline taken from Roman Catholic historian, Enrique Dussel, *A History of the Church in Latin America* (1981). Dussel begins the second era in the year 1808, while this study places the beginning of CALA national revolutions in the revolution of Haiti in 1792. The Episcopalian Church historian, William Wipfler's work on the RCC in the DR divides its history as: 1) (1492-1844) "The Church as a victim of history: from the Discovery to Independence;" 2) (1844-1929) "The Struggle of the Church to exist: From Independence to the Era of Trujillo;" 3) (1930-1961) "The Era of Trujillo: The Church as an instrument of control;" 4) (1962-) "Signs of the Times: the beginning of the confrontation with pluralism," *Poder, influencia, e impotencia: la iglesia como factor socio-político en República Dominicana*, (1980), p. 8.

The relationship between the RCC and the Haitian immigrants will be defined in terms of a sociological marginal-normal paradigm which identifies a people's group level of marginality in their social structures and compares that to a standard of normalization in order to define what ministries are needed.

3.2. The Roman Catholic Church in the Dominican Republic

The first era of the RCC is from its introduction in 1492 to the Haitian invasion of the Dominican Republic. Roman Catholicism was introduced to Hispaniola with the arrival of Cristobál Colón. It remained the predominant religion on the island until Haiti overthrew the French colonial powers in Haiti in 1792-1804, isolated the Roman Catholic hierarchy in Haiti and did likewise during the invasion of the Dominican Republic from 1822-1844. During the second era, between 1822 and 1844, the close cooperation between the RCC and the Dominican colonial government agreements was altered by the Haitian invaders. In 1844, the RCC re-established its hegemony with the Dominican government, as it was declared the religion of the new republic. Even though the RCC's relationship with the Dominican government from 1844-1965 was fragile, the RCC continued to be the religion of the Dominican Republic. From 1965 onwards, the RCC existed within a democratic and religious pluralistic society.

3.2.1. History of the Roman Catholic Church in the Dominican Republic

The Roman Catholic Church was established in the Hispaniola colony by the Spanish colonists. From 1492-1822, the RCC was the only institutionalized Christian church on the island. During the invasion of the Haitians, from 1822-1844, the priests and members of the RCC were seriously challenged by the Haitians, however, the RCC survived. The new constitution of the Dominican Republic, formulated after independence in 1844, re-established the RCC as the religion of the state. With the advent of a democratic state and the changes brought by Vatican II (1962-1965), the RCC in the Dominican Republic continued its social leadership role but also adjusted to its pluralistic position in society. The Haitian immigrants have been influenced by the changing role of the RCC in the Dominican Republic, especially after the papal visit to Hispaniola and the closer working together of the Dominican and Haitian hierarchies beginning in the mid 1980's.

3.2.1.1. Establishment of Roman Catholicism (1492-1822)

Roman Catholic Christianity came to the Caribbean in 1492, to South America in 1500 and to Mexico in 1519. Colón planted the Roman Catholic cross on the shores of Hispaniola in 1492. Religious orders came to the New World immediately after the original conquest. Bernardo Boyl, the first representative of the Roman Catholic Church, was accompanied by twelve workers and arrived in Hispaniola in 1493. The Franciscans came at the turn of the century. The Dominican order came in 1510. The first church was built in what today is known as Santo Domingo prior to the beginning of the sixteenth century. Three bishoprics were established by Pope Julio II in the island of Santo Domingo and three bishops were

appointed in 1504. The population of the church in the Hispaniola colony was mainly Iberian-American and would grow to include Indian-Americans and African-Americans.¹³⁹

The defense of the Roman Catholic faith and tradition was the concern of the sixteenth century Spanish Kings; it is also expressed by Colón in his letter to the king:

Our Highnesses must not consent that a stranger attempts or is able to set foot (on land), but only catholic Christians, and this would be for the growth and glory of the Christian religion, (and that) no one come to these parts except he be a good Christian.¹⁴⁰

The RCC came with the Spanish and Portuguese imperial powers and dominated the southern hemisphere of the Americas, i.e. Central America and South America, for more than three hundred years. Papal bulls, dating back to 1493, granted religious and political power to Spain and Portugal. Brazil became the jurisdiction of Portugal, and the rest of the Americas were held to be the responsibility of Spain. Protestant immigrants were not able to penetrate the heart of the Iberian-American Empire and, therefore, settled on the Caribbean islands under the protection of the Danish, Dutch, English and French colonial governments.¹⁴¹

On the French speaking islands, the Roman Papal See had direct control over the RCC. In the Spanish colonies, the Patronage system was established whereby the Spanish government was given the right to present to the Pope candidates for bishops in the colonies.

Román Pané began to work with the Indians in Hispaniola in 1496. He was the first person to learn the Taino language and to seek their conversion to Roman Catholicism.¹⁴² It is difficult to know whether the reported conversions among the Indian population were authentic.¹⁴³ Las Casas protested against evangelism methods such as forced baptisms to coerce Indians to become Roman Catholics.¹⁴⁴ The total extermination and immigration of the Indian population, converted or not, in Hispaniola by 1545 or shortly thereafter, put an

¹³⁹ Antonio Camilo González, *El marco histórico de la pastoral dominicana* (1983), mentions the three bishops and bishoprics established on November 15, 1504 as: Pedro Deza (Metropolitan), García de Padilla (Bayense) and Alonso Manso (Maguense).

¹⁴⁰ Ignacio Anzoátegui, ed., *Los Cuatro Viajes del Almirante y su Testamento* (1986), p. 73.

¹⁴¹ The British entered the Caribbean early in the 17th century: Bermuda (1609), Barbados (1626), Belize (1638), Jamaica (1655), Trinidad (1797), Grenada (1783). See Justo González, *Historia...*, pp. 142, 189, 209-211; David Barrett, ed., *World Christian Encyclopedia* (1982), pp. 162, 174, 335, 417, 678; Jean Bastian, *op. cit.*, pp. 23-24. The Dutch entered Curacao in 1634 and Surinam in 1668. Jan M. van der Linde, *Surinaamse Suikerheren en hun Kerk* (1966), pp. 13f., and A.H. Algra, *Dispereert Niet*, Vol. 5 (n.d.), pp. 278 - 281. The Danish entered St. Kitts, St. Thomas, and St. John. See K.S. Latourette, *The Great Century: The Americas, Australia and Africa*, Vol. 5 (1978), p. 49. The French took Martinique and Guadeloupe. The *La era de los conquistadores* French Huguenots settled in St. Thomas, St. Kitts, Surinam, British and French Guiana. González, *op. cit.*, pp. 142f., concerning Papal bulls

¹⁴² Carlos Esteban Deive, *Heterodoxia e Inquisición en Santo Domingo-1492-1822* (1983); Francisco Alvarez Seisdedos, trans., *Libro de las Profecías de Cristóbal Colón* (1984); Salvador de Madariaga, *Vida del Muy Magnífico Señor Don Cristóbal Colón* (1984). Alfonso Lockward, *Algunas Cruces Altas* (1992).

¹⁴³ Pedro de Córdoba, *Doctrina Cristiana y Cartas* (1988). Lockward cites Fernando Colón, *Vida del Almirante Don Cristóbal Colón* (1984), p. 211.

¹⁴⁴ Justo González, (1980), p. 28.

end to hopes of evangelizing the Indians. Moya Pons, in response to the 500 year celebration of the coming of the RCC to the Americas says:

I ask myself if the more than 400,000 Indians murdered "were not human beings?" Did they not have souls? Were they not also sons of God? Why is it celebrated and justified today those killings and exploitations as if it were an abstract work of an epoch and not done by bad Christians?¹⁴⁵

One of the basic historical sixteenth century documents by authors residing in Hispaniola, alongside Bartolomé de Las Casas' *Historia de las Indias* (1547), was Pedro de Córdoba's *Doctrina Cristiana para instrucción e información de los indios por manera de historia* (1544). Both Las Casas (1474-1566) and Córdoba (1482-1521), along with Antón de Montesinos (died 1528), vigorously protested the mistreatment of the Indians by the colonists in Hispaniola¹⁴⁶ and other Iberian colonies.¹⁴⁷

Antón de Montesinos will be remembered for his prophetic denouncement of the oppression of the Indians by the Spanish colonists. The following quotation is engraved below his statue, located near the harbor of Santo Domingo in the Dominican Republic:

Tell me, by what right or justice do you keep these Indians in such cruel and horrible servitude?...Why do you keep them so oppressed and weary, not giving them enough to eat, nor taking care of them in their illnesses? For with the excessive work you demand of them, they fall ill and die, or rather you kill them with your desire to extract and acquire gold every day...Are these not men? Have they not rational souls? Are you not bound to love these as you love yourselves? Be certain that in such a state as this, you can no more be saved than the Moors or Turks.¹⁴⁸

Bartolomé de Las Casas also served as a priest in the Dominican Republic. For years he tolerated the ill treatment of the Indians. In the twelfth year of his ministry, however, he began to denounce the abuses against the Indians. Las Casas represented the cause of the Indians before the Spanish and religious rulers. He was officially named *Defensor de los Indios* (Defender of the Indians).¹⁴⁹ He argued that the evangelization of the Indians could be done non-violently.¹⁵⁰ He worked for the eradication of the oppressive *encomiendas*, which were communities where Indians were forced to labor and to learn Catholic doctrine.¹⁵¹ The traditional colonial labor structures did not altogether disappear with

¹⁴⁵ "Moya pregunta porqué celebran matanza indios," *Ultima Hora* (March 30, 1992), p. 4.

¹⁴⁶ Luis Lugo, "Christianity and the Spanish Conquest of the Americas," (1991), p. 8. Bartolomé de las Casas, *Historia de las Indias* (1985), Vol. 11, pp. 548 f.

¹⁴⁷ Titus G. Funk, "Jesuitas y menonitas: dos modelos asincrónicos de obra misionera integral en el Paraguay," *Boletín Teológico* (41), pp. 31f. This lasted until 1768. The *reducciones* represent a very significant experiment in Catholic Christianity in CALA. It was perhaps the closest Christian community in comparison to separatistic Protestantism .

¹⁴⁸ See Dussel, *A History...*, p. 47; Las Casas, *op.cit.*, p. 176.

¹⁴⁹ González, *La era...*, pp. 61 - 63; MacKay, *The Other Spanish Christ* (1932), pp. 45 - 49; Dussel, *A History...*, pp. 48 - 49.

¹⁵⁰ González, *La era...*, p. 62.

¹⁵¹ Stephen Neill, *A History of Christian Missions* (1975), p. 172; Dussel, *op. cit.*, p. 86.

passing of colonialism. The labor exploitation of the illegal immigrant is similar to the former exploitation of the Africans who were allowed to be free colonists.

He taught that people were equal, not born as slaves by nature, as was deduced from the Aristotelian doctrine of man and slavery.¹⁵² Las Casas continued his polemic against the abuses of Spanish colonialism until his death. After his death, his literary works were prohibited in certain Latin American countries, such as Peru. By the middle of the seventeenth century, the Inquisition forbade his works in Spain.¹⁵³

Despite all the positive efforts on behalf of the Indians, Las Casas was not regarded as a great hero in the eyes of the African-Americans. Las Casas had recommended that Africans be brought to the New World to replace the weaker Indian workers. After Las Casas saw the horrible abuse of the African slaves, he very much came to regret his earlier position.¹⁵⁴

It is significant to note that through the protests of Montesinos, Las Casas, Córdoba, Vitoria¹⁵⁵ and the clergy mentioned above, attention was focused by the Catholics on the rights of the Indians. This stands in contrast to the rights of the African slaves who were transported to the New World and forced to develop and work for the growth of the colonial empires. Despite opposition, some early Roman Catholics, such as Pedro Claver of Colombia, were notable defenders of African slave rights.¹⁵⁶

The Iberian-American conquest left the Indians and Africans in a position where they had to adjust religiously in order to survive. The rise of Christo-paganism, i.e. the syncretism of Indian and African religions with Roman Catholic belief, can be traced back to the forced evangelization of the non-colonists.¹⁵⁷

The lack of priests and religious workers led to an institutional church that was static and continually dominated by political and social forces. The slow development of native leadership in CALA meant the RCC relied on foreign leadership.¹⁵⁸

The Inquisition was established in Mexico and Peru in 1569.¹⁵⁹ Records show that a small number of "Lutherans" were tried. Bible distribution was discouraged. Bishop Agustín

¹⁵² F. Du Base, ed., *Classics of Christian Mission* (1979), p. 213. Montesino's anthropology as expressed in his famous sermon recognizes that the Indian is made in the image of God.

¹⁵³ González, *La era...*, p. 63.

¹⁵⁴ Carlos Deive, *La Esclavitud del Negro en Santo Domingo* (1980), Vol. 1, p. 61.

¹⁵⁵ González, *op.cit.*, pp. 59-86.

¹⁵⁶ Many of the slaves were in poor physical and spiritual condition. An untold number had died in their chains on the slave ships or were close to death. Claver had built a small hospital to serve the slaves. He would go on board with a group of workers and seek to comfort the slaves in their plight. He also taught the slaves basic Christianity and baptized tens of thousands of Africans. González, *La era...*, pp. 122-126.

¹⁵⁷ Alfred Métraux, *Voodoo in Haiti* (1959); George Eaton Simpson, *Black Religions in the New World* (1978); William Madsen, *Christo-Paganism: A Study of Mexican Religious Syncretism* (1957); Dussel, *op. cit.*, pp. 82 - 86.

¹⁵⁸ Gerald Costello, *Mission to Latin America* (1979), pp. 23 - 25.

¹⁵⁹ Gonzalo Baez-Camargo "Evangelical Faith and Latin American Culture," *The Ecumenical Era in Church and Society* (Edward Jurij, ed.), (1959), p. 34. Baez-Camargo, "The Earliest Protestant Missionary Venture in Latin America," *Church History*, Vol. 21 (1952), p. 135. The writings of Las Casas, Vitoria and Zumárraga, were banned in certain regions by the Inquisition. It is ironic that Las Casas originally had asked for the Inquisition to be established in the Americas, Esteban Carlos Deive, *Heterodoxia e Inquisición en Santo Domingo* (1983), pp. 238-239. See González, *La Era de los Conquistadores* (1980), pp. 63,67. Bastian, *op. cit.*, pp. 15 - 16; González, *Historia...*, pp. 144 - 163. In 1569, the Holy Office of the Inquisition was set up in Mexico and Peru, John MacKay, *The Other*

Dávila y Padilla of Santo Domingo is reported to have ordered the seizure and burning of more than 300 Bibles in 1599 in Santo Domingo.¹⁶⁰

The seventeenth century can be characterized, both socially and religiously, as a time of retreat and consolidation. The colonial population was centralized around Santo Domingo and in the eastern Section of Hispaniola. The RCC established a seminary as well as formal schools. Religious orders such as the Franciscans, Dominicans, and Jesuits became established.¹⁶¹

The Jesuits, in particular, became very prominent in Hispaniola during the eighteenth century. The seminary in Santo Domingo was placed under their administration in 1703. In the same year the Jesuits established themselves in the French colony. By 1764 the Jesuits, being accused of inciting the slave population against their owners, are banned from the French colony. Three years later the Jesuits are exiled from the Spanish colony as well.¹⁶²

Theological reform challenging the teachings of the RCC was attempted but suppressed.¹⁶³ Those who theologically disagreed with RCC decisions would either have to conceal their beliefs or join the small movement of Protestants. Prior to 1792, freedom of religious expression was neither a serious option in Hispaniola, nor in other Hispanic countries at that time.¹⁶⁴

The establishment of Roman Catholicism was seriously challenged by the slave revolt in Haiti in 1792. The RCC had managed to survive the breakaway of the western colony in favor of the French; however, the slave revolt would eventually lead to the breaking of ties of the State and Church. and the introduction of Protestantism into Hispaniola.

Spanish Christ (1932), pp. 49 - 51. Baez-Camargo, *Protestantes Enjuiciados por la Inquisición en Ibero América* (1960); Baez-Camargo reports that during the 16th and 17th century, 310 judgments and 58 cases of suspicion were handled by the Inquisition. There were 27 executions. Richard Greenleaf, "The Mexican Inquisition and the Enlightenment," *New Mexico Historical Review*, Vol. 41, 3, (1966), p. 190. Lockward in *Tolerancia...*, reminds the reader that the Inquisition was not only set up against the Protestants but also to deal with baptized Catholics who had abandoned the faith, Jews, Muslims and Spiritists (p. 10). Daniel Monti, *Presencia del protestantismo en el Río de la Plata durante el siglo XIX* (1969), p. 28. Among the RCC religious figures one encounters men such as San Francisco Solano who dedicated the last 20 years of his life (1590-1610) to evangelize the Indians in the region of Tucumán (Argentina). Prior to his death he is reported to have said: "I am going to the kingdom, yes; but not by my merits, for I am the chief of sinners, but by the merits of Jesus Christ."

¹⁶⁰ Antonio Camilo González, *El Marco Historico de la Pastoral Dominicana* (1983), p. 50.

¹⁶¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 57-63.

¹⁶² *Ibid.*, pp. 63-75.

¹⁶³ From a Roman Catholic perspective, see Enrique Dussel, *A History of the Church in Latin America* (1981), pp. 43f. See Justo González, *La era de los conquistadores* (1980), pp. 53 - 155. José Miquez Bonino, *Doing Theology in a Revolutionary Situation* (1980), pp. 4 - 9. Of missiological interest is that until the powerful alliance between Church and State was broken it was difficult to be a non-Catholic Christian. The Bible colporteurs, lay missionaries and missions societies were the forerunners in Protestant mission work in the Latin American Christendom. The Moravians were among the first Protestants to combine church community and missions together in a context which was not controlled by their own government. See Orlando Costas, *Christ Outside the Gate* (1982), pp. 60 -61.

¹⁶⁴ Baez-Camargo, *op. cit.*, p. 135.

3.2.1.2. Challenges to Roman Catholicism (1822-1844)

The bloody and revolutionary conditions in Hispaniola from 1792-1844 both challenged and redefined the religious status quo of the Roman Catholic Church on the island. The Haitian national revolution against the French colonists began in 1791 and was accomplished in 1804. At this time, there was a rupture of Haitian and Papal relations which would not be fully restored until 1860. The slave revolt in Haiti which began in 1791 and was accomplished in 1792 was a direct challenge to the French colonial empire, which included the clergy of the Roman Catholic Church. The RCC leadership was supportive of the French colonists on the western side of Hispaniola.

The July 22, 1795, Treaty of Basilea conceded Hispaniola, in its entirety, to the French. The French ordered the Spanish colonists, including the clerics, of the eastern side of Hispaniola to leave. By 1798, Archbishop Fernando de Portillo y Torres, had overseen the leaving of some of the clerics and left himself. A significant number of clerics remained in order to support the revolutionary ideals of the French Revolution or to attend to their properties on the island.¹⁶⁵

The Haitian revolutionaries changed their alliances with France on several occasions. Basically, in order to overthrow the Spanish, they sided with the French, but in order to gain independence, they fought against the French. On January 1, 1804, led by Haitian generals Jean Jacques Dessalines and Henri Cristophe, Haitian independence was gained. In the wake of independence, the French white population in Haiti went into exile or was killed and all their properties confiscated.¹⁶⁶

Whereas the Haitian government cut Papal relations with Haiti in 1804, the Haitian constitution of 1816 recognized the RCC as the “religion of the state.” Such status did not exclude the freedom of religion.¹⁶⁷ This opened the door for Protestants to enter and stay in during the 1820’s and into the Dominican Republic by way of Haiti in 1824.¹⁶⁸

The Haitian revolutionaries invaded the Dominican Republic in 1802. At first, the Spanish colonists were allowed to stay, but under the leadership of Dessalines, they were ordered to leave. With the coming and going of the Haitian army, there were immigrations as well as times of resistance. With the return of the Haitian forces in the 1820’s and until the liberation of the Dominican Republic in 1844, the Haitians pressured the RCC to submit to government dominance.

The dismantling of the Roman Catholic privileges was not a smooth transition. In 1822, the Haitian governor confiscated church lands. On January 5, 1823, salaries of church personnel paid by the government were suspended. The archbishop of Santo Domingo was not recognized according to his position. Students at the Catholic operated Saint Thomas University were enlisted in the army. In 1824, some of the church salaries were restored. However, the Archbishop of Santo Domingo, Pedro de Valera, in open opposition to the invaders, refused to accept the 300 peso salary. In 1830, the archbishop fled to Cuba.¹⁶⁹

A side effect of the revolutionary 1792-1844 years was the association of Protestantism with the American free slave movement. Whereas European Protestantism has

¹⁶⁵ Moya Pons, *op. cit.*, p. 180.

¹⁶⁶ *Ibid.* p. 174.

¹⁶⁷ Alfonso Lockward, *La Constitución Haitiano-Dominicano de 1843* (1995), p. 37.

¹⁶⁸ George Lockward, *El Protestantismo en Dominicana*, p. 14.

¹⁶⁹ Moya Pons, *Manual...*, pp. 228-246.

been successfully held at bay for over 350 years, American Protestantism entered through the “freedom of religion” clauses in the national constitutions, first in Haiti and then in the Dominican Republic.¹⁷⁰

In conclusion, the Haitian led challenge of the RCC was reacted to by the Dominican nationalist who in turn re-instated the RCC as the religion of the state. Aside from the favored political status of the RCC, the RCC had a nationalistic association with the new independent Dominican Republic.

3.2.1.3. Re-establishment of Roman Catholicism (1844-1965)

Dominican independence was achieved and in the first constitution, formulated in 1844, the RCC was again recognized as the religion of the state.¹⁷¹ The clerical resistance of the Haitian invaders fortified the RCC’s national position in post-independence Dominican Republic.¹⁷² However, the RCC’s 352 year monopoly of religious dominance was broken when the Constitution included the freedom of religion as a basic right. Many of the benefits that the RCC enjoyed in their previous years were not restored.

Even though the position within the new Dominican Republic was affirmed in the constitution of 1844 as the religion of the State, the previous benefits gained from being associated with the Spanish crown were not fully restored. The military enforced religious uniformity and dominance was replaced with the freedom of religion.¹⁷³

The RCC community began to develop their own educational, leadership training and social institutions. In 1845 the Santo Tomás de Aquino seminary opened. A series of educational institutions were initiated during the following years.¹⁷⁴

The relationship of the institutional church with Dominican leaders of the latter nineteenth century, such as General Pedro Santana, President Buenaventura Báez and General Ulises Heureaux was filled with conflicts. Individual expulsion of priests took place in 1853, 1858, and 1862. The relationship between church and state stabilized until the American invasion of 1916, when several priests left. During the reign of Rafael Trujillo, the institutional church, as well as the religious orders, was established. In 1932, the Dominican government reaffirmed the legal status of the RCC. There were 58 parishes, 64 priests, one priest for every 22,000 persons. The RCC continued to maintain a close alliance with the Dominican government resulting in the *Concordato* of 1954. This agreement reaffirmed the RCC as the religion of the state and financial assistance was given to Catholic schools, hospitals, churches and programs.¹⁷⁵

¹⁷⁰ *Ibid.*, and Alfonso Lockward, *La Constitución Haitiano-Dominicano de 1843* (1995), p. 37.

¹⁷¹ *Constitution de la República Dominicana*, May 11, 1844, Art. 38.

¹⁷² Liberators formed “La Trinidad” society. Priests were actively involved in the independence movement, see Juan F. Pepen, *La cruz señal d el camino: influencia de la iglesia en la formación y conservación de la nacionalidad dominicana*, p.75. Pepen adds that “the history of Dominican heterodoxy remains unwritten; but experiences demonstrate that our nationality ends where the [Protestant] ‘Churches’ and “voodoo” begin.” Pp. 142-143. According to Hugo Polanco Brito, 8 out of the 32 signers of the new constitution were priests. “La Iglesia Católica y la primera constitución dominicana,” *Clio*, no.125 (Jan.-Aug, 1970).

¹⁷³ E. Dussel, *op. cit.*, p. 66.

¹⁷⁴ Antonio C. González, *op. cit.*, p. 86f.

¹⁷⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 84-107; González, *op. cit.*, p. 117. See José Luis Sáez, *Cinco Siglos de Iglesia Dominicana* (1987), pp.122-134.

In the closing years of the Trujillo dictatorship as well as during the mid 1960 revolutionary years, some of the RCC leaders began to speak out against the abuses of the Trujillo government as well as the intervention of the North American troops. The appearance of a more vocal "popular church" was in the making.¹⁷⁶

By 1962, the first Roman Catholic university, *Madre y Maestra*, was founded in Santiago. During the Trujillo years, many Roman Catholic orders had been established, schools opened and hospitals maintained. With the coming of political democracy, the RCC institutions continued to develop.

The close of the Second Vatican Council in 1964 and the introduction of a democratic government in the Dominican Republic came during the same time period (1961-1966). The position of the Vatican Council identified Protestants as "separated brethren" rather than heretics. There seemed to be more openness on the RCC to co-exist peacefully with other religions. Added to this openness was the introduction of political democracy in the Dominican Republic after the fall of Trujillo.

3.2.1.4. Development of Roman Catholicism (1965-present)

The Second Vatican Council (1962-1965) is a watershed event for modern RCC history. Although RCC dogma was not changed, openness to a variety of socio-religious renewal expressions was expressed. This was significant for Hispaniola. Catholic services and mass were offered in the vernacular language, Bible translations and readings were encouraged and the popular church remained a viable option. Awareness was raised as to the existence of the masses of poor, many of whom were Roman Catholic and many who were Haitians and Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic.¹⁷⁷

Several popular and contemporary Catholic movements arise and become prominent. These include the popular church (the church of the people, as seen in the Base Ecclesial Communities and the popularization of liberation theology), the charismatic renewal, the continuation of the Catholic Action and Christian Democracy movements. The Roman Catholic hierarchy has sought to accommodate all three movements while seeking to reject teachings that conflict with Roman Catholic teachings. Liberation theology has influenced the official, as well as the popular agenda of the RCC in the Dominican Republic; most of the liberation praxis has been concentrated in the political arena.¹⁷⁸

Since 1965, ecumenical efforts are developed in the Dominican Republic, especially with the mainline Protestant churches and agencies.¹⁷⁹ A limited amount of social work projects and Bible distribution efforts are being carried out ecumenically, through the cooperation of Roman Catholics and Protestants.¹⁸⁰

¹⁷⁶ Wipfler, *op. cit.*, pp. 108-222.

¹⁷⁷ Panky Corcino, "Agarrados al mismo Dios," *Listín Diario* (September 13, 1998), p. D5.

¹⁷⁸ William Cook, "The Expectation of the Poor: A Protestant Missiological Study of the Catholic 'comunidades de base' in Brazil," (University Microfilms, Ann Arbor, Mich. Catalog No. 8216810 (1985).

¹⁷⁹ Roman Catholic observers were invited to attend conciliar ecumenical meetings of the World Council of Churches and attended the Council of Latin American Churches (CLAI) until the mid 1990' s.

¹⁸⁰ RCC and Protestants work together in social work projects, such as in the Christian Center for Promotion and Services in Peru. *1986 Resource Sharing Book* (1986), p. 754. Roman Catholic translators work alongside of Protestants in the United Bible Society in Curacao as well as in other

The post Trujillo Dominican Republic is relatively free from overt violent anti-Protestant actions, unless one considers the frequent deportation of the predominantly Protestant Haitians as religiously inspired. Such a conspiracy theory has not been substantiated. The virtual silence of the monolithic RCC's hierarchy in the Dominican Republic, in face of the deportations, nevertheless, creates a certain measure of suspicion among Protestants. However, the Roman Catholic community at large in Haiti and the Dominican Republic has protested even though the hierarchy remained virtually inactive in bringing forth solutions.¹⁸¹

The rise and fall of military and popular governments in Haiti have involved both the Dominican and Haitian RCC hierarchies as well as popular movements. Democratically elected President Jean Bertrand Aristide was a former Roman Catholic priest. The military dictator who took over after the Aristide coup, Raul Cedras, was loosely associated with a Protestant church. Yet, in a strange turn of events, only the Vatican State recognized the militarized Cedra's government. This has been interpreted as the RCC hierarchy's protest of Aristide's criticisms against the institutional church.¹⁸²

The RCC hierarchy in the Dominican Republic and Haiti and the popular church movements have an ongoing conflict in their political and cultural views. This is noticeable in their differing interpretation of ministry to the Haitian immigrants.

3.2.5. The Development of Roman Catholic Mission Agencies

According to the *Directorio Católico Dominicana* (Dominican Catholic Directory), there are numerous agencies working in the areas of communication and literature distribution, health care, social service, education, family services and human rights advocacy. The following is a synopsis of Roman Catholic ministries that are operating in the Dominican Republic.

3.2.5.1. Communications and Literature Distribution

Roman Catholic Christian literature is readily available in both urban bookstores as well as parish offices. After Vatican II, the RCC in the Dominican Republic has placed more emphasis on the reading of the Bible. Parishes also cooperate with the United Bible Society

countries. For a report of RCC and Protestant cooperation, see Robert A. O' Donell, "Unidad y Misión: Perspectivas Católico Romanas," No. 23, Year 11 (2nd sem., 1989), pp. 64-76.

¹⁸¹ For an interesting historical background. Fernandez, Luis, Martínez, "The sword and the crucifix: church-state relations and nationality in the nineteenth century Dominican Republic." *Latin American Research Review*. (Winter, 1995) Vol. 30. No. 1., pp. 69-92. Leoncio Peralta, "Monseñor Adames, "El de dominicanos y haitianos es un matrimonio impuesto," *Listin Diario* (February 6, 1997). "Cardenal declara Haití necesita ayuda sustancial," *Listin Diario* (October 13, 1996). p. 16A. Manuel Azcona, "El Cardenal teme una ola migratoria desde Haití," *Listin Diario* (February. 1, 1999), p. 16a.

¹⁸² The Vatican's recognition of the military Haitian government in power can be interpreted as the continuation of the Church-State relationship in which Roman Catholicism is considered the religion of the state. The popular movement in Haiti speaks out against Haitian abuses. "Declaración de los Obispos Católicos de Haití sobre los braceros Haitianos," Centro de Coordinación y Animación Pastoral Haitiana, July 1991.

in distributing Bibles. The Haitians are able to purchase Bibles in French and Haitian Creole.

The RCC publishes eight publications covering the areas of worship, social work, news events, theology and human rights. There are five RCC radio stations.¹⁸³

3.2.5.2. Health

Catholic workers are employed as health care workers or chaplains in the public hospitals throughout the Dominican Republic. The Roman Catholic Church works in 20 hospitals. Over 100 clinics are operated by religious workers. Caritas Dominicana has been able to stock church related pharmacies with medicines donated from abroad.¹⁸⁴

3.2.5.3. Social Services

National Catholic social services, such as homes for children, for the youth, feeding centers, old age homes and community organizations are made available throughout the Dominican Republic. The Catholic Relief Service responds to natural disasters.¹⁸⁵

3.2.5.4. Education

Roman Catholic workers are involved with the public education system in the Dominican Republic as school administrators, teachers and helpers. There are over 150 primary and secondary Roman Catholic schools, of which the majority is in the capital and surrounding regions. There are 22 specialized schools in the area of commerce, communications and social work as well as 15 technical institutes. Radio correspondence courses offering high school and technical school training are offered over RCC radio stations. The RCC maintains three universities, of which the largest is *la Universidad Católica Madre y Maestra in Santiago*. There are 15 seminary level schools as well as eight schools for religious workers.¹⁸⁶

3.2.5.5. Family and Youth Services

The RCC is active in promoting family, youth and communal retreat centers and courses. There are over 40 homes and retreat centers dedicated to serving the church families.¹⁸⁷

3.2.5.6. Human Rights Advocacy

The Centro de Investigación y Acción Social is active in reporting social injustices. Legal assistance and counseling are given on an individual basis as well as parish basis. Roman Catholics participate in the Comité Dominicano de los derechos humanos (CDH) and other

¹⁸³ *Directorio Católico Dominicano* (1985), pp. 191-192

¹⁸⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 184-187.

¹⁸⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 189-190.

¹⁸⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 179-184, 191.

¹⁸⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 187-188.

social action groups. In relationship to the Dominican-Haitian situation in the Dominican Republic, the RCC has established a Centro Pastoral Haitiana (Haitian Pastoral Center). According to Jean Batist, the Haitian work is limited by the existing formal relationship that the RCC has with the Dominican government. The RCC funds and priority in the Dominican Republic is primarily for the Dominicans. However, the Pastoral is active in worship services as well as socio-political concerns among the Haitian sugar cane cutters.¹⁸⁸

3.3. Roman Catholic Ministries and the Haitian Immigrants

The Haitian Pastoral Center is the focus of the RCC's ministerial response to the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic (Section 3.3.1). However, the influence of the RCC hierarchy and laity is observable in each area of society that affects the Haitian immigrant. Section 3.3.2. will show the influence of the RCC in relationship to how government, the military, labor, education and religion affect the Haitian immigrants.

3.3.1. Haitian Pastoral Center

Since the Second Vatican (1965) two predominant forces within the RCC have spoken about and addressed the need for ministry among the Haitian immigrant in the Dominican Republic. The traditional view of ministry is represented by the Dominican RCC hierarchy and a populist view is presented by voices associated with the popular church movement.

The traditionalist and populist views follow the pattern of the two types of Catholic churches, as described by church historian, Sidney Rooy:

The first two types illustrate traditional Catholic and Protestant approaches. We shall call these two types "the two swords" and "the two kingdoms," respectively. The second pair describes present-day options: the "popular" Protestant church movement, which we will call, the "the refuge of the masses" (following Christian Lalive D'Epinay), and the popular Catholic movement of the Base Ecclesial Communities, which we shall classify as "the liberation of the masses."¹⁸⁹

Within the RCC, and especially since the Second Vatican (1965), there has been more openness to experiment with different models of ministry among the Haitian immigrants. In 1985 the Haitian Pastoral Center was formed. A handful of RCC priests and the Haitian Pastoral Center are implementing a variety of contextualized ministries. The Haitian Pastoral Center bridges the traditional status quo point of view with the perspectives of the popular movement. In Section 3.3.2. the interaction between the variety of views within the RCC will be studied.

3.3.2. Roman Catholic Church Ministries and the Haitian Immigrant's Context

¹⁸⁸ Elina Maria Cruz, "Sacerdote considera goberino debe variar trato a haitianos," *El Siglo* (September 17, 1990), p. 1. Pamphlet, "Centro de Coordinación y animación de la Pastoral de los Inmigrantes Haitianos en República Dominicana." (2000).

¹⁸⁹ Sidney Rooy, "Social Revolution and the Future of the Church," *Occasional Essays*, Year 13, No. 1 and 2 (1986), p. 61-62.

By government decree, the RCC is the official religion of the Dominican Republic and Haiti. As previously mentioned, the Dominican government declared Roman Catholicism to be the religion of the state in 1844 and the last Concordato was signed between the Dominican government and the Roman Catholic Church in 1954. In 1860, the Haitian government signed an agreement with the Vatican. Officially, Roman Catholicism is the state religion in both Haiti and the Dominican Republic. The privileged position of the RCC hierarchy with the government requires an extra responsibility of speaking in favor of religious and social rights.

One of the responsibilities in having a privileged position with the government is to be a voice to the government against the government's, military's, labor's and general public's social injustices, when such situations arise. Granted, most religious groups promote speaking up and acting against injustice, but the religion of the state has a special relationship with the state, and it would seem it should be the RCC's responsibility to voice opposition to the abuses against the Haitian immigrants and propose workable solutions. From a review of over one thousand Dominican newspaper articles and documents describing and analyzing the Dominican and Haitian issues (1988-1994) several patterns of response became typical of both the traditional RCC as well as from the popular movements. The hierarchy of the RCC in the Dominican Republic asked that personal abuses against the Haitian immigrants be stopped, yet, there was no call from the RCC hierarchy to review Dominican immigration laws, deportation law and labor contracts. The call for such reviews has come from the popular church, small representations of priests and the laity of the RCC in the Dominican Republic.¹⁹⁰ In other words, the traditional RCC spoke in favor of the existing status quo while the popular movements challenged that position.

In Haiti, as well as among the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic and elsewhere, the election to the Haitian presidency of former Roman Catholic priest, Jean Bertrand Aristide, in 1990, brought forth a surge of hope for the establishment of a

¹⁹⁰ *Misionología Dominicana-Haitiana* (1984-1994) found in the reference library of the Miami International Seminary. The Dominican clergy who speak on behalf of the Haitian immigrant are a minority. See Altagracia Moreta Feliz, "Avelino Fernández dice que le padre Milton Ruiz no conoce el problema haitiano," *Listín Diario* (January 20, 1997) p.8. The bishop of Barahona, Fabio Mamerto Rivas calls for a political resolution to the immigration problems, Genarao Contreras, "El obispo de Barahona pide adoptar medidas para armonizar las relaciones con Haití," *Listín Diario* (March 3, 1997). On the other hand, clerical spokesmen maintain an alarmist view of the Haitian presence in the DR, Leoncio Peralta, "Monseñor Adames, "El de dominicanos y haitianos es un matrimonio impuesto," *Listín Diario* (February 6, 1997) speaks about the historical and traditional prejudices between the Haitians and the Dominicans. The Dominican Cardinal, Nicolás de Jesús López Rodríguez, places the responsibility of documenting the Haitian immigrants with the Haitian government and not the Dominican who employs the sugar cutters: "Cardenal declara Haití necesita ayuda sustancial," *Listín Diario* (October 13, 1996). p. 16A. The cardinal also speak out about the dangers of the Haitian presence in the DR; Manuel Azcona, "El Cardenal teme una ola migratoria desde Haití," *Listín Diario* (February. 1, 1999), p. 16a. An example of the Haitian Pastoral mediating position is seen in an interview conducted by a reporter from *El Siglo*, the then director of the Commission, Rev. Agapito Betances, responds to the Dominican government's denial of mistreatment of Haitian immigrant by saying: "I think that the government should look at these denouncements very seriously and take into consideration the possibility that we need to change...Rather than discussing whether or not what America Watch is saying is true...we have to admit our responsibility and seriously consider what to do in the future." Elina María Cruz, "Sacerdote considera gobierno debe variar trato a haitianos," *El Siglo* (September 17, 1990), p. 1.

democratic Haitian society. Aristide had for the time being overcome the status quo of the traditional RCC, the military and cultural elite in Haiti. He was democratically elected by the people in a landslide victory and he set out to usher in long-needed socio-political reform.

Just prior to the coup and exile on September 29, 1991, President Aristide called for an end to the slavery of Haitian sugar cane cutters in the Dominican Republic. This was not well received by the Dominican government and so deportations of Haitian immigrants were dramatically increased by the Dominican armed forces. The deportations were temporarily halted after the coup against and the exile of the outspoken former priest. The political changes on September 29, 1991, dashed the hopes of the marginalized Haitians again. The Dominican and Haitian RCC hierarchy did not condemn the military coup against Aristide. The Haitian populists interpreted the silence as support and consequently reacted in ransacking Vatican offices in Haiti and physically abused one of the diplomats.¹⁹¹

On both sides of the Dominican and Haitian border, the RCC hierarchies maintained their posture of silence as to intervention of the Haitian military and the increased deportations of the Dominican government. On the other hand, RCC laity and a handful of RCC priest have articulated and protested the abuse of Haiti by the military and abuse of the Haitian immigrants by the Dominican military.¹⁹²

The relationship between the Haitian and Dominican governments from 1844 to the Trujillo era in the 1930's was historically and psychologically conflictive. The Dominicans were wary of the attempts of the Haitians in the mid nineteenth century to invade their republic. The Haitians had reasons to be concerned in the twentieth century as tens of thousands of Haitians were massacred in 1937 by Trujillo forces.

The role of the Haitian and Dominican RCC hierarchy was one of initial silence and a consequent hesitant condemnation. The unwillingness of the hierarchy of both the Dominican and Haitian Roman Catholic churches to sincerely denounce the oppression of the Haitian sugar cane cutter is an ongoing subject of investigation.¹⁹³

The deportations during the late 1980's and 1990's have seen the resurgence of the government using military force in order to control the Haitian immigrant population. The number of death attributed to the forced deportation are substantially less than in 1937. Nevertheless, the traumas are significant.¹⁹⁴

¹⁹¹ In January of 1991, Haitian rioters attacked the Vatican office in Puerto Prince and physically hurt the Vatican diplomat, León Kalenga. He was attended to by the doctors of the Dominican embassy in Puerto Prince. Rafael Nuñez and Leo Reyes, "Mejora en RD cura golpean Haiti," *El Nacional* (January 11, 1991), p. 5.

¹⁹² Moya Pons, *El Batey...* (1986). Altagracia Moreta Feliz, "Avelino Fernández dice que el padre Milton Ruiz no conoce el problema haitiano," *Listín Diario* (January 20, 1997) p.8. The bishop of Barahona, Fabio Mamerto Rivas in: Genarao Contreras, "El obispo de Barahona pide adoptar medidas para armonizar las relaciones con Haiti," *Listín Diario* (March 3, 1997).

¹⁹³ The silence of both the Dominican and Haitian hierarchy concerning the massacre of 1937 is observed by church historians and social scientists alike. One of the most complete studies of the relationship of Haiti and Trujillo, which includes a commentary on the role of the Roman Catholic Church in the events surrounding the massacre of 1937, is given by former Madre y Maestra professor, journalist, lawyer, and researcher, Bernardo Vega, in *Trujillo y Haiti*, Vol. 1, (1988), pp. 245, 266-267, 304-305; Juan Manuel García, *La Matanza de los Haitianos* (1983), pp. 141-144. William Wipfler, *op. cit.*, pp. 93-9.

¹⁹⁴ Members of the deported ICRRD reported the death of children (Roman de la Rosa) and spouses (Locano Jean's wife) due to the lack of medical aid. There were complaints of police brutality in the

The use of the military to deport illegal immigrants is not in question. What is questionable is for the government's sugar cane industry to first hire, then use the Haitian immigrants without legal papers and then use the military to forcefully deport them. Cardinal Nicolás de Jesús López Rodríguez, who in his official pronouncements and homilies most consistently reflects the justification of the traditional hegemony of the Dominican CEA, calls for the Haitian government to document the workers, rather than placing the responsibility at the feet of the Dominican government who employs the workers. He also calls for a humane treatment of the deportees while overlooking the transgression of the Dominican government that knowingly and willfully employed illegal immigrants.¹⁹⁵

Even though the Dominican and Haitian governments are constantly at odds with each other, historically there have been issues in which they have agreed to cooperate. One of those issues is the supply of profitable labor for the Dominican sugar cane industry. During the 1960's and well into the 1980's, the Dominican and Haitian government agreed on a series of labor contracts where the Haitian government would supply Haitian workers for the Dominican sugar cane operations. The RCC hierarchy remained silent on the failure of the Dominican government to properly document the immigrant employees and protect their immigrant rights. This fact was particularly visible when the Dominican government closed the immigration office to Haitian cane cutters, starting in 1989, in order to deport them in 1990, when their documents expired.

During the 1990's, the Haitian and Dominican bishops called on the Haitian government to properly document the workers being sent to the Dominican Republic. Again, the absence of a similar request for the Dominican government is noteworthy.¹⁹⁶

The reforms brought by the popular movements in the post Vatican Two era have especially been aimed at adult education. The need for literacy training has been stressed. The Haitian Pastoral Center has promoted literacy training for Haitian immigrants in the Spanish language. Haitian children were encouraged to enroll in from kindergarten to fourth grade in areas where schools were available.

Haiti was and remains to this day predominantly Roman Catholic. The presence of the popular church movement in the Roman Catholic Church is significant among the Dominicans in the Dominican Republic but to a lesser degree among the Haitian immigrants. The popular movement among Roman Catholics in Haiti is very strong and has become part, and at times a dominant part, of the political scene in Haiti.¹⁹⁷

The presence of the theology of liberation has fostered dialogue in the political, educational and social work, as well as in ecclesiastical circles. Not all of the participants in the dialogue were liberation theologians. To be sure, the themes of class dominance,

Dominican Republic but the worst abuses were reported in Haiti (Edmón Confidant, interview, June 6, 1992). "Dominican Government Deports Haitians Again," *Haiti Info*, Vol.5, No. 5, (February 8, 1997), p. 4. In Haiti, Father Jean Marie Vicent was assassinated on August 28, 1994. He was a vocal opponent of the Haitian military government. Reuters, "Paramilitares haitianos asesinan párroco católico seguía Aristide," *El Nacional* (August 29, 1994). Raschid Zaiter, "Radiografía de un crimen," *El Nacional* (September 5, 1994), editorial. Systematic executions by the para-military in Haiti was a common occurrence during the 1990s.

¹⁹⁵ "Cardenal declara Haití necesita ayuda sustancial," *Listín Diario* (October 13, 1996). p. 16A.

¹⁹⁶ *Ibid.*

¹⁹⁷ Moya Pons, *Manual...*, pp. 519-520; Moya Pons, *El Batey...* pp. 68-69; Wipfler, *op.cit.* pp. 94-95.

political oppression, class struggle and liberation were discussed.¹⁹⁸ The dialogue in the Dominican Republic was most fervently carried on among the laity of the RCC and progressive educators, journalists and lawyers.¹⁹⁹

Above and beyond what has been observed about the absence of serious critique by the traditional RCC concerning the Dominican political, judicial and labor practices, one observes an acculturation process at work. The traditional focus for RCC ministry is to treat the Haitian as a temporal visitor within the Dominican Republic. The religious services rendered are forced. The RCC hierarchy needed to be reminded by John Paul II (December, 1980) to minister to the Haitian immigrants. As a result the Haitian Pastoral Center was formed in on October 12, 1985. Yet, the hierarchy maintains its posture of deploring abuses but not addressing the Dominican responsibilities.

In order for the Haitian immigrant to be normalized in his society he will require certain stable social conditions in terms of legality, family rights, health care, education, labor laws and other civic rights. In terms of his legal status in the country, immigration and civic rights need to be defined and defended. As a member of a family unit there is a need to define immediate and nuclear family rights and legally document the members of the family. In order to work and live a quality life, preventative and curative health care is required. Schools for children and education for adults are important in order to develop one's communication, vocational and knowledge skills. Workers are to organize and seek the best wages and labor conditions. Freedom of religion and conscience is to be sought.

The RCC in the Dominican Republic has two opposing views as to how the Haitian immigrant can obtain normalcy. The traditional view is that Haitians are temporary immigrants in the Dominican Republic and they will find their social normality by returning to Haiti. The populist view is that Haitian immigrants should be able to express their search for identity and normalcy within the context of their Dominican situation. Currently, the traditional view is dominant in the Dominican Republic.²⁰⁰

The service rendered to the Haitian immigrant by the RCC is influenced by the view of which the church has of itself and of the Haitian immigrants. For some, the RCC in the Dominican Republic exists to serve the Dominican population, first of all. For others, the RCC is to serve all who inhabit the Dominican Republic.

The traditional view of ministry among the Haitian immigrant is to provide services to the Dominicans and include the Haitians by way of exception. Haitians are allowed to participate in the RCC institutions if they adapt to the Spanish language and Dominican leadership. Dominican immigration, military and labor authorities are asked to minimize their abuses of the Haitian immigrants. An emphasis is placed on supporting the political

¹⁹⁸ The author observed the RCC base communities in the Yamasá and Plata regions from 1985-1990 which are demographical areas with many Haitian immigrants. The base communities were Dominican led and attended. The situation is different in the southern Barahano region.

¹⁹⁹ A social scientist who continues to monitor the Haitian immigrant situation is Ramón Antonio Veras, a journalist and lawyer who wrote, *Inmigración-Haitianos-Esclavitud* (1983). His second book, *Migración Caribeña* (1985), looks at the legality of the labor contracts between Haitian and the Dominican Republic, comparing his findings to other countries such as Venezuela and Puerto Rico. Maurice Lemoine, *Azúcar Amargo: Hay esclavos en el Caribe* (1982) gives a moving narration complete with pictures of the Haitian sugar cane cutter situation.

²⁰⁰ Leoncio Peralta, "Monseñor Adames, "El de dominicanos y haitianos es un matrimonio impuesto," *Listín Diario* (February 6, 1997). Altagracia Moreta Feliz, "Avelino Fernández dice que le padre Milton Ruiz no conoce el problema haitiano," *Listín Diario* (January 20, 1997) p.8.

and cultural views of the Haitian RCC hierarchy and criticize the popular Haitian government ushered in by Aristide. Gratitude is expressed for the development of the Haitian Pastoral Center, even though its outreach is limited.²⁰¹

The populist sees the Haitian immigrant as a victim of a political and cultural war between the powers that be. Blame for the continual abuse of the Haitian immigrations is laid at the feet of the powers of the state, military, labor and church. Ministry takes the form of human rights documentation and denunciations, community projects, adult education and contextualized worship services. The basis for operation is the local community and the communication channels are the local and internal press.²⁰²

The Haitian Pastoral Center bridges both the traditional as well as populist view of ministry. This is facilitated by having Haitian priests employed through the Center in order, together with sympathetic Dominican priests, to work with the Haitian immigrants.

3.4. Conclusion

Without analyzing the role of Biblical and theological truth in the traditional hierarchy and popular movements in the RCC, this Chapter has established that the hierarchy of the Dominican RCC have contributed to the disfranchisement position of the Haitian immigrant in the Dominican Republic by failing to condemn the Dominican legal, military and labor abuses of the Haitian immigrants and by not applying ecclesiastical sanctions against the abusers. The RCC laity have challenged the Dominican, Haitian and international neglect of the Haitian immigrant. The Haitian Pastoral Center has served as a balance between the traditional hierarchy and populist movement within the Dominican RCC and it continues to serve as a beacon of socio-political hope for changing the Haitian immigrants' status in the Dominican society.

²⁰¹ "El cardinal..." *op.cit.*

²⁰² José Castillo, *La Inmigración de Braceros Azucareros en la República Dominicana* (1978); Lemoine, *op.cit.*; Esteban Rosario, *Iglesia Católica y Oligarquía* (1991); Roman Antonio Veras, *op.cit.*

CHAPTER 4

PROTESTANT CHURCHES IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC AND THE HAITIAN IMMIGRANTS

Thesis 3. *While many of the traditional Protestant churches in the Dominican Republic are part of the disfranchisement of the Haitian immigrants several groups have established ministry among the immigrants.*

4.1. Introduction

One of the fastest growing churches during the 1970's and 1980's were the Haitian immigrant churches in the Dominican Republic (Chapter 6). A variety of international and national para-church ministries operate alongside the Protestant churches, especially in the fields of education, human rights advocacy, social work, and Christian literature distribution (Section 4.2.5). The birth and development of the ICRRD is closely related to the development of Dominican Protestantism. Traditional Protestantism, like its RCC predecessor, would marginalize the Haitian immigrants from most of its ministries. It would take a special strategy to break with the socio-cultural patterns of disfranchisement.

4.2. Protestant Churches in the Dominican Republic

After the arrival of Roman Catholicism at the close of the fifteenth century and the beginning of the sixteenth century, four distinct movements of Protestant Christianity entered and developed in the Dominican Republic after the arrival of the Roman Catholics.²⁰³ The four periods include: the early representation of European Protestants (1528-1824); 2) North American Protestant involvement (1824-1924); 3) the establishment of denominational Dominican Protestantism (1924-1965); and 4) the current denominational and para-church growth in Dominican Protestantism.

²⁰³ The authors of the CONPAS 92 study classified the variety of Dominican Protestant groupings as: Liturgical, Historical Evangelical, and Pentecostal. Three distinct theological groups are recognized as they manifest themselves in the Dominican Republic. Church historian George Lockward identifies the non-Roman Catholics as Protestants. This study recognizes the same groups but seeks to classify Protestants as an historical movement which includes both Europe and the Americas. They are theologically "evangelical" in the sense of holding to the basics of the gospel and the practice of evangelizing. Also, they are theologically related to the sixteenth century Protestant churches. These include the Lutheran, Anglican, Reformed, and Presbyterian churches. Out of the Protestant churches arose renewal movements such as the Baptist, Methodist, Wesleyan, Moravian, Congregational, Nazarene, Missionary Alliance, Brethren, and other eighteenth to twentieth century denominations present in the Dominican Republic. The most significant renewal movement within twentieth century Protestantism has been the Pentecostals and Charismatics.

4.2.1. Early Representation of European Protestants (1528-1824)

In previous chapters it had been described that Protestantism was established in the Dominican Republic in 1824. Earlier attempts had been made but had been eradicated either through external persecution or internal disintegration.²⁰⁴

The first recorded peaceful entrances of Protestants into Hispaniola were members of the Welsers banking family expedition the year of 1528. They were willing to establish a colony in the Caribbean or Latin America. Charles V, King of Spain, was willing to repay the monetary debt to the Welser bankers with conquered land. The Welsers were loosely associated with German Lutheranism. The Welser colonists moved from Hispaniola to Venezuela in 1528.²⁰⁵

In 1594, "Lutheran" influences on the northern coast of Hispaniola were denounced by the Archbishop of Santo Domingo, Nicolás de Ramos. The focus of attention was the northern coast, including the island of Tortugas. By the end of the sixteenth century, a reported 300 confiscated copies of Protestant Bibles were burned in front of the Santo Domingo cathedral.²⁰⁶

The northern coast of Hispaniola was also frequented by English and French pirates and buccaneers. In 1605-1606, the colonial authorities destroyed a series of their northern coastland cities and retreated to the safer confines of Santo Domingo, in the south.²⁰⁷

English buccaneers, under the leadership of Anthony Hilton, established a "puritan" colony on the island of Tortugas during the years 1631-1635. The Spanish from Santo Domingo overtook the island in 1635, killing or enslaving more than 600 persons.

The Spanish Dominicans routed the followers of the renegade French Huguenot, known by historians as Captain Le Vasseur. He was on Tortugas from 1640-1652.

Tortugas Island served the English, Dutch, and French as a launching point for attacks against the Spanish in the eastern part of the island, as well as a centre for contraband trading. However, piracy and contra banding did not develop a stable atmosphere for the establishment of Protestant Christianity on the island.²⁰⁸

²⁰⁴ Alfonso Lockward, in *Intolerancia y Libertad de Cultos en Santo Domingo* (1993) gives a detailed documentation of the heresy trials from the 1500's to the 1800's. The name "Lutheran" does not refer necessarily to members of the Lutheran Church but more generally to non-Roman Catholics.

²⁰⁵ Sidney Rooy, in "La llegada de los "luteranos" a Venezuela," in *Iglesia y Misión* #37 (July-Sept., 1991), pp. 28-29, seriously questions the degree of Lutheranism of the Welser expedition in Venezuela. The expedition decided not to stay in the Dominican Republic but settled in Venezuela. No Lutheran church work was reported in the Venezuela.

²⁰⁶ George Lockward, *El Protestantismo en Dominicana* (1982), p. 9, 428.

²⁰⁷ Frank M. Pons, *Manual de Historia* (1995), pp. 51-61.

²⁰⁸ Peña Batlle, *La isla de la Tortuga* (1988) pp. 55f. documents the Calvinist influence in Tortuga. Such influences were reported as early as 1594. Jacques Pannier and Gustave Mondain (ed.) *L'expansion française outre-mer et les protestants français* (1931); González, *Misión...*, p. 415; J. Metzler (ed.) *sacrae Congregationis...* pp. 1131-1161; Arthur Newton, *The European Nations in the West Indies* (1933), pp. 171-175 and Pons, *op. cit.*, pp. 79. A. Lockward, *op. cit.*, pp. 212-218 refutes Batlle's observations about the influence of Protestantism in Haiti. He correctly points out the role of Voodoo. The first name of Le Vasseur is not identified by the above mentioned authors.

Protestantism was not formative in the development of Haiti prior to the nineteenth century. Roman Catholicism remained the dominant religion with Voodoo as the other major religious movement.

As was the case with European Roman Catholicism, the European Protestant representation in Hispaniola from 1528-1824 was deeply influenced by mercantile and imperial interests. The close association of the Protestants with pirate activities put Protestants in conflict with the Spanish and colonists. One of the major influences associated with the Protestant-pirate hegemony was its association with slave trading to Hispaniola in 1528. The fact that the Welsers, in the fifteenth century and the West Indies Company, in the seventeenth century, were early carriers of Protestants as well as African slaves, associated European Protestants with the slave trade. Besides such a negative association, little is recorded as to the Protestant evangelization of the African and Indian American peoples in Hispaniola.

The absence of Protestantism prior to 1824 can in part be attributed to the dominance of Roman Catholicism on Hispaniola. However, the moral and religious weakness of Protestantism must also be signaled as a contributing explanation for the absence of Protestantism. The attempts to establish Protestant missions and churches did not occur until 1824 and then, not through the traditional European or North American churches but as represented by the freed African-American slaves coming from the northern USA through Haiti.

4.2.2 North American Protestant Involvement (1824-1922)

The Haitian revolution of 1792 led to a sequence of events which would open the doors for Protestants to permanently enter Haiti, and via Haiti, into the Dominican Republic. Recall from Section 3.2.1.1. that the Roman Catholic leaders in Haiti sided with the defeated French colonists. Since the Haitian revolution, priests had been leaving Haiti and President Alexandre Peti6n had given Quakers and Wesleyan Methodists from North America permission to immigrate to Haiti in the early 1800's. This resulted in over 6,000 African-Americans with Protestant affiliations coming to the northern region in the Dominican Republic. This occurred in 1824, under the regime of Haitian President Jean Pierre Boyer, whose troops had captured all of Hispaniola in 1822.²⁰⁹

The Protestant groups entering in the Dominican Republic had unique characteristics. They were Wesleyans, African-American, lower class, and dedicated to rural labor. Anglo-American missionaries soon joined the growing movement. The Protestants lived in the more desolate northern regions and were favored by the Haitian invaders.²¹⁰ At the time of the Dominican liberation from Haiti in 1844, the Protestant community was well established and allowed to stay in the Dominican Republic.

The first Protestant church in the Dominican Republic was the *Iglesia Africana Metodista Episcopal Church* (IAME: African Methodist Episcopal Church). It settled

²⁰⁹ George Lockward, *op. cit.*, p. 9-14. The early Haitian leaders were favorably disposed toward Protestants, not for Protestant doctrinal reasons, but to create a counter balance toward French and Spanish colonialism. For a chronology of events prepared by Jean Stephens, see pp. 85-94.

²¹⁰ The Wesleyan-Methodist movement can be considered part of an evangelical reformation within the Protestant churches in England. It is notable that the first Protestants did not enter Hispaniola through European American leadership. Anglo Wesleyan and Methodist missionaries would come later.

into the northern Samaná region. Lay preacher, Isaac Miller, was the first minister. Religious services were started in 1824. The denomination was organized in 1899 as a mission church.²¹¹

Wesleyan missionaries began to work, first of all with English speaking African-Americans in the northern part of the Dominican Republic, and eventually initiated work in the Spanish language. Methodist missionary William Tawler, who came in 1834, was the first Spanish speaking missionary to preach in the Dominican Republic. The Wesleyan work was integrated into the *Iglesia Evangélica Dominicana* (IED: Evangelical Dominican Church) and the *Iglesia Metodista Libre* (IML: Free Methodist Church) in the twentieth century.²¹²

In 1899, a Methodist lay missionary, Samuel Mills began preaching throughout the northern region. Under much pressure, imprisonments, and setbacks, he was able to motivate the development of mission churches as well as formal educational activities. The Free Methodists became national leaders in the development of Christian schools.²¹³

The Episcopal Church (English speaking, later *Iglesia Episcopal Dominicana* (IEPD)) started its work in 1898, ministering to English speaking visitors from England, the Antilles, and the USA. Soon, Spanish speaking ministry was developed. The church maintained a British flavor. Contacts with the Haitian Episcopal Church were maintained. The ordination of the first Episcopal priest for the Dominican Church, the Rev. Benjamin L. Wilson, was conducted by the bishop James Theodore Holly of Haiti. Bishop Holly was ordained in 1895 as the first African ordained bishop for the Protestant Episcopal Church in Haiti.²¹⁴

The entrance of the *Iglesia Moraviana* (IM: Moravian Church) into the Dominican Republic was initiated in 1905 by African-Antillean sugar cane workers and administrators. A new church was inaugurated in San Pedro de Macoris in 1911. Most of the Moravian Church was integrated into the Evangelical Dominican Church union of 1919-1920.

The *Iglesia Evangélica del Séptimo Día* (IESD: Evangelical Seventh Day Adventist Church) work was started in 1907 by the Jamaican evangelist, Charles Moulton. A school and eventually a church were established in 1909 in the sugar cane town of Batey Consuela as well as in the region of Santo Domingo. The Seventh Day Adventist has developed considerably through the planting of churches, the founding of elementary schools, high schools, and higher educational institutions.²¹⁵

The first Presbyterian and United Brethren representatives were sent from Puerto Rico in 1911. The doctors, Philo W. Drurry (Presbyterian), and Nathan H. Huffman (United Brethren), came to explore the possibilities of working together. The history of the resulting work will be discussed in chapter 5.

²¹¹ Lockward, *op. cit.*, pp. 283-292 records the early history of the African Methodist Church in the Dominican Republic. The letters of William Cardy are the subject of A. Lockward, *Cartas de Cardy, Primer Misionero Metodista en Samaná* (1988).

²¹² George Lockward, *Correspondencia de Tindall, Primer Misionero Protestante en Dominicana* (1981).

²¹³ George Lockward, *El Protestantismo...* pp. 292-301. Israel Brito B., *Historia de la Iglesia Metodista Libre Dominicana* (1978).

²¹⁴ Lockward, *op.cit.*, pp.314-327. Margaret Short, "Toward the Renewal and Growth of the Dominican Episcopal Church: A Practical and Theological Case Study," (1992)

²¹⁵ Lockward, *op. cit.*, pp. 379-384.

The union of Wesleyan, United Brethren, Methodist, Presbyterian and Moravian groupings was accomplished in 1919 and the *Iglesia Evangélica Dominicana* (IED: Evangelical Dominican Church) was formed in 1922. The Brethren Church was introduced into northern Dominican Republic through a railroad accountant who, by 1919, was transferred from Argentina. By 1921, missionary Arthur Peterkin and his wife came to work in La Vega. Despite notable violent reactions from Roman Catholic clergy and lay persons, the work grew.²¹⁶

Haitian Baptist congregations were planted in the La Romana sugar cane region in the early 1920's. Due to a shortage of pastors, visiting pastors came from Haiti. Lay leaders assumed most of the church's responsibilities.

The entrance of Protestantism into the Dominican Republic was greatly influenced by two political factors. One, the external intervention of the Haitian invasion in 1824 and the USA occupation in 1916 opened the door for Protestant entry, and two, the Dominican Constitution as formulated in 1844 guaranteed the freedom of religion. Through the Haitian invasion of 1824-1844, freed African-American slaves from North America came and stayed. After the declaration of Dominican freedom in 1844, the Methodists, Wesleyans, Episcopalians, Moravians and Adventists became established. The USA take over of the island from 1916-1924 were also years when the Presbyterians and Baptist become part of the growing Protestant scenario in the Dominican Republic and the first national Dominican denomination was born, the *Iglesia Evangélica Dominicana* (IED: Dominican Evangelical Church).

4.2.3. Establishment of Denominational Dominican Protestantism (1922-1965)

The early 1920' s was the scene of two important Protestant developments. One was the formation of the IED, which consisted of a joint effort of the Methodists, Presbyterians, United Brethren and Wesleyan. This marked the first union movement among the Dominican Protestants. The intent of the new denomination was to establish a national church, even though the first superintendents were North Americans.

The second significant movement towards the development of the identity of the Protestant Dominican national church was the coming of the Pentecostals. Some of the early Pentecostal preachers, like Salomón Feliciano, cooperated with the Presbyterians and later the IED. Once the Pentecostal congregations began to organize, they would become the largest Protestant movement in the Dominican Republic in the twentieth century.

The first Pentecostal missionary, Salomón Feliciano, came to the Dominican Republic in 1916. Street preaching in cities, such as San Pedro de Macoris, was the main initial activity. The first congregations did not become established until the 1930' s. In 1933, a pastor from Haiti invited the Church of God in Haiti to work in the Dominican Republic.²¹⁷ The first *Asamblea de Dios* (AD: Assembly of God) started in 1942 in Pedro Cabrera. By 1946, the *Iglesia de Dios* (ID: Church of God) had 10 congregations. Another large denomination, *Arca de Salvación* (AS: Ark of Salvation) was begun in 1945. Today the Pentecostal churches are the most numerous, accounting for more than

²¹⁶ *Ibid*, pp. 384-391.

²¹⁷ Derk Oostendorp, *Desde Lutero...* pp. 59.

200 distinct denominations making up 62.7% of the total Protestant population in the Dominican Republic. The largest Pentecostal group is the Assemblies of God, followed by the Church of God of Prophecy and the Church of God.²¹⁸

A variety of Evangelical Protestants followed the initial Protestant groups, especially since the language barriers had been conquered. The *Templos Evangélicos* (TB: Evangelical Temples) were established in 1939; the *Iglesia Evangélica Misionera* (IEM: Evangelical Missionary Church) in 1945, the same year the *Iglesia Evangélica Menonita* (IEMen: Evangelical Mennonite Church) came; and in 1962, the *Iglesia Bautista* (IB: Southern Baptists) was initiated.²¹⁹

The early Protestants were primarily introduced into the Dominican Republic through the African-American networks, either via Haiti or the Antillean islands, in particular Puerto Rico. This accounts for the entrance of the American Methodist Episcopal, Wesleyans, Methodists, Moravians and Episcopal, Baptists, Pentecostals, and Seventh Day Adventists. Iberian-American work was developed through the Free Methodists, Evangelical Dominican, and later, Bible Temples, Evangelical Temples, Evangelical Missionary, Mennonite, and Baptist churches.

The year 1965 represents the passing away of non-democratic governments and the coming of democracy. The doors of opportunity for service continued to open, not only for new denominations but also for ecumenical and para-church ministries.

4.2.4. Growth of Dominican Protestantism (1965-present)

According to the 1987 Dominican government statistics, there were 6,707,710 inhabitants in the country. CONPAS 92 reported 138,783 registered members and an estimated 276,000 affiliates for Protestant churches. The Protestant churches' membership and affiliate attendees constitute an estimated 6.18% of the total population. From 1974 to 1988 the number of Dominicans who were members of or regularly attended Protestant churches increased by 5.37%.²²⁰

Some of the Dominican churches continue to denominationally or ecumenically relate to mainline European and North American churches. These churches include the *Iglesia Africana Metodista Episcopal*, the *Iglesia Episcopal Dominicana*, and the *Iglesia Evangélica Dominicana*. From 1974 to 1988, their adult membership rose from 8,856 to 10,625 and number of churches from 51 to 67. The North American initiated theologically conservative churches went from 13,122 members in 184 organized churches in the year 1974 to 20,513 members in 375 churches. National conservative groups grew from 360 in the year 1974 in 9 churches to 2865 in 33 churches. North American related Pentecostal churches accounted for 16,280 members in 290 churches in the year 1974 and 49,184 members in 779 churches in 1988. Nationally initiated Pentecostal groups are estimated at 10,000 members in 125 churches in the year 1974 growing to 20,000 in 250 churches in the year 1988. The Adventist grew from 8,319 members in an estimated 50 organized churches in the year 1974 to an estimated 25,000 members in 143 churches in the year 1988.²²¹

²¹⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. pp. 342-354; *Desde Lutero...*, CONPAS 92.

²¹⁹ Lockward, *op. cit.*, pp. 391-421.

²²⁰ *Desde Lutero...*, pp. 86-89.

²²¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 82-89.

The Dominican Haitian churches, which will be further studied in section 5.3, constitute the fastest growing church during the 1970's to the 1990's in the Dominican Republic.

The CONPAS 92 missiological analysis of the Protestant churches in the Dominican Republic, a study of which the author was a participant, came to the following conclusions about the years 1974-1990. First, virtually all of the Protestant churches were growing. If they were not growing it was usually due to a church split. Secondly, the traditional Pentecostal churches had grown the most in number. Third, historical Protestant churches were maintaining their membership numbers through the influence of evangelism in their congregations and finally, the Haitian Protestant churches were among the fastest growing church groups in the Dominican Republic.

The Protestant movement has been promoted through a variety of Protestant mission agencies to which we now turn our attention.

4.2.5. Protestant Mission Agencies (1965-present)

There are a variety of Protestant mission agencies which have an international background and are working in the Dominican Republic. They are working in the areas of Bible distribution, medical work, social services, educational ministries, family, youth organizations and human rights investigation.

4.2.5.1. Communications and Literature Distribution

Early Protestant missionaries, such as Rev. John Tindall (1836) and Rev. William Tawler (1839) distributed Bibles prepared by the British Bible Society and American Bible Society. Rev. William Cardy obtained French Bibles in 1941.²²² In 1929, the Bible Society work was initiated in the Santo Domingo area, under the auspices of the office in Havana, Cuba. In 1951, the first depot was opened in the Dominican Republic.²²³ Today, the United Bible Society is the largest Bible distributor in the nation. French and, periodically, Haitian Creole Bibles are made available.

The Gideons International came to the Dominican Republic in 1963 and made their presence known through distributing Bibles in public institutions. The Gideons were led by prominent Protestant leaders such as George Lockward, Julio Rodríguez and Roque Polanco, and from 1973 until 1993, Julio Postigo.²²⁴

The Bible League opened its office and depot in 1990. The first national director of the Bible League in the Dominican Republic was Pastor Pierre Philippe of the Christian Reformed Church. Due to the close cooperation of the Bible League with the Christian Reformed Church, many of their Bible needs, as well as some of the Haitian Creole materials, are supplied through them. The emphasis of the Bible League is to encourage Protestant churches to plant churches as well as distribute Bibles.

With the exception of *Radio Revelación*, most of the Protestant radio and television programs rent air time from secular stations.

²²² Lockward, *El Protestantismo...*, pp. 428-429.

²²³ *Ibid.*, p. 429; Brito, *op. cit.*, 93.

²²⁴ Lockward, *op. cit.*, pp. 444-446.

4.2.5.2. Health

Missionary medical work was first of all administrated through denominational agencies. The IED established medical work in the early 1920's which developed into the *Hospital Evangélica* and a school for nurses. Before closing in 1955, the hospital and school had not only served thousands of patients, but introduced the first pre-natal clinic, set up an x-ray centre, and offered special services to mothers and children. The hospital and school were closed due to the availability of government hospitals and schools and the lack of funds to maintain the institutions.²²⁵

The *Caravanas de Buena Voluntad* (Goodwill Caravans) originated in Costa Rica and came to the Dominican Republic in 1959. The idea of having a team of doctors, nurses and para-medical helpers to go to areas needing medical attention was well suited for the Protestant churches. George Lockward observes:

The Protestants with their liberty to initiate programs without having to consult religious authorities have demonstrated a great capacity of services in the poor sectors.²²⁶

In addition to mobilize quickly, the medical missions multiplied rapidly. A Dominican counter-part to the Goodwill Caravans, *Sociedad Médica Cristiana*, was established by Dr. Socrates Perez. The Medical Assistance Program (MAP) was introduced by the Baptist minister Howard Shoemaker in the early 1960s.²²⁷

The Christian Medical Society (CMS), based in Texas, USA, also developed an extension program in Santo Domingo. This led to the establishment of the DELE eye clinic and the building of Elias Santana hospital in Los Alcarrisos. The eye clinic provides eye check-ups and used glasses for hundreds of patients per week. The hospital specializes in eye surgery, general surgery and child nutrition programs. CMS continues to conduct medical caravans throughout the country as well as in Haitian immigrant regions, such as Sabana Grande de Boya.

The Luke Society, which cooperates with the ICRRD, was set-up in the mid-1980's in conjunction with Dr. Socrates Perez of the *Sociedad Médica Cristiana*. Preventive health care and medical consultations were the major activities. Dr. Perez was followed in the late 1980's by Dr. Silvia Ricardo Martinez, member of the Haina ICRRD church. The *Sociedad Lucas* was nationalized in 1995. The medical centre is located in Los Angeles, close to the National Ministry Centre of the ICRRD. In conjunction with the Reformed Congregations Diaconal Committee from the Netherlands, a community health program is conducted in the bateyes of Barahona and responses are made to natural disasters and emergency situations.

²²⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 362-376. Lockward notes that if the hospital and nursing school would have adopted self-support principles from the beginning that it could have continued to serve the Dominican Republic.

²²⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 438.

²²⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 442-443.

4.2.5.3. Social Services

Social services, like medical mission work, were initiated through the respective denominations. In 1961, the *Servicio Social de Iglesias Dominicanas* (SSID: Social Services of Dominican Churches) was organized as a social service counter part to Church World Services (CWS) of the National Council of Christian Churches (NCCC). Initial leadership came from expatriates working with the Episcopal and IED churches. SSID specializes in development work. To be sure, it has played a crucial role in emergency aid, such as during the 1965 Revolution and the 1979 hurricane David.²²⁸

Para-church agencies such as Child Care International, Compassion International, Tear Fund, World Relief and World Vision have developed educational, community development, construction and emergency help projects. Denominational agencies continue to undertake social work, but it is within the organization. Ecumenical and para-church agencies are involved in the larger projects.

In light of the limited medical resources in the *bateyes*, medical caravans have been an effective means to bring preventative, curative and surgical health to these areas. The Christian Medical Society, the Luke Society and the Good Samaritan are three health ministries that offer consultations, medicines, referrals and follow up care. The local church serves as a meeting place and church leaders cooperate in offering services to the community.

The diaconal committee of the ICRRD is very active in cooperating with ALFALIT and SSID in promoting women's programs and emergency relief. The ICRRD formed a community development program called DESCO. It serves as a model for facilitating the cooperation of ecumenical projects, international missions with local congregational deacons.

4.2.5.4. Education

Many of the denominations in the Dominican Republic have developed educational ministries. Unlike medical and social work missions, denominations or agencies closely associated with churches have developed schools. The oldest and largest is associated with the Free Methodist Church. As of the 1990's, the *Instituto Evangélico* in Santiago is the largest evangelical school in the Dominican Republic. The ICRRD is associated with COCREF (*Colegios Cristianos Reformados/ Christian Reformed Schools*) which accounted for 22 schools, 65 teachers, and a budget of \$84,000 US each year.²²⁹ At the beginning of the 1990's there were more than 1,500 Haitian immigrant children enrolled in the COCREF system.

Alfalit Dominicana was active during the 1980's in teaching Dominicans and Haitian immigrants how to read in Spanish. Several projects were undertaken to teach Haitian Creole literacy to Haitian immigrants. The Haitian literacy training efforts come and go, depending on international funding.

The *Universidad Nacional Evangélica* (UNEV: National Evangelical University) started in Santiago in 1986, when the government granted a decree for UNEV to give bachelor degrees. Two extensions were set up, one in Villa Altagracia (agricultural

²²⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 431-436; Brito, *op. cit.*, pp. 98-102.

²²⁹ Ray Brinks, "Colegios de la Iglesia Cristiana Reformada," *El Siglo* (April 16, 1991), p. 12.

studies) and the other in Santo Domingo. Santo Domingo became the largest student center, with over 200 part time students registered in 1992. The inter-denominational effort includes leaders from all the major denominations in the Dominican Republic. Most of the students and graduates are in the area of education.²³⁰

4.2.5.5. Family and Youth Services

Youth organizations, especially international youth projects, are popular on the tourist island. The international groups cooperate with national groups in work projects. Interdenominational youth programs began to flourish during the 1970's. The first program YMCA, was introduced in 1968. Some of the programs include: *Cruzada Estudiantil* (Campus Crusade); InterVarsity Christian Fellowship (IVCF); *Juventud para Cristo* (Youth For Christ); *Juventud Con Una Misión* (Youth With A Mission); World Servants (Holland and USA) and others associated with Christian Colleges and denominations.²³¹ The influence of the youth groups on the Haitian immigrants is two-fold. Some of the Haitian immigrant youth cooperate with national and international youth ministries. However, the most visible contribution by international youth groups has been the number of building projects which have been conducted during the 1970's and 1980's.²³²

Family programs and counseling services are offered through the local congregations as well as through professional services. Many of the social service ministries have a family counseling component, especially for the poor.

4.2.5.6. Human Rights Advocacy

International human rights agencies have sought to bring attention to the "forced labor" conditions of the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic. American Watch, Amnesty International, *Episcopal Pastoral Haitiana*, Lawyers Committee for Human Rights, the National Coalition for Haitian refugee, the United Nation's Commission on Slavery, and the U.S. Committee for Refugees are among the better known and vocal groups.²³³

Unlike the RCC in the Dominican Republic, the Protestant churches are not the religion of the state nor do they benefit from receiving special status from the government. Nevertheless, the large quantity of immigrants poses an opportunity for potential votes for the political parties. Traditionally, the Dominican Haitian vote sided with one of the long time leaders of the *Partido Revolucionario Dominicano* (PRD), Peña Gomez, who was born of a Haitian mother and who survived the 1937 massacre while living close to the Dominican-Haitian border. On the other hand, the long time secretary of the *Partido Reformado*, Alfonso Lockward, was a strong advocate for Haitian rights

²³⁰ UNEV promotional literature.

²³¹ The author's family hosted groups from Dordt College, IVCF, TASK, Redeemer College, Reformed Bible College, and YWAM.

²³² The ICCRD community was the recipient of dozens of youth work crews from 1985 to 1991. Groups of youth came from Calvin College, Dordt College, Trinity College, Redeemer College as well as young people with church work crews.

²³³ American Watch, "Half Measures: Reform, Forced Labor and Dominican Sugar Industry," (March 1991); Robin Kirk, "Stone of Refuge: Haitian Refugees in the Dominican Republic," (1991).

and a just treatment of the immigrants. His intercession on behalf of the Haitian political refugees, of Haitian Protestants and his work to promote educational, medical and social work among the Haitian immigrants is noteworthy.²³⁴ Nevertheless, during the last decades of the 20th century, the Haitian immigrant was virtually powerless against the sanctions of the Dominican government, except to voice complaints to national and international advocacy groups about abuses in immigration, labor and military activities.

Protestant voices were active in reporting human rights abuses to international human rights organizations who in turn reported the cases to the international press. Most of the attention generated about the plight of the Haitian immigrants from Protestant sources in the Dominican Republic is channeled through international sources such as American Watch, the National Coalition for Haitian Refugees, Oxfam, the United Nations Working group on Slavery and among others, the Committee of External Affairs of the United States Congress.²³⁵

Protestant voices have protested the deportation of Haitian workers, the unjust labor conditions, the recruitment of minors, employee abuses and other irregularities of the Dominican sugar cane industry. The most vocal has been the *Acción Social y Pastoral de la Iglesia Episcopal* led by Rev. Edwin Paraison.²³⁶

Protestant churches have become a temporary haven of refuge for Haitian immigrants but little has been accomplished for long term community building. As with the RCC hierarchy, the traditional Protestant church leaders do not call for the legalization of the Haitian immigrant in the Dominican Republic. This call comes from the international missionaries and community.

In order for the Haitian immigrants to become legally normalized in the Dominican context the following would be required:

1. The legalization of the status of the Haitian immigrant by the Dominican government;

²³⁴ Lockward supported the *Caravanas Médicas* among the immigrants, provided Creole Bibles through his association with DELE and supported the work of the *Templo Biblico* in the Haitian *bateyes*. He provided educational scholarships and low interest loans to aspiring Haitian youth and workers. Lockward served as a special counselor for the Haitian ambassador, Guy Alexandre. His intellectual studies include a thorough study of the Haitian constitution, from which the Dominicans borrowed freely in defining their 1844 constitution. See *La Constitución Haitiano-Dominicano de 1843* (1995). Lockward was imprisoned by the PRD government due to his association with the CETEC University in which several medical doctors were caught selling titles. Ironically, it was Lockward who alerted the authorities, including the FBI, to the fraudulent practice of these professors. This political imprisonment in the worst prison of the Dominican Republic, la Victoria, of the politically most important evangelical Dominican figure, did not deter Lockward from continuing writing, advocacy work and providing facilities for the newly formed *Universidad Nacional Evangélica* (UNEV) in Santo Domingo.

²³⁵ American Watch, "Harvesting Oppression: forced Haitian labor in the Dominican Sugar Cane Industry," (1991) and "Half Measures: Reform, Forced Labor and the Dominican Sugar Industry," (1991). Certain missionaries of the ICRRD and pastors of the Episcopal Church cooperated with American Watch; Kirk Robin, "Stone of Refuge: Haitian Refugees in the Dominican Republic," (1991). Edwin Paraison, "Grupo Pastoral Haitiana Expone en EU caso braceros," (1991), p. 8. United Nations Economic and Social Council: Commission of Human Rights, "Preliminary Report for 1982 to the United Nations Working Group on Slavery: Haitian Migrant Labor in the Dominican Republic," E/CN.4AC.2/1982/5:3.

²³⁶ Paraison, *op cit*.

2. The documentation of the second and third generation of Haitian immigrant children as Dominicans or legal immigrants.
3. The promotion and recognition of Haitian and Dominican legal papers
The presence of para-church agencies facilitates inter-denominational cooperation and has been helpful for a diverse Protestant community to face the tremendous task of evangelizing, training leaders, educating, social work, Bible and literature distribution, and political advocacy.

4.2.5.7. Multiculturalism

The history, cultural and socio-economic realities of the Haitian immigrant in the Dominican Republic do not favor an idealistic multiculturalism for society or the church. Yet, the church must be a model community and point to social as well as spiritual solutions. The fact that Dominicans, Haitians and international missionaries are working together is a hopeful sign for the future. So what type of multiculturalism is needed?

The uniculture model would adopt the Dominican language, Dominican leadership and develop Dominican institutions or they would only use the Haitian language, leadership and institutions. The multicultural model allows for and actively promotes the use of different languages, a variety of local leadership and encourages the expression of one's culture in the family, church and community. However, within the multicultural Christian community, both uniculturalism and multiculturalism will be expressed and needs to be channeled in the most constructive way.

The Baptist, Nazarene and Christian Reformed churches have all implemented Haitian leadership, in the Haitian language among Haitian immigrants. The ICRRC have been the most persistent in maintaining Haitian uniculturalism. As a result they are serving the largest Haitian immigrant community. The Dominican leadership and membership in the denomination accounts for perhaps a 20% of the total community. Such a Christian church is not the norm in the Dominican Republic. Yet, such an extreme helps to make up for the lack of Haitian ministry in the traditional Dominican churches.

4.3. Protestant Church Ministries and Haitian Immigrants

In comparison to the RCC presence among the Haitian immigrants as reported in Chapter 3 the Protestant presence among the immigrants is significantly higher. This section will annotate the development of the Protestant churches among the Haitian immigrants and study how the churches and missions minister in their marginal context.

In the CONPAS church reports, the following statistics were presented about Protestant churches working among the Haitian immigrants. Most of the Haitian immigrants can be said to belong to the Baptist, Nazarene, Pentecostal and Christian Reformed denominations.

Name of Church Year Members Affiliates Groups

Haitian Baptist Missionary Church and Baptist Eternal Life Church

1974	620	?	4 (4 ch)
1988	838	?	31(27 ch)

Christian Reformed Church

1976	-	20	1
1987	2853	9108	195 (77 ch)

Nazarene Church

1974	-	-	-
1987	6905	22391	200(180 ch)

Several other churches have a sprinkling of Haitian membership but they are so minimal that they are not included under Dominican-Haitian churches. They include the Bible Temples, Evangelical Temples, Missionary Alliance, Assemblies of God and Free Methodists.

Baptist church memberships remain stable. For the Haitian Baptist Missionary Church and the Baptist Eternal Life Church, church membership increased in the year 1974 from 620 to 838 in the year 1988. In the same period, their church groups grew from 4 churches to 27 churches. The number of their churches multiplied but the average membership of the congregation decreased. As with other Haitian denominations, second and third generation Haitians have become Dominicanized.

The Nazarene work among the Haitian immigrants is concentrated in the southeast sugar cane fields of the Dominican Republic. The Nazarene Church witnessed significant church membership increases from 228 members in full communion in the year 1976 to 5,399 members in the year 1986. The membership continued to increase to 8,078 by the year 1990. Including the 2,175 associate members or affiliates, in the year 1990 totals were 10,253. The Haitian immigrant members account for more than 3,000 people.²³⁷

Several reasons are given to explain the rapid growth of the Nazarene Church in the Dominican Republic in the period from 1976-1986.

First of all, the high immigration rate of Haitians to the La Romana region brought Protestants from Haiti to the region. The Nazarenes had already been working in Haiti since 1945.²³⁸ The Baptist missionary presence in the La Romana and San Pedro de Macoris areas was limited while the need for Haitian ministry continued to increase. Rev. William Porter, then working in Haiti, saw the need to establish the Nazarene church in the Dominican Republic. Together with José Castro, Rev. Librado Figueroa and Dr. José Rodríguez, the mission work of the Nazarene Church was officially initiated on September 24, 1975.²³⁹

The coming of Nazarene international missionaries in 1972 led to the establishment in 1975 of the Nazarene Church in the Dominican Republic.²⁴⁰

²³⁷ "Iglesia del Nazareno-República Dominicana. Datos Estadísticos Periodo 1976-1990," (1993).

²³⁸ Barrett, *op.cit.*, p. 270; *CONPAS* 92, p. 75.

²³⁹ Cristino Peña Tejada, "La Iglesia del Nazareno en la República Dominicana," *Manual de Misionología Evangélica Dominicana: 1987-1988* (1989), pp. 156-157.

²⁴⁰ Barrett, *op cit.*, p. 273.

Evangelistic, educational, and organizational attention was given to both the Dominican and Haitian population. The principles of establishing self-supporting, self-governing, and self-propagating churches were followed. Eventually, both Haitian and Dominican church districts were formed.²⁴¹

The growth of the Haitian immigrant churches began to wane after the year 1986. Ricardo Díaz Polanco, a Nazarene pastor, noted that after the rapid establishment of the Haitian churches, the denomination was concentrating more on the Dominican churches and their leadership.²⁴² The development of a Dominican Protestant leadership that could promote and facilitate Haitian immigrant leadership and membership was considered an improvement over the religious segregation which the international missionaries had encountered in the early 1970's. However, the development of Haitian leadership slowed down as the Dominican leaders assumed the leadership roles in the denomination.

The Assemblies of God, the largest Pentecostal denomination in the Dominican Republic, account for only one Haitian church at the end of the 1980's. Yet, many of the Haitian immigrants come from Pentecostal churches in Haiti. The Haitian Pentecostal churches are not known for sending missionaries to follow-up on their members dispersed throughout the cane-fields nor have Pentecostal missionaries come to establish churches. Haitian immigrants in the urban areas are represented among the Dominican Pentecostal denominations.

The largest Dominican Pentecostal denomination to absorb Haitian churches is the *Asamblea Cristiana Unida*, led by Aurelio Díaz. This denomination consists of a loosely organized association of congregations which work together, especially in the area of social services among the Haitian immigrants. In the year 1978, the denomination reported 500 affiliates. By the year 1992, the denomination consisted of 3270 members in 72 churches, including both Dominican and Haitian. It is estimated that 15 congregations are Haitian.²⁴³

The informal nature of Pentecostal expansion has traditionally meant that Pentecostal denominations have not developed their own denominational mission boards. Pentecostal expansion is usually conducted in a spontaneous, non-formal way. Pentecostal church members have joined existing Protestant churches in the *bateyes* or they have formed their own house church.²⁴⁴

The Christian Reformed churches followed in the footsteps of the Haitian Baptists and the Nazarene work in the southeastern part of the Dominican Republic. The precedent of conducting worship service in Haitian Creole, the building of chapels, the training of local leadership, and the development of the interdenominational and ecumenical networks, all had been functioning prior to the arrival of the Christian Reformed missionaries. The dynamics of the growth of the *Iglesia Cristiana Reformada en la Republica Dominicana*, a church which was organized in 1981 and which by the year 1987 registered 2,853 members, will be studied in Chapter 6.

Several other churches have a sprinkling of Haitian membership, for instance: *Templos Biblicos* (Bible Temples), *Sala Evangélica* (Evangelical Hall), *Alianza*

²⁴¹ Ricardo Díaz Polanco, interview, August 1987, Santiago, DR.

²⁴² *Ibid.*

²⁴³ Barrett, *op. cit.*, p. 270; *CONPAS* 92, p. 75.

²⁴⁴ This observation is affirmed by Ray Brinks and Pierre Philippe of the ICRRD, Ricardo Díaz Polanco of the Nazarene Church and Felix Hernandez of the Assemblies of God.

Misionera (Missionary Alliance), and *Metodista Libre* (Free Methodists). The total church membership of Haitian immigrants in these churches is estimated at several hundred.²⁴⁵

The number of registered Protestant Haitian immigrant membership grew from an estimated 2,000 to 10,595 from the years 1974-1988. Churches increased from a scattering of less than 100 house churches and small missions groups to over 284 registered congregations and several hundred mission churches during the same period. In the context of Dominican Protestantism, the Haitian immigrant churches had the fastest growing membership during the 1980's.²⁴⁶

4.4. Conclusion

This study has proposed that in order to address structural disfranchisement as manifested in government, military, labor, and education action needs to be taken to seek to normalize the human and communal relationships. The historical, cultural, legal, lingual and religious recognition of the Haitian immigrant is vital to overcoming their disfranchisement in the Dominican Republic. Dominican Protestantism also comes from a marginal background and should be in a position to identify with the struggles of the Haitian immigrants.

Even though the Protestant churches in the Dominican Republic are rooted in the North American missionary activities and have experienced influences from her neighbors: Haiti, Puerto Rico, Cuba and the English Antilles, the origins of Protestantism are associated with the era of the Haitian invasion of 1822-1844. The first Protestants came from Haiti and the Haitian invaders favored Protestantism over Roman Catholicism.

The Protestant movement in the Dominican Republic is not consciously associated today with the former Haitian invasion, but Haitian immigrants are still treated as intruders. Even the traditional Dominican Protestant churches have avoided working with the Haitian immigrants. Only a handful of denominations such as the Haitian Baptists, Bible Temples, Christian Reformed and Nazarenes have made significant progress in building the church among the Haitian immigrants.

International advocacy groups and mission agencies have paid special attention to the plight of the Haitian immigrant. Church planting, Christian schools, medical caravans, social work and human rights advocacy international ministries usually are financed from the outside and led by Dominicans. Several notable exceptions are seen with the Bible League (Pierre Philippe) and Human Rights advocacy (Edwin Paraison).

The Haitian immigrant church community will require legal recognition of its leaders, member, churches and Christian institutions in order to maintain normality in their Dominican social situation.

As within the RCC, so in the Protestant church community, the traditional and populist views concerning the presence of the Haitian immigrants are diametrically opposite. The traditional view advocates a unicultural Dominican society in which there is little room for the legalization of the Haitian immigrant. The populist view opts for a

²⁴⁵ The largest would be the Bible Temples who have several congregations in Santo Domingo and region and several in the southwestern Barahona zone.

²⁴⁶ *CONPAS*, pp. 88-89.

multicultural Dominican society where all ethnic and social groups can legally exist. International missions have provided support for the multicultural approach, often times overlooking or being ignorant of the historical conflicts between the two nations in Hispaniola as well as the traditional stereotypes which the Dominicans and Haitians have of each other. The Protestant mission, ecumenical and interdenominational movement, especially in times of emergency and social need, has served as a bridge between the Dominicans and Haitian immigrants. More importantly, several significant denominations have integrated Dominican and Haitians into one cooperating community. These churches present a social model to follow.

PART II

THE REFORMED AND PRESBYTERIANS AND THE HAITIAN IMMIGRANTS IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC CHAPTER 5

THE REFORMED AND PRESBYTERIANS IN THE CARIBBEAN AND LATIN AMERICA (1528-1991)

Thesis 4. *After years of isolation, the international Reformed missionary community has since the 1980's spearheaded ministries among the Haitian immigrants*

5.1. Introduction

The *Iglesia Cristiana Reformada en la República Dominicana* (ICRRD: Christian Reformed Church in the Dominican Republic) was preceded throughout the Caribbean and Latin America by Reformed and Presbyterian churches and missions. The earliest Reformed influence in CALA is attributed to the French Huguenots who established a church in Coligny, Brazil in 1555. The Presbyterians trace their first work to Presbyterians who came to Bermuda in 1609. Chapter 6 will introduce the Reformed and Presbyterian denominations and missions in CALA and indicate how they have directly or indirectly influenced the ICRRD's strategy and mission work.

Section 5.2. presents an overview of the history of the Reformed and Presbyterian churches and mission in CALA. The Dominican Republic is one of the last Caribbean nations to be influenced by the Reformed and Presbyterians. Section 5.3. introduces the ideological considerations regarding their Reformed identities. Three streams of Reformed identity will be described: traditional, ecumenical and evangelical. The Reformed identity is defined in terms of a written confession or statement of faith and is observed in the practice of the church.

The study will demonstrate that the Reformed and Presbyterian churches and missions tradition in CALA influenced the identity and development of the ICRRD. In turn, the ICRRD has made a certain contribution to Reformed Christianity in CALA.

5.2. Reformed and Presbyterian Church and Mission History in CALA

Reformed and Presbyterian church and mission history in CALA can be divided into two eras: the early history from 1555-1916 and the later history from 1916 to the present. Starting in the year 1555, when the French Huguenots established their first Protestant church in Coligny, Brazil, this early history period extends to the year 1916, the year of the Panama Congress, the first Protestant ecumenical council in CALA. The second period starts with the Panama Congress and continues into the present.

5.2.1. Early Reformed and Presbyterian Churches and Missions (1555-1916)

During the sixteenth century, Protestant-like theological reformation attempts were made within the context of the Roman Catholic Church (RCC). The unresolved conflict between Roman Catholics and Protestants led to the formation of a variety of alternate denominational churches and missions scattered throughout CALA. The Protestant church and mission expansion in CALA followed the patterns of early northern European pirate, mercantile and colonial activities until the turn of the century. In the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century, North American influences increased in the economic, political as well as in mission spheres.

Early Protestant church and mission history in CALA begins with the formation by the Huguenots of the first Reformed church in Coligny, Brazil, in the year 1555. By the year 1916, when the first ecumenical CALA conference was called, national Reformed and Presbyterian churches had been established throughout the entire CALA. The Panama Congress in 1916 signaled a parting of ways from European and North American denominationalism towards the establishment of a CALA Protestant identity. In this section the 1555-1916 history of the Presbyterians and Reformed will be studied.

The sixteenth century French Huguenots were at the forefront of Protestant expansion in the Americas. Thereafter came the Dutch, English, Italians and Germans. By the year 1916, the Reformed churches had at one time or another established 61 congregations in 19 nations employing 11 missionaries and at least 258 ministers. The place and the dates of the origin and presence of the work include the French Huguenots in Brazil (1555-1558) and Surinam (1686-1783), the Netherlands Reformed Church in Brazil (1625-1654; 1911- present); St. Eustatius (1630-1850's), Tobago (1630-?), Curacao (1634-present), St. Martin (1648-1792), St. Thomas (1660-1827), Surinam (1667-present), St. Kitts (1722-1774), Saba (1736-1816), British Guyana (1736-1845), St. John (1750-1828), Aruba (1822-present), Bonaire (1843-present) and Argentina (1895- present). The Reformed Church in America began in St. Kitts (1774-1792) and St. Thomas (1827-present). The Waldensians worked in Uruguay (1856-present) and in Argentina (1859-present). The Reformed immigrants from the Netherlands started up in Argentina (1895- present).²⁴⁷

²⁴⁷ Statistics, as used in this Section, are taken from Neal Hegeman, "Charts," in *Reformed and Presbyterian Churches and Mission in the Caribbean and Latin America. 1528-1916*, (2000). Churches whose historical roots are associated with the coming of the French, Dutch, English, Italians and Germans are listed in alphabetical order, not counting the Presbyterians who are mentioned in footnote three. GKC (*Gereformeerde Kerken in Curacao*: Reformed Churches in Curacao); GKNVB (*Gerformeerde Kerken in Nederland (Vrijgemaakt)* in Brazilia: Reformed Churches in the Netherlands (Liberated) in Brazil); GKNVC (*Gereformeerde Kerken in Nederland (Vrijgemaakt)* in Curacao: Reformed Churches in the Netherlands (Liberated) in Curacao); GKNVS (*Gereformeerde Kerken in Nederland (Vrijgemaakt)* in Suriname: Reformed Churches in the Netherlands (Liberated) in Surinam); GKP (*Gereformeerde Kerk van Paramaribo: Reformed Church of Paramaribo*); HKS (Hervormde Kerk in Suriname: Reformed Church in Surinam); IEFA (*Iglesia Evangélica Francesa en Argentina*: French Evangelical Church in Argentina); IEPA (*Iglesia Escocesa Presbiteriana de la Argentina*: Scottish Presbyterian Church of Argentina); IERBA (*Iglesia Evangélica Reformada de Buenos Aires*: Evangelical Reformed Church of Buenos Aires); IEVA (*Iglesia Evangélica Valdense en Argentina*: Waldensian Evangelical Church in Argentina); IEVA (*Iglesia Evangélica Valdense del Río de la Plata*: Waldensian Evangelical Church of Rio de la Plata); IPEA (*Iglesia Presbiteriana Escocesa en Argentina*: Scottish Presbyterian Church in Argentina); IRA (*Iglesias Reformadas en la Argentina: Reformed Churches in Argentina*); NHKS (*Nederlandse Hervormde Kerk in Suriname*: Netherlands Reformed Church in Surinam); VPGA (*Verenigde Protestantse Gemeente van Aruba*: United Protestant Church of Aruba); VPGC

Reformed influence in Haiti and the Dominican Republic occurred during the sixteenth and seventeenth century in the northern coastal regions. Pirate, buccaneer and some colonial activity on Tortugas Island also included persons associated with the Huguenot faith. Yet, a Reformed church was not established in Hispaniola until the year 1981.²⁴⁸

The Presbyterians came to CALA at the beginning of the seventeenth century. They generally established English speaking colonies. They include Bermuda (1644-present); Antigua-Bahamas-Martin (early 1700's), Saba (1736-1755), Jamaica (1800-present), British Guyana (1815-present), Grenada (1830-present), Trinidad (1836-present) and St. Lucia (1896-present). Presbyterian work in Spanish speaking nations originated in Argentina (1829-present), Columbia (1856-present), Mexico (1872-present), Chile (1873-present), Guatemala (1882-present); Cuba (1884-present), Puerto Rico (1899-present); Venezuela (1897-present), Dominican Republic (1911-1920) and Peru (1916-present).

By the year 1916, the Presbyterians had worked in a total of 474 churches scattered throughout 22 nations. The mission boards employed over 163 international ordained missionaries, 159 international lay missionaries and 61 international ordained pastors were sent as ministers of congregations. There were 111 national ordained ministers, 340 national workers and more than 40 national missionaries were sent, for a total number exceeding 874.²⁴⁹

(*Verenigde Protestantse Gemeente van Curacao*: United Protestant Church of Curacao); Sources for information: M. Dalmas, *Historia de los Valdenses en el Río de la Plata* (1973); L. Knappert, *Geschiedenis van de Nederlandsche Bovenwindsche eilanden...* (1932); W.L. Villalpando, *Las Iglesias del Trasplante* (1970); J.M. Van der Linde, *Surinaamse suikerheren en hun kerk* (1966); A.W. Marcus, *De geschiedenis van de Nederlandse Hervormde Gemeente in Surinam* (1935); J.W. Ort, *Vestiging van de Hervormde Kerk in Suriname: 1667-1800* (1963); F.L. Schalkwijk, *Igreja e estado do Brazil Holandes: 1630-1654* (1984). Neal Hegeman, "Reformed Churches and Missions in CALA," Chapter 5, gives an historical review of Reformed churches and missions in CALA prior to 1916

²⁴⁸ Manual A. Peña Batlle, *La isla de la Tortuga* (1988), pp. 55f, González, *Misión...*, p. 415. J. Metzler, ed, *Sacrae Congregationis ...*, pp. 1131-1161. Arthur Newton, *The European nations in the West Indies* (1933), pp. 171-175. A series of churches came out of the French Reformed influences: EEG (*Eglise Evangélique de la Guyana*: Evangelical Church of Guyana); EEGUA (*Eglise Evangélique de la Guadeloup*: Evangelical Church of Guadeloupe); ERF (*Eglise Réformée de France*: Reformed Church of France); ERFM (*Eglise Réformée de France de Martinique*: Reformed Church of France of Martinique); ERS (*Eglises Réformées de la Suisse*: Reformed Church of Zwitzerland); UEE (*Union de l' Eglise Evangélique*: Union of Evangelical Churches); UEELF (*Union des Eglises Eangélique Libres de France*: Union of Free Evangelical Churches of France Reformed Churches of Zwitzerland

²⁴⁹ Hegeman, "Charts, *op. cit.* Abbreviations as they appear in chronological order include: CE (Church of England); CS (Church of Scotland); GMS (Glasgow Mission Society); PCS (Presbyterian Church in Scotland); FCS (Free Church of Scotland); RCE (Reformed Church in England); UFCS (United Free Church of Scotland); PCBer (Presbyterian Church in Bermuda); SMS (Scottish Missionary Society); PCJ (Presbyterian Church in Jamaica); USC (United Scottish Church); UPC (United Presbyterian Church); USCS (United Secession Church of Scotland); CST (Church of Scotland in Trinidad); PCC (Presbyterian Church in Canada); IPC (*Iglesia Presbiteriana en Chile*: Presbyterian Church in Chile); PCUS (Presbyterian Church in US (Southern)); PCUSA (Presbyterian Church in USA (Northern)); IPPR (*Iglesia Presbiteriana de Puerto Rico*: Presbyterian Church of Puerto Rico); PG (Presbytery of Guyana); PCG (Presbyterian Church of Guyana); FCS (Free Church of Scotland); IEPA (*Iglesia Escocesa Presbiteriana de la Argentina*: Scottish Presbyterian Church of Argentina); IPB (*Igreja Presbiteriana do Brasil*: Presbyterian Church of Brazil); IPIB (*Igreja Presbiteriana Independente do Brasil*); IPV (*Iglesia Presbiteriana en Venezuela*: Presbyterian Church in

The arrival of Presbyterian representatives to the Dominican Republic during the first decades of the twentieth century was the first permanent Reformed influence on Hispaniola. The visits eventually led to cooperation with several small Protestant groups and the formation of the *Iglesia Evangélica Dominicana* (IED) in 1922. The Dominican Republic was the last Spanish speaking Caribbean island to be introduced to Presbyterianism. In fact, Presbyterians became so absorbed in developing schools, seminaries, hospitals and churches in Puerto Rico, that most of the Presbyterian mission focus and resources in the Caribbean were placed there. Presbyterians did not establish in Haiti.

5.2.2. Later Reformed and Presbyterian Church and Mission (1916-present)

After the year 1916, the slow process of nationalizing the Reformed churches in CALA began. The Reformed churches in CALA can be categorized according to language groups: French, Dutch, English, Spanish, Portuguese, Hungarian, German, Papiamentu, Haitian and some indigenous languages.²⁵⁰ The following is a brief overview.

The French Reformed work is concentrated in the French speaking Caribbean and Argentina. As of the year 1980, five congregations are found in French Guyana, eighteen in Guadeloupe, one in Martinique and one in Argentina. Most of the Reformed work is among French immigrants and through the military chaplaincy.

Dutch speaking ministries continued after the year 1916 in Argentina, Aruba, Bonaire, Brazil, Curacao and Surinam. Papiamentu was used as the main language in some of the churches in the Netherlands Antilles. The Dutch immigrants to Brazil and Argentina led to the establishment of colony congregations at the beginning of the twentieth century.

Venezuela); PCB (Presbyterian Church in Belize); IPNM (*Iglesia Presbiteriana Nacional de México*: National Presbyterian Church of Mexico); ARPC (Associate Reformed Presbyterian Church); IENPG (*Iglesia Evangélica Nacional Presbiteriana de Guatemala*: National Evangelical Presbyterian Church of Guatemala). Sources include: D.A. Bisnauth, *A Short History of the Guyana Presbyterian Church* (1970); Doodnath, C.A. Dunn, "The Great Divorce and What Happens to the Children," (1971); I. Hamid, *A History of the Presbyterian Church in Trinidad: 168-1968* (1980); G.S. Mount, *Presbyterian Missions to Trinidad and Puerto Rico: The Formative Years* (1983); W.L. Villalpando, *Las Iglesias del Trasplante* (1970); S. Morton, *John Morton of Trinidad* (1916); *Annual Report of the BFM of the PCUSA; Annual Report* (PCUSBFM).

²⁵⁰ Hegeman, "Reformed Churches and Missions in CALA," Chapter 7, gives a historical description of the CALA Reformed churches from 1916-1990. ICRCR (*Iglesia Cristiana Reformada en Costa Rica*: Christian Reformed Church in Costa Rica); ICRCu (*Iglesia Cristiana Reformada en Cuba*: Christian Reformed Church in Cuba); ICRES (*Iglesia Cristiana Reformada en El Salvador*: Christian Reformed Church in El Salvador); ICRH (*Iglesia Cristiana Reformada en Honduras*: Christian Reformed Church in Honduras); ICRLB (*Igreja Crista Reformada Latino Americano do Brasil*); Latin American Christian Reformed Church of Brazil) ICRN (*Iglesia Cristiana Reformada en Nicaragua*: Christian Reformed Church in Nicaragua); ICRPR (*Iglesia Cristiana Reformada en Puerto Rico*: Christian Reformed Church in Puerto Rico); ICRRD (*Iglesia Cristiana Reformada de la República Dominicana*: Christian Reformed Church in the Dominican Republic. See also *Annuaire...*; Barrett, *op. cit.*, "Argentina," "Brazil," "French Guyana," "Guadeloupe," "Martinique," "Surinam,"; Reformed Church of America, 1989 *Directory* and 1988 *Financial Statements of the General Synod* (1989); *Protestant Reformed Acts of Synod. 1987*; Sidney Rooy, letter, March 1990; *CRC Acts of Synod 1986*; *CRWM Annual Reports. 1991*; Hegeman, *Iglesia Dulce...*; *Informes al Sínodo 1979 (IEVRPA)*; Informe (December, 1984); R. Boersema and Jacob Glas, *Congress...3*; István Kotsis, letter, March 2, 1990.

By the year 1980, there were three congregations in Argentina, three in Brazil and 11 in Surinam for a total of 17 congregations with 5,646 members, 11,766 affiliates and 9 pastors.

The Presbyterian English speaking churches trace their roots to their beginning in Bermuda at the beginning of the seventeenth century. During the twentieth century, English speaking Presbyterian churches were to be found in the Antigua, Bahamas, Belize, Bermuda, Cayman Islands, Grenada, Guyana, Jamaica, St. Lucia, Tobago and Trinidad. Two English speaking Reformed churches were operative during the 1980's. The Reformed Church in America church in St. Thomas consists of one congregation, with 136 adult members and 60 affiliates. The Protestant Reformed missionaries working with a national church of seven congregations and 404 total adherents left Jamaica near the end of the 1980's.

The Spanish speaking Reformed church ministries occurred in eleven nations in CALA: Argentina, Costa Rica, Cuba, Dominican Republic, El Salvador, Guatemala, Honduras, Mexico, Nicaragua, Puerto Rico and Venezuela. The 180 congregations were served by 36 international missionaries, 137 national pastors, involving 15,086 adult members and a total of 30,780 affiliations.

The Portuguese work is represented by the Presbyterians in Brazil, numbering over 800,000 affiliates by the end of the 1970's.

The largest Hungarian Reformed church work is in Brazil, with 18 congregations and a reported 14,000 affiliates. It is complimented by three small congregations in Argentina, Uruguay and Venezuela. Services are also being held in the more predominate Spanish and Portuguese languages.

Two German-speaking, Swiss Reformed congregations are located in Argentina and Brazil, accounting for an estimated 2,200 affiliates. Like the Hungarian Reformed, the second-generation immigrants and new affiliates are using the Spanish or Portuguese language.

The newest language group among the Reformed churches was officially recognized in the year 1981 with the formation of the ICRRD. The ICRRD uses both the Haitian Creole and the Spanish. The *Eglise Evangélique Réformée* (EERH), consisting of many ICRRD deportees, started in the year 1985 in Haiti. It has steadily grown from three congregations in 1985 to 15 by 1992.

Presbyterian missionaries and national pastors in Brazil, Guatemala, Mexico and Peru also utilize indigenous languages when applicable. The predominant trend among indigenous people is to maintain the indigenous language in the rural areas while switching to Spanish and Portuguese in urban areas.

The largest language group among the Presbyterians and Reformed is Portuguese, followed closely by Spanish speakers. Missionaries and national workers continue to show versatility in being able to learn and work in a variety of languages. This is also the case for missionaries working with the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic as they learn both Spanish and Haitian Creole.

There are more than two million Presbyterians and Reformed church members in CALA. Yet, the international mission movement flowing out of the CALA Presbyterians and Reformed is very limited. The vast majority of Reformed and Presbyterian missionaries in CALA come from the United States. Increasing emphasis on training and sending CALA missionaries is needed.

5.2.3. Denominational, Interdenominational, Global Confessional and Para-church Agencies

The Reformed and Presbyterian churches organize their mission work at a variety of levels. International denominational agencies generally seek the cooperation of national denominations. Such cooperation would consist of the church sending missionaries to establish or conduct missions with churches belonging to the same ecclesiastical federation.

In interdenominational missions, two or more churches or denominations agree to cooperate in mission work. The agreements may be as informal as granting emergency relief after a natural disaster or as formal as establishing ecclesiastical relationship with the cooperating denomination.

Global confessional agencies consist of churches and mission agencies worldwide, which agree to partner in mission activities. Global or international cooperation has historically been accomplished in two ways: 1) through denominational representation in international ecumenical councils and 2) through church participation in international confessionally defined para-church ministries.

Para-church agencies are controlled and administrated by their self-defined board and mandates. Para-churches mission agencies may or may not have denominational representation.

Reformed and Presbyterian missions in CALA is represented in all of the above mentioned partnerships.

5.2.3.1. Denominational Agencies

During the twentieth century, evangelism and follow-up church planting and educational activities were the mission priorities of the Reformed and Presbyterian missions. Generally speaking, Reformed and Presbyterian denominational missions have advanced in church development, diaconal work, evangelism, family services, literature distribution, youth services and other ministries for the national church.

The Reformed churches' denominational mission agencies have been active throughout CALA. The largest work is carried by the CRCNA, working in 13 countries. The RCA has its largest representation of missionaries in southern Mexico. RCA missionaries are also present in Honduras, St. Kitts, St. Thomas and Venezuela. The Dutch *Gereformeerde Zendingsbond* (GZB: Reformed Missions League) worked in Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Guatemala, Nicaragua and Peru during the 1980's. The Dutch *Gereformeerde Kerken in Nederland* (GKN: Reformed Churches in the Netherlands) has missionaries in Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Costa Rica, Nicaragua and Suriname. Smaller representation of Dutch missionaries include the Liberated GKN in Brazil, Curacao and Suriname, and the *Christelijke Gereformeerde Kerk* (CGK: Christian Reformed Church) in Brazil. From the North American side, the Netherlands Reformed Congregations (NRC) is found in Bolivia, the Free Reformed Church (FRC) in Guatemala, the Protestant Reformed Church (PRC) were in Jamaica and Independent Reformed groups are active in Mexico.

The Presbyterian churches' denominational missions have been active throughout CALA. The Presbyterian Church USA (PCUSA) is active in the World Council of Churches (WCC), the National Council of Christian Churches (NCCC), and Latin American regional ecumenical programs. Mission to the World (MTW) of the Presbyterian Church of America

(PCA), a denomination which started in 1973, has missionaries in Brazil, Central America, Chile, Colombia, Ecuador, Mexico and Peru. The Associate Reformed Presbyterian Church (ARPC) has been working in Mexico for close to a century. The Cumberland Presbyterian Church works in Columbia (IPCC). The Orthodox Presbyterian Church (OPC) had a very small presence in Surinam.

During the last two decades, the PCUSA and CRCNA denominational agencies have operated on a full time basis in the Dominican Republic. The Presbyterian Church US (PCUS), now known as the PCUSA, supported the work of Rev. T. Dodd who worked with the IED until his retirement in the late 1970's. The Spanish broadcasts of the Back to God Hour (BGH) of the CRCNA made periodic contacts with listeners in the Dominican Republic from 1971 on. The Christian Reformed World Relief Agency (CRWRC) became involved in extensive relief efforts after the devastation of Hurricane David in the year 1979. Christian Reformed World Missions (CRWM) sent their first full time missionary, Rev. Ray Brinks, to the Dominican Republic in the year 1980.

At the end of the twentieth century, the Dominican Republic had two Reformed denominations, the IED and the ICRRD. The IED related with international denominations through their involvement in the ecumenical movement. The ICRRD basically stayed as a receiving church to the CRCNA rather than maturing into a mutual sending partner in international missions. A strategy for such a partnership has not been entertained by the ICRRD or CRCNA.

5.2.3.2. Interdenominational Agencies and Partnerships

In this Section, a variety of Reformed and Presbyterian mission partnerships in CALA are identified. North American denominations are crossing denominational lines in order to work in mission partnerships. Cooperation continues to be given from Europe as well as from Asia.

National Presbyterian churches and missions are partners of CALA Reformed churches and missions within the same nation. This was true for the *Iglesia Escocesa Presbiteriana de la Argentina* (IEPA: Scottish Presbyterian Church of Argentina) and the *Iglesias Reformadas en la Argentina* (IRA: Reformed Churches in Argentina), as well as the *Igreja Presbiteriana do Brasil* (IPB: Presbyterian Church of Brazil) and the *Igreja Evangélica Reformada do Brasil* (IERB: Evangelical Reformed Church of Brazil). The IEPA is a small ethnic transplant church depending on other Reformed churches for ministers and fellowship. The IPB is a large and growing national church that helps out the smaller transplanted IERB church.²⁵¹

The *Iglesia Presbiteriana Nacional de México* (IPNM: National Presbyterian Church in Mexico) has since 1925 cooperated with the Reformed Church in America (RCA).²⁵² The partnership has resulted in one of the largest Presbyterian movements in CALA. In describing the RCA's involvement in Mexico, Charles van Engen writes:

²⁵¹ Villalpando, *op. cit.*, pp. 107-109; Barrett, *op. cit.*, p. 149; letter, Kenneth Murray, January 30, 1988; *Hand Book of Member Churches: World Alliance of Reformed Churches* (1989), p. 27.

²⁵² Hugo Esponda, *Historia de la Iglesia Presbiteriana de Chiapas* (1986); Charles Van Engen, "Chiapas para Christo-Chiapas For Christ," *Charm and Challenge of Chiapas*: 1986, p. 8; Van Engen, interview, May, 1985, Holland, Mich.

After nearly 60 years of Reformed Church participation in mission in Chiapas the picture is an astounding one...Over 120,000 Presbyterian Christians speaking six different languages. Over 800 chapels and places of worship...Over 60 ordained pastors speaking four languages and many unordained lay pastoral church workers...Over 100 village health care clinics under the jurisdiction of the local churches...Four Bible schools and leadership training programs....²⁵³

On a far smaller scale, the *Iglesia Presbiteriana de Venezuela* (IPV: Presbyterian Church of Venezuela) started a joint venture with the RCA in education in 1989. Cooperative efforts were realized with the *Seminario Evangélico* as well as with local congregations.²⁵⁴

The *Iglesia Presbiteriana Independiente de México* (IPIM: Independent Presbyterian Church in Mexico) agreed to work with the Christian Reformed Church in North America (CRCNA) starting in 1962. Joint efforts were made in church planting and leadership training. The *Juan Calvino Seminario* continues to prepare national pastors.²⁵⁵ The IPB in Brazil also cooperated with the CRCNA. The church planting and leadership training venture lasted from 1967-1990.²⁵⁶

The *Gereformeerde Kerken in Nederland* (GKN: Reformed Churches in the Netherlands) works together with the *Iglesia Evangélica Presbiteriana de Chile* (IEPC: *Evangelical Presbyterian Church of Chile*). The mission activities are centered on education.²⁵⁷ Another Dutch mission agency, the *Gereformeerde Zendingsbond* (GZB: Reformed Missions League) works with the *Iglesia Presbiteriana Nacional de Chile* (IPNC: National Presbyterian Church of Chile), the *Iglesia Evangélica Presbiteriana en Perú* (IEPP: Evangelical Presbyterian Church in Peru), the *Iglesia Evangélica Nacional Presbiteriana de Guatemala* (IENPG: National Evangelical Presbyterian church of Guatemala), and the *Iglesia Presbiteriana de Colombia* (IPCo: Presbyterian Church of Colombia).²⁵⁸

Ecclesiastical Presbyterian partnerships have not been developed with the ICRRD in the Dominican Republic. Latin American Presbyterian pastors and seminary professors have lectured at ICRRD meetings. Presbyterians have worked in short term para-church construction and/or youth projects in the Dominican Republic. However, ecclesiastical relationships have not been developed between international Presbyterian denominations and the ICRRD.

²⁵³ Van Engen, *op. cit.*, pp. 3-4.

²⁵⁴ Interview with Richard van Voet, November, 1988; Barrett, *op. cit.*, p. 741; WARC membership book (1989), p. 36.

²⁵⁵ The Christian Reformed Church *Acts of Synod* gives mission field information.

²⁵⁶ Carl Bosma, letter, August, 1990; Timothy Pennings, "The Baptism of Brazil," *Impact* (1989), p.7; Thomas De Vries, "Christian Reformed World Mission Report 1989," p. 43.

²⁵⁷ *Voortgangverslag beleid Zuid-Amerika Orgaan* (1982), p. 30; Hans De Wit, "Santiago, wat een stad!" *Vandaar* (June-July, 1980), p. 11.

²⁵⁸ Barrett, *op. cit.*, pp. 226-230; "Chili," *GZB info bulletin* (1982); William Van Laar, "Het presbyterianisme in Chili: Toekomst of versterving," *Wereld en Zending* (August 20, 1987), p. 3; Pedro Quiroz Arana, *Testimonio Político* (1987); J.E. De Groot, *Ik weet waar gij woont: De Iglesia Evangélica Presbiteriana del Peru, haar context, geschiedenis en huidige situatie*, (1979); John Kessler, *A Study of the Older Protestant Missions and Churches in Peru and Chile* (1967); Leo Smelt, *La Misión de la Iglesia Evangélica Presbiteriana del Perú en la sociedad peruana actual y la herencia de la reforma* (1987); Jan van Roest, letter, September, 1988.

The ICRRD maintains an active partnership with the CRCNA. Missionaries continue to be sent and national programs continue to receive support. Plans were made for CRWM to continue to work directly with the ICRRD until the year 2005.

The ICRRD has ties with the *Eglise Evangélique Réformée* (EERH: Evangelical Reformed Church in Haiti). The EERH has remained relatively small and did not receive the same degree of ecclesiastical and financial help from CRWM, as ICRRD has. The ICRRD received from CRWM during the 1980's more than 10 ordained ministers, while the EERH received one. Attempts were made by the respective churches and mission agencies to agree upon and carry out a unified mission strategy for Haiti and the Dominican Republic, but that failed.

The ICRRD has focused its interdenominational ecclesiastical relationship with one international denomination, the CRCNA. Churches and mission groups from non-CRCNA are actively cooperating with the ICRRD and this is carried out on a local and regional level.

5.2.3.3. Global Confessional Bodies

At the time of writing, the ICRRD does not have membership in any global confessional body. Practically, the ICRRD participates in ecumenical social work projects sponsored by SSID, which in turn cooperates with Church World Services (CWS) of the National Council of Christian Churches (NCCC).

The *Iglesia Evangélica Dominicana* (IED) and the *Iglesia Episcopal Dominicana* (IEPD) are members of the Latin American Council of Churches (CLAI). They are not members of the World Council of Churches (WCC). The IEPD is active in the human rights documentation of abuses of Haitian immigrants.

ALFALIT Dominicana and SSID are the main ecumenical projects within the Dominican Republic which receive ecumenical aid. ICRRD's leadership has been involved at the board, as well as staff level, of both institutions.²⁵⁹

The ICRRD is not involved as members of global confessional bodies, yet they cooperate in social work projects sponsored by the CWS, WCC and SSID.

5.2.3.4. Para-church Agencies

The CALA Reformed and Presbyterians are involved in communication and literature distribution, health care, social services, education, family and youth services.

Since 1916, para-church mission agencies associated with Reformed people have scattered throughout CALA. The tradition of Reformed or Presbyterian personnel working with Bible Societies is traced back to the Waldensian pastor, Benjamin A. Pons. In 1898, he began to work with the *Sociedad Bíblica Británica y Extranjera* (British and Foreign Bible Society) in Buenos Aires.²⁶⁰

A variety of Reformed leaders and church members are employed by Bible Societies. In Argentina, for example, Rev. Tomás Mulder worked with the United Bible

²⁵⁹ The IED has participated in AIPRAL (Association of Reformed and Presbyterian Churches of Latin America) as well as CIEMAL (Council of Evangelical Methodist Churches of Latin America/ *Consejo de Iglesias Evangélicas Metodistas de América Latina*). *73 a Asamblea General Anual* (1995), pp. 56-57

²⁶⁰ Dalmas, *op. cit.*, p. 85.

Society (UBS). Pedro Arana also served as the national director of the UBS in Peru. Robert Scholman worked with the Bible Society of the Antilles.²⁶¹ The Wycliffe Bible Translators (WBT) employ Reformed translators in Mexico, Brazil, Peru and Surinam.²⁶² The Bible League has established itself in Mexico as well as, among other CALA countries, in the Dominican Republic.²⁶³

Several printing and literature distribution services are related to the Reformed CALA community. The interdenominational *Editorial La Aurora* published Reformed materials until closing in the mid-1980's. Ecumenical agencies, such as the WCC publish *Contact* in a variety of languages, including French, Portuguese and Spanish. Christian bookstores in the main urban centers offer Reformed literature prepared by CLEI, FELIRE, La Estandard de la Verdad, Libros Desafios, Logoi and UNILIT.

The CRCNA's Spanish program of the Back to God Hour, La Hora de la Reforma, is heard throughout CALA. Periodic television programs are sponsored by the BGH as well.

Para-church health care services are provided by the Luke Society. Under the leadership of Dr. Peter Boelens the Luke Society established clinics and medical work in Ecuador, the Dominican Republic, Honduras and Mexico.

Several para-church diaconal and social services, coming from abroad, work with the ICRRD. They include: ALFALIT International (literacy training); Compassion International (child education sponsorship) and TEAR Fund (development projects). This in turn is complimented by denominational mission diaconal programs like the Christian Reformed World Relief Committee (CRWRC).

Several Interdenominational educational institutions are administrated by or taught in by CALA Reformed persons. Dr. Gerardo Viviers taught theology for many years at ISEDET in Buenos Aires. Viviers has the distinction of being the first CALA Reformed pastor or leader to obtain a doctorate degree in theological studies. The primary schools of Tres Arroyos, Argentina, the primary schools and secondary school of the IERB in Brazil, and the ICRRD schools in the Dominican Republic, are closely associated with the Reformed churches. During the 1980's, World Wide Christian Schools (WWCS) began making its impact on education in CALA by helping schools develop their buildings and introducing scholarship programs.²⁶⁴ Ecumenical programs supported by Reformed Churches continue to support educational programs throughout CALA.²⁶⁵

International Youth organizations which cooperate with the ICRRD include: College students from Calvin College, Dordt College, Redeemer College, Reformed Bible College, Youth For Christ; Youth With A Mission and World Servants from the Netherlands and the USA. Besides participating in educational activities, the students have helped in the construction projects of churches, schools and camp grounds.

The ICRRD leadership involvement has developed in several major areas via the para-church mission network. Rev. Pierre Philippe, pastor of an ICRRD church and president of the national council for a number of terms, has directed the Bible League outreach in the Dominican Republic. Another ICRRD member, Dr. Silvia Ricardo Martínez,

²⁶¹ Sociedad Antiano de Beibel: Report of the Board (1986).

²⁶² Chester Schemper, "The World Home Bible League and Latin America," *Crossing Latin Borders*, No. 2 (1987), pp. 3.1f.

²⁶³ The periodical, *The Other Side*, gives WBT supporters an overview of their work. Letter from WBT regional representatives for Michigan, Bob and Bernie Ellen, February, 1986.

²⁶⁴ World Wide Christian Schools promotional materials.

²⁶⁵ 1986 WCC Resource Sharing Book, pp. 700f.

is the director of the Luke Society. Their office and clinic is near the national ministry center of the ICRRD in Santo Domingo. Milagros Comprés has served as one of the educational directors of COCREF. Future leaders in the areas of education, social work and church work are being prepared at the National Evangelical University (UNEV).

The para-church movement has made quick inroads into the ministries associated with the ICRRD in the Dominican Republic. The para-church movement is able to by-pass the international mission agency's control, the denominational hierarchy's supervision and overcome ecclesiastical and theological barriers simply by relating directly to local Christians and churches for ministry. Several para-church agencies, such as the Bible League, Luke Society, Dominican Social Services and the World Wide Christian Schools, have taken deliberate steps to develop a working relationship with denominational mission agencies and churches.

With the multiplying number of mission cooperation efforts it will be a challenge to define and maintain one's own theological and ecclesiastical identity. The identity questions continue to be addressed within the denominational structure of the ICRRD.

5.3. Identity of the Reformed and Presbyterians in CALA

Thesis 5. *The ICRRD consists of independent evangelicals who are becoming evangelical reformed.*

In ecclesiastical and theological publications, "reformed" can have a generic, a denominational or a typological meaning. Sections 6.3.1. – 6.3.3. defines and explains the traditional, ecumenical and evangelical characteristics identifiable among the Reformed in CALA. Each of the Sections will observe how the different Reformed identities are expressed in the ICRRD.

Calvinistic Reformed doctrines are held by Reformed Anglicans, Reformed Presbyterians, Reformed Congregationalists, Reformed Baptists and several other groups of Christians who have publicly affirmed the sixteenth and seventeenth century Reformed doctrines. This includes the Waldensians, who pre-date the sixteenth century Reformation, and who officially joined the Reformed movement in 1532.

The sixteenth century Reformed worldview emphasized the glory of God in all aspects of life (*solī Deo gloria*), His sovereign grace for salvation (*sola gratia*), justification through faith alone (*sola fide*), salvation in Jesus Christ alone (*solus Christus*) and the sufficiency of Scripture on matters of faith and life (*sola Scriptura*). What ties all these theological concepts together is the emphasis on the sovereignty of God, that is, His control over all that happens in the universe. He rules by His Word. He sent His Son for salvation. He requires faith in His Son for salvation. He elects for salvation and He does all things for His glory. The Reformed world and life view is thoroughly theological, God – centered.²⁶⁶

The Reformed did not start in an ecclesiastical, historical and theological vacuum. It was a movement claiming to be a return to the foundations of the one holy catholic and apostolic church. The foundations were not defined in terms of one particular institution but rather it was articulated in relationship to the Biblical and apostolic truths. Jean Calvin (1509-1564) observed:

²⁶⁶ Belgic Confession (BC), Art. 1 and 2; Canons of Dordt (CD) 1.6, and 1.18; Heidelberg Catechism (HC) Lord's Day 1, 2 and 48.

If the Church is founded on the doctrine of the apostles and prophets, by which believers are enjoined to place their salvation in Christ alone, then if that doctrine is destroyed, how can the Church continue to stand? The Church must necessarily fall whenever that sum of religion which alone can sustain it has given way. Again, if the true Church is "the pillar and ground of the truth" (I Tim. 3:15), it is certain that there is no Church where lying and falsehood have usurped the ascendancy.²⁶⁷

In separating from the medieval European RCC and forming a multitude of national, provincial and local churches, the institutional unity of the "one holy catholic" church was altered. Calvin reasoned that wherever the Word of God is sincerely preached and the two sacraments are properly administered, there the Church exists.²⁶⁸ The true Church is not perfect for "in this Church there is a very large mixture of hypocrites....," but inasmuch as the means of grace are properly exercised, the Church could be considered as Christian.²⁶⁹

The sixteenth century Reformed churches spoke of the true and false church. According to the Belgic Confession, the false church could be recognized in the following ways: 1) more authority assigned to the church than to God's Word; 2) lack of submission to Christ; 3) unbiblical administration of the sacraments; 4) man - centeredness and 5) the persecution of true believers. Such a definition was generally associated with the Roman Catholic Church.²⁷⁰

The Reformers translated the Scriptures into the world's main languages, including the Spanish language in 1569. The appearance and wide use of the printing press facilitated the reproduction of pastoral, theological, political and Biblical treatises throughout Europe.²⁷¹

The Reformed missiological view that emphasizes the glory of God in missions sees missions as the extension of God's kingdom. This was well represented by the early Dutch Reformed advocate, Gisbertus Voetius (1580-1676). Voetius defined God's mission as the extension of His glory throughout the world. The threefold goal for missions was: *vocatio et conversio gentium* (the calling and conversion of the gentiles); *plantatio ecclesiae* (the planting of the church) and *gloria et manifestatio gratiae divinae* (the glory and manifestation of divine grace).²⁷²

The Presbyterian movement can be characterized as Reformed in doctrine and Presbyterian in church government. Reformed doctrine was nurtured and developed, as expressed in the Westminster Standards during the middle of the seventeenth century and maintained until the present.²⁷³

²⁶⁷ Jean Calvin, *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, 4.2.1.

²⁶⁸ *Ibid.*, 4.1.9; BC, Art. 29.

²⁶⁹ *Institutes*, 4.1.7.

²⁷⁰ BC, Art. 28, 29.

²⁷¹ Enrique Fernandez and Fernandez, *Las Biblias Castellanas del Exilio* (1976).

²⁷² Calvin, *op. cit.*, 1.1.1. Harvey Conn, ed., *Theological Perspectives on Church Growth* (1976), presents a contemporary expression of Reformed missiology in which the glory of God is central. J.A.B. Jongeneel, "The Missiology of Gisbertus Voetius..," p. 55. The three fold purpose for missions is reflected in the mandate of CRWM as well as the *CRWM Field Strategy for the Dominican Republic* (1982).

²⁷³ Lukas Vischer, "The Reformed Tradition and the Multiple Facets," *The Reformed Family Worldwide* (1999), p. 2; J. D. Douglas, "Calvinism's Contribution to Scotland," *John Calvin. His Influence in the Western World* (1982), pp.217- 240.

Puritan Reformed influences, as expressed through low Anglican, conservative Baptist and evangelical Congregational missionaries, were important in introducing and maintaining doctrinal Reformed teachings in CALA.²⁷⁴

The confessional standards held by the Reformed and Presbyterian churches in CALA are the Helvetica Confessions (First: 1536, and Second: 1566), Calvin's Catechisms (1537 and 1541), the Confession of Geneva (1537), the Belgic Confession (1561), the Heidelberg Catechism (1563), the Canons of Dordrecht (Dordt, 1619) and the Westminster Confession and Catechism (1643-47). Confessions and declarations that are more theologically diverse have since been written, such as the French Confession of Faith and the Barmen Confession. More than 60 Reformed confessional statements and documents could be cited. For our purposes, the Confessions adopted by the sixteenth and seventeenth century Reformed churches will be referred to as the Reformed standards.²⁷⁵

The ICRRD, in its initial synodical meeting on May 1, 1981, adopted the proposal of the CRWM missionaries to recognize the Apostle's Creed as a basic doctrinal statement for the new denomination. The proposal was made by the missionaries in order to recognize the relationship of the new churches with the historical Christian church. The Reformed Three Forms of Unity were translated into Haitian Creole and studied in both Creole and Spanish by the church leaders. The Heidelberg Catechism became a popular teaching document for the Adult Sunday School movement. Other than the Apostle's Creed, no other confessional statement has been adopted by the ICRRD.

Sections 6.3.1. – 6.3.3. will identify three sets of Reformed characteristics being developed in CALA and elsewhere: the traditional, ecumenical and evangelical Reformed types.²⁷⁶ All of the expressions seek to maintain Reformed principles and practices, but defer as to uniformity and pluriformity.²⁷⁷ The identification will take into account the particular development of Reformed characteristics within the broader Protestant movement.²⁷⁸

²⁷⁴ Orlando Costas, *Christ Outside the Gate* (1982), p.69, footnote .

²⁷⁵ *Creeeds of the Churches* (1982)(ed. by John H. Leith), p. 127f.

²⁷⁶ The design of the three fold characteristics is based on observations made by Sidney Rooy, letter, May, 1995. Historians have used a variety of terms to describe the different aspects of Reformed Christianity. They range from: influence (Stanford Reid), to tradition (David Wells), to facet (Lukas Vischer), to characteristics (John Hesselink). Even though all of the above are acceptable, this study has chosen to speak about "characteristics" since it is the most general. See the index of the following works: Jean-Jacques Bauswein and Lukas Vischer, ed., *The Reformed Family Worldwide* (1999); John Hesselink, *On Being Reformed. Distinctive Characteristics and Common Misunderstanding* (1983); David Holwerda, ed., *Exploring the Heritage of John Calvin* (1976); Stanford Reid, ed., *John Calvin. His Influence in the Western World* (1982); David F. Wells, *Reformed Theology in America* (1985).

²⁷⁷ The basis for the characteristics are historical, theological, as well as practical considerations. Reformation theology, as defined in its confessions, catechisms, hymns and theological works from the sixteenth and seventeenth century, is the traditional model. The ecumenical Reformed model is characterized by its structural and ideological union efforts, especially as it is expressed during the end of the nineteenth century and including the twentieth century. The evangelical Reformed emphasize and prioritize evangelization leading to personal conversion and church membership. The Latin American *evangélicos* (evangelical) do not necessarily identify their theology with historical Protestantism but rather consider themselves as an offshoot from the historical churches. See Escobar, *op. cit.*, p. 46. Samuel Escobar, "¿Qué significa ser evangélico hoy?" *Misión* Vol.1, No. 1, p. 46

²⁷⁸ Escobar, *op. cit.*

5.3.1. Traditional Reformed

The traditional Reformed Christians doctrinally adhere to the infallibility and utilize the historic Reformed creeds in a consistently legal way. Liturgically, they seek to follow the historical precedents established by the Synod of Dordrecht (1618/1619), not only in the doctrines of grace but also as to Dordrecht's Church Order and worship patterns. Common practice includes the reading the law, the use of established preparatory and sacramental forms, the singing of the Psalms alongside a limited selection of hymns and the officiating of churches serves by ordained clergy. Their pastors and leaders are chosen for their preaching abilities as well as pre-established educational requirements for the entrance to the pastoral office. The governing and pastoring offices are open to all confessing male adults. The public signing of a Form of Subscription binds the leaders to the Biblical interpretation, Confessional adherence and Church Order of the Church. Church membership is based upon a serious consideration of the Covenant of Grace in which the divine promises and the corresponding duties of parents are consecrated in the sacrament of infant baptism. Catechism of children and a solid foundation of knowledge is required for adult membership, whether of the covenant youth or adult converts.²⁷⁹ There is disparity on the question of rebaptism of converts from Catholicism, yet it is widely practiced. Revivalist practices and popular religiosity are excluded from worship services.²⁸⁰ Relation between Reformed churches is organic in character and based upon a common acceptance of the authoritative nature of the Bible and its interpretation in the historic Reformed creeds. Consciousness of the social causes of oppression and human suffering are known and recognized, but are considered to be the task of the Christian in society. The Church has the duty to preach social justice and require of its members commitment to consonant social action. Meanwhile, it must also minister to the needy, particularly to those of the household of faith.²⁸¹ The planting of Reformed churches through the preaching of the gospel, the celebration of the two sacraments and the maintenance of Christian discipline, is considered central in missions. Evangelism is the task of both the office bearers and the church members in the congregation, as well as being part of the Christian's vocation in society.²⁸²

The traditional Reformed share with the ecumenical Reformed an emphasis on the importance of historical Reformation literature. Reformed and Presbyterian authors whose literature is known throughout CALA include Argentine born Juan Boonstra of the Back to God Hour radio program and the Cuban born, Les Thompson of Logoi ministries. Popular translated Reformed authors include: Louis Berkhof (*Systematic Theology*), William Hendricksen (*New Testament Commentaries*), Gerald Nyenhuis (*El Dios que Adoramos*), Arthur Pink (*Attributes of God*); R.C. Sproul (*The Holiness of God*) and Charles Spurgeon (*Pulpit Commentaries*).

The traditional Reformed denominations in CALA include the small denominations and congregations associated with the mission of the *Gereformeerde Kerken Vrijgemaakt* in Brazil, Curacao and Venezuela; the mission churches cooperating with the Canadian Reformed Churches in Brazil; the Christian Reformed Church in Puerto Rico and several

²⁷⁹ HC, Lord's Day, 27; BC Art. 36, and the CD, Head 1, Art. 17 affirm that children of believers are in covenant with God.

²⁸⁰ B.C. Art. 7.

²⁸¹ H.C. Lord's Day 38.

²⁸² CD, Head 2, Art. 5.

Christian Reformed congregations in Costa Rica, Nicaragua and Honduras; and the Netherlands Reformed Congregations in Bolivia. The traditional Reformed denominations gravitate toward two international councils, the International Conference of Reformed Churches (ICRC: *Concilio Internacional de Iglesias Reformadas*) and the World Fellowship of Reformed Churches (CLIR: *La Confraternidad latinoamericana de Iglesias Reformadas*). Both interdenominational bodies are relatively recent (ICRC, 1982; WFRC, 1994) The ICRC includes both Reformed and Presbyterian churches.²⁸³ The CLIR is wider as it includes Reformed Baptist and Reformed Episcopalians. The ICRRD is not a member of either council although conversations have been had with representatives of CLIR.

5.3.2. Ecumenical Reformed

The ecumenical Reformed are identified in their alliance with other Christian churches through membership in international and regional ecumenical councils.

The Christian Reformed Church in Brazil and the Presbyterian Reformed Church in Cuba are the only two Reformed denominations in CALA who were members of the World Council of Churches (WCC). The United Protestant Church of the Netherlands Antilles, a union church with significant Reformed background, is also a member. The Presbyterians have a larger representation in world ecumenical councils.²⁸⁴

The Reformed Churches in Argentina, the Christian Reformed Church in Brazil, the Evangelical Reformed Church of Brazil, the Presbyterian Reformed Church in Cuba and the Reformed Church of El Salvador are members of the World Alliance of Reformed Churches (WARC).²⁸⁵

There are at least three ecumenical regional councils which include Reformed churches from CALA: The Association of Presbyterian and Reformed Churches in Latin America (AIPRAL: *Asociación de Iglesias Presbiterianas y Reformadas en América Latina*); the Caribbean Council of Churches (CCC) and the CLAI (*Congreso Latino Americano de Iglesias*). The Christian Reformed Church in Brazil and the Reformed Church of El Salvador are members of AIPRAL. The Presbyterian Reformed Church in Cuba and the Reformed Church of Surinam are members of the CCC. The Reformed Churches in Argentina, the Christian Reformed Church in Brazil and the Presbyterian Reformed Church in Cuba are members of CLAI.²⁸⁶

The 1916 Panama Congress was the start of the organized and institutionalized ecumenical tradition in CALA. The ecumenical meetings lasted until the 1930's and was re-initiated in 1949 with CELA I (*Conferencia Evangélica de Latino America*) in Buenos Aires and CELA II in 1961 in Lima. Both the mainline Protestant ecumenical councils, such as CELA (CELA I: 1949; CELA II: 1961; CELA III: 1969); CLAI (*Congreso Latino Americano de Iglesias*, 1982) and the more conservative evangelical ecumenical council,

²⁸³ *Reforma Siglo 21. Boletín Teológico de la Confraternidad latinoamericana de Iglesias Reformadas* Vol. 1, No. 1, (July, 1999) and Vol. 1, No. 2 (December, 1999). Jean-Jacques Bauswein and Lukas Vischer, ed., *The Reformed Family Worldwide* (1999), pp. 706-707.

²⁸⁴ Jean-Jacques Bauswein and Lukas Vischer, *op.cit.*, pp. 87,145, 399.

²⁸⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 49, 87, 145, 159.

²⁸⁶ *Ibid.*

CLADE I (Latin American Congress for Evangelization) and CONELA (*Congreso Evangélico Latino Americano*) trace their roots to the Panama Congress of 1916.²⁸⁷

The ecumenical Reformed doctrinally hold to the normativity of Biblical interpretation and adherence to the historical Reformed creeds. Adherence is not defined in terms of literal application; rather it is their teaching and norms as understood in a new and changing world that is considered essential. Liturgically, they are open to significant changes in the Church Order of Dordt and to the introduction of new liturgical forms that they believe to be more responsive to new challenges. Their pastors and leaders are usually well prepared academically, however, there is significant latitude in the acceptance of candidates for ordination, as long as the proper pastoral gifts are present. Differences exist on the question of the ordination of women to governing and pastoral positions, but generally this is accepted. Church membership is based upon the Covenant of Grace in which parents are expected to respond to the divine initiative by baptizing and educating their children in the ways of the Lord. Rebaptism of converts from Roman Catholicism is not ordinarily practiced. Catechism and education is usually required for adult membership. New hymnology, contemporary creeds, enculturation of contextual worship forms, use of typical musical instruments, inclusion of worship forms from other church traditions, are encouraged. Revivalist and popular religion is rarely evident, but not principally excluded. The relationship between Reformed churches is organic as well as structural. Church unity with Reformed churches is sought on the basis of a general acceptance of the Reformed faith, creeds and tradition. Ecumenical relationships are encouraged with other denominations that adhere to the Apostles' Creed, a full Trinitarian position and the authority and normativity of the Scriptures. Emphasis is placed upon both the personal and structural nature of sin and injustice in society. These must be addressed in an integral way. Mission means the communication of the gospel in a word and deed ministry in which living and preaching the gospel are inseparable and equally essential. Therefore, priority is not assigned to preaching, sacramental use and disciplining over social action. Such a priority would be considered an unbiblical divorce between integral parts of a whole and faithful witness to Jesus Christ that strives for cosmic reconciliation. Personal evangelism is considered an integral part of the whole mission of the church.²⁸⁸

The ICRRD is not a member of an ecumenical council, however, as will be described in 8.5., the church cooperates with national ecumenical agencies in social work projects.

5.3.3. Evangelical Reformed

Evangelicalisms, as the name implies, places evangelism as the priority of the mission of the church. In CALA, the evangelical movement generally includes the historical Protestants as well as the denominations that have arisen out of the historical Protestant structures.²⁸⁹ In

²⁸⁷ W.R. Read, *et al.*, *Latin American Church Growth* (1969), p. 43; Hans-Jurgen Prien, *Die Geschichte des Christentums in Lateinamerika* (1978), pp. 797f. Wilton M. Nelson, "Panama 1916 y Su Impacto sobre el Protestantismo Latinoamericano," *Pastoralia* Vol. 1 (November, 1978), pp. 5-21.

²⁸⁸ Federico J. Pagura, "CLAI: Consejo Latinoamericano de Iglesias," *Misión*, No. 6, pp. 31-35. Pedro Savage, "CLAI y CONELA: Implicaciones sobre la iglesia," *Misión*, No. 4, pp. 3-19. The main tenets of the ecumenical reformed description come from CALA church historian, Sidney Rooy, *op. cit.*

²⁸⁹ Escobar, *op. cit.*

most CALA countries, the evangelicals form national councils and carry out national projects. In this study, churches that are traditionally reformed or ecumenical reformed may consider themselves evangelical and participate in evangelical events. The largest Reformed evangelical denomination in CALA is the ICRRD.

The evangelical Reformed hold to the inerrancy of Scripture, yet are non-confessional in relationship to the historic Reformed creeds. Liturgically, they are spontaneous and innovative. Their leaders are chosen for their pastoral gifts and congregational acceptance rather than educational qualifications. Church membership is based on the voluntary decision rather than covenant promise. Therefore there is a depreciation of the importance of infant baptism.²⁹⁰ Roman Catholics are rebaptized. Elements of popular religiosity and revivalism tend to characterize congregational worship. Church members take active part in the leading of the worship services. The relation between churches is associative rather than organic and structural. In missions they emphasize the saving of souls and enlisting them in the local congregation. Evangelism stresses the importance of accepting the claims of the gospel and renouncing sin and the sinful lifestyle. Evangelism and prayer are made a priority in Christian service. Charity for immediate and personal needs receives attention and constitutes a duty for all Christians, especially for fellow church members. Cooperation in para-church ministries is readily sought.²⁹¹

The degree to which the ICRRD is influenced by the variety of Reformed characteristics is reflected in the minutes of the synodical decisions that are made every year. In Chapter 8 (Sections 8.3 and 8.4) the three fold characteristics of the Reformed identity within the ICRRD will be studied.

5.3.4. Unity in Diversity

The three fold characteristics of the Reformed identity is not a static categorical description but rather defines the operating principles within the Reformed community in CALA. The ICRRD can best be described as an evangelical Reformed church. Key elements of the evangelical heritage, in terms of worship style and leadership structures of the Haitians, were maintained.²⁹² The ICRRD cooperates with social service agencies supported by the international ecumenical movement as well as with the United Bible Society.²⁹³ The traditional Reformed influence is seen in the emphasis on ministerial leadership training in Reformed doctrine, the translation of classical Reformed doctrinal statements and literature into Spanish and Haitian Creole, the promotion of church doctrinal discipline and leadership accountability in the broader assemblies.²⁹⁴ The ICRRD, as an evangelical Reformed denomination, is influenced by all three streams of Reformed identity.

²⁹⁰ Hegeman, *Iglesia Dulce...*, p. 118, Article 62. Baptism of children was permitted in the ICRRD.

²⁹¹ Kenneth S. Latourette, "The Early Evangelical Missionary Movement in Latin America," *National Council of Christian Churches*, paper, 1961. Samuel Escobar, *op. cit.* Sidney Rooy, *op. cit.*

²⁹² Many of the early ICRRD pastors held Baptist and Pentecostal doctrinal positions. Most were self-appointed leaders, functioning as local pastors before receiving official denominational recognition.

²⁹³ The identification of the ICRRD with ecumenical agencies is not through official membership in international councils but rather through participation in national councils and projects such as SSID and *ALFALIT Dominicana*.

²⁹⁴ See 6.4.

5.4. Reformed and Presbyterian Ministries in CALA and the Haitian Immigrants

The CALA Reformed and Presbyterian churches and missions had very little lasting influence in Hispaniola until the twentieth century. In the twentieth century, the Presbyterian missionaries joined other Protestant missionaries in planting churches and developing Christian ministries in the Dominican Republic. After 1980, a large number of CRCNA missionaries came to work with the ICRRD. Section 6.4.1. will study the denominational influence of the Reformed and Presbyterians international denominations in relationship to the Haitian immigrants. Section 6.4.2. will observe the influence of international Reformed and Presbyterian missions on the context of the Haitian immigrants.

5.4.1. Reformed and Presbyterian Denominational Ministries

The initial work of the Presbyterian missionaries in Dominican Republic was church development, leadership training and social work realized in cooperation with the Dominican Evangelical Church (IED). The Presbyterian missionary presence waned during the closing decades of the twentieth century.

The world wide ecumenical movement has served the Haitian immigrants through their network of national social work projects. It was not until the CRCNA send their first full time missionaries in 1980 that a Reformed church was developed among the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic. The ICRRD became the largest and most significant Reformed presence for the Haitian immigrants.

The ICRRD maintains a loose partnership with the EERH in Haiti, which started in 1985. Periodic spontaneous visits were made by church leaders from both sides of the border. The EERH did not benefit from the same multi-ministry missions strategy as implemented with the ICRRD. The EERH asked for such a strategy but CRWRC and CRWM in Haiti and the Dominican Republic could not agree on how to cooperate with the EERH in order to accomplish such a comprehensive strategy. Social assistance was given by CRWMC, CRWM and the ICRRD to the EERH during the early 1990's when thousands of Haitians were forced to return to Haiti and had to be fed and housed.

5.4.2. Reformed and Presbyterian Ministries and the Haitian Immigrant Context

The international Reformed and Presbyterian influences on the context of the Haitian immigrants is limited. Historically, the Dominican Republic and Haiti were not the recipients of Reformed evangelism and church planting efforts. Not until the twentieth century did the Reformed make a significant contribution to the development of Christianity in Hispaniola.

The first Reformed influence brought to Hispaniola came in the form of French imperialism. Among the French invaders of Tortugas, were the Huguenots. It is reported by Dominican historians that in 1626, a certain Le Vasseur (first name not given), identified as a French Huguenot, was stationed on Tortugas Island while the French were there.²⁹⁵ The Spanish colonists from Santo Domingo took over the island in 1635, killing or enslaving

²⁹⁵ Manual A. Peña Batlle, *La isla de la Tortuga* (1988), pp. 55f, refers to the Calvinist influence in la Tortuga. Such influences were reported as early as 1594. *González, Misión...*, p. 415. J. Metzler, ed, *Sacrae Congregationis ...*, pp. 1131-1161.

over 600 persons. Le Vasseur managed to stay on Tortugas until 1652 at which time his enemies reported that he was murdered.²⁹⁶

The French Protestants did not establish a presence in Haiti during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries as they did in French speaking French Guyana, Guadeloupe and Martinique. The Haitian revolution from 1792-1804 either exiled or killed the French population, thereby removing any French Protestant presence in Haiti.²⁹⁷

When the freed slaves from the United States came to Haiti in 1820's, then migrated into the Dominican Republic in the year 1824, there were no known Reformed or Presbyterians among them. It would not be until 1911 that Presbyterians would turn their attention on the Dominican Republic. In Haiti there is no reported Reformed or Presbyterian church development until the 1980's. A handful of Reformed and Presbyterian missionaries worked through para-church mission organizations in Haiti.²⁹⁸

Reformed literature published abroad began to make inroads into the Dominican Republic during the early 1970's. Publications of the Back to God Hour, the Spanish Literature League and Logoi were introduced. French publications by the Back to God Hour came to Haiti during the 1970's as well. The Back to God Hour received response from their radio and television programs in the early 1970's.

Until the 1980's, the ecumenical agencies who received donations from international Reformed and Presbyterian churches in order to carry out emergency relief and development work. With the coming of CRWRC during the 1980's, the missionaries became directly involved in the administration of ecumenical councils and developing social service projects.

Reformed and Presbyterian involvement in government matters have come in the form of protest against North American occupations (1916-1924 and 1965). At that time the Presbyterian missionaries agreed with the national leaders of the IED that the USA invasion was not justified. During the late 1980's and early 1980's, CRCNA missionaries protested the government's treatment of the Haitian immigrants.²⁹⁹

5.5. Conclusion

The arrival of the ICRRD into the Reformed Church family in CALA was preceded by hundreds of years of mission work, church planting and social work projects by the Reformed and Presbyterians in other regions of CALA. The Reformed and Presbyterians did not become established in the Dominican Republic until the first Presbyterian missionaries came in the early decades of the twentieth century. As the first wave of the United States

²⁹⁶ Batlle, *op. cit.*; Arthur Newton, *The European nations in the West Indies* (1933), pp. 171-175.

²⁹⁷ Barrett, *op. cit.*, pp. 303-304; Philippe Gueritaul, "Les Huguenots de la fin du XVIIe à la moitié du XVIIIe siècle," *Histoire de la Guyane, Grande Encyclopédie de la Caraïbe*, Vol. 7. (1989), p. 12-17; González, *Historia...*, p. 180. A.W. Marcus, *De Geschiedenis van the Ned. Hervormde Gemeente in Suriname* (1935), p. 24.

²⁹⁸ Presbyterians were involved with World Team in Haiti. CRWRC of the Christian Reformed Church started their partnership in the 1970's with the Missionary Church. The first Reformed church, *Eglise Evangélique Réformée Haiti* (EERH: Evangelical Reformed Church in Haiti).

²⁹⁹ Neal Hegeman, "El Exilio de los Cristianos Haitianos," *El Tiempo Final* (September 4, 1991); Ryan Veenema, "Youth Camp-Prison Camp," *Missionary Monthly* (September 1983). Letters were sent to both the USA and Canadian government by missionaries.

Presbyterian mission movement was reaching its peak in Puerto Rico, the Dominican Republic was opened as a field by 1911. The first established Reformed influence in the Dominican Republic came through the Presbyterian missionaries cooperating with the IED. The IED were forerunners in developing national ecumenical projects such as the UBS and SSID. The Haitian immigrants have participated in these national ecumenical projects.

The emphasis on church planting and leadership training among Haitian immigrants was brought in by the missionaries of the CRCNA beginning in the 1980's. The first visiting CRCNA missionaries were missionaries had labored in Argentina, Central America, Mexico as well as in other regions of the world. From their experiences in other CALA fields and in response to ministering among a dispersed group of Christians gathered in house churches, the CRCNA missionaries and the ICRRD developed an indigenous church planting strategy centered on a continuing leadership training program which led to the formation of a large ICRRD denomination.

As one of the newest members of the theological diverse and international Reformed church family, the ICRRD has already made a significant impact. The ICRRD is the numerically largest Reformed denomination in CALA. It has the largest number of members and pastors. Its evangelical heritage has found its place among both the traditional and ecumenical Reformed expressions in the Dominican Republic.

CHAPTER 6

THE CHRISTIAN REFORMED CHURCH IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC AND THE HAITIAN IMMIGRANTS

Thesis 5 *The initiation of the ICRRD was not due to evangelism growth but transfer growth from small independent evangelical groups.*

6.1. Introduction

The Reformed among the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic are mostly associated with the *Iglesia Cristiana Reformada en la República Dominicana* (ICRRD: Christian Reformed Church in the Dominican Republic). Chapter 6 will study not only the biographical statements written by a representative number of ICRRD leaders but also analyze the annual historical development, ministerial training program, the theological identity and interchurch relationships of the denomination. Section 6.2. will review the oral histories of seven ICRRD pastors, while Section 6.3 is dedicated to describing the historical development of the ICRRD denomination from the years 1981-1991. Section 6.4. studies the development of ministerial training in the ICRRD. Section 6.5. will analyze the variety of ministries in the ICRRD. The theological identity of the ICRRD is the subject matter of Section 6.6. In Section 6.7., the ICRRD ministry involvement in the Haitian context is analyzed. Chapter 6 will demonstrate that the ICRRD has a multi-dimensional ministry to meet the many challenges that their context of disfranchisement brings to the foreground.

6.2. Leaders of the ICRRD

The contextual situation of the Haitian immigrant leaders and members of the ICRRD will be studied in terms of personal testimonies and research documentation collected during the 1980's and early 1990's. Since the Haitian immigrant's knowledge of their history depends on oral rather than the written tradition, it is necessary to use an oral history methodology, supported by documental research.³⁰⁰

In interviewing the early leaders and some of the members of ICRRD, it was apparent that the historical recollection of national and family history did not exceed three generations. The collective memory of family history was based almost entirely based on oral tradition rather than written records. Legal documents dealing with past generations that would be registered with the Haitian government, are difficult to secure, due to both Dominican and Haitian incomplete archive record-keeping practices.

In order to understand the historical dynamics of how the ICRRD came to be developed in this context, the personal histories of seven of the early leaders will be presented. These personal histories will also be used to study the daily experiences of the pastors and the ICRRD.

³⁰⁰ Neal Hegeman, *op. cit.*, pp. 206-214. The author conducted a Haitian immigrant population count survey, using anthropological, immigration and economic study sources.

6.2.1. Elofin Lerisme

Lay pastor Elofin Lerisme was the primary contact for the mid 1970's CRC visitors. He was a member of the ICRRD until the late 1980' s when he was excommunicated from the church for ethical reasons. His son-in-law, Eugenio Castillo, was the secretary of the small church in Tarana, and tells his story as follows:

I am the son-in-law of (former) pastor Lerisme having married his daughter. Many people credit Lerisme for writing the first letter to the La Hora de la Reforma but that is impossible since he does not know how to read and write. I wrote the letters with my own hand. There were very few people in the church who knew how to read and write. Lerisme, himself, never learned.

We Haitian people in the Dominican Republic are constantly being treated as slaves. I know because I was a *buscon* (scout). The company, CEA, would pay me to go to Haiti to recruit Haitians to work in the harvest. For every Haitian I brought I was paid by a certain military officer at the border. At least there was some money in that. My wife and children would have to work in the garden. However, when I saw how the Haitians were treated I knew that as a Christian this was not right. I stopped doing it but now I make very little to feed my family.³⁰¹

The Tarana village, several kilometers north of the larger city of Sabana Grande de Boya, was the starting point for the ICRRD. The village consisted of free standing, palm wood, clap board homes, as well as three long barracks built by the CEA sugar cane company. During the 1980's, most of the sugar cane companies were owned by the government and managed under the Consejo Estatal de Azucar (CEA). There were two stores in town and a windmill for water. The total population during the sugar cane season was around 300, with the numbers substantially dropping during the off-cane cutting season.

All the men in the extended family were involved in the sugar cane harvest and related activities. Lerisme cut sugar cane but also tended a large garden several kilometers from his home. Products from the garden were sold at the market in Sabana Grande de Boya by the family members.³⁰²

The Lerisme's came over from Haiti during the 1960' s. Lerisme' s legal papers were up to date and so he would not be considered an *ambasfil*, an illegal immigrant working as a temporary cane cutter. Lerisme was the person involved with whom the first contacts with the Puerto Rican and later the full-time missionaries were made.

6.2.2. Eugenio Castillo

Eugenio, the afore-mentioned son in law of Lerisme, was a *buscon* (scout), i.e., a recruiter who collaborated with CEA to secure more Haitian workers. Regular recruiting was done by

³⁰¹ Eugenio Castillo, interview, February 10, 1993, in Sabana Grande de Boya.

³⁰² The illegal activity of tending a garden besides being a sugar cane cutter is the subject matter of pp. 225-266 of El Batey. It is considered that the Haitian family, in order to survive, must have a garden. Sometimes garden plots are conceded, other times not. This becomes a hot bed for bribery and fraud.

Haitian government officials, but Eugenio worked on a non-contractual basis whereby he was paid by Dominican military officers when he brought extra recruits to the border.³⁰³

As his name indicates, upon coming to the Dominican Republic during the 1960s, Eugenio took on a Dominican name. However, his Haitian accent indicates his country of origin. Eugenio was the secretary of the Tarana church. Since illiteracy was estimated to be close to 50% among the Haitian immigrants, there were few in the congregation who knew how to read and write.³⁰⁴ Besides knowing how to write, Eugenio was a good organizer for the church and was active in securing help for the needy and elderly.

Eugenio was the father of 12 children. He far surpassed the low Haitian immigrant birth rate of less than two. Several of the ICRRD pastor's families in the Sabana Grande De Boya zone had large families: for example, there were 12 children in the families of Ulisses Cabrera, Edmón Confidant and Eugenio Castillo.

Whereas Lerisme was the pastor figure who attracted the attention of Christian Reformed missionaries, Eugenio served as the secretary and administrator, having the ability to carry out what Lerisme wanted.

Eugenio became the pastor of the nearby Batey Verde church, when its pastor, Jorge Pasible, became too ill to continue.

6.2.3. Emilio Pérez

Emilio Pérez was one of the youngest leaders to join the ICRRD. He lived and worked in Monte Plata, about 20 miles from Sabana Grande de Boya, the capital city of the province with the same name. Emilio writes about his first contacts with the missionaries:

One Tuesday, May the 5th, 1978, we gathered together a group of Haitians who were sugar cane cutters. They liked the evangelical worship services even though only one of them was a Christian and the rest were non-converts. However, they all sang Christian hymns. The idea came to brothers Emilio Pérez Martínez, Marcelie Bena, Jeanoi and Fisca Jean, who were foremen of the afore mentioned group, to visit this group of *braceros*. They lived in Batey César Contreras, which lies east of Monte Plata. When we arrived we first of all asked the *braceros* to put their shirts on. Immediately, we read from Psalm 27:1 and afterwards said a prayer to the Lord in which we asked that it would be His will to give us the opportunity to establish a *campo blanco* in the name of our Lord Jesus Christ.

That is how our church started and grew in Monte Plata. We had good evangelism opportunities in that place, with the help of the Lord. The church grew and in three months there were 93 persons in attendance. However, since our denomination was the World Evangelistic Crusade Church, we did this work under the direction of the Crusade Church. After 6 months, the Crusade Church stopped visiting us. We visited their central office but none of them visited us.

³⁰³ Moya Pons, *op. cit.*, pp. 272-272.

³⁰⁴ Moya Pons, *op. cit.*, p. 460; Geisteffer, "General Survey of Communities with a Christian Reformed Church," unpublished research (Santo Domingo: CRWM office, 1983).

In 1979, before hurricane David, we made contact with Pastor Elofin Lerisme. He told us of the Christian Reformed Church. From that time on, we joined the Reformed Church.³⁰⁵

Emilio became the pastor of the Monte Plata church. After an initial struggle against the influences of Voodoo, Emilio and the leaders made a decisive decision against the work of the Voodoo prophets and practitioners and saw the congregation prosper. Emilio was one of the first ICRRD pastors to move back to Haiti in order to work with the CRWM missionaries in leadership training. He moved to Haiti in 1987 and was one of the founding leaders for the *Eglise Evangélique Réformée* (EERH).

6.2.4. Sirel Lors

Pastor Sirel Lors joined the ICRRD and become one the main leaders for the capital city until his return to Haiti in 1992. He writes:

I entered the Dominican Republic in 1975. I started to visit the World Evangelistic Crusade Church, however, since I did not know Spanish very well they did not give me much attention. I left this church and went to the Bible Temple Church. They received me very well but I did not feel happy. In 1978, there was a brother who was also the president of the council who was going to make a visit to the central church in La Romana. I said it was not good for him to go there; rather it would be better to start a new chapel here. He immediately said, "yes." The first service was in my home. The second service was conducted in the home of brother Sintot. The third one was held in the house of Enoc.

On May 9, 1978, we rented a house and after 9 days we had 55 persons attending the services, there was hardly enough room for everyone. We had to move to a place that was larger. I bought boards and made benches. After one year there was a division in the church. There was a Baptist Church. All who were Baptist went, taking benches and the pulpit with them. I started over new with the people who were in agreement with me. The church filled up again, but now it was independent. We worked without mission help for one year.

In 1981, I met the supervisor of the church, Nuevo Betel. We had a conversation and arrived at the conclusion that he would pay me \$50.00 (pesos) as salary and \$30.00 for the congregation. I did not last very long with that mission, only 6 months. During that same year I heard people speaking of the Reformed mission. I sent someone to find the representatives of the Tarana church, but Lerisme did not want the mission to go to the capital. He said: "The people of the capital are too smart." However, this was not the will of the Lord because the Lord wanted us to work together. One day, in the morning, Raymond Brinks arrived at my house with Manuel José de Chirino and two more people. At that time, I was affiliated with Rodríguez and could not commit myself. He said to me, "That is nothing, you can visit me." He gave me his address. There came a time when Rodríguez could not pay

³⁰⁵ Hegeman, *Iglesia Dulce...*, pp. 15-16. Interview on July 14, 1984.

for the house, lacking both mission support and his own funds. It was at that time we joined the ICRRD.³⁰⁶

The struggle for the Haitian immigrant to support himself and develop church programs was part of the reason why changing denominational allegiance was common for the Haitian immigrant. The average pay for the cane cutters was several American dollars a day, while the urban street vendor could improve that to about \$4.00 USA. The supporting community for the churches, most of whom were sugar cane cutters and illegal gardeners in the rural areas, manual laborers and street vendors in the urban areas, gave liberally to the church, but that generally did not amount to a consistent full-time pastor's salary. Despite the dire economic circumstances, however, none of the ICRRD approved pastors quit the ministry to find other full time work. Many had part time jobs on the side. Several had to leave due to being involved in theft, extortion and fraud.

CRWM programs assisted the pastors' families with educational scholarships, documentation needs, medical needs, pensions, business loans and when possible, work. However, the majority of the pastors wanted to have World Missions pay full time pastor's salary. The inability of the denominational leaders and mission leaders to come to an agreeable solution led to a short boycott during the summer of 1985, in which the pastors did not participate in missionary-led classes or joint meetings. The tense situation was resolved through joint meetings and the formulation of a new church-mission agreement. Pastors' salaries were not granted, rather pastor business loans and an annual sharing of the profit made through the national ministry center was shared with the pastors.

6.2.5. Locano Jean

Locano Jean was an enterprising worker. He sold used clothing on his old motorbike. He frequently traveled back and forth to Haiti. Locano was able to join the ICRRD, having built, together with his congregation, his own chapel. Locano's personal history includes the following:

I came from Haiti to the Dominican Republic. My mother accepted the Lord Jesus Christ in 1954 and joined the Pentecostal Church. The name of the pastor was Ramón Jene Olfín. I entered the DR the 11th of March, 1972. Since that time I went around preaching in various churches but I did not have anything stable until 1976, when I affiliated with the Pentecostal Church with whom I stayed for 3 years and 8 months. I left because of the bad doctrine and because of the pastor. In 1980 I constructed a temple with my own resources. After preaching the gospel for 5 months I affiliated with the Mennonite Church. Afterwards I left the Mennonite Mission due to the problems that the Mission was having in the country. On November 9, 1982, I joined with the Reformed Mission by means of a letter of recommendation by brother Emilio Pérez Martínez to Rev. Raymond Brinks. On November 12, 1982, Raymond came to visit the church in Batey Bermejo.³⁰⁷

³⁰⁶ Sirel Lors, as quoted in *Iglesia Dulce...*, p. 16. Interview conducted on July 14, 1984. Brinks adds: "Sirel's group was meeting in one-half of a two-room house when I first visited them. As he himself says, members were coming and going" (July letter, 1998).

³⁰⁷ Interview with Locano Jean on July 14, 1984.

There is constant movement of people between Haiti and the Dominican Republic. Pastor Jean would make periodic visits to Haiti. This was accomplished by bus. He would use his Haitian papers to go to Haiti, and his non-registered Dominican papers to return. If his paper work was not accepted he would simply walk across the border at an unguarded point. His trips across the border were used to buy and sell used clothing.

6.2.6. Odeis Ydamé

Pastor Odeis Ydamé of Batey Hato San Pedro made his living as a gardener, while his wife, Maria, sold used clothing. Odeis Ydamé writes about his perception of dealing with social problems in the context of the church:

In times past, when I was a Pentecostal, I was as a slave, it was like following a body with no head, it was like walking without knowing where you were coming or going. The person in charge of the mission church did not know how to read and write. The pastor kept all of the benefits of the church to himself. He only had the good doctrine to be able to say that we should not do evil, nor walk in evil ways, but he always had a heavy hand and a hard heart. The believers did not go anywhere with him.

One day, my wife and I stopped in front of the church and took a good look at what condition the church was in. In the days that followed we were in the worship service and I raised my hand and asked to speak. When I arose I said to the congregation, "brothers, let us improve the condition of the church making a few alterations." The leader in charge said, "no." The answer that he gave me afterwards was that I had visited other more beautiful and better constructed churches. This is what he told me. The new Americans were constructing various churches but in the beautiful churches no one is saved and we are good the way we are. After hearing this we started to think, pray, and fast, asking God to deliver us from the "yoke of slavery".

One night, after going to bed, my wife had a revelation. She saw that we were making a chapel roofed with *yagua* leaves, with the walls made of coco branches, at about two kilometers from Batey Hato San Pedro. She awoke from her dream because the Lord had given us liberty from the yoke. Right where we lived, the patio was sown with *yucca*, *ayama*, *plátano*, and *guandules*. A few days after the revelation we visited a brother outside the *batey* and said to me, "We need a chapel here." I said to him, "that is true." Shortly after this visit another brother told me the same thing and I responded in the same way to him. We did not originally have this idea but through prayer and fasting the thought came to us.

Days later, another brother and I went to look for poles in the hills. We painted a variety of them in hope of one day being able to build a dwelling place. We were thinking of pastor Lerisme of the Reformed denomination. I went to him and he said, "roof it, I am coming soon to receive it." On Saturday, January 16, 1982, we roofed it with *yagua* and made the sides with coco branches just as we had seen it in the revelation.

On Sunday, 17th of January, 1982, at 9:30 A.M., we entered the chapel, and we began to sing choruses and hymns and read the Word of God, awaiting the visit of pastor Lerisme and his congregation. Several minutes later the small buses with music and large banners arrived. When the town people saw this, both young and old from

around the chapel came to see. They (and we) had a marvelous worship service. The same day they put a sign which said: "IGLESIA CRISTIANA REFORMADA... After Lerisme said to me, "continue working, on February 28 Rev. Raymond Brinks is coming to receive the chapel."

From that day on the liberation from the yoke began. On April 17 we went to a meeting in Bienvenido where Pastor Andrés Díaz works. From then on I have studied the Bible daily. The Reformed denomination can help you.

The Reformed denomination is a shining light because the Christians, humanly speaking, are just about all living in slavery. Now we are free, thanks to the Reformed denomination, which teaches to read (and) to write. They help the miserable in the Republic with everything, so many poor people, the elderly without resources, parents who cannot educate their children due to their economic conditions, because of their poverty, because what they earn is not enough to eat from.³⁰⁸

The social conditions to which pastor Ydamé refers to were staggering. Illiteracy was calculated between 45% and 55%.³⁰⁹ Sixty percent had never been to school. Two percent finished secondary school.³¹⁰ Infant mortality is high.³¹¹ Intestinal, venereal and tuberculosis diseases cause most of the deaths.³¹² In the early 1980's, what was thought to be tuberculosis, was latter discovered to be related to AIDS. Both the Dominican and Haitians have described the working conditions to be slave-like and oppressive.³¹³ Within these social conditions, Odeis and his family were able to start and maintain an ICRRD church. CRWM and CRWRC introduced a variety of medical, social service and educational programs to benefit the church and their community, utilizing the church as a community and ministry center.

6.2.7. Pierre Philippe

Pierre Philippe came from the central plateau of Haiti. He was baptized in the Roman Catholic Church and received elementary education in French. In his testimony Pierre writes:

Please permit me to give a brief personal history prior to my coming to the Christian Reformed Church. I lived in a *batey* named Contador, which is about five kilometers from Batey Nuevo, where there was a group of brothers who would meet. This group was led by the son of Pastor Francisco de la Rosa of Bayaguana. I was a fallen away member of the Assembly of God church in Contador. The elder of that church was under discipline and there was no one to replace him. The group fell away and the temple was left in ruins.³¹⁴

³⁰⁸ Odeis Ydamé, as quoted in *Iglesia Dulce...*, p. 17 and *El Boletín Reformado* (December, 1986).

³⁰⁹ G.Geisteffe, *op. cit.*, calculated illiteracy at 46% and *El Batey*, pp. 62-63, at 54.6%.

³¹⁰ Moya Pons, *El Batey*, p. 64

³¹¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 314-315

³¹² *Ibid.*, p. 314.

³¹³ *Ibid.*, p. 109.

³¹⁴ Hegeman, *Iglesia Dulce...*, p. 41. Interview on July 14, 1984.

Pierre began to take leadership in Contador and proved to be a very capable leader, not only at the local level, but also at regional meetings and beyond. His quick mind and reconciliatory manner quickly gained him entrance into the leadership circles of the ICRRD. As lay pastor of a small group in Contador, north of the capital, he had ready access to traveling routes to the capital.

Pierre was particularly concerned about the reading level of the Haitian immigrants. He secured employment with ALFALIT Dominicana, a literacy training organization. He also was trained and worked with the World Relief community development program. Afterwards, he became the first director for the Liga Bíblica, a Bible distribution agency for the Dominican Republic. He also served, on several occasions, as the president of the ICRRD.

Pierre was able to converse and write in French, Haitian Creole and Spanish. Like so many other Haitians who learned French and Creole in Haiti, and Spanish in the Dominican Republic, the learning of languages was a necessity for economic survival.

Missionaries used the services of interpretation of Pierre Philippe, Emilio Pérez, Roberto Cherubín, Joseph Levielle, Odeis Ydamé, Sofanía Lors, Charlis Deson, Mateo Pérez and others to translate Spanish articles, books, creeds and literacy training materials into Haitian Creole, as well as interpreting for preaching and teaching.

The testimonies of the above mentioned seven ICRRD pastors are representative of the stories of the early leaders in the denomination. All, with the exception of Elofin Lerisme, maintained their leadership status within the ICRRD. All of the leaders expressed how difficult it was to live as a Haitian immigrant. The leaders had been involved with a variety of non-traditional Protestant groups prior to forming or joining the ICRRD. They all had maintained the composition of their own small congregation, and finally, all sought to extend their ministry to other Haitian immigrants. Yet, the newly forming ICRRD did not only consist of the leaders. Rather, the ICRRD developed as a people movement that required indigenous leadership as provided by the seven pastors.

6.3. History of the Assemblies and Important Events of the ICRRD

Thesis 7. *The maturation of the ICRRD is related to its level of auto-responsibility*

Records of annual assembly meetings of the ICRRD were kept by the recording clerk, read at the subsequent assembly meetings and stored in the denominational archives. Section 6.3. describes the denominational history from its organization in the year 1981 until the assembly of the year 1991. The earlier years will be described in more detail as they lay the foundation for the later years.

The pre-organization activities leading up to the first official meeting of the synod of the ICRRD on May 1, 1981, start with the arrival of Rev. Ray Brinks. When the Brinks family arrived in Santo Domingo in the year 1980 and searched out the Haitian groups which had made contact with the Christian Reformed Church in North America, he was able to locate six small congregations. He estimated that there were 80 adult members, with 150 children and visitors, totaling 230 by May of 1980. Exploratory visits were made by the Brinks, as well as by the newly arrived missionaries, the Hegemans, and plans set to organize the scattered group of home churches into a national assembly on May 1, 1981.

The following Sections (6.3.1.-6.3.10) give a year-by-year historical description of the denominational activities, as they are recorded in the records of the annual meetings. The author, who attended all but one of the meetings (1985), will supplement the annual records with other relevant information. It will be seen that the ICRRD grew from a small gathering of scattered Haitian immigrant church groups to a large and vibrant denomination which was able to withstand the destructive forces of constant discrimination and temporary deportations while continuing to grow in ministry services and membership.

6.3.1. Official Organization (May 1981-May 1982)

The small chapel of the *Iglesia Misionera* (Missionary Church) in Sabana Grande De Boya, several hours north of Santo Domingo, was the site of the May 1, 1981, first national assembly of the new ICRRD. Rev. Raymond Brinks spearheaded the ICRRD by organizing a series of pre-assembly meetings in Santo Domingo.³¹⁵ Nine groups sent representatives and three groups came as observers. Of the nine official groups, six were recognized as organized churches and three as groups in the process of formation. The nine groups reported a total adult membership of 149, with a total regular church attendance of 494. With the help of missionaries, the records were kept by the secretary of the assembly.³¹⁶

Rev. Brinks proposed that each church group would organize a local ruling committee, which in turn would send delegates to regional and national meetings. Members for the Central Committee included the president (Rev. Brinks), secretary (Roberto Decír), first vocal (Emilio Pérez Martínez), second vocal (Eugenio Castillo), and treasurer (Teodoro Lindor).³¹⁷ All the members of the local committee would be considered equal and decisions would be made democratically. The committees were coordinated and supervised by an executive committee formed at the national level. Early on in the development of the ICRRD there were no regional committees; these came with the multiplication of groups and development of zonal work. The national executive committee was called the Central Committee. The local committees were asked to send reports to the Central Committee every three months.³¹⁸

In order for a group to affiliate with the ICRRD, a simple procedure was followed. First, the interested group would speak with a regional ICRRD pastor. The local pastor would bring the request to join to the Central Committee. Central Committee members

³¹⁵ *Actas...1981*. Art. 1.1. Hegeman was also present as missionary in orientation.

³¹⁶ Haina, Monte Plata, Cristo Rey, Cojobal, Piraco, Barahona, San José, Coquitos and Batey Cinco were officially present. Haina, Piraco and Coquitos were groups in formation. Two groups from Juan Sanchez and Tarana completed the list, *Actas...1981*, Art. 1.4. The actual definition of what constituted a church or a group was defined by the Church Order in subsequent years. The general perception in 1981 was that a church had to choose and support a lay pastor willing to lead them. The statistics for the churches are reported in *Iglesia Dulce...*, p.83.

³¹⁷ *Ibid.*, Art. 8.G. The election of Central Committee members was slightly different from the leaders chosen for the first national assembly. The officers of the Central Committee were: Ray Brinks (president), Jean Paul Gilbert (secretary), Emilio Pérez Martínez (vice-secretary), Julio Andino (treasurer) and Michel Lebrun (vice-treasurer). By the end of 1992, Ray Brinks, Eugenio Castillo and Michel Lebrun remained in the ICRRD. Emilio Pérez took a position with World Missions in Haiti. Jean Gilbert fled the country following a major fraud scheme involving several Christian social service agencies. Roberto Decír died of AIDS. Julio Andino and Theodor Lindor joined another church.

³¹⁸ *Actas...1981*, Art. 8.F.

would visit, explain the basic Reformed doctrines and investigate the practices and affiliations of the group. The Central Committee in turn would bring the petition for affiliation, generally as a mission station, to the National Assembly.

The practice of recording minutes of proceedings and making requests by means of letters was not foreign to the independent groups. The church secretary recorded the proceedings of the worship service. Attendance, collections, number of Bibles, topics of sermons, songs sung, names of the persons who spoke and other relevant information was faithfully recorded in a notebook by the church secretary.

The notion of a denomination being ruled by committees was welcomed by most, but did not fit well with all the new leaders. Pastor Lerisme of Tarana boycotted the first meeting since he was not offered a leadership position in the new denomination. He reasoned that, "I was the first pastor that the Mission contacted and the others came later."³¹⁹ The tensions were temporarily resolved after the first meeting.

The Assembly recognized five lay or interim pastors: Sirel Lors (Cristo Rey); Montás Decír (Cojobal); Julio Andino (Barahona); Prestino Bueno (San José) and Francisco de la Rosa (Bayaguana). The only qualification required was that they were practicing pastors and supported by their local church group. Theological or educational requirements were not stipulated. Lay pastors were allowed to conduct the sacraments and perform church weddings. Pastoral licenses were granted yearly.

A deacon category, in the "second pastor" sense of the Baptist tradition, was applied to Marius Jassaint (Monte Plata), Frank Fils-Aimes (Haina) and Desius Similien (Coquitos).³²⁰ The function of the deacons would be to assist the pastor in administrating the church.

The newly constituted denomination adopted the Apostles Creed as their confessional statement upon the recommendation by missionary Brinks. The intent of the motion was to recognize the historical nature of the church, associating what had been an independent movement to a historical church and theology. The assembly also resolved, upon the recommendation of this missionary, to leave the responsibility to the churches to prepare a more adequate creed for the contemporary church.³²¹

A national church budget was developed. The construction and repairs of church buildings were budgeted at \$7,300 pesos; emergency fund, \$2,000; rentals, \$600.00; meetings \$500.00; leadership training and literacy training, \$200; for a total of \$10,600.00 pesos.³²² The national budget was set up to include offerings and volunteer labor on behalf of the local churches that were receiving the benefit of the budget.

The local congregations that became part of the ICRRD each have a unique history. It will not be possible to give an historical overview of each one; however, certain groups will be mentioned due to their importance to the denomination in later years.³²³

Rev. Brinks started to work with a small group in Haina, then leaving it to others to continue. The first national leader was Frank Fils-Aimes. He was a young Haitian who had lived in Florida for two years until he was deported. He had been previously affiliated with

³¹⁹ A subsequent visit was made by Brinks to pastor Lerisme in order to keep him involved in the new denomination.

³²⁰ *Ibid.*, Art. 8D. The office of deacon as proposed by delegates reflected the Baptist tradition. This term was used until it was redefined in later years by the Church Order

³²¹ *Ibid.*, Art. 7.

³²² *Ibid.*, Art. 9. The Dominican peso was worth around .70 USA cents at that time.

³²³ See *Iglesia Dulce...*

the Baptist and Adventist churches. Lay pastor Fils-Aimes asked for a salary from the CRWM. He left the project because mission policy did not allow for pastor salary payments by the mission agency. Another Haitian Christian replaced Fils-Aimes: Manuel Pérez. Manuel was appointed as the leading elder of the new group that consisted of a mixture of Dominican and Haitian members.

The city of Haina was the site of a small school. The main teacher was Remes Larouix, an ex-sergeant of the Haitian army. The church rented its meeting hall from Larouix. Over 100 students attended in the early grades. CRWM assisted by providing the benches, schoolbooks, two helpers, teacher training classes and better blackboards.

The Haina ICR church did not grow to be large yet it had a significant youth program.³²⁴ The youth included two brothers, Pedro and Eufemio, and two sisters, Silvia and Luz, of the Ricardo family. Eufemio Ricardo writes:

My oldest sister was a member of the Pentecostal Church. She took us to church when we were children. I remember on one occasion that at the end of a sermon, a preacher gave a call to repentance and my cousins, my brothers and I converted although we did not consciously know what we were doing. We lived as Christians although we had not completely decided to follow Jesus Christ. One day, when an aunt of my father died, a pastor was leading the funeral service and at the end of the service I approached him and asked him to pray for me so that I could accept Jesus Christ. When I went home and told my family members and my mother about what had happened they asked: "Why not bring the pastor to pray for all of us?" Nevertheless, my family members converted on their own and later a missionary lady of the Methodist Church prayed for my mother to accept the Lord.

Although I was a Christian, I did not do any work in service of the Lord for the extension of the gospel. A Christian who does not serve in the work of the Lord can not be considered a genuine Christian.

I began to work for the Lord when I came to the ICR. I still remember the first message I heard which dealt with "The Sower." It did not last any longer than eight or ten minutes. I remembered that missionary, Cornelio Hegeman, had to have us sing a few extra songs to give time for the other class to finish.³²⁵

Another church in the Santo Domingo metropolis was the Cristo Rey congregation. This church consisted mostly of Haitian immigrants. The *barrios* of Santo Domingo were strongly populated with Haitian immigrants. These immigrants would dedicate themselves to small home industries such as selling candy on street corners, cleaning, gardening, selling fruit from the market or merchandising used clothing. Second generation Haitians from the rural sugar cane *bateyes* would move into the city and several attended the Cristo Rey congregation.

Another urban church was a Dominican congregation in Barahona, in the southwestern part of the Dominican Republic. The small church group had passed through

³²⁴ The Haina youth group became the platform for a variety of future leaders. They include Dr. Silvia Ricardo Martínez (director of Luke Society), theological student Eufemio Ricardo, engineer Pedro Ricardo, teacher Alexandrina de Paulo and others

³²⁵ *Iglesia Dulce....*, pp. 30-31. November 10, 1984.

several denominations. The lay pastor, Julio Andino, moved to Santo Domingo in pursuit of employment. The son of the former pastor, Miguel Andino, served as a contact person between visiting missionaries and the group.

Most of the small congregations to join the ICRRD during its first year were located in the rural *bateyes* in the marginal areas. There were interested groups in the Sabana Grande de Boya, Monte Plata, Bayaguana, as well as the San Luis zones. San José was located northeast of Santo Domingo. Lay pastor Prestino Bueno and his extended family formed the nucleus of the congregation. Formerly, they had been associated with the *Cristo La Unica Esperanza* mission, which was under the direction of Rev. Aurelio Díaz. Another small church, Coquitos, was situated close to San José. The principle leaders were Desius Smilien, Daniel Israel and Moreste Luis.

Batey Cinco, near Bayaguana, came to the ICRRD through contacts made with pastor Lerisme. The lay leader, an elderly and illiterate man, was Francisco de la Rosa. The children of de la Rosa were active in Pentecostal and spiritistic activities. De la Rosa reported that young people coming from Haiti had received the gift of prophecy. Evening services turned into spiritistic manifestations and healing services.³²⁶

Cojobal was located several miles outside of Sabana Grande De Boya. Lay pastor, Montás Decír, directed the church in Cojobal as well as the one in nearby Piraco. Pastor Decír's full time employment was as a *mayordomo* with the Sugar Cane Company, which was a position to oversee the Haitians working in the cane fields. The two sons of the pastor, Roberto and Sergio, were students at the local schools and served as secretaries for church committees.³²⁷

Monte Plata was developed under the leadership of Marius Jassaint and the church secretary, Emilio Pérez Martínez. Jassaint, who was illiterate, relied on the more educated secretary. However, because Martínez was involved in spiritistic meetings that became a concern for church members and missionaries alike. Finally, in a decisive confrontation at the end of a worship service between the healing practices of a voodoo prophet and the Biblical exhortation as given the author, Martínez became convinced that the voodoo healing practices were exercises in manipulation.³²⁸

Besides the development of local congregations, CRWM began to develop several mission programs associated with the ICRRD. The first primary school was opened in Bienvenido on September 11, 1981, soon to be followed by a school in Cristo Rey. Gladys Brinks began giving classes, training several young adults to assume responsibilities. The CRWM field strategy called for missionaries to concentrate mostly in the area of teacher

³²⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 33. Hegeman visited Batey Cinco on December 31, 1981 and reported seeing spiritist activities such as participants going into trances. During the trances, young men would seem to be overcome with extra strength, as they single handedly picked up other adults and twirled them around like dolls. Healing practices were observed, in which the healer would rub his head against the stomach of the sick person in hope of passing on healing powers. One of the youth told how she was healed from her disease by a healer who apparently caused her to cough up a lizard. As her disease reoccurred, she was treated for tuberculosis, of which she died later.

³²⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 11.

³²⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 35-36. Hegeman gives a description of his encounter with the healing practices of the Voodoo prophet. Significantly, after the confrontation, many others told their stories about dealing with Voodoo. Several members who had been relying on Voodoo healing efforts were tested and found to be with tuberculosis and other treatable diseases

training. The schools were started as private ventures, with the future hope of being recognized by the Dominican government.

Health and social services were pressing needs, both among the Dominicans as well as the Haitian immigrants. The Luke Society, under the direction of Dr. Peter Boelens, established contacts with Dr. Sócrates Pérez, a member of the Free Methodist Church. Dr. Pérez had been active in Christian medical work for many years. He was designated as director of the new program, starting in Santo Domingo with a small clinic and in the training of health promoters. The Dominican administrated SSID helped CRWM, and later CRWRC, to enter the Dominican Republic and to establish a developmental and relief work among the Haitian immigrants.³²⁹ Literacy training was needed among ICRRD members as well as some of the leaders. ALFALIT Dominicana was helpful in supplying materials for teachers. The author started several literacy training classes that enabled about 30 persons to read and write.

The Evangelical Literature League's (TELL) representative, Jack Roeda, visited the Dominican Republic and established contact with the ICRRD as well as the missionary community. Mr. Roeda also represented the Back to God Hour, whose program, La Hora de la Reforma, had been active in the Dominican Republic prior to the coming of CRWM.

The newly organized denomination continued to grow. The first year of the ICRRD (May 1, 1981-May, 1982) saw the affiliation of six organized churches, three groups in formation, with five pastors and two missionaries recognized by the National Assembly. There were a total of 149 adult members. Regular church attendees, besides the adult members, totaled 345 persons. The total church community was recorded as 494.³³⁰

Generally speaking, the ICRRD was an organization of small groups of independent and self-started groups, and on the other hand, the first-time organization of evangelism contacts. The re-organization of the small Haitian groups was deemed necessary by the leaders in order to resolve leadership conflicts, receive more denominational attention, resolve doctrinal questions and meet the urgent need for cooperation. The ICRRD did not immediately establish doctrinal criteria for accepting new groups and leaders. Groups came from the Dominican as well as North American directed Pentecostal groups. The Dominican groups included the Cruzada Evangélica Mundial (Evangelical World Crusade) and Nueva Bethel (New Bethel). In the following years, a significant number of groups formerly associated with the Cristo La Unica Esperanza (Christ the Only Hope) would join. The international groups were the Mormons and a revival movement out of New York. The re-organization did not bring official protest from the former denomination, as in most cases the contacts had already been severed.

Commitment was made by the ICRRD leaders to participate in the continuing leadership training program offered by the missionaries. Re-licensing was in part dependent on the lay leader's participation in the classes. The largest group of leaders and members were Haitian immigrants. Many did not have legal status and their social status was unstable. Considerable work had to be done to secure legal working and marriage documents for church leaders. The lay pastors were frequently involved in securing proper documentation for their members.

³²⁹ The relationship between SSID and the ICRRD was affected by the fraudulent activities of Mr. Jean Gilberto. Mr. Gilberto cooperated with SSID in establishing programs for communities of Haitians. Gilberto fled the country, after selling to SSID personal properties and confiscating program money.

³³⁰ *Iglesia Dulce...*, p. 83.

The influx of CRWM money for construction and repair of church buildings, emergencies and social programs, had a significant attraction for leaders and members of other churches to join the ICRRD. It should be pointed out that the ethically questionable practice of missionary agencies encouraging the buying of churches, pastors, and members was discussed at a variety of levels. In order to discourage attracting churches for financial reasons, as well as to promote financial responsibility, it was decided that pastors were not to receive salaries from CRWM but rather should be remunerated through the tithing and collections of the local congregation. Furthermore, no incoming properties would be purchased and the limited budget for construction of buildings would be determined by the ICRRD Assembly. Also, the recipient group was responsible for certain contributions to the construction. Local church contribution of the approved construction was estimated at 10% of the overall cost. Maintenance cost would be the responsibility of the local church. Social programs, such as medical treatment, nutritional classes and literacy training were opened to all in the community, rather than just the church community.

Preaching during worship services continued to be the main vehicle used to communicate the Christian message. Worship services in the rural *bateyes* would last several hours. Often, members and visitors would walk for miles to attend the service. Services leaders were appointed by the local leaders. In that way the services could be led by persons who were in attendance and not be dependent on leaders or missionaries who might or might not make it to the service.

Phenomenal church growth continued. Evangelism was conducted through personal conversation and through worship services in homes, or outdoors. Interested persons were invited to these worship services. The practice of evangelism included praying for people to accept Jesus Christ as their personal Savior and Lord. Evangelistic groups would often go to a neighboring *batey* to hold services and start *campo blancos*. If people made a commitment, they would receive training in the basic doctrines of the church. Adult candidates would receive water baptism prior to becoming a member of the church.

6.3.2. Structural Establishment (May 1982 - May 1983)

The second National Assembly was celebrated on May 1, 1982, at the APEN camp (*Asociación Pro-Evangelización del Niño*), just west of Santo Domingo. APEN would become a regular meeting place until the national Ministry Center was built 10 years later. The most important item on the agenda was approving the request of nine churches, nine *campo blancos* (mission groups) and nine lay pastors. Adult church membership went from 149 to 445, attendees rose from 345 to 920. Total attendance jumped from 494 to 1365.³³¹

The second assembly recognized previously approved and new pastors alike. The annual renewal of pastor's credentials would continue. The five pastors accepted in 1981 were renewed. The new pastors were: Andrés Díaz, Elofim Lerisme, José Luis, Locano Jean, Jorge Pasible, Emilio Pérez Martínez, Rafael Pérez, Montás Silbelis and Legran Valdéz. Clodis Dagren (Maní) was accepted as an evangelist.

Due to the growth of the denomination, five zones were developed. They included the capital zone, north-western Sabana Grande de Boya zone, the central Monte Plata zone, the north-central Bayaguana zone and the north-eastern San José zone.³³²

³³¹ *Ibid.*

³³² In later years, Bayaguana was joined to the San José and San Luis zone..

The previous assembly had approved the Apostles Creed as a theological statement. The second assembly started to deal with theological questions that arose out of the experiences of the congregations. The Central Committee had commissioned a sub-committee to study the theme of the gifts of the Holy Spirit in the ICRRD. The ICRRD was subject to a variety of Pentecostal and Voodoo practices, including spontaneous prophecy and trances practiced during the worship services. The following conclusions were adopted regarding prophecy:

1. That the prophets present their prophecies in an orderly way and in conformity to the Word of God (I Peter 4:11). The prophecy should be well examined, prepared and interpreted before it is presented in the church.
2. That the church exercise spiritual manifestations of the Spirit (fruit and gifts of the Spirit) and stop seeking physical and mental manifestations of the Spirit which are extreme and unnecessary.
3. That the leaders of the church exercise more order in the church so as to prevent extreme manifestations.
4. That church leaders learn how to read during the next year.
5. That those who know how to read teach those who do not.
6. That the Mission help with teaching materials for those who teach others how to read and write.
7. That we develop a medical work in the church which focuses on preventing diseases.
8. That we leave behind magical practices (when we try to control God and spiritual powers) corresponding to healing.
9. That if there are questions about health that we speak with a doctor or with Dr. Socrates Pérez (Luke Society).³³³

It was planned and announced to have a special leadership training workshop during the year. The missionaries, Dr. Sócrates Pérez and Dr. Andrés Cornelius from ALFALIT, would lead the workshop.

Liturgical forms were prepared in both the Spanish and Creole languages. Raymond Brinks borrowed from the forms of the *Iglesia Reformada de Argentina*, with which he was familiar. Provisions were made for infant baptism and/or infant dedication in the baptismal form and foot washing in the Lord Supper form. Infant dedication was a carryover from the Baptist background of many of the churches and foot washing was common in the Pentecostal Church and the Church of the Prophecy. Child dedication and foot washing were optional and not to be considered as an ordinance.³³⁴

The ICRRD began to expand around the fringes of the capital city. Pastor Andrés Díaz, leader of a small independent congregation of mostly Dominicans, was the pastor of the second Dominican church in the ICRRD.

³³³ The study report was carried out with pastors from different churches and Hegeman. Four areas of transformation were recommended: these were in the areas of prophecy, order in the church, literacy and health. The report sought to address the need which spiritistic activities were addressing. The report was approved and put into practice

³³⁴ *Actas...* 1982, Art. 25.

Pastor Díaz, Martín González (Papito) and the Haitian Clodis Dagren (Maní) formed a construction team to repair and build chapels for ICRRD groups. Maní specialized in making school-church benches. With a group of local volunteers, the three man team could build a wooden church or school in three to five days.

Construction of church buildings was not the only activity for the builders. Bienvenido was the sight of a thriving elementary Christian school. Also, a mission group was developed in nearby Pared.

Motivation to reach out among the Haitian immigrants was expressed in different ways. Maní, one of the leaders of Bienvenido, testified that he had seen the Lord in a vision. He saw a field of sweet potatoes. The Lord ordered him to harvest the field. Maní understood this to mean that he was to gather a church together in one of the largest Haitian immigrant dwellings near Santo Domingo, Los Alcarrizos. A building was constructed and it quickly filled to overflowing. Maní was designated as evangelist by the ICRRD. Los Alcarrizos would become one of the main ICRRD centers in the future.

On the northern side of Santo Domingo, La Estrella became the mission project of Cristo Rey. Luis Benuoit, a carpenter, was the leading elder of the 16 members and 30 attendees. Luis did not know how to read or write, but his son, Santos, did. Therefore, Santos was put in charge of a literacy training program in the small structure squeezed in between two sugar cane housing barracks.

Buenos Aires was the site of a small private school, operated by a teacher called Salomón. Pastor Andrés Bautista was reported to be in charge of a small congregation. Several church services were held but it became evident that the recently appointed pastor Bautista was not suited for the task. Bautista voluntarily resigned. Salomón decided to affiliate with the *Templo Bíblico* movement, a Brethren group also active among the Haitian immigrants.

Further north, in the Sabana Grande de Boya zone, the first Dominican group was started by the author. A small house was rented on the main street and evening services begun. Youth activities were started. Milagros Comprés, a well-known public school teacher, was converted through a Bible study conducted by Sandra Hegeman. Octavio Monegro, a new Christian, became active in evangelism and visiting new groups in the central Santiago area.

Batey Verde was where the elderly pastor, Jorge Pasible, was serving a church community of more than 60 persons. The congregation had been under the supervision of a neighboring pastor, Jean Kelly, from Juan Sanchez. However, Pastor Kelly failed to use construction money for the church building and led a double life as a pastor in two different denominations. When visitors from the *Iglesia de Dios no Sectaria* came to visit, Pastor Kelly would put the sign of that church on the front of the building. When the ICRRD pastors would visit, the ICRRD sign was used. Kelly flew to Haiti with several CRWM missionaries in order to "show the Mission his churches." Members and leaders of the "Kelly churches" expressed their surprise that Kelly had identified himself as one of their leaders. The ICRRD assembly and pastors were not fooled by Kelly and they successfully blocked his attempt to become a pastor in the ICRRD and applied discipline.

A second group in Juan Sanchez, led by Mr. Pedro Garcia and Mrs. Rosa de Garcia, was recognized by the ICRRD. Mrs. Garcia, better known as "Rosa," was very active in the community: as a participant in community groups, as well as through selling used clothing. Pedro worked as a cane loader at the local train stop. Pedro received literacy training classes

and thereafter was able to read and write. Rosa led the Sunday classes while Pedro was the leader in the worship services.

In Aseradero there was a small chapel that had ties to the church in Batey Verde. Elder Eugenio Castillo, son-in-law of Pastor Elofin Lerisme, was in charge. During 1983, a fire destroyed a barracks of 12 units next to the chapel where an evangelism film was being shown. Within minutes, the flames consumed the belongings and furniture of the one-room apartments. The church continued despite this initial set back.

Carmona, north of Sabana Grande de Boya, had been a "Kelly church." Kelly also had confiscated the construction funds of Carmona allotted by the national assembly. Yet, unlike Kelly's church in Juan Sanchez, the Carmona group had enough local leadership, with elders such as Andrés Jean, to continue as a church.

The church in Hato San Pedro was developed around the family of Mr. Odeís Ydamé. The palm-wood building, covered by yagua leaves was in the backyard, and the garden space of lay pastor Ydamé presented a picturesque scene. Hato San Pedro would become an important meeting place for the developing network of churches in that area.

René Valentine, a jovial kindhearted gardener, living in the remote *batey* of Altigracia, describes the beginning of the ICRRD in that village:

I came to Batey Altigracia in the year 1981. What I found in the *batey* was Gaga (Dominican Voodoo) and Voodoo...

I began to preach with the power of God but encountered many difficulties. I encountered spiritism but at that time I did not know exactly what it was since I was new to the area. I also encountered a couple, who had been living common law for 20 years. The lady was a preacher. I opposed this. A division came in the group. I continued to preach but sometimes there were so many spiritistic manifestations that I could hardly work. On some occasions I had to stop the singing of hymns in order to pray.

On another occasion a group from Piraco visited us. When they came they noticed that there was a division and this was reported back to their church. Later they sent me a letter in order to give me information about the Reformed denomination. I had the opportunity to speak with them and accepted the offer of affiliation. Two days later I went to the house of Pastor Montáse Decír and told him I would accept the doctrines of the Reformed Mission. From that day on I began to preach against the manifestations and false prophets. They came and saw that the Mission had given money to buy a place where I could preach the Word of God. From that day I began to work better in the Lord's work.³³⁵

Further southeast of Sabana Grande de Boya zone, towards the capital city, Santo Domingo, the Central zone was developing rapidly. The young and energetic pastor Locano Jean was instrumental in visiting many of the new contacts. Pastor Jean owned an old motorcycle, which he would use to visit neighboring *bateyes* within an hour or an hour and a half radius, selling used clothing. Jean was responsible for opening up or affiliating a handful of churches. Locano's family had undergone the tragic experience of losing two children to nutritional and related medical complications. Other children in the *batey* were malnourished. Bermejo became one of the first places where CRWM missionary, Miss

³³⁵ *Iglesia Dulce...*, p. 44. Interview on December 12, 1984.

Dawn Meyer, established a child nutrition program. Particularly satisfying for Meyers was to see one child of a set of twins being nourished back from the brink of death to health again.

Pastor Jean describes his outreach efforts from 1983-1985:

In 1983, a lady called, Aridia Senvel of Batey Antoncí, gave her life to the Lord in my church in Bermejo. She asked if a church could be started in her *batey*. Afterward, 18 persons were converted and so a church was organized under the direction of Dante Fiste.

During the same year I went to El Bosque to visit and preach there. Eight persons converted among whom Hipólito Elime became the leader.

After three visits, near the end of 1983, a group of eleven persons formed a church in La Yagua. José Martínez went with me and I bought a house for \$200.00 pesos. Alejandro Juan was put in charge of the church. Alejandro died in 1985 and Manuel Santo Reyes was put in charge.

In 1984, two persons came from Batey Fría to visit the Pentecostal Church in Bermejo. They invited me to go to their place and preach. I went and six persons were converted. Afterwards, Raymond (Brinks) went and bought a house for \$100.00 pesos. Siruis Deroso was left in charge. He went to Haiti in 1985 and Nene de Calin assumed the responsibilities.

El Velázquez was received at the end of 1984. This group used to be Pentecostal. Brinks and I made a visit to receive the group and Gerardo Antonio was left in charge.³³⁶

Los Jovillos was the site of a group that used to be with the *Mita en Aaron*. *Mita*, as they were known, came out of Puerto Rico, was featured on Dominican television and where quite popular among the Haitian immigrant population. The teaching of *Mita* was that their prophet, Aaron, had the secret power of the Spirit. The quest of the *Mita* worship service was to seek the power of the Spirit for secret knowledge, healing, and resolving life's problems. Civil marriages were not recognized. Leader, Simon Dima, had enough knowledge from his Haitian Baptist background to question the *Mita* teachings. When he heard about the newly forming ICRRD, he joined with his group of five adult members and 25 attendees. Literacy training classes began in Los Jovillos and several one-day medical clinics to provide people in the *batey* medical assistance.

Just south of Los Jovillos, in El Caño, a dilapidated palm wood structure destroyed by hurricane David in 1979 was re-enforced in order to start a preaching station. Several elderly men as well as a neighboring family were served, first of all by the youthful Juan Pérez and later by an elderly Haitian, Anastacio Claude. Juan Pérez left to go to the capital city and later attempted to cross the dangerous Mona Passage to Puerto Rico. After paying a high financial stipend, he successfully reached Puerto Rico, only to be caught by the authorities and returned to Santo Domingo. After his release from jail, Pérez became involved in the gang life of Santo Domingo and was murdered shortly thereafter.

In Antoncí, about six or seven kilometers away from El Caño, the Assembly of God was interested in selling their brick church building in order to move to a larger city. The

³³⁶ The historically predominant evangelical churches in Haiti are the Baptist churches. During the 1970's and 1980's, the Pentecostals became very strong.

ICRRD received the small the church and the work was placed under the supervision of Bermejo.

North of Antoncí, in Cuesta de Jobo, another building was being sold by the United Pentecostal Church. The ICRRD made its largest construction investment of the year by paying \$1,000 pesos for the brick building. Mr. José Esperanza was left in charge. The church consisted of his family and a few neighbors.

Further east, the denomination began to develop rapidly. La Luisa Prieta, under the leadership of pastor Montás Silbelis, had an extensive network of contacts in neighboring villages. Pastor Silbelis worked as a foreman in the sugar cane company and was also able to secure legal documentation for workers and for marriages.

In the north, Peguerito, associated with Batey Cinco, was supervised by Pastor Francisco de la Rosa. Like Batey Cinco, Peguerito was very spiritistic. The young single adults would travel back and forth to Haiti and La Romana (in the west) seeking prophecies, healings and manifestations of the Spirit. National ICRRD leaders were hesitant to work with Batey Cinco and Pequerito, leaving the missionaries to visit them. The missionaries had a limited impact on de la Rosa's work.

Batey Nuevo was led by Ramón de la Rosa, son of Francisco. When Ramón went to La Romana, the group joined with Amelral, which in turn joined with Santa Lucía. Ramón's groups were generally unstable as spiritistic practices were reported to be a frequent occurrence.

Out of the work with Batey Nuevo, contacts were made for future ICRRD developments. Pierre Philippe, who would become the pastor of San José de Guano and president of the ICRRD on several occasions, during the 1980's and 1990's.³³⁷

Northeast of the capital city, in what was later designated as the San Luis zone, one of the main future leaders, Pastor Legran Valdéz, pastored a small group in Naranjo. The church building, like their pastor, was small in stature. Pastor Legran, as he was known, was in his late 50's. He came from a Baptist background and had been affiliated with *Cristo la Unica Esperanza*. The Baptist mission movement had weakened among the Haitian immigrants and the *Cristo la Unica Esperanza* denomination and mission were embroiled in internal conflicts. Pastor Legran brought a humble spirit and common sense to the meetings and work of the ICRRD.

San José started a mission post in Chilin. However, the potential of outreach of the San José group was limited due to long distances, Haitian immigrant mobility patterns, and leadership conflicts.

Jabacao and Hato Mayor had small groups, formerly associated with *Cristo la Unica Esperanza*. Mr. Cristóbal Lendi, a fiery and rather unpredictable man, was temporally the leader, until he was suspended as a pastor because of his aggressive attitudes toward the membership of the church and with other church leaders.

In the outskirts of the military city of San Isidrio, Pastor José Moisés Garcia established a small preaching station which never matured into an organized church.

Out west, in the San Pedro de Macorís and La Romana zones, the Nazarene Church had established many churches. The early missionaries tried to avoid competing with the Nazarene Church for the allegiance of already existing church groups. In Cacata, Mr. Ramón de la Rosa had gathered a group together. Several Nazarene groups sought affiliation with the ICRRD in the La Romana area. The missionary made contact with officials of the

³³⁷ *Iglesia Dulce...*, p. 41.

Nazarene Church asking them to resolve their differences. This was accomplished. However, later, a few Nazarene groups joined the ICRRD. The cross-overs during the 1980's were minimal for both denominations.

La Matilla, close to the Roman Catholic center of Higuey, formed a church of members disciplined out of the *Iglesia de Dios Pentecostal y Misionera*. The discipline was related to the group's contacts with Ramón de la Rosa. The leader left in charge of the breakaway group was Feliciano de la Rosa.

The second year of the formation of the ICRRD, according to the statistics of the second Assembly, recorded 445 adult members, 920 attendees, for a total community of 1365 persons. There were 15 organized churches and 12 preaching stations. There were a total of 14 lay pastors and one evangelist, and four missionaries. Two new primary schools had been opened bringing the total to four.

The growth patterns in the ICRRD continued, not so much in the growth of the groups but through the addition of other groups. Transfer growth was at least five times higher than congregational growth through births, marriages or evangelism.³³⁸

Transfer growth into the ICRRD was strongest among groups formerly affiliated with *Cristo la Unica Esperanza*, an Independent Dominican Pentecostal denomination, which has its headquarters in San Cristobal.³³⁹

Along with church growth, attention to matters of doctrine was given by the denominational and missionary leaders. Missionaries encouraged the formation of study groups of national pastors in order to deal with the practice and tolerance of spiritism which was manifest within some of the church groups. Besides the synodical study groups, missionaries began to offer Bible and theology classes in the ICRRD zones. All pastors were required to attend and elders were encouraged to do likewise, if their work load allowed them to.

The CRWM mission staff continued to grow during the second year of the ICRRD's existence. Rev. Wayne De Young and Rev. José Martínez were transferred by CRWM from Central America to the Dominican Republic. Three experienced missionaries and one first term missionary were assigned to the zones where the Haitian groups were gathered. Ray Brinks, as the mission team coordinator, oversaw the missionary work and worked in the Yamasa-Monte Plata zone as well. Wayne De Young labored in the San Luis zone, east of the capital city. José Martínez concentrated his mission efforts in the Santo Domingo zone, especially among the Dominican population. The author continued in the Sabana Grande de Boya zone and made, during the same time period, exploratory trips to the La Romana and La Vega regions.

The structural establishment of the ICRRD was rapidly taking place during its second year of existence. Churches and mission stations were being organized at the local, regional and national levels. Leadership training was made available through missionaries teaching in the zones on a regular basis. The beginnings of the Christian school movement were established. Initial responses to emergency as well as long term social development

³³⁸ Of the original six organized churches and three preaching stations, the growth reported for the year was from 149 to 199 adult members and 345 to 441 other attendees for a total of 494 total attendees to 631 total attendees. Growth of older groups grew 50 adult members compared to 246 new adult members through affiliating groups. Total attendance grew in new groups by 137 while 734 new attendees came through affiliating groups

³³⁹ Other small Pentecostal groups include *Iglesia de Dios no-sectaria*, *Cruzada Evangelica*, but mostly self started house churches.

needs were attempted. The ICRRD became the recipient of an expanding international missionary movement through the arrival CRWM missionaries.

6.3.3. Representative Cooperation (May 1983-September 1984)

The ICRRD and CRWM exerted extensive efforts in order to follow up responsibilities of church group organization, mission strategy and development, leadership training and supervision.

From May 1983 to September 1984, the National Assembly went from 31 to 41 churches and from 36 to 39 mission groups. Five groups ceased to exist during that time span. Twenty-two pastors were re-licensed and eleven new pastors were examined and approved bringing the total to 31. The statistical survey reported baptized members increasing during this time period from 900 to 935, regular attendees went from 2015 to 2139, and total attendance went up from 2915 to 3064.³⁴⁰

New CRWM missionaries continued to come. They included Rev. Ryan and Mrs. Julia Veenema, who would work in the Barahona district; Dr. Derk and Mrs. Nancy Oostendorp, missionaries for the La Romana zone and Mr. Jeff and Mrs. Kathy De Jong, Christian school teacher trainers in Santo Domingo.³⁴¹

The Third Assembly had appointed five study committees. They studied: *vigilias* (all night religious feasts or vigils), baptism of children, the family, pastor's houses and discipline.

During the year, the committee studying the practice of *vigilias* recommended that the all night meetings be shifted to all day Sunday meetings. Congregations would be free to choose the day or all night festivities but they were not to allow the "spiritual possessions" to take place. Such possessions were associated with Voodoo. Pastors were reminded to be wise in preventing disorders as the *vigilias* attracted town drunks and spiritists alike.³⁴²

Whereas most of the church leaders and members were familiar with the Baptist view of believer's baptism, the missionaries introduced the theology and practice of infant baptism. The committee appointed the previous year, came up with three recommendations. They were:

1. If parents dedicate their children in the church they are to understand that this is not a sacrament but a custom of the Old Testament, also practiced by Jesus and good to do, if there is no baptism of children. This was approved.
2. That the ICRRD permit its members to have their children baptized, if they know why they are doing it. Not approved.
3. That we (the ICRRD) give the missionaries the opportunity to baptize their children in the ICRRD and any pastor has the same right to baptize the children of Christians. Approved.³⁴³

The difference between recommendation two and three was that number two established that infant baptism was not the agreed upon practice of the ICRRD but that number three

³⁴⁰ *Actas 4*, Art. 58, 77,78; *Iglesia Dulce...*, pp 82, 118.

³⁴¹ *Actas 4*, Art. 59.

³⁴² *Ibid.*, Art. 61.

³⁴³ *Ibid.*, Art. 62.

allowed for exceptions. The strong sentiment against infant baptism was that all of the lay pastors had been leaders, members or attendees in adult-baptism type churches. Also, infant baptism was associated with the practice of the Roman Catholic Church and Protestant churches with whom the Haitian immigrants were familiar with. Re-baptism was traditionally required of persons baptized as infants.

Some of the recommendations of the study committee dealing with family issues included: a) not to allow for common law marriages; b) establish guidelines for divorce, remarriage and reconciliation and c) recommend marriage concerns to local pastors. The committee was expanded to include more members, especially because legal questions regarding marrying Haitians needed to be solved. In certain geographical zones the Dominican civil judges were not recognizing Haitian documentation for marriage.³⁴⁴ Although non-legal relationships had been very common amongst the Haitian immigrants this committee decided that there were legal avenues available for legal marriages for interested parties. Full church membership would require a legal marriage for married couples. This decision was motivational for improving the legal status of many church members. It has been very important in stabilizing church families.

The committee on pastoral housing recommended that two pastor's homes be built in each zone per year. Visiting construction groups were willing to help in such labors. The regional assembly would decide which pastors would be benefited first. The house would belong to the pastor; it would not be a parsonage. This decision was taken as a way to help the pastors without creating the dependency involved in outside agencies paying salaries.³⁴⁵

The discipline committee continued to deal with pastors who needed to be corrected. Since the standards for becoming a pastor were so open ended, leadership conflicts and moral questions had to be dealt with as they arose.

The third year of the ICRRD denomination required increased denominational and zonal meetings. The meetings were useful for administration, teaching, correction and resolving of practical issues. The ICRRD benefited by their leaders, members and missionaries being able to deliberate, learn and serve together. This was seen in their ability to organize more church groups, increase the enrollment and participation in church leadership training classes and through the ICRRD ability to study doctrinal issues and implement practices consistent with their findings

6.3.4. National Identity Expressions (September 1984 - September 1985)

The fourth year of the ICRRD was a time in which the importance of national and contextualized leadership in the local churches, at the denominational level and in para-church ministries became evident. The ICRRD continued to stress the importance of ministering among the Haitian in their language, using their own leaders, Bible, hymnbooks and liturgical order. The Dominican leadership and ministry were not ignored but its growth lagged behind that of the Haitian immigrants.

In the National Assembly of August 30, 1985, 45 groups were recognized and 10 new churches were accepted. Of these 10 churches, five had been groups that had become churches. The total number of churches was 56 with 103 groups. There were 41 pastors, eight missionaries with CRWM and four missionaries with CRWRC (See Appendix II). The

³⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, Art. 63.

³⁴⁵ *Ibid.*, Art. 64.

number of adult members grew to 2392, with children and regular visitor adding 4336 more for a total of 6728 attendees.³⁴⁶

The growth of the church was mostly evangelism activities whereby the local churches would visit neighboring villages. "Worship evangelism" - conducting small worship services in a variety of places, was well received. Within the worship service, prayers, praises and teaching from the Bible were given. Visitors were personally challenged to follow the Lord Jesus Christ and take the necessary steps to join the local congregation.

Another reason for the church growth was that independent Haitian groups began to see that the ICRRD had a comprehensive church planting, education and social assistance program. Whereas the Nazarene Church had offered such assistance previously to the Haitian immigrants, the emphasis of the Nazarene Church had shifted towards evangelizing and educating Dominican groups. The ICRRD's main emphasis continued to be the ministry among Haitian immigrants. The majority of church services were conducted in Haitian Creole. Haitian Bibles and hymn books were used. The ICRRD became known as the "Haitian church."

Contacts were being made by the Haitian leaders with family and friends in Haiti. Would CRWM work in the south-eastern, Thiotte and Jacmel areas of Haiti? It soon became apparent that CRWM and CRWRC could not agree, thereby stopping CRWM from doing follow up in Haiti.³⁴⁷

The Christian school movement grew to eight schools, the number of teachers increased to 26, serving 605 students.³⁴⁸ Teachers were given continuing education and were supervised by missionary and national directors. All of the schools operated in the Spanish language and used the Dominican Department of Education guidelines.

Social work projects were used as experiments. José Martínez set up a pharmacy in the capital city. The author was able to persuade SEPAS (*Sociedad Evangélica Pro-Acción Social*) to put wells in Carmona and la Pista. CRWRC cooperated with SSID in order to help, with micro-industry programs, 150 families in the San Luis area and 135 families in the Central zone. ALFALIT, with grant money from CRWRC, made plans to help 200 persons in the San Luis zone, 350 in Santo Domingo, and 350 in the Sabana Grande De Boya zone. CRWRC also helped women groups develop micro-industries such as making cross-stitch greeting cards for tourists and export.³⁴⁹

At the end of fourth year of the ICRRD denomination, the National Assembly heard the reports and recommendations of a variety of committees.

The documentation committee reported having helped 350 Haitians with residency papers and 200 more workers receive documentation.³⁵⁰ It was hoped that the legalization

³⁴⁶ *Actas 5*, pp. 123f; "El Crecimiento de la Iglesia," p. 82; *Iglesia Dulce...*, p. 51.

³⁴⁷ The main discussion was between CRWM-DR (Ray Brinks, spokesperson) and the Haitian CRWM and CRWRC. The CRWM-DR plan was rejected by the missionaries in Haiti. Although conversations between the DR and Haitian church groups continued, it has not resulted in similar church growth as in the DR.

³⁴⁸ *Iglesia Dulce...*, p. 52.

³⁴⁹ The most consistent, long term employment opportunities for members and leaders of the ICRRD came in the area of formal education. In the early 1990's, CRWM aggressively supported ICRRD students and COCREF teachers with university scholarships. The need for bachelor level teachers for the COCREF schools was met, plus teachers went to the public school system to teach.

³⁵⁰ *Actas 5*, Art. 97.

of the Haitian immigrant pastor and church leaders would facilitate access to civil courts for marriage licenses and make traveling throughout the Dominican Republic possible.

The committee studying inter-church visiting practices recommended that the visiting and celebration of the sacraments continue with churches that did not conflict with ICRRD doctrine and practice. Communion with sectarian groups was prohibited.³⁵¹

The Cooperation Committee, seeking to define the relationship between the ICRRD and the mission agencies, was not able to report since the zonal assemblies had not studied its recommendations. The national church expressed its hope to go beyond simply adopting a missionary prepared document.

The Dress-code Committee came with a recommendation that churches should not seek to put rules into place about clothing. This position, though favored by most missionaries, was not approved by synod and a new committee was formed to continue to study the issues surrounding dress codes.

Two new committees were formed, one to develop Sunday school materials and another to develop radio programs.

CRWM reported on developing three funding projects with the ICRRD. There was a building budget, leadership training classes budget and together with CRWRC, a diaconal budget. The building budget was primarily the responsibility of CRWM.³⁵² The leadership training classes started with 100% CRWM funding and were diminished over the years. The diaconal fund started as 60% Mission and 40% national church, with the idea of working to match peso per peso. The matching grant from the Mission funding became very popular, where the national church would raise 50% and the mission agencies would fund 50%.

In a move toward the nationalization of denominational leadership, the ICRRD pastors and leaders were elected as vice-president and treasurer of the Central Committee. All the local congregations were led by national pastors. The leaders chosen by the local groups were similar to their ethnic makeup.

National identity was expressed in two major ways. First, the ICRRD became known as a Haitian church due to its emphasis on ministering to a large number of Haitian immigrants in their own language. Secondly, Dominican churches and leaders remained active participants in the ICRRD as shown by the election of Dominican leaders to the Central Committee, the hiring of Dominican social workers and educators, and the continuation of Dominican church groups. However, the Dominican church growth was slow and they remained as a minority within the ICRRD.

6.3.5. Expansion and Turbulence (September 1985 - September 1986)

With the continuing growth of a denomination which included Haitian immigrant and Dominican leaders and members, tensions arose within the ICRRD during its fifth year of existence and had to be resolved.

³⁵¹ *Ibid.*, Art. 95.

³⁵² The Haitian immigrants had difficulties building and keeping buildings for churches. The ICRRD registered the properties in the name of the denomination. International and national work teams began building wooden structures for the church groups. CRWRC was not in favor, at that time, of using international work teams. Several CRWM missionaries were enthusiastic about hosting work teams and eventually (by early 1990's) the use of work teams became a CRWM field strategy.

Adult membership rose to 2527; total attendees numbered 6212, bringing the total to 8739. At the 1986 National Assembly, 61 churches and 108 groups were recognized. Licensed pastors went up to 54.³⁵³

The Christian schools grew by one, bringing their number to 15. Eight more teachers were hired as more grades were added to existing schools. Along with the tuition paid by the parents of the students, CRWM financially supported the school program.

Social service programs, especially those associated with CRWRC continued to expand. Due to the oppressive economic conditions of the Haitian immigrants and Dominican poor the hoped for self-support was difficult to accomplish.

Tensions within the ICRRD began to manifest itself in the capital zone. The original tension was between the expressed will of the capital zone and that of the Mission Committee. First of all, the capital leaders came to Central Committee with five petitions. The requests were: 1) pastor's salary to be paid by the Mission; 2) pastoral housing to be financed by the Mission; 3) permanent ordination for all pastors; 4) begin a theological seminary and 5) establish the authority of the national Church. Even though the Central Committee adopted these petitions and addressed them to the Missionary Committee, the Missionary Committee refused to act on them.³⁵⁴ The Missionary Committee, consisting of leaders from CRWM, CRWRC and the ICRRD, was perceived by leaders of the capital zone as directing national church policy and programs. It claimed that the mission agencies had the final say about how mission funds designated for the ICRRD would be used and thereby the Mission Committee rather than the Central Committee was dictating the program agenda of the ICRRD. If the mission agencies did not approve of how their donated money was spent they threatened to withhold the money.³⁵⁵

Capital zone missionary, José Martínez, expressed his frustration with the Missionary Committee and resigned from CRWM to return to the USA. In his absence as president of the Central Committee, vice president Miguel Andino, a Dominican leader from the capital city, became acting president. At the start of the National Assembly, his presidency, and the other leadership positions of the Central Committee were challenged from the assembly floor. Miguel Andino was voted out and replaced by Emilio Pérez. Roberto Cherubín, as treasurer, and Pierre Philippe, as secretary, continued in their tasks. The reaction against Andino was related to the perception by both the Haitian leaders, as well as the missionaries, that the capital zone leaders wanted to take control over the leadership of the ICRRD's assembly and denomination. Whether their perceptions were real or not is secondary to the overall result of the democratic election process which took place the assembly. The Haitian delegates became aware that due to their vast numbers, they were able vote in their leaders and influence the assembly's agenda.

The effect of Haitian voting patterns were immediate. Representatives from the National Assembly questioned the leaders of the capital zone, for allowing pastors to retain their license, while having churches with less than 10 communicant members. It was argued that such leaders were not pastors but evangelists. During the next year, these "evangelist's"

³⁵³ *Iglesia Dulce...*, p. 57.

³⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 61.

³⁵⁵ Attempts were made to place the Missionary Council under the jurisdiction of the ICRRD. CRWRC programs were granted in areas where missionary and national church cooperation was favorable. The ICRRD began to question missionary church attendance patterns. The lack of church attendance was interpreted as a sign of the missionaries' lack of commitment to the ICRRD.

churches were closed due to the lack of leadership and membership. The capital zone leadership digressed into a series of property disputes and church closings.

The September, 1986 Assembly meeting was the beginning of a rupture between the Haitian and Dominican leadership within the ICRRD. The capital zone, led by Dominican leadership, had failed to convince the Missions Committee and the assembly of the ICRRD of its agenda. The Haitian delegates began to see that by the democratic process they were able to control the leadership roles of the ICRRD. In response, Dominican leaders began to speak of forming their own denomination.

6.3.6. Church Stabilization (September 1986 - September 1987)

The attempts by the capital zone to take over the leadership of the denomination failed. The National Assembly reacted to the take-over bid: the ministerial licenses of six capital leaders, the four evangelists and two pastors, were not renewed. One of the capital pastors had confiscated more than US\$6,000.00 worth of pharmacy medicine as back payment for the proposed pastor's salary. Another leader took over a church building and rented it out as a home. Dominican and some Haitian churches temporarily stopped meeting in regional meetings in the capital. The capital zone continued, as Haitian groups formerly affiliated from a Pentecostal movement joined. However, ICRRD evangelism growth among the Dominicans practically stopped in the capital zone during 1987.³⁵⁶ In other sectors of the ICRRD both the Dominican and Haitian continued to grow.

The Seventh National Assembly, held September 1987, was presided over by Pastor Locano Jean. Thirty four groups were accepted by the National Assembly. Twenty church groups were approved bringing the number up to 81. Forty three pastors were re-licensed and 19 new pastors accepted. The assembly statistics report that there were 2853 adult members, with an estimated 7000 children and regular visitors, accounting for a total church attendance of a reported 9900. Sixteen primary schools were in operation, with the hope of opening three more.³⁵⁷

Missionary Wayne De Young accepted a position with CRWM in Haiti. He recruited Pastor Emilio Pérez Martínez and Pastor Roberto Cherubín to head up the Jean Calvino Institute, a leadership training program headquartered in Port-au-Prince.

Whereas in the beginning of the ICRRD, the San Luis, Sabana Grande De Boya, Central, San Pedro and capital zones had grown, la Romana received a boost with the work of Dr. Derk Oostendorp in that area. The Barahona zone was consolidated with the presence of Rev. Daniel Roeda. The Cibao zone, in north-central Dominican Republic, developed a Dominican church planting work with five to six groups and Haitian work with seven groups. Later, church developments on the north coast occurred under the leadership of Rev. Thomas Walcott.

National church leaders started to be chosen for leadership positions in para-church agencies. Before leaving for Haiti, Pastor Emilio Pérez Martínez was employed by Micro-Industria to supervise work projects. Pastor Natalio Pérez García was hired as a Medicine and Nutrition Promoter for SSID. Pastor Octavio Monegro was the ALFALIT promoter for the Sabana Grande de Boya zone.

³⁵⁶ Church statistics were not made available in the *Actas* for 1987.

³⁵⁷ *Iglesia Dulce...*, p. 64.

With the opening of the Universidad Nacional Evangélica (UNEV: National Evangelical University), teachers, social workers and theologians would be prepared for schools, social work and para-church ministries. The author became involved in the setting up of the department of theology and several ICRRD students enrolled in UNEV.

These developments in the ICRRD were accompanied by signs of harassment. In the Esperanza zone, several ICRRD churches were closed due to military deportation sweeps. It appeared that the military, as well as the politicians, were becoming increasingly concerned about the mounting number of Haitians in the Dominican Republic. The Haitian churches, as visible meeting places for Haitians, were easy targets.

The seventh year for the ICRRD brought a restructuring in the capital zone, an expansion of denominational and para-church ministries, continuing church growth, as well as an increased concern by Dominican government authorities about the increasing number of Haitian immigrants in the country.

6.3.7. Mission Affirmation (September 1987 - September 1988)

The Eighth National Assembly, presided over by Pastor Natalio Pérez Garcia, was a time of re-affirming the mission identity of the ICRRD. The national church leadership began to express more interest in taking leadership roles in the international sponsored mission projects. CRWM and CRWRC, in turn, called for ongoing leadership training and church financial support.

Fifty-nine pastors were re-licensed and 13 new pastors were accepted. Fourteen new groups and one new church were received.³⁵⁸ Adult membership had grown from 2853 from a year previous to 3060. Total attendance stood at 9800 in September 1988.

The National Assembly dealt with a variety of outreach-related questions. Joel Zwier, director of CRWRC, gave a report about CRWRC activities and answered a variety of questions and responded to concerns expressed. Pastor Javelo Gomez wondered if Micro-Industry should be associated with the ICRRD, since in their zone, they were ministering in the area but not working with the ICRRD. He objected to the ICRRD being associated with "unconverted" workers. Zwier responded that CRWRC and Micro-Industry also work with non-Christians. Pastor Alberto Hernández wondered why CRWRC had not visited the regional zone meetings. Zwier responded that since the La Vega zone meetings are for Dominican churches, CRWRC works more with the poorer Haitian population. Pastor Locano Jean asked Derk Oostendorp, CRWM field director, if the CRWRC money belongs to the ICRRD. Oostendorp replied in the negative but explained that CWRM gives some money to CRWRC for certain projects. Pastor Sirel Lors solicited the pig program, which had started in the San Luis zone, for the capital area. CRWRC would investigate which project could be done.³⁵⁹

CRWRC became more involved with the ICRRD during the upcoming year. CRWRC relief and social development programs were organized with local churches and ICRRD leaders were voted to ecumenical boards such as ALFALIT and SSID.

The Diaconal Committee of the ICRRD was given \$59,350.63 pesos and the church raised \$30,148.44 pesos. Each zone established special projects for the poor, elderly and sick. The money raised for the local diaconal needs, coupled with the support for the

³⁵⁸ *Actas* 8, Art. 175,176.

³⁵⁹ *Actas* 8, Art. 169.

national pastors, amounted to a significant financial commitment for both the ICRRD and mission agencies.³⁶⁰

The issue of women in office came to the National Assembly through the recommendation of the Church Order Committee.³⁶¹ After a lively debate at the assembly, the final proposal was stated in Article 13 of the Church Order that reads:

The participation of the sisters in the church is very important in light that they, like the men, are made in the image of God (Gen. 1:26), are heirs of salvation (Gal. 3:28) and equipped with spiritual gifts in order to serve God. In view of the apostolic Christian principles for good order in the church in relationship with the man and woman (Ephesians 5;21-23; I Tim. 2:9-15; I Tim. 3:11) the sisters can be leaders of the Ladies Society, leaders in the Sunday School, secretaries of the church, deaconesses and lady missionaries.

The brothers who are elected by the church will have as their responsibility the leadership of the ecclesiastical committees of the church, such as the local committee, regional committee and national assembly.³⁶²

The women in office issue had the potential of being divisive, as it was within the Christian Reformed Church in North America. Missionaries had different points of view on the matter but decided not to press the issue. National church leaders were not overly concerned about the exact title women church workers had, women participation in the congregations and denominational projects was ongoing.

The process of indigenization within the ICRRD continued to develop. At the beginning of the history of the ICRRD congregations were choosing their own leaders and financially supporting them while the pastors were approved by synod and synod supervised the overall development of the denomination. At the yearly assembly meetings, study committees were formed in order to study doctrinal, ethical and ministry related issues. A Cooperation Committee (later renamed the Missionary Committee) oversaw mission projects which CRWM, CRWRC and the ICRRD had in common. By September 1986, national leadership was directing both the Central Committee as well as the National Assembly. The Eight National Assembly witnesses the continuing dialogue between ICRRD leaders and missionary leaders in order to fully involve the local ICRRD congregations in the mission projects. This process would prove to be very valuable for future years when the social stability of the Haitian immigrants would be affected by increased deportations and socio-political unrest.

6.3.8. Internal Growth (September 1988 – September 1989)

During the period of 1988 – 1989, it was reported at the National Assembly that 393 baptisms were registered in the churches. This was one of the signs of internal growth within the ICRRD. Established churches numbered 86, groups were up to 143; there were 52

³⁶⁰ *Actas* 8, Art. 172.

³⁶¹ *Ibid.*, Art. 172.

³⁶² *Reglas Internas*, Art. 13.

pastors including 12 new pastors; 3,227 adult members, 2,969 believers and 3,402 children for a total of 9598 attendees.³⁶³

The ICRRD denominational mission programs continued to develop. The Diaconal Committee dealt with 4,379 emergency cases. The ICRRD raised \$40,291.00 pesos and CRWM/CRWRC contributed 62,578.00 pesos.³⁶⁴ ALFALIT, SSID, the Pig Plan, Micro-Industry and a new program called DESCO (Desarrollo Comunitario) were going well.³⁶⁵

The 20 primary schools continued to flourish. For the new year, three more were planned, in order to teach a total of 2,000 students with 60 teachers. Many of the teachers came from the ICRRD.³⁶⁶

The National Assembly was informed that Natalio Pérez Garcia, Neal Hegeman and Pierre Philippe were collecting data about human rights abuses. Deportations were systematically and frequently starting to occur. There had been reports of child labor, child trafficking and abuse of Haitian immigrants.³⁶⁷

A committee to study the role of prophecy reported to the assembly. Occult activities associated with self-proclaimed prophets had been reported. Such practices as prophets spitting, dragging people through the dust, the use of fetishes, the drinking of special teas and potions and immoral life styles, were denounced. Many of the activities are associated with healing ceremonies. Biblical guidelines were set forth.³⁶⁸ One of the committee members, Pastor Juan Garcia, resigned from the ICRRD claiming that if such activities were not permitted, then the Spirit would leave the church.

As the church continued to grow and develop, a book of liturgical forms was needed. A committee was chosen to present one for 1990.

The years 1988-1989 were a time for the internal organization of the ICRRD. Congregations were evangelizing and incorporating members in the church; pastors and leaders were being trained on a ongoing basis; the Christian primary school movement continued to grow; diaconal and social work projects were serving an increasing number of persons in need; and the denominational leaders were studying and seeking to correct un Biblical practices.

6.3.9. Calm Before the Storm (September 1989 - September 1990)

The nation of Haiti was increasingly experiencing political and military turmoil. The Dominican government's continued to express concern over the increasing number of Haitian immigrants coming to the Dominican Republic. It would be a matter of time before the Dominican would take drastic steps to send the Haitian immigrants back to their homeland. Since the ICRRD consisted mostly of Haitian immigrants, the political unrest also affected the denomination.

Pastor Pierre Philippe, ICRRD pastor, promoter for DESCO and later the first national director for the Bible League, became the National Assembly and Central

³⁶³ *Actas 9*, Art. 196.

³⁶⁴ *Ibid.*, Art. 185.

³⁶⁵ *Ibid.*, Art. 192.

³⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, Art. 194.

³⁶⁷ Some of the committees took several years to complete. The committees were useful for study, discussion and finally implementing a corporate decision.

³⁶⁸ *Ibid.*, Art. 187.

Committee president in 1990. He would occupy that position for several years, intermittently. Pastor Philippe is especially gifted in leadership administrative skills.

Total overall church membership was slightly down from the previous year. Adult membership rose to 3,250, other adult attendees dropped to 2,727 and the children's participation grew to 3,550, for a total of 9,227. The number of churches rose to 93, mission groups dropped to 138; there were 63 pastors, with three new ones. Adult baptisms decreased to 205.³⁶⁹

DESCO continued to develop, reporting work in 19 *bateyes*, directly associated with the ICRRD. Micro-Industry changed its name to Casa Caribeña. There were 482 women working with them.³⁷⁰

Since the mid-1980's, work crews from North America and Europe had been coming to build churches, pastor's houses, schools and clinics. During 1989-1990, seven groups had come to the ICRRD regions. They generally built two structures during a two-week stay.

A new project was being developed in the capital city. Previously, a Ministry Center: a nationally operated center to carry out a variety of administrative, educational and evangelism ministries had been developed in Sabana Grande De Boya.³⁷¹ Now the concept of having a national ministry center in the capital region was approved. Property was bought and a large building was constructed. One of the functions of the center would be to rent out dormitory space to visiting groups and national gatherings. Since the center was owned by the ICRRD, part of the profits would be given to the pastors.

The coming of the storm was being felt in different parts of country. On December 31, 1989, the CEA superintendent of Batey Nuevo (SGDB) came into the church on Sunday morning and ordered the men to cut cane. Even though the Dominican national constitution grants holidays and Sundays off, the order had been given so Haitians would work on Sunday in order to finish the harvest. The act was denounced by the ICRRD and SSID to the government and the aforementioned superintendent of Batey Nuevo was removed from his position.

In Barahona, near the border of Haiti, pastors Julio Santana and Mauricio Ruiz denounced the ongoing imprisonment of Haitians. There seemed to be a concern by the Dominican authorities that too many Haitians were coming into the Dominican Republic.³⁷² This concern would escalate into a nation wide deportation in the near future.

The ninth year of the existence of the ICRRD was difficult, in the sense that the conflict between the Dominican government and Haitian immigrants was escalating. Denominational, mission agency, SSID leaders and international human right advocates denounced the increasing abuses of Haitian immigrants but the results were minimal.

6.3.10. The Storm of Deportations (September 1990 - September 1991)

As the ICRRD entered into its tenth year, the rapid growth of the movement would be severely challenged by deportations enforced on Haitian members of the ICRRD. Deportations started unofficially in 1990. In several years, 1990 and 1991, approximately

³⁶⁹ *Actas 10*, Art. 227.

³⁷⁰ *Ibid.*, Art. 208.

³⁷¹ Hegeman, *Ministry Among...*, The thesis was used as a background study for the development of the Ministry Center in Sabana Grande De Boya.

³⁷² Letter written by Julio Santana and Mauricio Ruiz and faxed by Hegeman to American Watch.

one third of the ICRRD membership was deported. Would the new denomination continue to stand together? Would it be able to offer leadership and help to the deportees?

On June 13, 1991, Dr. Joaquín Balaguer, president of the Dominican Republic, issued an executive decree to begin the forced repatriations of Haitians living in the Dominican Republic back to Haiti. When the *coup d'etat* forced Haitian President Jean-Bertrand Aristide into exile to the United States, more than 70,000 Haitians were deported. Among them, were over 2,500 members, attendees and their children of the ICRRD.³⁷³

During the year prior to the 1991 deportations, the Dominican government had already stopped giving out any legal papers to the Haitian sugar cane cutters. Without legal documentation, it was impossible to secure a social security number needed for birth certificates, marriage licenses, social security, medical help and other legal matters. The Dominican government thereby successfully turned the 300,000 or more Haitian immigrant community into a mass of illegal migrants. Deportation in 1991 was an easy matter as the immigrants did not have legal papers.³⁷⁴

Haitian immigrants in the urban centers were the first to be evacuated. The privately owned and government owned sugar cane villages were hardly touched. Several sugar cane *ingenios* (plantations) which were going out of business were removed. One of the sugar cane regions that was scheduled to be switched from sugar cane to garden plots was near Altagracia (SGDB). On February 19, 1990, the superintendent of the area, Fernando Sanchez, confiscated the garden plot of the Haitian immigrant, Ishmael Jean, of Batey Altagracia. The area did not need sugar cane workers anymore, so they were open targets for theft and abuse.³⁷⁵

Haitians were fearful of the deportations but also eager to return to Haiti, since it was reported that democracy had been restored. However, the exile of President Aristide took away any immediate hopes of freedom in Haiti.³⁷⁶

Large-scale deportations were halted after the Haitian coup. Yet, periodical military sweeps continue to be recorded. Haitians were brought across the Haitian border to start the November 1992, sugar cane season.³⁷⁷

The response of the ICRRD and the missionary community to these developments was twofold. On the one hand, the church and missionaries helped Haitians to return to Haiti; on the other, they assisted political refugees from Haiti when they came to the Dominican Republic. CRWRC set aside an emergency fund to rent buses to take Haitians and their few belongings to Port-au-Prince. This helped to minimize the trauma of organizing the moves.³⁷⁸ Refugees from Haiti, fleeing the anti-Aristide forces, were offered a sanctuary at the ministry center in the capital.³⁷⁹

³⁷³ Hegeman, "Repatriación Haitiana afecta comunidad evangélica," *El Nacional* (September 9, 1991).

³⁷⁴ "Half Measures. Reformed, Forced Labor and Dominican Sugar Industry," *Americas Watch* (ed.) (March 1991), p. 27f; interview with Joaquín Balaguer in *Listin Diario*, (March 30, 1989), p. 10.

³⁷⁵ Hegeman visit with Ismael Jean in March, 1990 in Villa Altagracia.

³⁷⁶ February, 1992, interview with pastor Odeis Ydamé, who returned to Thiotte, Haiti and stayed there. Many of the Haitians returned to the Dominican Republic after the exile of Aristide

³⁷⁷ German Reyes, "Traen haitianos para la zafra," *Hoy* (November 25, 1992, p. 1).

³⁷⁸ During the deportation a number of ICRRD pastors sold church materials and even buildings in order to return. They were placed under discipline measures. *Actas II*, Art. 237

³⁷⁹ Robin Kirk, "Stone of Refugee:Haitian Refugees in the Dominican Republic," U.S. Committee for Refugees, June 1992. The author interviewed Robin Kirk at the ministry center in the capital.

What were some of the effects of the deportations? Christian schools lost many students. The number of schools went down from 27 to 22, with 1,088 students and 64 teachers. The number of pastors went from 63 to 51; many pastors followed their members to Haiti. It was estimated that over 2,500 attendees had left for Haiti by September, 1991. The EERH only had three established churches, mostly around the capital city, Port-au-Principe. New congregations were formed in the south eastern region, around Thiotte and in the Port-au-Principe regions. Requests were made by the deported pastors for the ICRRD and CRWM to become involved in church development in Haiti.

The deportation was a deterrent for the development projects among the Haitian immigrant community. Emergency relief took its place. The Pig Project, Micro-Industries, literacy training and diaconal loans programs for Haitian immigrants were halted.

The Haitian immigrants deported from the Dominican Republic were first of all shipped to Port-au-Principe. From there they were bussed to their families' communities. The largest number went to the southwestern Jacmel and Thiotte area. A significant number stayed in the vicinity of the capital.

Many of the Haitians began to secretly return to the Dominican Republic. They complained about not being well received in their home towns in Haiti. There was a scarcity of food, housing and work. Forced labor in the Dominican Republic was still better than work situation in Haiti.

Another storm cloud on the horizon of the ICRRD was related to the disease of AIDS. In the mid-1980's, hundreds of Haitians in the Dominican Republic were dying per year from what was believed to be tuberculosis. Later it became known that the TB was a complication due to AIDS. During the early months of 1990, five more members from the ICRRD died of AIDS. Many more were known to be infected with the HIV virus.³⁸⁰

The year 1991 ended under the cloud of political turmoil in Haiti. President Aristides of Haiti had gone into exile. Haitian immigrants were slowly starting to come back to the Dominican Republic. The immigrants had left much of their possessions in being deported and now they were coming back with virtually nothing but the clothes on their bodies.

The ICRRD had wisely maintained their empty church buildings. Very few were closed. When the immigrants returned, many came back to their previous churches. Diaconal, adult education, leadership training programs had been put on hold and had to be re-organized. The ICRRD was affected by the deportations but it had outlasted the political storms.

6.4. Ministerial Training in the ICRRD

Thesis 8. *Leadership training and Christian education was the dominant ministry activity during the first decade of the ICRRD.*

Ministerial training was offered to both the church leaders as well as the leaders involved in Christian ministries. Systematic Christian education was initiated by the visiting and full

³⁸⁰ Among the AIDs fatalities were a pastor (Julio Satana), a language tutor (Celestine), a school teachers(Julio Brown), young people (Sergio Decír) and others.

time missionaries with the emphasis on training national teachers to continue in the task of training.³⁸¹

Prior to the coming of the Puerto Rican World Missions' missionaries in 1976, the Back To God Hour (BGH) broadcasted Spanish programs which were listened to and responded throughout the island. From 1976 to 1979, the Puerto Rican missionaries offered a variety of courses using the programmed materials of CITE. From the arrival of the first missionaries in 1980 until the establishment of the ICRRD in 1981, educational workshops were given to church leaders. The first decade of the ICRRD was filled with training for church leaders, as well as for Bible distributors, literacy trainers, development workers, schoolteachers and small business projects managers. After 1991, national led study projects became more prominent as the number of missionaries decreased and the size of the ICRRD grew.

Rev. Juan Boonstra of the BGH was known throughout the Dominican Republic for his teaching broadcasts of "La Hora de la Reforma." His messages were accompanied by several small traditional Reformed doctrinal and sermon booklets. It was through the BGT correspondence that the first contacts were made with the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic.

When the Puerto Rican missionaries began to visit in 1976 and continued to do so on a bi-annual basis until 1980, they used the programmed text books produced by CITE. Like the broadcasts of the BGH, all the materials were in Spanish. The visitations and classes of the missionaries served two main goals: 1) to create a forum for communication, discussions and learning; and 2) to prepare for the sending of full time missionaries.

From 1980 to 1981, in the years when missionaries together with the early church leaders, were preparing the programs for the ICRRD, several important teaching workshops were given. Topics relating to church organization, basic theology, Bible, health were presented by missionaries and leaders from Protestant churches. It became evident that both Spanish and Creole teaching materials would be needed. Brinks undertook the task of learning Haitian Creole in which he, with the help of tutors from the church, became proficient.

When the ICRRD was organized on May 1, 1981, the educational program was well under way. Church leaders were required to enroll in the continued education classes. Usually they were held on a monthly basis. National seminars were held annually. This system continued for the first decade and beyond. By 1991, there were 18 teachers, including both missionary and nationals, meeting with over 350 students on a monthly schedule, training them to teach Sunday School and preach in the church services where more than 9,000 people were gathered.³⁸²

Several observations can be made about the success of the ICRRD leadership training program.

³⁸¹ Ministerial training is the subject matter of two doctoral theses: Neal Hegeman's *Church Ministry Among Marginal Peoples...* (1985) and Ray Brink's *The Formation of a Non-Formal Educational Team* (1989). The subject matters reported in the thesis will not be repeated here. This study will give a synopsis of the training program and present several conclusions

³⁸² See Hegeman, *Ministry among...* Brinks, *Non Formal...* Since the author and Brinks have written extensively about theological education, readers are deferred to those sources for a more indepth coverage.

1. The requirement for all ICRRD pastors to be enrolled and active in the continuing education program of the denomination created a system for communication, discussion, interaction, understanding and learning. The educational system had a stabilizing and strengthening effect on the ICRRD.
2. The absence of academic requirements for entrance into the ministerial training program allowed for all leaders to attend.
3. The provision of education, ranging from literacy training to master degree university courses provided theological and ministerial training for the whole denomination.
4. The teaching of sermon and Sunday School lessons in the monthly meetings were practical ways for the students to share what they had learned in class with the members and attendants in the congregations.
5. National teachers were trained in the early stages of the teaching program. This was well accepted by the students and provided a means to continue the educational program when the missionaries left the region.
6. Classes were held in places which were accessible to the students. The teacher would travel to the student for regional classes, rather than expecting the students to visit the teacher. The highest cost for the students was travel, so this arrangement reduced the costs.
7. Remuneration for national teachers was taken from the participating churches offerings as well as from donor agencies.
8. Opportunity was given to study in both Spanish and Creole. Educational materials were prepared in both languages. Haitians and Dominicans were employed by CRWM to write, edit and produce materials.
9. Materials for the denominational education program were prepared by a team of writers representing the cross section of the denomination. Educational materials were produced in booklet form. The advent of computerized writings helped in editing and producing the materials.
10. The system of monthly regional classes and annual conferences that were initiated at the beginning of the denominational continue until the present.

The ICRRD leadership training program did not utilize a residential seminary and their program went beyond the conventional Theological Education by Extension models.³⁸³ Each zone developed their unique study center while the denominational education committee would bring resources together and edit and print materials. The hiring of both Haitian and Dominican writers, the advent of computers and latter internet would make the preparation of materials more feasible.³⁸⁴

Not only were church leaders trained. A variety of educational training programs were instituted. *ALFALIT Dominicana* developed classes for literacy training starting in

³⁸³ *Ibid* and see Kinsler Ross, *The Extension Movement in Theological Education* and Ralph Winter, *Theological Education by Extension*. Both Brinks and Hegeman initially saw the ICRRD leadership training program as TEE. However, there was no academic or accrediting recognition of a central institution, as is the case in TEE. Rather, this was distance education in which local study centers are developed to meet the local educational needs. The local leaders were educated through the monthly classes but also participated in conferences, seminars and work shops presented by other educator

³⁸⁴ During the 1990's, CRWM developed study booklets that were used for internet studies. These became popular in Colombia, Guatemala, and Mexico.

1982. By 1985, literacy training was offered in the Creole language.³⁸⁵ The Christian Schools, COCREP, trained their own teachers through a series of annual workshops. With the establishment of UNEV, teachers from COCREP were given scholarships in order to upgrade their education.³⁸⁶ The diaconal committee associated with CRWRC offered training courses for development and diaconal work. By January of 1991, more than 100 persons were involved in continuing education in ministries related to the ICRRD community.

The ongoing educational program of the ICRRD and related ministries continued after 1991. World Missions trained teachers to teach in the nine regions of the ICRRD. The teachers were remunerated by the ICRRD and not the mission board. A scholarships donor program was developed to include international partners such as the *Gereformeerde Gemeente* (Reformed Congregations) diaconal fund. CRWM provided scholarships for teacher training at UNEV for COCREP teachers. The children of ICRRD leaders also received scholarships. The Luke Society as well as the diaconal committee trained their workers through workshops as well as at UNEV.³⁸⁷

6.5. Ministries of the ICRRD

Ecumenical ministries and relationships of the Reformed and Presbyterians churches in CALA, as well as that of the IED, have previously been discussed. ICRRD denominational ministries have been introduced in Section 6.4. Section 6.5. will continue to analyze the ministerial development of the ICRRD in relationship to the Protestant Dominican churches (6.5.1.), to denominational agencies (6.5.2.) as well as to interdenominational, global confessional and para-church agencies (6.5.3.)

³⁸⁵ *ALFALIT Dominicana* was used by CRWRC and CRWM as the channel in order to do Creole literacy training. With the moving away of the missionaries the program ceased.

³⁸⁶ The development of COCREP is a study in and of itself. The teachers were trained via UNEV and ongoing workshops but also through personal mentoring. Gladys Brinks, Sandra Hegeman, Jeff De Jonge, Kathy de Jonge and other missionary wives developed curriculum and supervised teacher development. The COCREP national team maintained high educational and moral standards for the school teachers and administrators. Eventually, graduates of the school system became national and regional directors (i.e. Julio Vílchez, Norma René).

³⁸⁷ The payment of the ICRRD regional teachers by the church classis or zones is functioning. The scholarship program for Christian schools in the early 1990's relied upon COMPASSion International, World Mission and World Wide Christian Schools. COMPASSion International withdrew as they sought to work in public school projects. World Missions basically paid missionary teachers salary and provided some funding, but with the departure of COMPASSion, a sizeable amount of scholarships had to be found. Jan Van Heteren, director of the *Deputaatschap Tot Hulpverlening in Bijzondere Noden der Gereformeerde Gemeente* (Relief and Emergency Arm of the Netherlands Reformed Congregations: in Holland), undertook 100 student scholarships at first and have increased that to over 250. The *Gereformeerde Gemeente* also gives partial support to the Luke Society work conducted by Dr. Silvia Ricardo Martínez with the Haitian immigrants. The Bible League in Chicago has donated thousands of Bibles and Biblical booklets, which in turn are sold at a low cost throughout the Dominican Republic. Direct donations to both church and para-church projects from a variety of churches and agencies are replacing denominational funding.

6.5.1. Relationship to the Protestant Dominican Churches

On the local level, the ICRRD congregations exchange church visits with most evangelical groups. Evangelical interdenominational cooperation is evident in evangelism campaigns, literature distribution, education projects, health and social service ministries and during times of emergencies. There are, however, real obstacles to be overcome.

There have been occasions when personality and even denominational conflicts have prevented the interchange of visits and cooperation. For example, leaders of the ICRRD and the *Asamblea Cristiana Unida* (United Christian Assembly), led by Rev. Aurelio Díaz, are members of the SSID board. Several ICRRD congregations came out of the ACU due to clashes with Rev. Díaz. However, the common need for SSID resources has caused some of the leaders to work together again, although they had different denominational positions.

Most of the ICRRD are Haitian Creole-speaking churches. Interchurch visits are most readily carried out with other Haitian Creole-speaking congregations. There is a noticeable barrier between Dominican and Haitian churches. In order to overcome that barrier it is expected that the Haitian learn to speak in Spanish and so break the communication barrier. There are few Dominican church and ecumenical leaders who speak Haitian Creole.

6.5.2. Denominational Agencies

As shall be seen in Section 6.5.3., most of the ecumenical contacts of the ICRRD are associated with missionary and para-church agencies.

6.5.3. Interdenominational, Global Confessional and Para-church Agencies

The presence of the United Bible Society, Gideons International, ALFALIT, SSID and *Libería Dominicana* has been mentioned. There are other para-church ministries, mostly associated with the ICRRD, with Reformed influence.

The Bible League was established in 1985 and is currently directed by Rev. Pierre Philippe of the ICRRD. The Bible League has strong North American Reformed administrative involvement and financial support. Bible distribution, as well as training for church planting is emphasized by the Bible League.

The Luke Society is directed by Dr. Silvia Ricardo Martínez, member of the Haina Christian Reformed Church. The small medical and health prevention ministry is supported by, among others, Dutch and North American Reformed people. The Christian Medical Society conducts an annual clinic and surgery caravan in the Sabana Grande de Boya region. Doctors and nurses of the Reformed community in North America have participated with other evangelical medical personnel.

Missionaries with CRWM have played a formative role in the establishment of the UNEV. Haitian immigrant students are enrolled in the education, social work and theology departments.

CRWRC was instrumental in establishing MICRO Industries, DESCO, as well as ALFALIT and SSID projects among the Haitian immigrants. The Eggs for All poultry farm was established in the SGDB region by a group of Christian farmers from Iowa, USA.

Reformed literature produced by LOGOI, CRC Board of Publications, the Evangelical Literature League and CLEI are well represented in major urban centers and in such bookstores as DELE and Maranatha.

The ICRRD is not a member of the WCC, WARC or REC, at the international level, nor CLAI, CONELA or other Latin American councils. Travel costs have been prohibitive for ICRRD leaders to attend international meetings.

The ICRRD leaders and members have worked most effectively in para-church agencies such as the Bible League, Luke Society and UNEV. Mission agency associated agencies such as COCREF and DESCO also employ ICRRD leadership. SSID and ALFALIT sought to employ ICRRD leaders and members but no ICRRD leaders or members were on ecumenical agencies staff by 1991.

Future ecumenical expressions will require ICRRD initiative. Opportunities for world missions are being made available through youth ministry as well as church planting opportunities. The traffic between the Dominican Republic and Haiti continues day by day. Better relations need to be developed with the Haitian evangelical churches and institutions. Franklin Medrano toured with YWAM to Jamaica and Mexico. Pierre Philippe has traveled world-wide representing the Bible League's Bible distribution and church planting program. Dr. Silvia Martínez has traveled through the Americas as one of the Luke Society representatives. Every year, UNEV is graduating ICRRD students, preparing them to work in education, social services and administration.

It will take a concerted effort by denominational, interdenominational, ecumenical and para-church agencies to minister to the multiple needs of the Haitian immigrants.

6.6. Reformed Identity of the ICRRD

Having studied the history of the ICRRD we turn our attention to the identification of the theological identity of the church. Within the three-fold framework of the Reformed identity, the decisions made by the ICRRD Synod and practices with the ICRRD from 1981-1991 will be studied. The traditional Reformed (6.6.1.), the ecumenical Reformed (6.6.2.) and the evangelical Reformed (6.6.3.) dimensions of the Reformed identity will be assessed. Section 6.6.4. will analyze how unity is maintained in such a diverse theological community.

6.6.1. Traditional Reformed

At the initial synodical meeting on May 1, 1981, the CRWM missionaries introduced the Reformed understanding of a representative form of church government as well as the Reformed concept of being part of the universal church. Missionary Brinks was the architect of the denominational system by which the ICRRD organized itself, with later refinements being made by synodical committees, the national church assemblies and other missionaries.

The missionaries introduced a Reformed or Presbyterian understanding of church government in which the church was defined and organized as local church committee, congregation, regional committees and national committees. The legislative authority for making decisions was allocated to the local, regional and national assemblies. The local church committee's authority was primary with the authority of the broader assemblies being delegated by the local church committee.

Prior to the coming of the missionaries, Haitian groups had operated on a congregational basis with loose denominational associations. Previously, pastors and denominational leaders made decisions and expected the churches to carry them out. In the new system the authority was shifted to committees that operated at local, regional and national levels.

The representative form of church government allowed for strong individual leadership but created a system of check and balances at broader levels by which could hold the leaders accountable. With such a system the ICRRD was able to absorb an increasing number of groups as they were presented by local leaders and accepted by the larger bodies. Several years after its implementation the capital zone sought to exercise its unilateral direction over the denomination, however, by majority vote they were halted. Whereas the Haitian leaders, who greatly outnumbered the Dominican leaders, were receptive to the representative form of church government, Dominican leaders soon dropped out of the synodical meetings as they perceived that the synod was Haitian controlled.

Missionary Brinks also recommended at the first ICRRD meeting that the ICRRD adopt the Apostles Creed as a creed. The idea of having a creed, and a perceived Roman Catholic Church creed, was a novel idea to all of the national leaders. The missionary intention was to identify the new movement in terms of the historical development of the Christian church. The national perception was that the creed was part of the tradition of the Roman Catholic Church. Nevertheless, its adoption has not generated much more discussion since. Practically, the creed was used, among other teachings, for adult Sunday school lessons. It also opened the door for a more positive discussion about the theological contributions recorded in early and medieval church history. It was decided by the synod that the Heidelberg Catechism would be used for leadership training classes and for Sunday School classes.

Another traditional Reformed concept introduced by CRWM missionaries in the ICRRD was the importance of maintaining a consistent and integral world and life view. According to the CRWM field strategy, the missionaries introduced a multi-ministerial strategy in which multiple needs were addressed. Besides the regular church and evangelism programs, ministries were developed in education, health, social services, literature and community development. In the early years of the program development, all the ministries were carried out according to the Reformed theological constructs. The mandates for the Christian schools, the ICRRD emergency funds and literature production was coordinated with the ICRRD and expressed in traditional Reformed terminology. This approach was challenged and changed with the coming of CRWRC in the year 1983. Their decision to work with SSID and ALFALIT was simply communicated to the ICRRD without seeking their approval or cooperation. Such an approach was challenged by the 1985 Synod and altered so that the ICRRD synod would be represented in the ecumenical agencies.

Since its inception as a denomination, traditional Reformed concepts have been introduced into the ICRRD. Although other non-traditional Reformed influences are present within the ICRRD, the representative form of church government, the communal adoption of historical creeds used in Reformed churches, the election of elders and deacons for church government, the ongoing Biblical reformation through a trained leadership and the living out of a consistently Reformed world and life view, have been taught and implemented. It must be acknowledged that the traditional Reformed influence exists due to the missionaries' teachings and strategies. It can be concluded that national leaders and

congregations may be influenced by traditional Reformed teachings but have not fully embraced the traditional Reformed confessional tradition as established in the sixteenth and seventeenth century.

6.6.2. Ecumenical Reformed

The ecumenical relationships that were developed during the first ten years of the ICRRD are described in Section 6.5. Section 6.6.2. will study the development of ecumenical theology in the ICRRD as introduced in Section 5.3.2..

Ecumenical theology and practice was introduced to the ICRRD in two ways: one, through cooperating with ecumenical social work agencies and two, through the influence of international missionaries. In the search to meet their social needs the Haitian immigrants came into contact and cooperation with national ecumenical agencies, such as SSID. Also, CRWM and CRWRC missionaries influenced the ICRRD to consider developing ecumenical relationships. However, the missionaries were not very insistent. The CRCNA, the sending church of the missionaries, chose not to develop a fraternal relationship with the ICRRD. The ICRRD was required to pay for their visits to the North American assemblies, that was a cost which the ICRRD was not prepared to make. Basically, for the same reason, the ICRRD did not develop ecumenical relations with the REC and CLIR.

In the fifth assembly (1985), Article 95 contains the recommendations of the Comité de visitas (Visits Committee). The study committee dealt with guidelines for interchurch visits by the congregations (Section 8.5.1). The committee affirmed that the visits between churches of one's own denomination or of another denomination, whether that be to celebrate the sacraments, for weddings, evangelism campaigns or for festive reasons are a great blessing if done according to the Biblical tradition. The report recommended that if visits were made with groups whose doctrines and practices were noticeably different then such visits needed to be made with much discretion and without compromising one's own position. It was stated that sectarian groups should not be visited but rather that they should be evangelized.³⁸⁸

The study committee report was approved by the Fifth Assembly and its recommendations guided the ICRRD for the following years.

Partnerships with national ecumenical and para-church organizations were approved on a case by case basis. The synod of the ICRRD did not enter into a theological debate about any of its ecumenical or para-church partners.³⁸⁹

6.6.3. Evangelical Reformed

The ICRRD maintained basic evangelical practices while accepting reformational tenets. Evangelical practices were maintained in the oral worship style, music selection and the order of worship. Reformed theological tenets were introduced through emphasizing the preaching of God's Word, stressing the importance of church elders supervising congregational worship and membership lifestyle and implementing a system of leadership training and Adult Sunday School teacher training.

³⁸⁸ *Actas.*, pp. 124-125.

³⁸⁹ Bauswein and Vischer, *op. cit.*, p. 153.

The style of worship of the ICRRD is informal and almost identical with other *evangélico* churches. Even though the order of worship is not written down, nor instructed through a book of worship, it is based on oral communication and well known to all of the participants.³⁹⁰ During a regular worship service the order is divided into different “parts.”

1. “The First Part” (*La primera parte*): THE OPENING OF THE WORSHIP SERVICE
 - A. Presentation by a church leader of the person who will lead the “first part”
 - B. Opening prayer and benediction in the name of the Triune God
 - C. Response by the audience with slogans such as: “Glory to God.” The glory to God is also done three times or more in antiphonal fashion³⁹¹
 - D. Leader’s self-introduction and words of gratitude for the privilege to lead the worship to God
 - E. Prayer of praise
 - F. Congregational songs of praise
 - G. Leader turns over the “first part” to the person who is leading the “second part”

2. “The Second Part” (*La segunda parte*): CONGREGATIONAL PARTICIPATION
 - A. Words of gratitude for being asked to lead the congregation’s “opportunities”
 - B. Prayer for blessing on the participants, audience and leaders
 - C. Opportunities are given to members of the audience to either sing, testify, read a Scripture or give an announcement
 - D. Prayer in thanksgiving for the audience participation
 - E. Offerings are announced by the pastor
 - F. Offerings are taken
 - G. Prayer for the offering
 - H. Turning over of “the second part” to the preacher

3. “The Third Part” (*La tercera parte*): PREACHING
 - Preacher is introduced or introduces himself
 - Prayer for guidance
 - Song of revival (*avivamiento*)
 - Scripture reading
 - Sermon
 - Prayer
 - Call to come to Christ
 - Prayer

³⁹⁰ Attempts to introduce a written order of worship were not helpful. The order of worship is briefly described in the *Reglas Internas de la Iglesia Cristiana Reformada* in Article 17.

³⁹¹ A popular chant at the beginning of the service include:

Leader: *¿Quién vive?* (Who is alive?)

Audience: *Cristo!* (Christ)

Leader: *Y su nombre?* (and His name?)

Audience: *Gloria!* (Glory!)

Leader: *Y nosotros?* (and us?)

Audience: *En victoria!* (in victory!)

Leader: *Y el diablo?* (and the devil?)

Audience: *En derrota!* (in defeat!)

4. The Last Part” (*La última parte*): THE CLOSING
 - A. Roll call of all the members, their family members and regular visitors
 - Recognition of visitors
 - Closing announcements about week’s calendar
 - Closing songs
 - Closing prayer
 - Closing benediction

If there is the celebration of Baptism and the Lord’s Supper, this is usually done at the end of the service, after the preaching. During the first two years of the ICRRD, missionaries developed the liturgical forms for these two ordinances. The language of the forms was borrowed from the *Iglesias Reformadas en la Argentina*, with which Ray Brinks was familiar with. In 1989 the National Assembly formed a committee to review and update the denomination’s liturgical forms.

The ICRRD use the basic hymn books of the *evangélico* churches in Hispaniola. The songbook, *Chanz Esperanz* (in French and Creole) and the *Himno de Gloria* (in Spanish) are used in the worship services. One attempt was made by José Martínez to introduce traditionally Reformed hymns into the services, but which was not followed up on after his transfer. The basic reason for staying with the well known hymns was that many of the songs were commonly used and memorized hymns. The new hymns that were being introduced had different tunes and longer verses.³⁹²

After the arrival of the missionaries, the general order of worship remained the same. Only a few innovations were introduced. These included more leadership exercised by the pastors and elders in conducting the worship services. The confession of sin was incorporated into the prayer life of the church and teaching materials were provided for the Sunday School classes, which were held right before the service. Regularly, the Sunday School lesson was expanded on in the sermon.

The pastor’s role in the worship service was enhanced. The pastor and elders were reminded by the missionaries to take more leadership in setting the direction and in establishing the order of the service. In the past practices ranged from having children preach and tolerating spiritistic healings and wild dancing during the worship service.³⁹³

During the first years of the ICRRD significant time was spent by synodical study committees studying and analyzing the spiritual health of the congregations. Studies were carried out to discern the spiritual ramifications of spirit possession, physical manifestations, visions and prophecies. Unlike the fundamentalist movement which in Haiti and the Dominican Republic had sought to remove any suggestion of Pentecostal and spiritist influence, the ICRRD missionaries and leaders sought to Biblically discern between what was the work of the Holy Spirit and what was not. The ICRRD study

³⁹² The “reformed” hymns had a variety of Euro-American tunes, some as old as the Genevan tunes. The cultural music in the ICRRD plays a defining role in the ethos of the church service. If Reformed principles for music are applied, it needs to be done by ethnic musicians who understand culture, musicology and Reformed theology.

³⁹³ When Fransisco de la Rosa was asked why he allowed the “spirit possessions” during the church service, he stated that one should not try to control the Spirit. The leadership training classes as well as the synodical committees addressed such issues, although de la Rosa maintained his ways albeit isolated from the rest of the ICRRD.

committee recommended continuing the use of drums, animated singing and prophecies, with the admonition to see whether they were Biblical and to maintain order in the church. By engaging the church in Biblical reflection and exercising communal accountability, most of the questionable religious manifestations were dealt with. When church leaders were unwilling to address certain practices, the questionable behaviors would not only continue but increase and lead to the separation of the group from the ICRRD. The involvement of the denominational and congregational leaders in on going educational activities created a solid base for Biblical studies, theological reflection and ongoing reformation in the congregations.³⁹⁴

The introduction of teaching materials as well as classes for Sunday School teachers was a significant Biblical teachings and theological influence for the ICRRD churches. Adult Sunday School teachers were trained on a monthly basis to give weekly classes in the church. In some of the areas, Sunday School teachers for children were trained as well.³⁹⁵

For several years the ICRRD national leaders received the Reformed teachings from the CRWM missionaries about the importance of the covenant. When it came time to decide in 1984 about what to do about the inclusion of children in the covenant through baptism, the majority voted against the practice, thereby reasserting their evangelical identity.³⁹⁶ Missionaries and others who were convinced that children of believers were to be baptized were given such liberty but infant baptism was not considered a denominational position. Evangelicalism in Hispaniola is strongly associated with adult baptism. The ICRRD affirmed its evangelical roots while not accepting a basic traditional Reformed teaching. Several of the ICRRD pastors, such as Sirel Lors and René Valetine, baptized the children in their congregations, but it was not a wide-spread practice during the first ten years.

6.6.4. Unity in Diversity

The ICRRD has been able to absorb all three major streams associated with the Reformed identity. Such cooperation is greatly facilitated through the denominational system of having periodic regional meetings, yearly assemblies and ad hoc study committees. The local leaders of the ICRRD are well represented at the regional and national assemblies. ICRRD pastors and leaders work in COCREF, DESCO, Bible League and SSID. Ample time is given to discuss and study matters of mutual interest at the denominational level.

The international missionary community has been dynamically involved in the construction, education, social work and literacy programs associated with the ICRRD. Two large ministry centers, one in Sabana Grande de Boya and the other in Santo Domingo, exist to help the national programs and also serve to host and organize international mission personnel and groups.

³⁹⁴ *Actas...*, 1984, Articles 61, 63, and 65. The National Assembly dealt with spiritual manifestations, common law marriages and the actions of a pastor.

³⁹⁵ Sunday School materials for Adults were prepared by a production committee. The booklets include Genesis, Proverbs, Psalms, Old Testament History, Gospels, Acts, Romans, the Holy Spirit, the Sacraments, the Heidelberg Catechism and a variety of other themes.

³⁹⁶ *Actas...*, 1984, Art. 62.

6.7. Conclusion

Observing the personalities, events and identities associated with the ICRRD from 1981-1991 leads to the following summary:

The CRWM missionaries did not start churches from point zero. Before their arrival, small house churches and self-appointed leaders were meeting in a variety of Haitian *bateyes*. The early missionaries assisted the independent churches to organize, give leadership and establish themselves. Appendix VI gives a year by year report of the adult members, children, total attendees, pastors, congregations and mission preaching points of the ICRRD.

The motivation of the national church as well as the missionaries was tested through trials, errors and finally, the deportations. Even with the temporary loss of nearly one-third of the ICRRD membership, the ICRRD continued. The local congregations continue to evangelize, preach, educate, discipline and serve the Lord. One fundamental reason for the survival of the ICRRD was its strengthening and promotion of indigenization at the congregational and leadership level which in turn allowed the small groups to survive.

The indigenous approach to local congregational leadership greatly benefited the churches in the areas of evangelism, organization of worship services, serving in educational and diaconal projects, and working at ecumenical levels. Indigenization facilitated the local congregations in self-government and self-support, and most importantly, self-propagation. If the small congregations were not able to increase in membership they would have a difficult time surviving at all. The statistics of the first decade of the ICRRD showed that the small congregations grew significantly.

The immediate organization of a national, regional and local denominational structure strengthened the ICRRD as a whole. Representative decision making, project cooperation, dialogue concerning theological issues, and quick responses to emergency situations were all benefits of being well organized.

The CRC missionaries represent a wealthy denomination in North America. Yet they worked among the poorest of the poor in the Western Hemisphere. The paradoxical situation was balanced by offering volunteer help and then matching grants for many national church programs. Visiting work-crew members and national workers labored side by side in constructing churches, schools, pastor's homes, clinics and ministry centers. The schools were administrated, taught and maintained by nationals. The missionary community would assist in setting up a locally supported church, school and diaconal program.

Diaconal programs had a short life span. This was the case with ALFALIT's work, Micro-Industry, SSID, the Eggs For All and the Pig Project. By 1991, projects had ceased and promoters and board members had moved on or had been let go. Many of the ICRRD pastors and members would accumulate debts from self-help business programs that they could not repay. The already weak financial structure of the Haitian immigrants came crashing down all together with the mass deportations in 1991. However, after the deportations, the congregations remained active with a reduced membership and when members started to return from Haiti, educational and social programs were restarted.

The deportations had many negative social ramifications but it also served to strengthen the remaining church community and establish a relationship with the isolated CRC Haitian groups. New leaders had to step forward and the existing membership

continued to encourage each other and work together. When the deported members returned they found a functional Christian community ready to help them.

Ongoing leadership training accounts for churches being able to know, reflect and act in response to the challenges of the ICRRD. With the withdrawal of the missionaries, such training will be taken over and developed by the national leaders. Programmed text books, theological education at a distance, cooperation with evangelical educational ministries, such as UNEV, will be needed to motivate and encourage the leaders to train others so that the multi-dimensional ministries will meet the current needs.

The process of church indigenization was facilitated by congregations choosing and financially supporting their own leaders. At the denomination level it took five years for the ICRRD to have its first national assembly president. The congregations were self-propagating as they carried out evangelism and membership enrollment activities on their own. The matching diaconal grants by international mission agencies helped the church to double their assistance to their needy. Parents were expected to pay part of the overall cost of the COCREF schools. All financial assistance by international mission agencies was measured by the standard of whether or not the assistance created a permanent dependency. The question was whether or not the project would fail if all international mission funds were withdrawn. If so, then the project would be over-dependent and its future was questionable. The indigenous character of the ICRRD help it to grow rapidly as well as sustain the shock of the 1990 deportations.

The rapidly growing indigenous denomination, together with international mission agencies associated with the CRCNA, addressed real personal and social needs among the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic. The socially disfranchised position of the Haitian immigrants created a variety of dysfunctional relationships for the Haitian immigrant within the Dominican social structure. The ICRRD and related mission agencies worked towards creating a stable environment in which the Haitian immigrant could live and serve.

The ICRRD is an evangelical Reformed church which has learned to embrace tenets from the traditional and ecumenical movements. The traditional Reformed influence during the first decade came from the CRWM missionaries. With the departure of the CRWM missionaries, it remains to be seen if the ICRRD leaders will continue to study and work with traditional Reformed theology. The ongoing social needs of the ICRRD will require continuing cooperation with the national ecumenical and host of para-church agencies.

CHAPTER 7

CONCLUSION

7.1. Introduction

Chapter 7 summarizes the arguments and evidences that support the 8 thesis.

7.2. Thesis summaries

Thesis 1. *The historical, social and religious disfranchisement of the Haitian immigrants requires a multi-ministerial mission response that leads to personal and communal transformation.*

The development of the ICRRD in the Dominican Republic includes ministry responses that are related to the historical, social and religious conditions of their church leaders and members as described in Chapter 2. The realities of illegality, common law marriages, illness, illiteracy, employment abuses and, among other dysfunctions, idolatry requires a multi-ministerial response. Such responses are needed in the area documentation, family counseling, medical care, literacy training, education, social work as well as the ministries normally associated with the Christian church, namely, the evangelization of non-Christians, the planting and building up of the church and bearing witness to the gospel of Jesus and grace of God in all areas of life.

At CONPAS 92 it was pointed out that the churches of the Haitian immigrants were the fastest growing during the 1980's in the Dominican Republic. Such growth took place amongst the most disfranchised people group in the Dominican society. The many needs of the Haitian immigrants have required a multiple ministry approach in which not only evangelism and church planting takes place but also a wide spectrum of ministries. Interdenominational and para-church ministry cooperation was needed to address the multiple needs

The Haitian immigrant must develop their own sense of national, ethnic, family, social and religious identity and responsibility. The ICRRD has served as a community where such responses are facilitated.

Even though the ICRRD is in the Dominican Republic, the majority of its churches, leaders and members are Haitian immigrants. When the opportunity was presented for Haitian leaders to lead the ICRRD congregations, regional meetings and synod, these opportunities were seized and never relented. Through the ICRRD the Haitian Christian became enfranchised into the Dominican social structure.

With Haitian leaders and the assistance of both the Dominican and international missionaries, the transformation of the Haitian "franchise" began. Official documents were sought for church leaders, married couples and new born children. Churches were organized with Haitian leadership and membership. Common law unions were converted to legal marriages. Haitian immigrants and their children went to school, received degrees and entered the Dominican work force. Employment was secured for a variety of Haitian leaders in Christian ministries. Thousands of Haitians and hundreds of Dominicans were reconciled with God through faith in Jesus Christ.

The strength of the transformed Haitian franchise was most clearly seen during the deportations at the end of the 1980's and beginning of the 1990's. Whether or not the Haitian immigrant was in the Dominican Republic or in Haiti, contact was maintained with the church. Upon returning to the Dominican Republic many returned to their home *batey* and church.

The ICRRD serves as "islands of transformation," or communities within the community in which Christian spirituality, meaningful employment, legal justice, facilitating education and training, health, family life and personal well being are freely promoted, observed and shared.

Living in a "normal" Christian church community is not enough. Ongoing personal and social transformation is needed. The historical position of the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic is that of structural disfranchisement in society: their illegal status, levels of illiteracy, non-official family status, poverty and illness. To break out of the marginalized mold, essential social rights have to be established for Haitian immigrants in the areas of immigration status,³⁹⁷ educational reform³⁹⁸, family law³⁹⁹, organized labor opportunities,⁴⁰⁰ health care⁴⁰¹ and religious revitalization.⁴⁰² Most importantly, the leadership and movement from disengagement to participatory democracy and civil freedoms must come through the development of Haitian immigrant leaders.⁴⁰³ Their education must focus on seeking social normalization in terms of legal status, the right to form labor unions, enhancing educational opportunities, accessing financial capital and being able to offer basic social and medical services. This impetus must include both the NGO's and the governments, especially the Haitian government, since the Haitian immigrants are a legal extension from their homeland. However, not only the Haitian

³⁹⁷ The normalization of the Haitian immigrant's situation in the Dominican Republic does not necessarily imply that they will become citizens or permanent immigrants of the Dominican Republic. Rather, it refers to being treated in a legal and respectful way as they relate to the Dominican society as visitors, immigrants or guest laborers. Basic legal, human and civil rights of the Haitian immigrants have neither been recognized nor called for by the Dominican state, labor unions, military and traditional church. The Haitian government has not been able to normalize the status of the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic.

³⁹⁸ Some politicians do not want the children of Haitian immigrants to attend school if they do not have a Dominican birth certificate. Private schools are able to accept the Haitian children. The advent of home schooling also gives the Haitians an alternative to the discriminatory traditional school system.

³⁹⁹ Haitian immigrants are driven to common law marriages when local Dominican judges refuse to marry them. The ICRRD spend considerable time finding Dominican judges who would marry the Haitian immigrants. Financial help for deserted and divorced Haitian immigrant mothers and their children is unheard off.

⁴⁰⁰ Haitian immigrant laborers are not represented in the Dominican labor unions. The Haitians needs their own labor unions.

⁴⁰¹ Haitian immigrants generally receive better health care in the Dominican Republic than in rural Haiti.

⁴⁰² See Hegeman, *In Times of Revival*. During the first ten years of the ICRRD there were thousands of conversions, hundreds of family reconciliations and a gathering in of over 10,000 persons into the ICRRD.

⁴⁰³ The Haitian involvement in Christian ministry organizations, ecclesiastical meetings and community development programs has facilitated their administrative, business, deliberation, financial, negotiation, organizational and political skills.

government needs to be challenged in the area of their responsibilities, but also the Dominican and international governments.⁴⁰⁴

The central agent for ongoing personal and social transformation is the Gospel of Jesus Christ as exercised through the Living Church of God. Individuals and social institutions are important but they cannot transform themselves. Submission to the presence and power of the kingdom of God is needed for ongoing transformation. The ICRRD is a living witness to such a transformation.

Thesis 2. *The Roman Catholic Church in the Dominican Republic is part of the disfranchisement of the Haitian immigrants yet efforts are being made to minister to the immigrants.*

The relationship of the Dominican churches and the Haitian immigrants has more than 500 years of history. During the first four centuries and well into the twentieth century, the Roman Catholic Church functioned, off and on, as the state religion in both Haiti and the Dominican Republic. The contemporary RCC in the Dominican Republic speaks for traditional Dominican national and social values.

During the twentieth century, the Roman Catholic Church in the Dominican Republic and Haiti was slow to respond to the religious and social needs of the Haitian immigrants. Since 1985, the Haitian Pastoral Commission has operated among the Haitian immigrants. The Commission has developed a network of religious worshipping communities as well as promoted development projects, emergency assistance, educational scholarships and brought Haitian immigrants into contact with Catholic relief and social services. Second generation Haitian immigrants are expected to assimilate into the Dominican parishes and schools.

Strategical cultural cooperation is needed between the traditional Roman Catholic citizens and the Protestant Haitian immigrants in order to address social issues. It would be unrealistic to expect that the common concern of the RCC and the Protestants to work with Haitian immigrants would effect ecclesiastical reconciliation between the historically and theologically separated communities. Yet, there may be areas of common cultural and social interest where cooperation would be beneficial to all involved. This is especially significant in the areas of law, whether that be civil law, family law, immigration law or judicial law; as well as in the areas of social research, national literacy training projects, social services and emergency response. Participating groups would not have to suspend their views and practices of evangelism, social service, prophetic witness and worship, but seek to cooperate in common social goals. Such cooperation does not have to be carried out on an ecclesiastical level but can be realized through NGO and civic structures.

Thesis 3. *While many of the traditional Protestant churches in the Dominican Republic are part of the disfranchisement of the Haitian immigrants several groups have established ministry among the immigrants.*

⁴⁰⁴ The obvious weakness in relying on the Haitian government is that this government is very weak. Yet, the voice of the Haitian ambassador is heard throughout the press and nation. Assistance from the Dominican government exists but is minimal. International governments, such as the USA, regularly reject Haitian immigrants from entering the USA and have labor and social problems in their own sugar cane fields.

The national Dominican Protestant churches have also been slow to respond to the presence of over 500,000 Haitians in the Dominican Republic. By the beginning of the 1990's, many national Protestant churches, like the Assemblies of God, Church of God, Dominican Evangelical Church, Missionary Alliance and a variety of Pentecostal churches did not have a church ministry among the Haitian immigrants. Others, such as the Free Methodist, had one or two Haitian worshiping groups. If there were contacts between the Protestants and Haitian immigrants are in the area of emergency social or educational assistance where international funds were administrated by Dominican Protestants.

The Episcopal Church Haitian Pastoral Commission is conducting worship services and developing social work projects in several Haitian immigrants' communities. The Commission is also very active in speaking to human rights issues via the national and international press such as deportation abuses, child labor in the cane industry and poor working conditions. The Baptist churches have a handful of Haitian speaking churches. The Church of the Nazarene and the ICRRD has the largest number of Haitian immigrant congregations.

Historical disfranchisement cannot be used as a justification for Christians to tolerate social injustice. For that reason, the ministry of Dominican Protestants such as that of medical doctor Dr. Socrates Pérez, politician Alfonzo Lockward and educator Milagros Comprés, are noteworthy examples of valuable Christian integration and service that include the Haitian immigrants.

The church should inspire educating its members to the presence of the Haitian immigrants, their language, culture, history and needs. Some of the Dominican leaders, in following the strategy of international missionaries, need to learn Haitian Creole so that the communication barriers may be lowered between the Dominicans and the Haitians. Unless the Protestant churches show the Dominican Republic what integration looks like, their leaders and members can not expect that the society will accomplish what they are not able to practice in their own church circles.

Thesis 4. *After years of isolation, the international Reformed missionary community has since the 1970's spearheaded ministries among the Haitian immigrants*

French Huguenots roamed the northern shores of Hispaniola in the 16th and at the beginning of the 17th century. The American Presbyterians came to the Dominican Republic in the early 20th century. Neither the Presbyterians and Reformed entered Haiti until the 1960's.⁴⁰⁵

When CRWM entered the Dominican Republic in order to work with the Haitian immigrants, they did so with full force. From 1980 to 1991, 16 missionary families and 7 single missionaries were sent. CRWRC sent 4 missionary families and 4 individual missionaries. CRWM had 15 positions for church planting and leadership training, 6 for Christian school teachers and trainer, one as a youth worker, and one as a literacy trainer. CRWRC had two field directors, two missionaries for community health, two in community development, one in agriculture, one in micro-industries and one in literacy training.

The influence of the Christian Reformed Missionaries, both CRWM and CRWRC, was very significant, especially to help organize and develop both the ICRRD as a church

⁴⁰⁵ It is the author's understanding that Presbyterians did not enter Haiti after 1916 in respect for the Panama Congress accord which designated Haiti for the Methodists.

and a variety of para-church organizations as instruments of service. During the first decade of the existence of the ICRRD and related para-church agencies self-support structures were set in place for newly established entities such as Bible League, COCREF, DESCO and Luke Society. These agencies, plus the ICRRD, were able to continue ministry with or without the presence of the missionaries. Ongoing funding continued, but the finances are organized by the national leaders.

Thesis 5. *The ICRRD consists of independent evangelicals who are becoming evangelical reformed.*

The Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic and the Reformed did not really cross paths until the 1970's. Even though the Haitians came at the end of the 15th century and the Reformed had been in the Caribbean since the 16th century, they had not shared the Christian gospel together.⁴⁰⁶ Knowledge of the social needs of the Haitian immigrants, the response of the Back to God Hour, the visit of the missionaries, and then finally, after Hurricane David in 1979, the first full time Christian Reformed missionaries were sent.

The testimonies of the seven ICRRD pastors reveal that many of the ICRRD leaders had been associated with a variety of not well known independent evangelical groups. Once the leaders joined the ICRRD, their leadership and church groups stabilized considerably. Part of the stabilization was due to the study of Biblical theology and Reformed doctrine. The other reason was that missionary Brinks instituted a strong synodical church system that facilitated the administration and organization of the variety of independent small churches.

The theological identity of the ICRRD is shaped by its pre-ICRRD evangelical heritage and the influence of both the traditional and ecumenical Reformed perspectives. The ICRRD is evangelical Reformed as seen in the decisions taken by the annual ICRRD synods. The ICRRD has established its own eclectic identity in the area of doctrine, liturgy, church government and ministries. The Bible is considered inerrant and authoritative; the teachings of the early ecumenical creeds, such as the Apostle's Creed, are submitted to; and doctrinal decisions are deliberated on at the highest assembly of the church. However, the ICRRD has not adopted the traditional Euro-American forms of liturgy and sacramental practices in the areas of Reformed confessions, the order of worship and hymnody. Rather, the ICRRD has chosen to use confessions as study documents and tools for teaching church leaders and stopped short of requiring all leaders to affirm its teachings. The ICRRD has maintained the informal worship service that is similar to other Dominican and Haitian evangelical churches. Evangelism leading to church membership and ministry participation is stressed in all of the church groups. Without evangelism the small groups would not survive.

The ICRRD had a continuing reforming influence operating through its synodical committees. The assembly reports indicate that church committees actively sought to answer religious questions which arose out of the spiritistic context of the Haitian and Dominican cultures. Committees on prophecy, the gifts of the Spirit, sectarian groups, were accompanied by an active and regular leadership training program. The ICRRD became a

⁴⁰⁶ The reasons for the absence of the Presbyterian and Reformed in Haiti and among the Haitians is discussed in the author's, *Mission to the People and Church Maintenance: The Origin and Development of Presbyterian and Reformed Churches and Missions in the Caribbean and Latin America (1528-1916)*.

refuge from spiritism, a fact continually referred to in the leader's and member's testimonies.

In order for the ICRRD to become, maintain and promote the Reformed doctrine and cosmology their leaders will need to be further trained in Biblical languages, Bible exegesis, hermeneutics and Reformed historical theology.

Thesis 6 *The initiation of the ICRRD was not due to evangelism growth but transfer growth from small independent evangelical groups.*

Transfer growth was significant. Entire church groups left such denominations as the *Asamblea Cristiana* and the *Cristo la Única Esperanza* in order to join the ICRRD. In Barahona a group came out of the Mormon church. In Los Jovillos, members from the *Mitah en Aaron* joined the new movement.

Evangelism growth is reported by the General Assembly minutes. The adults who were baptized included children of members who were growing up but also new attendees. The baptisms and confessions of faith by children of adult members of the church can be considered biological growth. Church growth in relationship to adult baptisms and adult confessions of faith indicate that the majority of new members came primarily through transfer growth early on in the 1980's. Once the ICRRD became established hundreds of dedications and adult baptisms took place, indicating the increase of biological and evangelism growth.

Thesis 7. *The maturation of the ICRRD is related to its level of auto-responsibility*

The ICRRD started with an existing leadership, membership, and church organization base. The Puerto Rican missionaries, during the last 1970's, and the first full time missionaries, during the early 1980's, encountered home churches with self-appointed leaders and a small but loyal following. As the denomination grew, this pattern continued. The churches remained small and its membership was dominated by family members, friends and cooperating community members.

The missiological strategy, as reflected in missionary Ray Brink's field strategy, emphasized financial self-support for pastors; legislative self-governing at the local, regional, and national levels; and an active program of evangelism and outreach for self-propagation. The reports to the national assembly continue to reflect an emphasis on the church's auto-responsibility.

The local congregations are all self-supporting, self-governing and self-propagating. In order for auto-responsibility to continue at the regional, national and international levels, the denomination will require national leadership, the continual training of new leaders, and the support of national and international ministry initiatives. International missionary presence is meant to be temporary. At the end of the first decade of existence, the ICRRD was self-responsible at the congregational level only. The ICRRD's stability was seriously tested during the deportation in the early 1990's, when approximately one-third of the ICRRD was transplanted to Haiti. After the revolution of 1991, many would come back to the Dominican Republic again. The Sabana Grande de Boya zone and the Central zone were scheduled to be fully independent by 1993.

Key to the whole process of auto-responsibility is the congregation's full responsibility for the pastor's salary. Since the pastors are locally supported, they can also work towards auto-responsibility in other areas of their ministry, such as regional and national ministry participation, ecumenical relations and social advocacy.

Thesis 8. *Leadership training and Christian education was the dominant ministry activity during the first decade of the ICRRD.*

Ministerial training was emphasized from the beginning of the denominational project. The sequence of training developed from radio correspondence to programmed text books, workshops, monthly regional and annual national seminars, and finally, national taught and supported seminars. The training of pastors, elders and Sunday school teachers was a vital element in the educational and spiritual nurturing of the local congregations.

In 1979 there was close to about 20 students receiving theological and ministerial instruction. By 1991, over 350 leaders were being taught in order to give Sunday School and preach to over 9,000 persons.

The development of study materials by missionaries, Haitians and Dominicans became valuable resources. Study booklets were used in different zones and repeated over and over again. The advent of computer editing sped up the process. The writing emphasis was carried over by Roberto Cherubim and Emilio Perez who went to the church in Haiti. Eventually, the booklets of the *Instituto Biblico Reformado* were made available on the internet and thousands of students have used them in Colombia, Guatemala, Mexico and other Hispanic countries.

Dominican and Haitian curriculum developers and teachers continue to serve the regional groups.

The development of COCREP blossomed into more than 20 schools serving over 3,000 students. Most of the schools had classes from kindergarden to fifth grade. The Sabana Grande de Boya school was the first to initiate the complete Elementary program and High School as well.

CRWM has spent tens of thousands of dollars in teacher training work shops and UNEV scholarships for teachers. The result has been a highly educated training staff and the basis to expand the schools beyond grade 5.

Disfranchisement has practically closed the doors to Haitian immigrants advancing in the industrial, commercial, service industries, political positions but the educational system, especially the private schools; provide an avenue for social advancements. Haitians immigrant children are starting to graduate from the universities and enter a variety of professions including law, medicine, business administration and counseling. Christians and churches ministering with the Haitian immigrants are a driving force for preparing the new generation.

7.3. The Future of the ICRRD and the Haitian Immigrants

The development of the ICRRD, as a spiritual and ecclesiastical entity, is directly related to its social context. The future of the ICRRD will depend on its spiritual vitality as well as socio-cultural relevance.

7.3.1. Social Context

The socio-political state of affairs in Haiti is crucial for the well being of the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic. The immigrants' personal, family, cultural, legal and political protection comes from their homeland. However, events during the 1990's show a deterioration: Haiti has undergone a military coup (1991); a crippling embargo (1991-1994), their first democratic elections (1994); in 1995 a 40 % voters turnout election; the drop to 20% voters turnout for the December, 1995, presidential elections and the 5% turnout for the disputed 1997 presidential elections; the suspension of the government's legislative branch (1999); and the promise for more free elections in the year 2000. A country which is not able to provide stable government services for its own citizens will have little to offer its immigrants. Waiting for the restoration of Haiti may or may not happen in the lifetime of this generation of Haitian immigrants.⁴⁰⁷

The Dominican Republic continues to utilize the Haitian immigrants for its state owned as well as private sugar cane companies. Throughout the 1990's, there has been pressure by international human rights organizations as well as NGO's for the Dominican government to legalize and humanize their employment of the immigrants. However, these attempts seem to be suspended in times of deportations. The fact remains, with an unstable Haiti, the Dominican Republic faces a tremendous immigration wave, which it has not been able to control.⁴⁰⁸

One of the hopeful socio-political signs was the 1998 visit of Dominican president, Leonel Fernández, with the Haitian president, René Preval, in Puerto Principe. In the third article of the agreement, both nations promised to continue their dialogue over questions of migration in order to come to conclusion by June, 2000.⁴⁰⁹ This was accomplished but virtually suspended with the victory of president Mejilla in 2000.

NGO's continue to monitor human rights abuses among the Haitian immigrants and call for the regularization of Haitian migration status.⁴¹⁰ The Roman Catholic Church leaders in the Dominican Republic call for a humane treatment of the Haitian immigrants but express their fear that a massive migration of Haitians is imminent with such turbulence in Haiti.⁴¹¹ A handful of Protestant churches continue to develop community development projects, evangelization and church plants among the Haitian immigrants. The religious disenfranchisement continues with in the traditional churches but a pro Haitian immigrant church community has been planted in the Dominican Republic and continues to gain momentum.

⁴⁰⁷ Don Bohning, "Political impasse put elections at risk in Haiti," *Miami Herald* (March 15, 1998), 6
A. Michael Norton, "Acting on own, Haiti leader picks government," *Miami Herald* (March 26, 1999).

⁴⁰⁸ Guaroa Gil, "Los haitianos repatriados por el Ejército suman más de tres mil," *Listín Diario* (January 7, 1998).

⁴⁰⁹ Máximo Manuel Pérez, "Haití y RD buscarán un acuerdo global sobre migración en el 2000," *Listín Diario* (June 20, 1998), 12A.

⁴¹⁰ "Tres entidades piden la creación de una commission de consultas de RD-Haiti," *Listín Diario* (August 2, 1997).

⁴¹¹ Manuel Azcona, "El Cardenal teme una ola migratoria desde Haití," *Listín Diario*, (February 1, 1999), p. 16A.

7.3.2. Church context

Since the closing of the first decade of the existence of the ICRRD (1981-1991) almost another decade has passed. It is not within the scope of this study to give a detailed analysis of the second decade, however, several developments can be observed in the area of church growth, school development, social services and human rights conditions. Observations about the future of the Haitian immigrant in the context of the Dominican and Haitian government, military and labor were made in Section 9.5.

After the deportations of 1990, 6,151 attendees remained in the ICRRD. This was a drop of 3,076 since the year before. However, by 1994 the attendance rose to 10,545. It is reported that in the year 1999 the number of total attendees has crossed the 11,000 mark.⁴¹² From 1987 (9,900) to 1999 (11,000+) the growth has not been as high as from 1981 to 1987, however, the ICRRD continues to grow. The high degree of auto-responsibility at the congregation and leadership level has greatly facilitated the growth and development of the ICRRD. Local church members and leaders were able to function regardless of the national and international situations.

Leadership training classes continue to be offered at the zonal levels. Several zones are completely self responsibility in teaching and training their own leaders. Graduates from UNEV are working in the church zones, not only with the schools but also in church leadership training.

COCREF reached its peak in 1995 by serving over 4,000 students, taught by 93 teachers, overseen by 10 supervisors and gathering in 27 schools. It is reported that by the year 1999, the number of schools has dropped to 24 and the total number of students dipped to about 3,500.⁴¹³ One of the challenges facing COCREF is self-support. Since a large amount of the budget for kindergarden to fifth grade is paid for by World Missions, the schools can only grow in proportion to the budget. Two of the schools, Sabana Grande de Boya and Los Angeles, have developed a full program from kindergarden to the fourth year of High School. There too scholarship money is helping to pay part of the tuition cost but the student's tuition is significantly higher than the schools with higher subsidies.

The Luke Society graduated its health care program to a self-support status at the end of 1999. Dr. Silvia Martínez continues to serve in the clinic in Los Angeles. The former Christian Medical Society has become the Medical Ministry and their caravans continue to do surgery and conduct health clinics on a yearly basis in Sabana Grande de Boya.

ALFALIT Dominicana and SSID continue to offer literacy training, development projects and emergency relief. With the departure of most of the CRWRC missionaries and the reduction in donations, the programs benefiting the ICRRD have diminished.

The Christian Reformed missionaries' involvement with the ICRRD and associated para-church agencies is becoming increasingly specialized in area of leadership training for UNEV, donations for social work agencies, financial development for Christian Schools, and consultation for the ICRRD.⁴¹⁴ Construction crews continue to play an important role in

⁴¹² Raymond Brinks, "Statistics for the Dominican Republic ICRRD: 1980-1995," unpublished document (1999). Interview with Steven De Vries, World Missions director, May 1999.

⁴¹³ *Ibid.*

⁴¹⁴ World Missions continued to work in the sugar cane zones of the Dominican Republic. Richard and Marcia De Ruiter (1987-1994) worked in the San Pedro de Macoris zone; Rev. Steven and Lorri De Vries labored in the San Luis zone; John and Kotch Walcott (1989-1992) developed both churches and schools in the Santiago region; they were joined by Gary and Pamela Van Veen (1990-); Rev. Paul and

expatriate involvement. Since the first construction crews came in 1984 more than 200 churches, schools, clinics and housing structures have been built.⁴¹⁵

As the ICRRD continues, it is hoped that the historical, contextual and church development analysis carried out in this study will serve as a tool in analyzing and projecting a ministry strategy for working among the Haitian immigrants and other marginalized peoples in the Dominican Republic, Haiti and elsewhere.

7.4. Conclusion

The origin and development of the ICRRD during its first decade as a denomination is gives reason to believe that a disfranchised people group can be transformed by the gospel of Jesus Christ to become a vibrant spiritual and culturally relevant community within their broader social context.

Beth Vander Klay (1991-1997) moved to the southern Barahona region; Steve and Sandra Braunings went to the La Romana region in 1992. Rev. Dick and Caroline Vander Voorst went to live in Monte Plata in 1994. Rev. John and Susan Medendorp came in 1991 and John dedicated his efforts in teaching and administrating at UNEV. Susan worked with the Santiago Christian School. Rev. Ralph and Beth Veenstra (1995-1999) moved to Santo Domingo and Ralph worked with UNEV.

⁴¹⁵ Hurricane George destroyed and severely damaged more than 55 ICRRD church buildings in October of 1998. Under the leadership of Max and Kina Van Til as workcrew supervisor and assistant, by the summer of 1999, construction work teams made up of nationals and international workers, rebuilt 45 buildings.

APPENDICES: APENDIX I: LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

1. GENERAL ABBREVIATIONS

BC	Belgic Confession
CALA	Caribbean and Latin America
CD	Canons of Dordt
HC	Heidelberg Catechism

2. ABBREVIATIONS OF ECUMENICAL AND MISSIONARY ORGANIZATIONS

AIPRAL	Asociación de Iglesias Presbiterianas y Reformadas en América Latina Association of Presbyterian and Reformed Churches in Latin America
ALFALIT	Alfabetización por Literatura Literacy through Literature
BFBS	British Foreign Bible Socie
BGH	Back to God Hour
BL	Bible League
CEB	Comité Eclesiástica Básica Basic Ecclesial Committee
CIEMAL	Consejo de Iglesias Evangélicas Metodistas de América Latina Council of Evangelical Methodist Churches of Latin America
CITE	Cooperative International for Theological Education
CLADE	Congreso Latinoamericano de Evangelización Latin American Congress for Evangelization
CLAI	Congreso Latino Americano de Iglesias Latin American Council of Churches
CLIR	La Confraternidad Latinoamericana de Iglesias Reformadas Confederation of Latin American Reformed Churches
CMI	Consejo Mundial de Iglesias World Council of Churches
CMS	Christian Medical Society
COCREF	Colegios Reformados Christian Reformed Schools
CONPAS	Congreso de Pastores Congress of Pastores
CRWM	Christian Reformed World Missions
CRWMin	Christian Reformed World Ministries
CRWRC	Christian Reformed World Relief Committee
DESCO	Desarrollo Comunitario Community Development
FELIRE	Fundación Editorial de Literatura Reformada Editorial Foundation of Reformed Literature Facultad Latinamericana de Estudios Teológicos
FLET	Latin American Faculty of Theological Studies
GZB	Gereformeerde Zendingbond Reformed Missions League
ICRC	International Conference of Reformed Churches Instituto Misionológico de las Americas
IMDELA	Missiological Institute of Latin America

ISEDET	Instituto Superior de Estudios Teológicos Superior Institute of Theological Studies
LS	Luke Society
MTW	Mission to the World
NAE	National Association of Evangelicals
NCCC	National Council of Christian Churches
PCUS BFM	Presbyterian Church in US. Board of Foreign Mission
PCUSA BFM	Presbyterian church in USA. Board of Foreign Mission
RBC	Reformed Bible College
RCA:MTW	Reformed Churches of America: Mission to the World
REC	Reformed Ecumenical Council
	Sociedad Evangélica Pro-Acción Social
SEPAS	Evangelical Society Pro-Social Action
SMS	Scottish Missionary Society
SSID	Servicio Social de Iglesias Dominicanas Social Services of Dominican Churches
STS	Summer Training Session
TASK	Training and Service Corps
TEE	Theological Education by Extension
TELL	The Evangelical Literature League
TF	Tear Fund
TWR	Trans World Radio
UBS	United Bible Society
UCBWM	United Church Board for World Ministries
UNEV	Universidad Nacional Evangélica
WARC	National Evangelical University
WBT	World Association of Reformed Churches
WCC	Wycliffe Bible Translators
WIC	World Council of Churches
WSH	West Indies Company
WWCS	World Servants Holland
YFC	World Wide Christian Schools
YWAM	Youth For Christ Youth With A Mission

3. ABBREVIATIONS OF CHURCH DENOMINATIONS

CRCNA	Christian Reformed Church in North America
EERH	Eglise Evangélique Réformée Haiti Evangelical Reformed Church of Haiti
ICRPR	Iglesia Cristiana Reformada en Puerto Rico Christian Reformed Church in Puerto Rico
ICRRD	Iglesia Cristiana Reformada de la República Dominicana Christian Reformed Church in the Dominican Republic
IED	Iglesia Evangélica Dominicana Evangelical Dominican Church
IPPR	Iglesia Presbiteriana de Puerto Rico Presbyterian Church of Puerto Rico
IPRC	Iglesia Presbiteriana Reformada en Cuba Presbyterian Reformed Church of Cuba
IRA	Iglesias Reformadas en la Argentina Reformed Churches in Argentina
PCA	Presbyterian Church in America
RCA	Reformed Church in America
RCC	Roman Catholic Church

II. ICRRD MINISTRY RESPONSE TO HAITIAN IMMIGRANT CONTEXT

SOCIAL STRUCTURE	DISFRANCHISEMENT	NORMALIZATION	MINISTRY
GOVERNMENT	Illegality	legal protection and basic rights	Documentation program
FAMILY	Non-official family status	legal protection and civil rights	Pastoral program
HEALTH	Illnesses	basic health and nutrition	Luke Society, CMS
EDUCATION	Illiteracy	Reading, writing, and arithmetic	ALFALAT, COCREP, UNEV
LABOR	Under paid	provision for individual and family	DESCO
SOCIAL SERVICES	Non-accessibility to social services	Accessibility to social services	DESCO, SSID community development
RELIGION	Idolatry, dominance	freedom of religion and conscience	ICRRD, interden., parachurch, ecumenical ministries

III. LIST OF REFORMED MISSIONARIES IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC: 1980-

Christian Reformed Missionaries: CRWM

Dr. Raymond and Gladys Brinks (1980-1993)
 Dr. Neal and Sandra Hegeman (1981-1993)
 Mr. Jeffrey and Kathy De Jonge (1983-1998)
 Rev. Wayne and Sandra De Young (1983-1986)
 Rev. José and Pamela Martinez (1982-1986)
 Rev. Ryan and Julie Veenema (1983-1989)
 Dr. Derk and Nancy Oostendorp (1984-1990)
 Rev. Thomas and Judy Vander Ziel (1985-1989)
 Rev. Daniel and Jan Roeda (1986-1990)
 Rev. Thomas and Jacki Walcott (1984-1990)
 Mr. Eric Slechter (1989-1990)
 Miss Melinda Vermeer (1983-1984)
 Miss Cheryl Duimstra (1984-1985)
 Miss Jane McCullond (1984-1987)
 Miss Arlyan Noorloos (1984-1985)
 Miss Jan Wilson (1985-1986)
 Miss Eunice Kim (1989-1992)
 Rev. Richard and Marcia de Ruiter (1987-1994)
 Mr. John and Kotch Walcott (1989-1992)
 Rev. Steve and Lorrie De Vries (1988-)
 Rev. Paul and Beth Vander Klay (1991- 1997)
 Mr. Gary and Pamela Van Veen (1990-)
 Rev. John and Susan Medendorp (1991-)
 Mr. Steve and Sandra Braunings (1992-)

Mr. Max and Kina Van Til (1993-)
Rev. Dick and Caroline Vander Voorst (1994-2000)
Rev. Ralph and Beth Veenstra (1995-1999)

Christian Reformed Missionaries: CRWRC

Mr. Joel and Patricia Zwier (1983-)
Mr. Gaspar and Leanne Geisterfer (1984-1994)
Mr. Peter and Peggy Vander Muelen (1983-1988)
Mr. Hank and Bev Abma (1983-1985)
Miss Dawn Meyer (1986-1988)
Mrs. Karen Vander Sluis (1989-1991)
Miss Tammy Walhof (1989-1991)
Mr. Roland Vanderberg (1989-1991)

ICCRD Missionaries

Pastor Emilio Pérez Martínez (1987-)
Pastor Roberto Cherubín (1987-)

IV. LIST OF ICRRD PASTORS (1981-1991)

(first date is starting date and second date of termination up to 1991)

Prestino Bueno (1981-)
Montás Desir (1981-1984)
Sirel Lors (1981-1991)
Francisco de la Rosa (1981-)
Julio Andino (1982-1984)
Andrés Díaz (1982-1988)
Elofin Lerisme (1982-1984)
José Luis (1982-1985)
Locano Jean (1982-)
Jorge Pasible (1982-1985)
Emilio Pérez Martínez (1982-1987)
Rafael Pérez (1982-1984)
Montás Silbelis (1982-)
José Legrand Valdéz (1982-)
Edmón Confidant (1983-)
Ludovic Dejoie (1983-)
Feliciano de la Rosa (1983-)
Chagelis Desome (1983-)
Anatasio Enerio (1983 -)
José Esperanza (1983-1984)
Ernesto Feliz (1983-1988)
Valentín García (1983; 1987-)
Osuá San Jeremé (1983-)
Pierre Philippe (1983-)
Manual Sinfo (1983-1985)
Dorcelis Simé (1983-)
Dosli Sitle (1983-1984)
René Valetine (1984-1991)
Anicacio Claude (1984-1985)
Leonzo Francisco (1984 -)
Leopoldo Gómez (1984-1987)
Esteban Fuentes (1984-1985)
José Moisés García (1984- 1990)
Cristóbal Lendi (1984-1986)

José Lima (1984-)
Octavio Monegro (1984-1989)
Andrés Ortega (1984-1988)
Bienvenido Tejeda (1984-)
Manuelico Batista (1985-)
Andrés Jean Batist (1985-1990)
José Belisario (1985-)
Eugenio Castillo (1985-1986, 1991)
Roberto Cherubín (1985-1987)
Job Delosie (1985-1987)
José Dima (1985-1986)
Leans Dina (1985-1986)
Otany Dorsemy (1985-1986)
Manuel Félix (1985-)
Hipólito Gil Frias (1985-)
Natalio Pérez Garcia (1985-)
Pierre Jean (1985-)
Marcos Medina (1985-)
José Arilio Minier (1985-1986)
Tomás Vasquez (1985-1986)
Odeis Ydame (1985-1991)
Bienvenido Alcántara (1986-1987)
Jaime Almonte (1986-1987)
Ruben Antonio (1986-)
Felipe Aquino (1986-1987)
Diesol Benoit (1986-1987)
Luis Benoit (1986-1987)
Vidal Monta Carmelo (1986-1987)
Victor Donasien (1986-1987)
Isidro Encarnación (1986-1987)
Juan Garcia (1986-1989)
Javelo Gómez (1986-1990)
Otililo José (1986-1990)
Michel Pierre (1986-1990)
Miguel Javier (1986-1988)
David Pierre (1986-)
Wiltés Romulus (1986-)
Ayunio Venture (1986-1987)
Belmisse Yannes (1986-1987)
Emanuel Alexandre (1987-1990)
Ramón Alfonso (1987-1988)
Gerardo Antonio (1987)
José Calistíne (1987-1990)
Bienvenido Cedeño (1987-1988)
Nevá Dalmá (1987-)
Hipólito Felipe (1987-)
Clemente Fishemé (1987-)
José Floribe (1987-)
Fomil Jean (1987-)
Julián Juan (1987-)
Silverio Luimegue (1987-1988)
Narciso Martínez (1987-)
Gabriel Narciso (1987-1988)
Pierre Olivier (1987-1988)
Felipe Paulino (1987-1990)
Andrés Pérez (1987-1989)
Benera Primero (1987-)
Meristen Senvil (1987-1988)
Lisix Francois (1988-1989)

Inobien Gue (1988-)
Felipe Henríquez (1988-1989)
Miguel Joshe (1988-)
Mauricio Ruiz (1988-)
Desiné Sene (1988-1989)
Gilberto Sisteden (1988-1989)
Andrés Jean Baptiste (1989-1990)
Ulisses Cabrera (1989-)
Jacobo Camú (1989-)
Ignacio Fernández (1989-1990)
Elcilio Guerrero (1989-)
Chiler Mateo (1989-)
Ramón Martínez (1989-)
Wilfrido Noel (1989-)
Andrés Pierre (1989-)
Danneris Jara Rivera (1989-1990)
Santiago Sábado (1989-)
Julio Santana (1989-1991)
Benito Fabián (1990-)
Joselo Germán (1990-1991)
Francisco José López (1990-)
Pedro Antonio García (1991-)
Joel Luis (1991-)
Juan Pedro Nelson (1991-)
Otilio Telemon (1991-)

V. PROCESS OF AUTO-RESPONSIBILITY		
YEAR	EVENTS	AUTO-RESPONSIBILITY
May 1981- May 1982	Official Organization	-congregations choose own leaders and financially support them -lay pastors approved by synod. -formation of the Central Committee to oversee denomination -continuing education required of all pastors
May 1982- May 1983	Structural Establishment	-doctrinal themes related to ICRRD were studies by national leaders
May 1983- September 1984	Representative Cooperation	-rejection of missionary's recommendation on infant baptism
September 1984- September 1985	National Identity Expression	-Cooperation Committee between national church and committee questions mission agency leadership of ICRRD -matching funds for diaconal work
September 1985- September 1986	Expansion and Turbulence	-first national president for Central Committee and National Assembly -Capital zone seeks to work with more independence -Mission Committee is challenged by Central Committee
September 1986- September 1987	Church Stabilization	-Synod, led by Haitian majority, takes disciplinary action against Capital zone -two Haitian pastors go to work in leadership training in Haiti
September 1987- September 1988	Mission Affirmation	-conversation held about relationship with Dominican and Haitian churches -at the regional level, ICRRD raises significant money for needs of the elderly and poor
September 1988- September 1989	Internal Growth	-documentation and human rights program intensify
September 1989- September 1990	Calm before the Storm	-National Ministry Center opened
September 1990-Sept. 91	The Storm of Deportations	-despite massive deportation the ICRRD survives

**VI. CHURCH STATISTICS OF THE ICRRD FROM
1981-1991**

YEAR	Adult memb	Child and Visit.	Total Attn.	Pastors	Cong	Mission centers
May 1981	149	345	494	5	6	3
May 1982	445	920	1365	15	15	12
May 1983	900	2015	2915	26	31	36
Sept.1984	935	2139	3064	31	41	39
Sept.1985	2392	4336	6728	41	56	103
Sept.1986	2527	6212	8736	54	61	108
Sept.1987	2853	7000	9900	62	81	142
Sept.1988	3060	6800	9800	72	82	156
Sept.1989	3227	6371	9598	52	86	143
Sept.1990	3250	5977	9227	63	93	138
Sept.1991	2167	3984	6151	51	63	93

VII. MINISTERIAL TRAINING IN THE ICRRD: 1976-1991

TIME	Pre-1976	1976-1979	1980-1981	1981-1991	Post-1991
PHASE	Radio Ministry	Distance Education	Workshop education	Study Centers	Natioional Study Centers
Students	Radio audience throughout the island	20-50 students in the Sabana Grand de Boya region	Close to 200 students	By 1991 there were 18 teacher trainers, over 350 teachers being taught and over 9,000 in Sunday School	The church continues to grow, number of teachers being trained remains constant
Program	Back to God Hour programs in Spanish	Teaching sessions using CITE programmed text books	World Missions leadership trainers	WM leadership trainers, ALFALIT, COCREP, UNEV, DESCO	World Missions, COCREP, UNEV, DESCO
Languages	Spanish	Spanish	Spanish with Creole translation	Spanish and Creole	Spanish and Creole
Educational Materials	BGH booklets	World Missions and CITE materials	WM materials	WM leadership trainers, COCREP training, DESCO	Church leadership training, UNEV, DESCO
Teachers	BGH	World Missions from PR	World Missions in DR	World Missions (15), COCREP (5), ALFALIT (3), Bible League (1), DESCO (5), UNEV (1), SSID (2), Luke Society (2)	ICRRD, UNEV
Structure	BGH from Chicago	World Missions from PR	World Missions with ICRRD	Denominational, ecumenical, parachurch	Denominational and regional
Self-Responsibility	Radio program available	DR groups begin to self-organize	ICRRD becomes organized	Non-formal education in regional zones	National teachers teaching non-formal education in the zones

BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. PUBLICATIONS OF THE ICRRD

- Brinks, Raymond. "A Field Strategy for the Dominican Republic." Grand Rapids: Christian Reformed World Missions, 1983.
- Hegeman, Cornelius (Neal). *Iglesia Dulce: Una Historia de la Iglesia Cristiana Reformada Incorporada en la República Dominicana: 1976-1986*. Santo Domingo: Editorial Educativo Dominicano, 1986.
- Hegeman, Cornelius (Neal), ed.. *Actas y Estatutos de la Iglesia Cristiana Reformada. 1981-1991*. Santo Domingo: Misión Mundial, 1992.
- Hegeman, Cornelius (Neal), ed. *Reglas Internas de la ICRRD. Reg Inten EKRRD*. Santo Domingo: Misión Mundial, 1992.

2. PUBLICATIONS ABOUT THE ICRRD

- Brinks, Raymond. *Cane Harvest, A Kingdom Multi-Ministry Strategy for Missions*. Grand Rapids: Calvin Theological Seminary, 1985.
- Brinks, Raymond. *The Formation of a Non-Formal Education Team*. Philadelphia: Westminster Theological Seminary, 1989.
- Brinks, Raymond. "Colegios de la Iglesia Cristiana Reformada." *El Siglo*.(April 16, 1991).
- Brinks, Raymond. "Statistics for the Dominican Republic ICRRD: 1980-1995." Unpublished document. 1999.
- CRWM Field Strategy for the Dominican Republic. Grand Rapids: CRC World Missions, 1982.
- De Vries, Thomas. "Christian Reformed World Mission Report 1989." Grand Rapids: CRC World Missions, 1989.
- Geisteffe, Gaspar. "General Survey of Communities with a Christian Reformed Church." Santo Domingo: Christian Reformed World Relief, 1983.
- Hegeman, Cornelius (Neal). *Church Ministry Among Marginal Peoples: A Study Project on Church Ministry and Leadership Training Among the Haitian Immigrant Sugar Cane Cutters in the Dominican Republic*. Philadelphia: Westminster Theological Seminary, 1985.
- Hegeman, Cornelius (Neal), ed. *Manual de Misionología Evangelica Dominicana: 1987-1988*. Santo Domingo: UNEV, 1989.
- Hegeman, Cornelius (Neal). "El exilio de los cristianos haitianos." *El Tiempo Final* (September 4, 1991).
- Hegeman, Cornelius (Neal). "Repatriación Haitiana afecta comunidad evangélica." *El Nacional*.(September 9, 1991).
- Hegeman, Cornelius (Neal) and Leveillé, Joseph. eds. *Misionología Dominicana Haitiana Vol. 1988-1998*. Santo Domingo: National Evangelical University, 1988-1998.
- Hegeman, Cornelius (Neal), *In Times of Revival*. Miami: Miami Internacional Seminary, 2004.
- Veenema, Ryan. "Youth Camp-Prison Camp." *Missionary Monthly*. (September, 1983).

3. GENERAL PUBLICATIONS

- Acosta, Julio Cesar Mota. *Los cocolos en Santo Domingo*. Santo Domingo: Editorial La Gaviota, 1977.
- Algra, A.H. *Dispereert niet*. Vol. 5. Franeker: T. Wevers, 1972.
- Alvarez, Seisededos, Francisco. trans. *Libro de las Profecías de Cristóbal Colón. Madrid: Testimonio Compañía Editorial*, 1984.
- Alvarez-Vega, Bienvenido. "Apuntes sobre la Estructura de Poder en República Dominicana." Consulta sobre la Teología y la Practica del Poder. Jarabacoa: Fraternidad Teológica Latinoamericana, 1983.
- The American Heritage Dictionary*, New York: American Heritage Publishing Company, 1970.
- American Watch. "Harvesting Oppression: forced Haitian Labor in the Dominican Sugar Cane Industry." New York: American Watch, June, 1990.

- American Watch. "Half Measures: Reform, Forced labor and the Dominican Sugar Industry." New York: American Watch, March, 1991.
- Annual Report of the BFM of the PCUSA*. New York: Presbyterian Board of Publications, 1916.
- Annual Report (PCUSBFM)*. New York: Presbyterian Board of Publications, 1916.
- Anzoátegui, Ignacio. ed. *Los Cuatro Viajes del Almirante y su Testamento*. Madrid: Espasa Calpe, 1986.
- Arana, Pedro Quiroz. *Testimonio Político*. Lima: Ediciones Presencia, 1987.
- Arana, Pedro Quiroz. ed. *Teología en el Camino*. Lima: Ediciones Presencia, 1987.
- Azcona, Manuel. "El Cardenal teme una ola migratoria desde Haití." *Listín Diario*. (February 1, 1999).
- Bach, Marcus. *Strange Altars*. New York: The Bob's-Merrill Company, Inc., 1952.
- Baez-Camargo, Gonzalo. "The Earliest Protestant Missionary Venture in Latin America." *Church History*. Vol.21 (1952).
- Baez-Camargo, Gonzalo. "Evangelical Faith and Latin American Culture." *The Ecumenical Era in Church and Society*. ed. Edward Jurij. New York: The MacMillan Co., 1959.
- Baez-Camargo, Gonzalo. *Protestantes Enjuiciados por la Inquisición en Ibero América*. Mexico City : Casa Unida de Publicaciones, 1960.
- Balaguer, Joaquín. *La isla a reves*. Santo Domingo: Librería Dominicana S.A., 1984.
- Barnet, Miquel. *Biografía de un Cimarrón*. Barcelona: Ediciones Ariel, 1968.
- Barrett, David. *World Christian Encyclopedia*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1982.
- Barth, Fredrik. "Enduring and emerging issues in the analysis of ethnicity" in Hans Vermuelen and Cora Govers (eds.) *The Anthropology of Ethnicity. Beyond Ethnic Groups and Boundaries*. Amsterdam: Het Spinhuis (1996), pp. 11-32.
- Bastian, Jean Pierre. *História del protestantismo en América Latina*. Mexico City: CUPSA, 1989.
- Battle, Peña. *La isla de la Tortuga*. Santo Domingo: Editora Taller, 1988.
- Baud, Michiel., "Una Frontera-Refugio: Dominicanos y Haitianos contra el Estado (1870-1930)," *Estudios Sociales* Vol. 92 (April-June, 1993), pp. 39-64 and "Una frontera para cruzar: la sociedad rural a través de la frontera Dominico-Haitiana (1870-1930) *Estudios Sociales* Vol. 94 (October-December, 1993), pp. 5-28
- Bauswein, Jean-Jacques and Vischer, Lukas. *The Reformed Family Worldwide. A Survey of Reformed Churches, Theological Schools, and International Organizations*. Grand Rapids: W. B. Eerdmans, 1999.
- Beckford, George. *Persistent Poverty*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1972.
- Berg, Clayton L. Jr., and Pretiz, Paul E. "Latin America's Fifth Wave of Protestant Churches." *International Bulletin of Missionary Research*. (October, 1996).
- Beyerhaus, Lefever. *The Responsible Church and Foreign Mission*. Grand Rapids: W.B. Eerdmans, 1964.
- Bisnauth, D.A. *A Short History of the Guyana Presbyterian Church*. Georgetown: Labour Advocate Printery, 1970.
- Bohning, Don. "Political impasse puts elections at risk in Haiti." *Miami Herald*. (March 15, 1998). 6A.
- Bonino, José, Miquez. *Doing Theology in a Revolutionary Situation*. Grand Rapids: W.E. Eerdmans, 1980.
- Bonino, José, Miquez. *Rostros del protestantismo latinoamericano*. Grand Rapids: Nueva Creación, 1995.
- Boonstra, Juan. "Back to God Hour Campaign hits Maracaibo." *Mission Courier*. (September, 1982).
- Boersema, R.F. and Glas, Jacob. 3e Congress. *Gereformeerde Zendingsarbeiders in Latijns-Amerika*. Willemstad: Gereformeerde Kerken in Nederland Zending, 1981.
- Bosch, Juan. *Composición Social Dominicana*. Santo Domingo: Alfa y Omega, 1981.
- Ramonina Brea, *Ensayo sobre la formación del estado capitalista en la Republica Dominicana y Haiti* (1983);
- Brinks, Raymond. "Colegios de la Iglesia Cristiana Reformada," *El Siglo* (April 16, 1991).
- Brinks, Raymond. *El Liderazgo en Misión*. Santo Domingo: UNEV, 1993.
- Brito, Hugo Polanco "La Iglesia Católica y la primera constitución dominicana," *Clio*, no.125 (Jan.-Aug, 1970).
- Brito, Israel B. *Historia de la Iglesia Metodista Libre Dominicana*. Santo Domingo: Editorial Evangélica Dominicana, 1978.
- Cabral, Dore. "Encuesta Rumbo-Gallup: La población dominicana es mas anti-haitiana que racista." *Rumbo*. May 29, 1995. pp. 8-12.
- Calvin, Jean. *Instituciones de la religión cristianiana*. Grand Rapids: Nueva Creación, 1977.

- “Cardenal declara Haití necesita ayuda sustancial.” *Listín Diario*. (October 13, 1996).
- Casas, Bartolomé, de las. *History of the Indies*. Book 1. No. 85. ed. André Collard. London: Harper Torchbooks, 1971.
- Casas, Bartolomé, de las. *Historia de las Indias*. Vols. 1,2, and 3. Hollywood, Fl.: Ediciones del continente, 1985.
- Cassá, Roberto. *Historia Económica y Social de la República Dominicana*. Santo Domingo: Alfa and Omega, 1985.
- Castillo, Freddy Prestol. *El Masacre se pasa a pie*, Editora Taller, 4ta edición, Santo Domingo, 1977.
- Castillo, José. *La Inmigración de Braceros Azucareros en la República Dominicana*. Santo Domingo: Centro Dominicano de Investigaciones Antropológicas, 1978.
- Castor, Suzy. *La ocupación norteamericana de Haití sus Consecuencias: 1915-1934*, México: Siglo XXI Editores, 1971; *La Estructura Agraria Posesclavista en Saint Dominique* UNAM, CELA, México. 1978;
- “Centro de Coordinación y animación de la Pastoral de los Inmigrantes Haitianos en República Dominicana.” (pamphlet) Santo Domingo: Arzobispado de Santo Domingo, 2000.
- Christian Reformed Church. *Acts of Synod*. Grand Rapids: CRC Publications, 1986.
- Christian Reformed Church. *La Renovación Carismática*. Grand Rapids: Libros Desafío, 1977
- Christian Reformed World Missions. CRWM Annual Report: 1991. Grand Rapids: CRC World Missions, 1991.
- CIEMAL (Council of Evangelical Methodist Churches of Latin America/ Consejo de Iglesias Evangélicas Metodistas de América Latina). 73 a Asamblea General Annual. 1995.
- Colón ,Cristobál. "Memorial de Antonio Torres." *Cristóbal Colón. Diario de Navegación* y otros escritos. Santo Domingo: Ediciones de la Fundación Corripio, Inc., 1988.
- Colón, Fernando. *Vida del Almirante Don Cristóbal Colón*. Mexico City: Fondo de Cultura Economica, 1984.
- Confesiones de Fe de la Iglesia*. Barcelona: SEZ, 1990.
- Conn, Harvey. “God’s Plan for Church Growth.” *Theological Perspectives on Church Growth*. Nutley: Presbyterian and Reformed Publishing Company, 1976.
- Constitution de la República Dominicana*. May 11, 1844. Art. 38.
- Contreras, Genarao. “El obispo de Barahona pide adoptar medidas para armonizar las relaciones con Haiti.” *Listín Diario*. (March 3, 1997).
- Cook, William. "The Expectation of the Poor: A Protestant Missiological Study of the Catholic 'comunidades de base' in Brazil." University Microfilms, Ann Arbor, Mich. Catalog No. 8216810. 1985.
- Córdoba, Pedro de. *Doctrina Cristiana y Cartas*. Santo Domingo: Ediciones de la Fundación Corripio, 1988.
- Corcino, Panky. “Agarrados al mismo Dios.” *Listín Diario*. (September 13, 1998).
- Costas, Orlando. *Theology of the Crossroads in Contemporary Latin America*. Amsterdam: Editions Rodopi, 1976.
- Costas, Orlando. *Christ Outside the Gate*. Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1982.
- Costello, Gerald. *Mission to Latin America*. Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1979.
- Cowley, M. and Mannix, D. *Historia de la trata de negros*. Madrid: Alianza Editorial, 1968.
- Cruz, Elina María. “Sacerdote considera gobierno debe variar trato a haitianos.” *El Siglo*. (September 17, 1990).
- Dalmas, M. *Historia de los Valdenses en el Rio de la Plata*. Buenos Aires: Editorial la Aurora, 1973.
- Davis, Wade. *The Serpent and the Rainbow*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1985.
- Davis, Wade. *Passage of Darkness. The Ethnobiology of the Hatian Zombre*. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1988.
- Debs, Robert and Heinl, Nancy Gordon. *Written in Blood: The Story of the Haitian People, 1492 – 1971*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1978.
- “Declaración de los Obispos Católicos de Haití sobre los braceros Haitianos.” Centro de Coordinación y Animación Pastoral Haitiana, July 1991.
- Deiros, Pablo Alberto. *Historia del Cristianismo en América Latina*. Buenos Aires: FTL, 1992.
- De Groot, J.E. *Ik weet waar gij woont: De Iglesia Evangélica Presbiteriana del Peru, haar context, geschiedenis en huidige situatie*. Utrecht: University of Utrecht disertation, 1979.

- Derby, Robin L.H. and Turits, Richard. "Historias de terror y los terrores de la historia: la masacre Haitiana de 1937 en la República Dominicana," *Estudios Sociales* Vol. 92 (April-June 1993), pp. 65-76.
- De Vries, Thomas. "Christian Reformed World Mission Report 1989." Grand Rapids: World Missions archives, 1989
- De Wit, Hans. "Santiago, wat een stad!" *Vandaar*. (June-July, 1980).
- Deive, Carlos Esteban. *Vodú y magia en Santo Domingo*. Santo Domingo: Editorial Taller, 1977.
- Deive, Carlos Esteban. *La Esclavitud del Negro en Santo Domingo*. Vol. 2 and 3 Santo Domingo: Museo del Hombre Dominicano, 1980.
- Deive, Carlos Esteban. *Heterodoxia e Inquisición en Santo Domingo-1492-1822*. Santo Domingo: Editora Taller, 1983.
- Demorizi, Rodrigues. *Documentos para la historia de la República Dominicana. Colecciones de leyes*. Rome: Tipografía G Menaglia, 1952.
- D'Epina. C.L. *Haven of the Masses: A Study of Pentecostal Movement in Chile*. London: Lutherworth Press, 1969.
- Directorio Católico Dominicano 1985*. Santo Domingo: Vicaria del Pastoral, 1985.
- Documentos de la Conferencia del Episcopado Dominicano*. (1955-1990) *Evangelii Nuntiandi* (1975), *Dives in Misericordia* (1980), *Laborem Exercens* (1981); *Sollicitudo Rei* (1987), *Centesimus Annus* (1991).
- "Dominican Government Deports Haitians Again," *Haiti Info*, Vol.5, No. 5, (February 8, 1997).
- Dore, Carlos Cabral. "Los Dominicanos de origen haitiano y la segregación social en la República Dominicana," *Estudios Sociales* Vol. 20 (1987), pp. 57-72;
- Du Base, F. ed. *Classics of Christian Mission*. Nashville: Broadman Press, 1979.
- Dunn, Doodnath, C.A. "The Great Divorce and What Happens to the Children." Kingston: Queens University, 1971.
- Dussell, Enrique. *A History of the Church in Latin America*. Grand Rapids: W.W. Eerdmans, 1981.
- Eriksen, Thomas Hylland. "Ethnicity and Nationalism," *Anthropological Perspectives*. London: Pluto Press, 1993.
- Escobar, Samuel. "¿Qué significa ser evangélico hoy?" *Misión*. Vol.1. No. 1 (March/June, 1982).
- Esponda, Hugo. *Historia de la Iglesia Presbiteriana de Chiapas: Inicio y Desarrollo*. Mexico City: El Faro, 1986.
- Evertsz, Franc Baez. *Braceros Haitianos en la Republica Dominicana* Impreso de Taller, SD, 1984.
- Fennema, Meinder and Loewenthal, Troetje. "La construcción de raza y nación en la República Dominicana. *Anales del Caribe*. 1989. 9, pp. 191-227.
- Feliz, Altagracia Moreta. "Avelino Fernández dice que el padre Milton Ruiz no conoce el problema haitiano." *Listín Diario*. (January 20, 1997).
- Fennema, Meindert and Loewenthal, Troetje. "The Construction of Race and Nation in the Dominican Republic." *International Sociological Association* (1986).
- Fernandez and Fernandez, Enrique. *Las Biblias Castellanas del Exilio*. Miami: Editorial Caribe, 1976.
- Franco, José. *Historia de la Revolución de Haití*. Santo Domingo: Editora Nacional, 1971.
- Funk, Titus G. "Jesuitas y menonitas: dos modelos asincrónicos de obra misionera integral en el Paraguay." *Boletín Teológico*. Vol. 41 (March, 1991).
- García, Juan Manuel. *La Matanza de los Haitianos. Genocidio de Trujillo, 1937*. Santo Domingo: Alfa y Omega, 1983.
- Gardiner Harvey, *La política de inmigración del dictador Trujillo*, Santo Domingo, UNPHU, 1979.
- Gerard, Pierre Charles, *La Economía Haitiana y su Via de Desarrollo*. México, 1965; *Radiografía de una Dictadura. Haití bajo el Regimen del Dr. Duvalier* Madrid, Editorial Nuestro Tiempo, 1969
- Gerard, Pierre Charles. *Problemas Dominico-Haitianos y del Caribe* Mexico, UNAM, 1973.
- Gil, Guaroa Gil. "Los haitianos repatriados por el Ejército suman más de tres mil." *Listín Diario*. (January 7, 1998).
- Goff, J. *The Persecution of Protestants in Colombia: 1948-1958*. Cuernava: Sondeos No. 23, CIDOS, 1968.
- González, Antonio Camilo. *El marco histórico de la pastoral dominicana*. Bani: Amigos del Hogar, 1983.
- González, Justo L. *The Development of Christianity in Latin America*. Grand Rapids: W.B. Eerdmans, 1967.

- González, Justo L. *Historia de las misiones*. Buenos Aires: Editorial la Aurora, 1970.
- González, Justo L. *Historia del Cristianismo*. Miami: UNILIT, 1996.
- González, Justo L. *La Era de La Conquista*. Miami: Editorial Caribe, 1980.
- Greenleaf, Richard. "The Mexican Inquisition and the Enlightenment." *New Mexico Historical Review*. Vol. 41. No. 3 (1966).
- Guertual, Philippe. "Les Huguenots de la fin du XVIe à la moitié du XVII e siècle." *Histoire de la Guyane, Grande Encyclopéd de la Caraïbe*. Vol. 7., 1989.
- GZB info bulletin. Zeist: Gereformeerde Zendingsbond, 1982.
- Haiti Info ed. "Dominican Government Deports Haitians Again." *Haiti Info*. Vol. 5, No. 5 (February 8, 1997).
- Hamid, I. A *History of the Presbyterian Church in Trinidad: 1868-1968*. Trinidad: St. Andrews College, 1980.
- Hartog, Jan. *Mogen de eilanden zich verhuegen: Geschiedenis van het protestanisme op de Nederlandse Antillen*. Willemstad: Verenigde Protestantse Gemeente van Curacao, 1970.
- Hegeman, Benjamin. *Between Glory and Shame*. Zoetermeer, Boekencentrum, 2000.
- Hegeman, Cornelius (Neal). Unpublished monograph. Reformed Churches and Missions in the Caribbean and Latin America. Miami: Ministries in Action, 1995.
- Herskovits, Melville J. *Life in a Haitian Village*. Garden City: Doubleday and Co.: 1971.
- Hesselink, John. *On Being Reformed. Distinctive Characteristics and Common Misunderstandings*. Ann Arbor: Servant Books, 1983.
- Hoetink, H. *The Dominican People. 1850-1900. Notes for a Historical Sociology*. Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press, 1982.
- Holwerda, David, E. ed. *Exploring the Heritage of John Calvin*. Grand Rapids: Baker Book House, 1976.
- Iglesia Evangélica Dominicana, Septuagésima Primera Sesión Annual, Asamblea General 1987*. Santo Domingo: Iglesia Evangélica Dominicana, 1987.
- Iglesia del Nazareno-Repubblica Dominicana. "Datos Estadísticos Periodo 1976-1990." Santo Domingo, 1993.
- Informe*. Sao Paulo, Brazil. (December, 1984).
- Jongeneel, Jan A.B., *Missiologie. I. Zendingswetenschap*. 's-Gravenhage: Uitgeverij Boekencentrum B.V., 1991.
- Jongeneel, Jan A.B. "The Missiology of Gisbertus Voetius: The First Comprehensive Protestant Theology of Missions." (trans. John Bolt). *Calvin Theological Journal*. Vol. XXVI. No. 1 (1991).
- Kessler, John. *A Study of the Older Protestant Missions and Churches in Peru and Chile*. Goes: Oosterbaan and Le Cointre N.V., 1967.
- Kirk, Robin. "Stone of Refuge: Haitian Refugees in the Dominican Republic." New York: National Coalition for Haitian Refugees, 1991.
- Knappert, L., *Geschiedenis van de Nederlandse Bovenwindsche eilanden in the 18de eeuw*. The Hague: Martinus Nijhof, 1932.
- Latourette, Kenneth S. "The Early Evangelical Missionary Movement in Latin America." National Council of Christian Churches, paper, 1961.
- Latourette, Kenneth S., *The Great Century: The Americas, Australia and Africa*. Vol. V. Grand Rapids: Zondervan Publishing House, 1978.
- Lawless, Robert. "The Faces of the Gods: Vodou and Roman Catholicism in Haiti," *Journal of Third World Studies* (fall, 1995), pp. 477-481.
- Leith, John H. ed. *Creeds of the Churches*. Atlanta: John Knox Press, 1982.
- Lemoine, Maurice. *Azucar Amargo: Hay esclavos en el Caribe*. Santo Domingo: Ediciones CEPAE, 1982.
- Lewis, Oscar. *La Vida: A Puerto Rican Family in the Culture of Poverty*. New York: Random House, 1965.
- Leyburn J.G. *The Haitian People*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1941.
- "Cardenal declara Haití necesita ayuda sustancial," *Listín Diario* (October 13, 1996). p. 16A.
- Listín Diario ed. "Tres entidades piden la creación de una comisión de consultas de RD-Haití." *Listín Diario*. (August 2, 1997).
- Lockward, Alfonso. *Algunas Cruces Altas*. Miami: UNILIT, 1992.
- Lockward, Alfonso. *Intolerancia y Libertad de cultos en Santo Domingo*. Santo Domingo: DELE, 1993.
- Lockward, Alfonso. *La Constitución Haitiano-Dominicana de 1843*. Santo Domingo: Taller, 1995.

- Lockward, George. *Correspondencia de Tindall, Primer Misionero Protestante en Dominicana*. Santo Domingo: Editorial Educativo Dominicano, 1981.
- Lockward, George. *El Protestantismo en Dominicana*. Santo Domingo: CETEC, 1982.
- Lockward, George. *Cartas de Cardy, Primer Misionero Metodista en Samaná*. Santo Domingo: Editorial Educativo Dominicano, 1988.
- López, J.M. *Orígenes del Presbiterianismo en México*. Tamaulipas: H. Matamoros, 1972.
- Lugo, Luis. "Christianity and the Spanish Conquest of the Americas," (1991),
- Luperón, Gregorio. *Notas autobiográficas y apuntes históricos*, 2nd. ed. (Santiago: Editorial El Diario, 1939), Vol. 2.
- MacKay, John. *The Other Spanish Christ*. London: Student Christian Movement, 1932.
- Madariaga, Salvador de. *Vida del Muy Magnífico Señor Don Cristóbal Colón*. Madrid: Espasa Calpe, 1984.
- José Manuel Madruga, *Azúcar y Haitianos en la República Dominicana* (1986);
- Madsen, William. *Christo-Paganism: A Study of Mexican Religious Syncretism*. New Orleans: Middle American Research Institute: Publication 19, 1957.
- Marcus, A.W. *De geschiedenis van de Nederlandse Hervormde Gemeente in Suriname*. Paramaribo: De Tijd, 1935.
- Mars, Louis. *The Crisis of Possession in Voodoo*. Reed, Cannon and Johnson Co., 1977.
- Martin, David. *Tongues of Fire: The Explosion of Protestantism in Latin America*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1990.
- Martínez, Adarberto. *Julio Postigo. La Librería Dominicana. Semblanza e historia*. Santo Domingo: Amigo del Hogar, 1994.
- Martínez, Fernandez, Luis. "The sword and the crucifix: church-state relations and nationality in the nineteenth-century Dominican Republic." *Latin American Research Review*. 1995, Vol. 30, No. 1, pp. 69-92.
- Martínez, Samuel. *Peripheral Migrants: Haitians and Dominican Republic Sugar Plantation* (1995).
- Maust, John. *Peace and Hope in the Corner of the Dead*. Miami: LAM, 1987.
- McGavern, Donald. *Understanding Church Growth*. Grand Rapids: W.B. Eerdmans, 1980.
- McNeill, John T. *The History and Character of Calvinism*. London: Oxford University Press, 1979.
- Merton, Robert. *Social Theory and Social Structure*. New York: Free Press, 1949.
- Métraux, Alfred. *Voodoo in Haiti*. New York: Schocken Books, 1972.
- J. Metzler (ed.) *sacrae Congregationis...* pp. 1131-1161.
- Miller, Vincent Jr. "On Exporting American Academia to Third World Settings: Local Knowledge Versus Modernism and Post-Modernism. – A Position Paper." Indiana: PA: Indiana University of PA., 2000.
- Miquez, José, Bonino. *Doing Theology in a Revolutionary Situation*. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1980.
- Modain, Gustavo and Pannier, Jacques. ed. *L'expansion française outre-mer et les protestants français*. Paris: Société des Missions Evangéliques, 1931.
- Monti, Daniel. *Presencia del protestantismo en el Río de la Plata durante el siglo XIX*. Buenos Aires: La Aurora, 1969.
- Morton, Sarah. *John Morton of Trinidad*. Toronto: Westminster Co., 1916.
- Mount, Graeme S. "Presbyterianism in Puerto Rico: Formative Years, 1899-1914." *Journal of Presbyterian History*. Vol. 55 (1977).
- Mount, Graeme S. *Presbyterian Missions to Trinidad and Puerto Rico: The Formative Years: 1868-1914*. Hantsport, Nova Scotia: Lancelot Press, 1983.
- Moya Pons, Frank. *La Dominación Haitiana: 1822-1844*. Santo Domingo: Editoria Taller, 1978.
- Moya Pons, Frank. "The Taínos." *Caribbean Review*. 13 (Fall 1984).
- Moya Pons, Frank. et al. *El Batey. Estudio socioeconómico de los bateyes del Consejo Estatal del Azúcar*. Santo Domingo: Fondo Para El Avance De Las Ciencias Sociales, Inc., 1986.
- "Moya pregunta porqué celebran matanza indios," *Ultima Hora* (March 30, 1992).
- Moya Pons, Frank. *Manual de Historia Dominicana*. Santo Domingo: Caribbean Publishers, 1995.
- Murphy, Martin. "The 'Push' Factors of Haitian Migration to the Dominican Sugar Industry and the Characteristics of the Immigrants." A paper presented at the Dominican Museum of Man, Santo Domingo, May, 1983.
- Neill, Stephen. *A History of Christian Missions*. Toronto: Pelican, 1975.

- Nelson, Wilton H. "Panama 1916 y su Impacto sobre el Protestantismo Latinoamericano." *Pastoralia*. Vol. 1 (November, 1978).
- Nelson, Wilton H. *Protestantism in Central America*. Grand Rapids: W.B. Eerdmans, 1984.
- Newton, Arthur. *The European Nations in the West Indies*. London: A and C Black Ltd., 1933.
- Norton, Michael. "Acting on own, Haiti leader picks government." *Miami Herald*. (March 26, 1999).
- Núñez, Rafael and Reyes, Leo. "Mejora en RD cura golpean Haití." *El Nacional*. (January 11, 1991).
- O' Donnell, Robert A. "Unidad y Misión: Perspectivas Católicas Romanas." No. 23. Year 11 (2nd sem., 1989).
- Ort, J.W. *Vestiging van de Hervormde Kerk in Suriname: 1667-1800*. Sticusa: n.p., 1963.
- Oostendorp, Derk and Hegeman, Neal. *Desde Lutero hasta la República Dominicana*. Santo Domingo: UNEV, 1992.
- Oviedo, Gonzalo Fernández de. *Sumario de la Natural Historia de las Indias*. Mexico City: Fondo de Cultural Económica, 1979.
- Padilla, Rene. *El Reino de Dios y América Latina*. Buenos Aires: Casa Bautista, 1975.
- Padilla, Rene. *Misión Integral*. Grand Rapids: Nueva Creación, 1976.
- Pagura, Federico J. "CLAI: Consejo Latinoamericano." *Misión* No. 6 (June, 1983).
- Pagura, Federico J. "Carta de Buenos Aires." *Misión* No. 9 (June, 1984). Pané, Ramón. Relación acerca de las antigüedades de los Indios. Santo Domingo: Fundación Corripio, Inc. 1988.
- Paraison, Edwin. "Grupo pastoral haitiana Expone en EU caso braceros." *Listín Diario*. (June 12, 1991).
- Parkinson, Wenda. *This Gilded African: Toussaint L'Ouverture*. New York: Quarter Books, 1978.
- Pennings, Timothy. "The Baptism of Brazil." *Impact* (1989).
- Pepen, Juan F. *La cruz señal d el camino: influencia de la iglesia en la formación y conservación de la nacionalidad dominicana*. Santo Domingo: Editorial Duarte, 1954.
- Peralta, Leoncio. "Monseñor Adames, "El de dominicanos y haitianos es un matrimonio impuesto." *Listín Diario*. (February 6, 1997).
- Pérez, Juan Manuel. *¿Estos, no son hombres?* Santo Domingo: Ediciones Fundación García-Arévalo, Inc., 1984.
- Pérez, Máximo Manual. "Haití y RD buscarán un acuerdo global sobre migración en el 2000." *Listín Diario*. (June 20, 1998). 12A.
- Perlman, Janice E. *The Myth of Marginality. Urban Poverty and Politics in Rio de Janeiro*. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1979.
- Pierre, Bastian. *Historia del protestantismo en América Latina*. Mexico: CUPSA, 1989.
- Plummer, Gayle. "Haitian Immigrants and Back Yard Imperialism." *Race and Class* (Spring, 1985).
- Práctico Larousse. *Mexico City*: Ediciones Larousse, 1987.
- Price Mars, Jean. *La República de Haití y la República Dominicana*. Santo Domingo: España Gráficas, 1953.
- Prien, H.J. *Die Geschichte des Christentums in Latein-Americka*. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht, 1978.
- Protestant Reformed Acts of Synod. 1987*. Grand Rapids: R.F.P.A., 1987.
- Read, W.R.. *et al. Latin American Church Growth*. Grand Rapids: W.B. Eerdmans, 1969.
- Reforma Siglo 21*. Vol. 1, No. 1 (July, 1999) and Vol. 1, No. 2 (December, 1999).
- Reformed Church of America*. 1989 Directory and 1988 Financial Statements of the General Synod (1989) New York: Reformed Church of America, 1989.
- Reid, Stanford, W. *John Calvin. His Influence in the Western World*. Grand Rapids: Zondervan Publishing House, 1982.
- Rengstorf, K.H. "Apostello." *Theological Dictionary of the New Testament*. Grand Rapids: W.B. Eerdmans, 1969 .
- República Dominicana en Cifras 1990*. Vol. 16. Santo Domingo: Oficina Nacional de Estadística, 1991.
- Rescate*, Vol.I. Santo Domingo, (1996).
- Reuters. "Paramilitaries haitianos asesinan párroco católico seguía Aristide." *El Nacional*. (August 29, 1994).
- Reyes, German. "Traen haitianos para la zafra." *Hoy*. (November 25, 1992).
- Ricardo, Eufemio and Hegeman, Neal. "Directorio de la República Dominicana." *Desde Lutero Hasta la República Dominicana*. Santo Domingo: CONPAS, 1992.
- Ritchie, Donald A. *Doing Oral History*. New York: T Wayne Publishers, 1995.
- Roca, Hernán González. "Un bosquejo para la historia de la Iglesia Evangélica Dominicana." *Disciplina*. Santo Domingo: Iglesia Evangélica Dominicana, 1987.

- Rodman, Selder. *Haiti: The Black Republic*. New York: Devin-Adair Co., 1954.
- Rooy, Sidney. "Social Revolution and the Future of the Church." *Occasional Essays*. Year 13, No. 1 and 2 (1986).
- Rooy, Sidney. "¿La llegada de los "luteranos" a Venezuela?" *Iglesia y Misión*. No. 37 (July-September, 1991).
- Kinsler Ross, *The Extension Movement in Theological Education*. Pasadena: William Carey Library, 1981.
- Rosario, Esteban. *Iglesia Católica y Olgarquía*. Santiago: Editora Buhó, 1991.
- Rosenberg, June. *El Gaga: Religión y Sociedad de un Culto Dominicano*. Santo Domingo: Editora Alfa y Omega, 1979.
- Sacrae congregationis de propaganda fide memoria resum, 1622-1972. Vol. 2. Rome: Herder, n.d.
- Sáez, José Luis. *Cinco Siglos de Iglesia Dominicana*. Santo Domingo: Amigo del Hogar, 1987.
- Saillant, Silvio Torres. "The tribulations of blackness: stages in Dominican racial identity." *Latin American Perspectives*. May 1998. Vol. 25, no. 3. p. 126-187.
- Savage, Pedro. "CLAI y CONELA: Implicaciones sobre la iglesia." *Misión*. No.4 (October, 1993).
- Schalkwijk, F.L. *Igreja e estado no Brazil Holandés: 1630-1654*. Recife: FUNARPE, 1984.
- Schemper, Chester. "The World Home Bible League and Latin America." *Crossing Latin Borders*. No. 2 (1987).
- Sesdedos, Francisco, Alvarez. Trans. *Libro de las profecías de Cristóbal Colón*
- Short, Margaret. "Toward the Renewal and Growth of the Dominican Episcopal Church: A Practical and Theological Case Study." D.Min thesis for Fuller Theological Seminary, 1992.
- Simpson, George Eaton. *Black Religions in the New World*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1978.
- Sinclair, J.H. *Protestantism in Latin America: A Bibliographical Guide*. Austin: Hispanic American Institute, 1967.
- Smelt, Leo. *La Misión de la Iglesia Evangélica Presbiteriana del Perú en la sociedad peruana actual y la herencia de la reforma*. Lima: Centro Cristiano de Promoción y Servicios, 1987.
- Smith, N. *Levende stenen: 350 jaren protestantisme op Curacao*. Willemstad: Verenigde Protestante Gemeente, 1985.
- Sopena Diccionario-Enciclopédico Ilustrado de la lengua Español*. Vol. 4. Barcelona, 1966.
- Sosiedad Antiano de Beibel: Report of the Board. Willemstad: Sosiedad Antiano de Beibel, 1986.
- St. Jean, Yanick. "A Case of Inculturation: Haitians in the Dominican Republic." *International Policy Review* (6.1., 1996).
- Stoll, David. *Is Latin America Turning Protestant? The Politics of Evangelical Growth*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990.
- Taber, Charles and Yamori, Tetsuneo. *Christopaganism or Indigenous Christianity?* Pasadena: William Carey Library, 1975.
- Tejada, Cristino Peña. "La Iglesia del Nazareno en la República Dominicana." *Manual de Misionología Evangélica Dominicana: 1987-1988*. Santo Domingo: UNEV, 1989.
- The American Heritage Dictionary of the English Language*. New York: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1971.
- The Oxford Dictionary of World Religions*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- The Real Academia Español. Diccionario de la Lengua Español*. 1992.
- "Moya pregunta porqué celebran matanza indios." *Ultima Hora*. (March 30, 1992).
- Utrera, Cipriano de. *Santo Domingo: dilucidaciones históricas*. Vol. II. Santo Domingo: State Secretary of Education, 1978.
- Van der Linde, Jan M. *Surinaamse Suikerheren en hun Kerk*. Wageningen: H. Veenman, 1966.
- Van Engen, Charles. *Growth of the True Church*. Amsterdam: Editions Rodopi, 1981.
- Van Engen, Charles. "Chiapas para Christo-Chiapas For Christ." *Charm and Challenge of Chiapas: 1986*. Orange City: Reformed Church of America, 1986.
- Van Laar, William. "Het presbyterianisme in Chili: Toekomst of versterving." *Wereld en Zending*. (August 20, 1987).
- Van Lennep, M.K. *La Historia de la Reforma en España en el Siglo XVI*. Grand Rapids: Libros Desafios, 1984.
- Vega, Bernardo. *Trujillo y Haití*. Vol. 1. Santo Domingo: Fundación Cultural Dominicana, 1988.
- Bernardo Vega, in "Ethnicidad y el futuro de las relaciones Dominico-Haitiana," *Estudios Sociales*, Year 26, No. 94, Oct-Dec, 1993, p. 38.

- Veras, Ramón, Antonio. *Inmigración, Haitianos, Esclavitud*. Santo Domingo: Ediciones de Taller, 1983.
- Veras, Ramón, Antonio. *Migración Caribena: Un capítulo Haitiano* Santo Domingo: 1985.
- Verkuyl, Johannes. *Contemporary Missiology: An Introduction*. Grand Rapids: W.B. Eerdmans, 1978.
- Vial, Samuel. *Enciclopedia Ilustrada de historia de la Iglesia*. Madrid: CLIE, 1979.
- Villalpando, W.L., D'Epinay C.L., and Epps, D.C. eds. *Las Iglesias del Traspante: Protestantismo de inmigración en la Argentina*. Buenos Aires: Centro de Estudios Cristianos, 1970.
- Villamán, Marcos. "Religion y pobreza," in *Estudios Sociales*, No. 94 (Oct-Dec., 1993), p. 83-84.
- Voortgangverslag beleid Zuid-Amerika* Orgaan. Leusden: Centrum voor Zending, 1982.
- Wells, David. ed. *Reformed Theology in America. A History of its Modern Development*. Grand Rapids: W.B. Eerdmans, 1985.
- Wheaton, Philip E. *Triunfando Sobre las Tragedias. Historia Centenaria de la Iglesia Episcopal Dominicana. 1897-1997*. Santo Domingo: Iglesia Episcopal, 1997.
- Wiarda, Howard. *The Dominican Republic. A Nation in Transition*. New York: Praeger, 1968. f
- Williams, M. E. "Roman Catholic." *New Catholic Encyclopedia* Vol. 12, 1967.
- Winter, Ralph. *Theological Education by Extension*. Pasadena: William Carey Library, 1970.
- Wipfler, William. *Poder, influencia, e impotencia: la iglesia como factor socio-político en República Dominicana*. Santo Domingo: CEPAE, 1980.
- World Alliance of Reformed Churches. *Hand Book of Member Churches: World Alliance of Reformed Churches*. Geneva: WARC, 1989.
- World Council of Churches. *1986 Resource Sharing Book*. Geneva: WCC, 1986.
- Yates, Madonna. *Million-Dollar Vacations*. Richardson: Christian Medical Society, 1984.
- Zaiter, Raschid. "Radiografía de un crimen." *El Nacional*. (September 5, 1994). Editorial.

Interviews

- Pérez, Emilio. July 14, 1984. Santo Domingo
- Lors, Sirel. July 14, 1984, Santo Domingo
- Jean, Locano. July 14, 1984. Santo Domingo
- Phillipe, Pierre. July 14, 1984. Santo Domingo
- Ricardo, Eufemio. November 10, 1984. Santo Domingo
- Valentine, René .December 12, 1984
- Van Engen, Charles. May, 1985. Holland, Michigan
- Díaz, Ricardo Polanco. August 15, 1987. Santiago
- Dodd, Thomas, May, 1986. Santo Domingo
- Thomas, Luis. July 3, 1987. Santo Domingo
- Batist, Jean. September, 1988. Santo Domingo
- Van Voet, Richard. November, 1988. Orange City, Iowa
- Jean, Ismael. March, 1990. Altagracia
- Ydame, Odeis. February, 1992. Sabana Grande de Boya
- Confidant, Edmón. June 6, 1992. Sabana Grande de Boya
- Castillo, Eugenio. February 10, 1993. Sabana Grande de Boya
- Hegeman, Ben. May, 1998. London, Canada.
- De Vries, Steven. May, 1999. Santo Domingo.

Letters

- Ellen, Bob. February, 1986; Murray , Kenneth. Jan. 30, 1988; Van Roest, Jan. September, 1988; Kotsis, István. March 2, 1990; Rooy, Sidney. March 1990; Bosma, Carl. August, 1990; Rooy, Sidney. May, 1995

STUDENT MANUAL

JUSTIFICATION OF COURSE: The study of the beginning of the Christian Reformed Church in the Dominican Republic gives the mission student an insight into the dynamics of evangelism, church growth and spiritual revitalization in the midst of a disfranchised people.

COURSE OBJECTIVES

1. To read a thorough missiological investigation on the history of the ICRRD.
2. To respond to the reading
3. To search the internet for more information about the Haitian immigrants in the DR
3. To write a missiological reflection paper on cross cultural church planting
4. To write a final exam

COURSE EVALUATION

1. The reading of the author's thesis (15%)
2. Response to the questions (15%)
3. Intern updates on Haitian immigrant situation (20%)
4. Writing of a ten page missiological reflection paper on the ICRRD (30%)
5. Final exam (20%)

EXPLANATION OF COURSE RESPONSIBILITIES

1. The reading of the thesis will be verified with a three page commentary.
2. The response to the questions will be made in written form.
3. The internet search will be verified by submission of internet finds. The student will specifically look for materials on the Haitian immigrants in the DR and related topics. The student will apply his/her findings with the thesis of the author.
4. The missiological reflection paper will have a title page, a table of contents page, 7 pages of manuscripts, and a bibliography. At least three other authors will be referenced in the paper. The research paper will identify one area of interest about the ICRRD and then the student will contact resources in the DR in order to develop the research. Dr. Hegeman will help secure the internet contacts.
5. The final exam consists of the student memorizing all eight theses and writing a response to each one. This is a closed book exam.

CLASS RECORD

Name of student	Reading of thesis (15%)	Response to chapter questions (15%)	Internet Updates (20%)	Missiological reflection paper (30%)	Final Exam (20%)	Final Grade

QUESTIONS FOR THE EIGHT LESSONS

LESSON ONE. INTRODUCTION

READINGS. Read Preface and Chapter 1.

QUESTIONS. Term recognition

1. Culture
2. Anthropology
3. Indo-American
4. Euro-American
5. Afro-American
6. Ibero-American
7. Mestizo
8. Mulatto
9. Ethnic group
10. Homogeneous people group
11. CALA
12. Disfranchisement
13. Protestant
14. Evangelical
15. Indigenization
16. Presbyterian
17. Reformed
18. Mission
19. Ministry
20. Hispaniola

LESSON TWO. THE CONTEXT OF THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

READING: CHAPTER 2

1. What is the thesis for chapter 2?
2. Show how the Haitians became historically disfranchised.
3. Demonstrate how a sugar cane economy would lead to Haitian servitude.
4. What happened to the Indian slaves in 16th century Hispaniola?
5. What role did the Welser banking family have in the slave trade?
6. If emancipation in both Haiti and the Dominican Republic set the slaves free how did the Haitians end up in slave like conditions in the Dominican Republic?
7. Term identification
 - 7.1. bracero:
 - 7.2. ambasfil:.
 - 7.3. Batey:
 - 7.4. Carnet.
 - 7.5. Voodoo:
8. What are some of the symptoms of disfranchisements of the Haitian immigrant?

LESSON THREE. THE ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC AND THE HAITIAN IMMIGRANT

READING: CHAPTER 3.

QUESTIONS

1. What is the main thesis for chapter 3?
2. Discuss. Was Christopher Columbus Christian?
3. Discuss. How do you interpret the "First Evangelization of the Americas" in 16th century Hispaniola in terms of the Indian genocide and African slave trade?

4. Name and term recognition.
- 4.1. Román Pane:
- 4.2. Bernard Boyl:
- 4.3. Bartolomé de Las Casas.
- 4.4. Antón de Montesinos:
- 4.5. Inquisition.
5. Discuss the attitude of the Haitian revolutionaries toward the RCC at the beginning of the 19th century.
6. What relationship did the new Dominican Republic have with the RCC?
7. What has the traditional position of the RCC in the Dominican Republic been towards the Haitian immigrants?

LESSON FOUR. THE PROTESTANT CHURCHES IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC AND THE HAITIAN IMMIGRANTS.

READING: CHAPTER 4 QUESTIONS

1. By what cultural means were the Protestants present on the coastal regions of Hispaniola during the 16th and 17th century.
2. When was Protestantism first established in the Dominican Republic?
3. Who and when was the gospel first preached by Protestants in the Spanish language in the Dominican Republic.
4. When and with whom were the first Haitian Creole speaking churches established in the Dominican Republic? .
5. Which denomination did the most mission work among the Haitian immigrants during the 1970's and 1980?
6. Why did the Church of the Nazarenes stop growing among the Haitian immigrants during the mid and late 1980's?
7. When did the Christian Reformed Church come to the Dominican Republic?
8. How was the growth of the Pentecostal churches among the Haitian immigrants?
9. Did you see any particular patterns in the para-church ministries among the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic?

LESSON FIVE. REFORMED AND PRESBYTERIANS IN THE CARIBBEAN AND LATIN AMERICA (1528-1991)

READING: Chapter 5 QUESTIONS.

1. What is the fourth thesis?
2. Who are the French Huguenots?
3. When did the Huguenots establish the first Reformed church in the Americas?
4. Huguenot and later Netherlands Reformed contacts were frequent in the Caribbean
5. When did the Presbyterians establish their first church in Bermuda?
6. When did the Presbyterians begin to do mission work in the Dominican Republic?
7. From your reading and knowledge of history, why did it take until the 20th century before the Presbyterians came to the Dominican Republic?
8. What is the fifth thesis?
9. According to the author, what is traditional Reformed? Evangelical Reformed? Ecumenical Reformed

LESSON SIX. THE CHRISTIAN

READING: Chapter 6 QUESTIONS

1. What is the fifth thesis?
2. Why did the national leaders of small independent groups want to join the CRC in the DR?

3. What is the 7th thesis?
4. How did the ICRRD show financial self-responsibility?
5. How did the ICRRD show church government self-responsibility?
6. How was leadership developed in the ICRRD?
7. What are some of the ministries developed in the ICRRD?
8. The Dominican government began massive deportations of Haitian immigrants at the end of the 1980's.
9. How is it noticeable that the ICRRD is evangelical Reformed?
10. What is the 8th thesis?
11. Is there anything in particular that strikes you about the ICRRD's mission? (student's own answer)

LESSON SEVEN. CONCLUSION

READING: Chapter 7

QUESTIONS

1. Your commentary on thesis 1.
2. Your commentary on thesis 2.
3. Your commentary on thesis 3.
4. Your commentary on thesis 4.
5. Your commentary on thesis 5.
6. Your commentary on thesis 6.
7. Your commentary on thesis 7.
8. Your commentary on thesis 8.
9. How would you formulate a closing statement about the ICRRD?

LESSON EIGHT: FOLLOW UP STUDY

READING: review the bibliography for internet contacts

ASSIGNMENT.

1. Go to the public or university library and do internet research on books, magazine articles or thesis about the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic. Make your final report, reacting to the information.

TEACHER'S MANUAL

LESSON ONE. INTRODUCTION

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

1. Culture: the totality of one's values and actions.
2. Anthropology: the study of man (anthro)
3. Indo-American: short form for Indian American. This designation can be used for American Indians, East Indians who live in the American continent.
4. Euro-American. Americans from European descent.
5. Afro-American. Americans from African descent.
6. Ibero-American. Americans from Spanish or Portuguese descent.
7. Mestizo: Caucasian and Indian racial mix
8. Mulatto: Caucasian and Negroid racial mix
9. Ethnic group: a social group with certain common characteristics according to status, values and traits.
10. Homogeneous people group:
11. CALA: Caribbean and Latin America
12. Disfranchisement: in general terms, being set outside of a normal situation.
13. Protestant. Churches that are part of the 16th century churches who protested against the Roman Catholic Church and institutionally separated from them.
14. Evangelical. Christians and churches that place priority on evangelizing and bringing people to Christ.
15. Indigenization: generally refers to self-governing, self-support and self-propagation. However, the term literally means to indianize (indigena) which makes it a contextually dysfunctional term.
16. Presbyterian. Protestant branch of Christianity defined by the Westminster Standards.
17. Reformed. Protestant branch of Christianity defined by the doctrinally reformed confessions such as the Genevan confessions, Heidelberg Catechism, Canons of Dordt, Belgic Confession, Westminster standards, London Confession and others like it.
18. Mission. Literally means "to send".
19. Ministry. Literal meaning is "to serve."
20. Hispaniola: the island where the Dominican Republic and Haiti are.

LESSON TWO: THE CONTEXT OF THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

QUESTIONS AND SUGGESTED ANSWERS

1. What is the thesis for chapter 2? "The Haitian immigrant in the Dominican Republic is historical, social and religious disfranchisement from governing powers, economic development and traditional religion in Hispaniola."
2. Show how the Haitians became historically disfranchised. The Afro-American slaves in the Caribbean have been controlled by colonists, the wealthy class, and government programs.
3. Demonstrate how a sugar cane economy would lead to Haitian servitude. The sugar cane economy requires cheap labor and laborers who will continue to work under such conditions. Imported immigrants serve this purpose.
4. What happened to the Indian slaves in 16th century Hispaniola? It is estimated that over 400,000 lost their life by the mid 16th century. They died of Spanish brought diseases, were killed and committed suicide.
5. What role did the Welser banking family have in the slave trade? Charles V had a debt with the German banking family, the Welsers. Charles V gave land in the New World to repay. The Welsers were not Spanish or Roman Catholic and do the anti-slave trafficking laws of Spain and the RCC did not apply to him. His first expedition in 1528 included African slaves.
6. If emancipation in both Haiti and the Dominican Republic set the slaves free how did the Haitians end up in slave like conditions in the Dominican Republic? The deterioration of the economy in Haiti forced the Haitian agricultural class to look for other options. At certain times in the history

of Haiti the government sold sugar cane workers to the Dominican government in order to work in their sugar cane fields.

7. Term identification
- 7.1. bracero: short term Haitian sugar cane worker
- 7.2. ambasfil: an illegal worker and his family member.
- 7.3. Batey: Haitian village for Sugar Cane cutters in the Dominican Republic
- 7.4. Carnet. Working document for sugar cane cutter.
- 7.5. Voodoo: Afro-Haitian spiritist religion that centers on the adherent being possessed by spirits and appeasing the spirit world through religious ceremonies.
8. What are some of the symptoms of disfranchisements of the Haitian immigrant? Illegality, illnesses, illegitimate marriage, illiteracy.

LESSON THREE: THE ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC AND THE HAITIAN IMMIGRANT

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

1. What is the main thesis for chapter 3? The Roman Catholic Church in the Dominican Republic is part of the disfranchisement of the Haitian immigrants yet efforts are being made to minister to the immigrants.
2. Discuss. Was Christopher Columbus Christian? The student should include reflections on what it is to be a Christian, what were some of Columbus' actions and the evangelization of the Indians.
3. Discuss. How do you interpret the "First Evangelization of the Americas" in 16th century Hispaniola in terms of the Indian genocide and African slave trade? Both Roman Catholics and Protestants have raised serious questions about evangelizing through conquering and even the use of genocide. Like the Protestants, the RCC was involved in not responding against slave trafficking.
4. Term recognition.
- 4.1. Román Pane: first person to learn Taino and seek to evangelize the Indians.
- 4.2. Bernard Boyl: first religious worker in New World came with Columbus on his second voyage in 1493.
- 4.3. Bartolomé de Las Casas: Author of History of the Indies and defensor of the Indian's rights.
- 4.4. Antón de Montesinos: denounced the Spanish colonists for abuse of the Indians.
- 4.5. Inquisition. A special commission within the RCC to imprison and condemn to death persons who oppose the doctrines of the RCC.
5. Discuss the attitude of the Haitian revolutionaries toward the RCC at the beginning of the 19th century. They were anti-clerical. This attitude was taken into the Dominican Republic when Haiti invaded from 1822-1844.
6. What relationship did the new Dominican Republic have with the RCC? The RCC was recognized as the religion of the state but the new constitution also allowed for the freedom of religion. This was the first step toward Protestants being legally recognized in the DR.
7. What has the traditional position of the RCC in the Dominican Republic been towards the Haitian immigrants? The traditional RCC in the DR sees itself as the national religion of the DR. It does not establish Haitian churches for the Haitian immigrants. The Haitian Pastoral Center has formed a bridge between the Haitian immigrant community and the RCC.

LESSON FOUR

QUESTIONS

1. By what cultural means were the Protestants present on the coastal regions of Hispaniola during the 16th and 17th century. They accompanied the pirates. Some Huguenot influence was noticeable on Tortugas Island in northern Haiti.
2. When was Protestantism first established in the Dominican Republic? With the coming of the North American freed slaves who came through Haiti to Samana in 1824. They came during the time when the Haitian invaded the Dominican Republic.

3. Who and when was the gospel first preached by Protestants in the Spanish language in the Dominican Republic. By Methodist missionary William Tawler who came in 1834.
4. When and with whom were the first Haitian Creole speaking churches established in the Dominican Republic? Baptists from Haiti went to the La Romana region during the early 1920s.
5. Which denomination did the most mission work among the Haitian immigrants during the 1970's and 1980? The Church of the Nazarene. The missionaries came in 1972 and the church was established by 1975.
6. Why did the Church of the Nazarenes stop growing among the Haitian immigrants during the mid and late 1980's? The Church spends more time working among the Dominicans. Also, the Christian Reformed Church came on the scene and developed churches in many areas where the Nazarenes had not reached.
7. When did the Christian Reformed Church come to the Dominican Republic? The first full time missionaries came in 1980 and the church was organized in 1981.
8. How was the growth of the Pentecostal churches among the Haitian immigrants? In comparison to the growth of the Pentecostals among the Dominicans, the growth among the Haitian immigrants was slow. The traditional Pentecostal Dominican churches had very little mission work among the Haitians.
9. Did you see any particular patterns in the para-church ministries among the Haitian immigrants in the Dominican Republic? Most are financed by international missions. There is little Haitian leadership in the para-church ministries in the Dominican Republic.

LESSON FIVE. THE REFORMED AND PRESBYTERIANS IN THE CARIBBEAN AND LATIN AMERICA

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

1. What is the fourth thesis? After years of isolation, the international Reformed missionary community has since the 1980's spearheaded ministries among the Haitian immigrants.
2. Who are the French Huguenots? The French Huguenots are Protestants from France who are doctrinally reformed.
3. When did the Huguenots establish the first Reformed church in the Americas? 1555.
4. Huguenot and later Netherlands Reformed contacts were frequent in the Caribbean. Why is it that they did not become established in Hispaniola? First of all, there was no freedom of religion in the Dominican Republic until the establishment of the new republic (1844). The Netherlands Reformed were present in the Dutch Caribbean islands but the church was a colonist and European immigrant church. There was very little mission work going forth from such churches. Mission work came from the Netherlands but it did not reach Hispaniola. Not until the Christian Reformed Church was established in the Dominican Republic in 1981, did Hispaniola have a Reformed church presence.
5. When did the Presbyterians establish their first church in Bermuda? 1644.
6. When did the Presbyterians begin to do mission work in the Dominican Republic? After working in Puerto Rico, the Presbyterians made contacts in the Dominican Republic in the early 20th century. Eventually, during the 1920's the Presbyterians joined with the union church, *la Iglesia Evangelica Dominicana*.
7. From your reading and knowledge of history, why did it take until the 20th century before the Presbyterians came to the Dominican Republic? There are a variety of reasons. Some of them are: historically, the Dominican Republic was closed to Protestants until the Haitian invasion of 1922. The Presbyterians from Scotland were more involved in the English speaking Caribbean than the Spanish speaking Caribbean. The American Presbyterians spend a lot of resources and send many missionaries to Puerto Rico.
8. What is the fifth thesis? The ICRRD consists of independent evangelicals who are becoming evangelical reformed.
9. According to the author, what is traditional Reformed? Evangelical Reformed? Ecumenical Reformed? The traditional Reformed adhere to the Reformed creeds in a consistently legal

way. The evangelical Reformed adhere to the Reformed creeds and place evangelism as the priority in the mission of the church. The ecumenical Reformed identify with the Reformed creeds but are in alliance with other denominations in regional and international councils.

LESSON SIX

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

1. What is the fifth thesis? The initiation of the ICRRD was not due to evangelism growth but transfer growth small independent evangelical groups.
2. Why did the national leaders of small independent groups want to join the CRC in the DR? There are a variety of reasons but some of them are neglect from existing denomination; for others to give credence to a house church. It should not be discounted that some come for financial help.
3. What is the 7th thesis? The maturation of the ICRRD is related to its level of auto-responsibility.
4. How did the ICRRD show financial self-responsibility? Local congregations pay their own pastors.
5. How did the ICRRD show church government self-responsibility? Within several years of forming a denomination national leaders were chosen as leaders of the national assembly.
6. How was leadership developed in the ICRRD? Leaders committed themselves to receiving monthly classes. Sunday school materials were taught to leaders and used in the local churches. Regional meetings supervised the development of the churches and ministries. Local congregations supported their own local leaders.
7. What are some of the ministries developed in the ICRRD? Christian schools, diaconal work, community development, Christian literature development, medical caravans and church construction work crews.
8. The Dominican government began massive deportations of Haitian immigrants at the end of the 1980's. How did the ICRRD respond? The church assisted those who were deported to Haiti. Buses were rented and contact was maintained. When the Haitians returned after political turbulence in Haiti, many returned to their former churches.
9. How is it noticeable that the ICRRD is evangelical Reformed? The ICRRD is not traditional Reformed in that it has not officially adopted any Reformed creeds. Neither is it ecumenical Reformed since it does not participate in ecumenical alliances. The ICRRD is very active in evangelism and uses Reformed doctrine for teaching.
10. What are the eight theses? Leadership training and Christian education was the dominant ministry activity during the first decade of the ICRRD.
11. Is there anything in particular that strikes you about the ICRRD's mission? (student's own answer)

LESSON SEVEN

1. Your commentary on thesis 1.
2. Your commentary on thesis 2.
3. Your commentary on thesis 3.
4. Your commentary on thesis 4.
5. Your commentary on thesis 5.
6. Your commentary on thesis 6.
7. Your commentary on thesis 7.
8. Your commentary on thesis 8.
9. How would you formulate a closing statement about the ICRRD?

LESSON EIGHT (instructions in student manual).